

# DAILY HANSARD

YOUR VOICE IN PARLIAMENT



## THE SECOND MEETING OF THE FIFTH SESSION OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT

TUESDAY 12 FEBRUARY 2019

### ENGLISH VERSION

HANSARD NO. 193



#### DISCLAIMER

##### Unofficial Hansard

This transcript of Parliamentary proceedings is an unofficial version of the Hansard and may contain inaccuracies. It is hereby published for general purposes only. The final edited version of the Hansard will be published when available and can be obtained from the Assistant Clerk (Editorial).

**THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY SPEAKER**  
**The Hon. Gladys K. T. Kokorwe PH, MP.**  
**DEPUTY SPEAKER**  
**The Hon. Kagiso P. Molatlhegi, MP Gaborone South**

Clerk of the National Assembly	- Ms B. N. Dithapo
Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly	- Mr L. T. Gaolaolwe
Learned Parliamentary Counsel	- Ms M. Mokgosi
Assistant Clerk (E)	- Mr R. Josiah

**CABINET**

His Excellency Dr M. E. K. Masisi, MP	- President
His Honour S. Tsogwane, MP. (Boteti West)	- Vice President
Hon. F. S. Van Der Westhuizen, MP. (Kgalagadi South)	- Minister of Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. D. K. Makgato, MP. (Sefhare - Ramokgonami)	- Minister of Transport and Communications
Hon. N. E. Molefhi, MP. (Selebi Phikwe East)	- Minister for Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration
Hon. S. Kgathi, MP. (Bobonong)	- Minister of Defence, Justice and Security
Hon. O. K. Mokaila, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Environment, Natural Resources Conservation and Tourism
Hon. B. Arone, MP. (Okavango)	- Minister of Basic Education
Hon. M. N. Ngaka, MP (Takatokwane)	- Minister of Nationality, Immigration and Gender Affairs
Hon. O. K. Matambo, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Finance and Economic Development
Hon. V. T. Seretse, MP. (Lentsweletau - Mmopane)	- Minister of Infrastructure and Housing Development
Hon. T. Olopeng, MP. (Tonota)	- Minister of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology
Hon. Dr U. Dow, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of International Affairs and Cooperation
Hon. T. Mabeo, MP. (Thamaga - Kumakwane)	- Minister of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development
Hon. Dr A. Madigele, MP. (Mmathethe - Molapowabojang)	- Minister of Health and Wellness
Hon. E. M. Molale, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security
Hon. K. Mzwini, MP. (Mmadinare)	- Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services
Hon. T. S. Khama, MP. (Serowe West)	- Minister of Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development
Hon. P. P. Ralotsia, MP. (Kanye North)	- Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security
Hon. B. J. Kenewendo, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry
Hon. B. M. Tshireletso, MP. (Mahalapye East)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. M. M. Goya, MP. (Palapye)	- Assistant Minister, Investment, Trade and Industry
Hon. D. P. Makgalemele, MP. (Shoshong)	- Assistant Minister, Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development
Hon. F. M. M. Molao, MP (Shashe West)	- Assistant Minister, Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology
Hon. K. K. Autlwetse, MP (Serowe North)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. G. B. Butale, MP. (Tati West)	- Assistant Minister, Health and Wellness
Hon. T. Kwerepe, MP. (Ngami)	- Assistant Minister, Basic Education
Hon. I. E. Moipisi, MP. (Kgalagadi North)	- Assistant Minister, Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services
Hon. M. R. Shamukuni, MP (Chobe)	- Assistant Minister, Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration
Hon. K. Markus, MP. (Maun East)	- Assistant Minister, Agricultural Development and Food Security

## MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT AND THEIR CONSTITUENCIES

<b>Names</b>	<b>Constituency</b>
<b>RULING PARTY (Botswana Democratic Party)</b>	
Hon. Dr P. Venson-Moitoi, MP	Serowe South
Hon. S. M. Guma, MP	Tati East
Hon. C. De Graaff, MP	Ghanzi South
Hon. P. M. Maele, MP	Lerala - Maunatlala
Hon. L. Kablay, MP	Letlhakeng - Lephephe
Hon. S. Lelatisitswe, MP	Boteti East
Hon. J. Molefe, MP	Mahalapye West
Hon. P. Majaga, MP	Nata-Gweta
Hon. M. I. Moswaane, MP	Francistown West
Hon. B. H. Billy, MP	Francistown East
Hon. E. J. Batshu, MP	Nkange
Hon. S. Kebonang, MP	Lobatse
Hon. K. S. Gare, MP	Moshupa-Manyana
Hon. M. R. Reatile, MP	Specially Elected
<b>OPPOSITION</b>	
<b>(Umbrella for Democratic Change)</b>	
Hon. Adv. D. G. Boko, MP (Leader of Opposition)	Gaborone Bonnington North
Hon. G. S. M. Mangole, MP	Mochudi West
Hon. A. S. Kesupile, MP	Kanye South
Hon. N. S. L. M. Salakae, MP	Ghanzi North
Hon. Dr. T. O. M. Mmatli, MP	Molepolole South
Hon. S. Ntlhaile, MP	Jwaneng -Mabutsane
Hon. M. I. Khan, MP	Molepolole North
Hon. Kgosi Lotlamoreng II	Goodhope - Mabule
Hon. D. L. Keorapetse, MP	Selebi Phikwe West
Hon. S. O. S. Rantuana, MP	Ramotswa
Hon. K. M. Segokgo, MP	Tlokweng
Hon. B. M. Molebatsi, MP	Mochudi East
<b>(Alliance for Progressives)</b>	
Hon. W. B. Mmolotsi, MP	Francistown South
Hon. Maj. Gen. P. Mokgware, MP	Gabane-Mmankgodi
Hon. N. N. Gaolathe, MP	Gaborone Bonnington South
Hon. S. Kgoroba, MP	Mogoditshane
Hon. Dr P. Butale, MP	Gaborone Central
Hon. H. G. Nkaigwa, MP	Gaborone North
<b>(Independent Member of Parliament)</b>	
Hon. T. Moremi, MP	Maun West

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**  
**THE SECOND MEETING OF THE FIFTH SESSION**  
**OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT**  
**TUESDAY 12 FEBRUARY, 2019**

<i>CONTENTS</i>	<i>PAGE (S)</i>
<b>SPEAKER'S ANNOUNCEMENTS</b> .....	1
<b>QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER</b> .....	2 - 10
<b>QUESTION WITHOUT NOTICE</b> .....	11 - 12
Appropriation (2019/2020) Bill, 2019 (No. 1 of 2019) Second Reading (Resumed Debate).....	13 - 36



Tuesday 12<sup>th</sup> February, 2019

THE ASSEMBLY met at 2:00 p.m.

(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)

**P R A Y E R S**

\* \* \* \*

**SPEAKER'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**MRSPEAKER (MR MOLATLHEGI):** Order! Honourable Members, good afternoon. I have some announcements, the first one is as follows; Honourable Members, in accordance with Standing Order No. 99.1, I hereby inform you that the Committee of Selection met today; Tuesday 12<sup>th</sup> February 2019, to consider proposals for allocation of Parliamentary Committees to Honourable Members following recent Cabinet appointments.

I am therefore pleased to announce that the following Honourable Members have been appointed to the following Parliamentary Committees.

No.	Hon. Member	Committee
(i)	Hon. P. Venson-Moitoi	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Finance, Trade and Economic Development</li> <li>• Education and Skills Development</li> <li>• Government Assurances and Motions Passed by the National Assembly</li> <li>• Public Service and its Management</li> <li>• Public Accounts Committee</li> </ul>
(ii)	Hon. P. M. Maele	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Wildlife, Tourism, Natural Resources and Climate Change</li> </ul>
(iii)	Hon. T.O. Mmatli	Agriculture, Lands and Housing

Honourable Members, following the adoption by this House in July 2018 of the Inter-Parliamentary Union delegation report which was tabled by Honourable Boko, with the resolution for the establishment of Parliamentary Oversight Committees on Sustainable Development Goals, the Committee of Selection has thus constituted a Special Select Committee on the Sustainable Development Goals as follows;

- (i) Hon. K.P. Molatlhegi – Chairperson
- (ii) Hon. B.M. Tshireletso – Member
- (iii) Hon. D.G. Boko – Member
- (iv) Hon. N.N. Gaolathe – Member
- (v) Hon. W.B. Mmolotsi – Member
- (vi) Hon. G.S. Mangole – Member
- (vii) Hon. S. Lelatisitswe – Member
- (viii) Hon. J. Molefe – Member
- (ix) Hon. O.S. Rantuana- Member

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Inaudible)...



**MR SPEAKER:** Thank you Honourable Members. Order! Honourable Members, please take your seats. Honourable Kgathi! Order! Honourable Members, I have received a letter today; February the 12<sup>th</sup> 2019 and it reads as follows;

“Dear Speaker,

Resignation from position of Opposition Whip- Myself

This communication serves to inform your office of my resignation from the Opposition Whip position with immediate effect. I am grateful to my colleagues for the confidence they showed in me by electing me to the position, but the current political development within the opposition ranks makes my continuation in that position untenable. I wish my successor to be all the best in his new role. Thank you.

Yours sincerely,

Gilbert Shimane Mangole”

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Applause!) ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Procedure.

**MR SPEAKER:** No! No! No procedures Honourable Kgathi, switch off the microphone (mic).

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Thank you sir...

**MR SPEAKER:** Switch off and sit down. Honourable Members, those are the two announcements I had. Now, let us continue our business with questions.

## QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER

### EXISTENCE OF GABORONE INSTITUTE OF PROFESSIONAL STUDIES (GIPS) FACULTY OF TECHNOLOGY IN PHAKALANE

**MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** asked the Minister of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology to state:

- (i) if Government is aware of the existence of Gaborone Institute of Professional Studies (GIPS) Faculty of Technology in Phakalane;
- (ii) whether the environment at the Institute is conducive for technical learning;
- (iii) if he is aware that the faculty has been operational for the past four years without proper learning equipment; and
- (iv) what is being done to address this situation.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF TERTIARY EDUCATION, RESEARCH, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (MR MOLAO):** Thank you Mr Speaker.

(i) Mr Speaker, the Government is aware of the existence of Gaborone Institute of Professional Studies (GIPS), Faculty of Technology in Phakalane. The campus offers the following learning programmes which were approved under the old accreditation system of the Tertiary Education Council (TEC); Advanced Diploma in Automotive Electrical Engineering, Advanced Diploma in Motor Vehicle, Body Repair and Refinishing and Advanced Diploma in Diesel Plant Engineering.

(ii) Mr Speaker, for the learning environment to be considered conducive, the following key requirements need to be met:

- The content of the programmes has to be aligned to the industry needs and has to match the level of the programme;
- Qualified academic and support staff have to be in place.
- Equipment for practical sessions has to be available to allow the learners to implement the theory that is delivered in the lectures; and
- The learning space (classrooms, air circulation, toilets etc.) has to be sufficient, taking into account the number of students enrolled.

I wish to indicate that the Botswana Qualifications Authority (BQA) undertook an audit exercise at GIPS Phakalane on 21<sup>st</sup> November 2018, and another one is scheduled end of February 2019. The November 2018 audit whose scope covered only one programme; Advanced Diploma in Diesel Plant Engineering, has established the following:

- The content for the Advanced Diploma in Diesel Plant Engineering programme meets the requirements set.
- The staff engaged for the three learning programmes are qualified to teach as they have Bachelor’s degrees in the relevant fields.
- The equipment provided by the institution for the Advanced Diploma in Diesel Plant Engineering is inadequate.



- The classrooms are adequate and are air-conditioned. However, there is need to improve the learning space in the workshops.

On the basis of the above, the Authority concluded that the learning environment for the advanced Diploma in Diesel Plant Engineering is partially conducive due to the related equipment issues.

- (iii) Mr Speaker, the institution only started offering the mentioned programmes in 2016, which is only three years back. As I have already stated, the equipment provided for Advanced Diploma in Diesel Plant Engineering is not adequate.
- (iv) The Authority, having established that there is non-compliance regarding the delivery of the learning programmes offered by GIPS at the Phakalane Campus, directed the ETP on the 29<sup>th</sup> January 2019 to submit a corrective action plan, whose implementation will be monitored by the Authority. The Authority is awaiting the submission of the plan. The Authority will further audit the other programmes which were not covered in the first audit being Advanced Diploma in Automotive Electrical Engineering; Advanced Diploma in Motor Vehicle, Body Repair and Refinishing. The Authority is currently putting up a team of subject experts to start auditing these programmes by end of this month, February 2019. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Supplementary. I thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Minister, do you think you using the right words to say there is an equipment for Advanced Diploma in Diesel mechanic, whilst you know that those students do practicals and the course equipment for Advanced Diploma in Diesel Mechanic is not there. Lastly, is it right for you to come to this House and tell Batswana and this House that the school has equipment knowing very well that those students use the vehicles that they took from their parents; when you know that the school does not have any equipment and that you are the only one who can go and identify it because it is there at the Phakalane warehouse?

**MR MOLAO:** Mr Speaker, in the body of my answer I said an audit was undertaken in November 2018, which established that there was equipment shortage. They concluded that the learning environment is partially not conducive to deliver the programmes. Hence, the Authority has directed the school as at January this

year for them to present a corrective plan, which the Authority will measure as to how they are compensating for the shortages that have been established within their institutions. In addition, the Authority at the end of this month, February, will be going back to the same institution with a team of experts, to go and conduct further audit on the subjects or at the same institution so that we may ultimately ensure that everything is corrected and put in place. I thought that qualifies the questions from the Honourable Minister that we have admitted that not all equipment that is desirable is in place.

**MR KESUPILE:** Supplementary. Let me thank you Mr Speaker. I want to ask the Honourable Member if they ever question the students when they inspect the institution because some of these institutions have got a habit of borrowing the equipment just to disguise during the inspection. From there after the inspection is complete they return them to the owners and return to their old system.

**MR MOLAO:** It is really difficult for me to admit the practice that the Honourable is talking about. The only thing that I can admit is that, during audit the students are normally given the chance to comment or air their views. When this audit is done, the students came, at first they came to my office and went to BQA to go and lodge a complaint that forced BQA to go and audit. Mostly they were attending to the complaints which were expressed by the students.

#### **UPDATE ON THE POSITION OF OPERATIONS AND MARKETING MANAGER AT HASKINS (PTY) LTD HELD BY AN EXPATRIATE**

**MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** asked the Minister of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development how long the position of Operations and Marketing Manager at Haskins (Pty) Ltd has been held by an expatriate; and to state:

- (i) if there are no qualified Batswana for the position;
- (ii) what qualifications the current manager holds which Batswana do not possess; and
- (iii) why the work permit of the manager was approved despite there being Batswana with similar or better qualifications and work experience.



**MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT, LABOUR PRODUCTIVITY AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT (MR MABEO):** Thank you very much Mr Speaker and good afternoon.

Mr Speaker, the position of the Operations and Marketing Manager was held by an expatriate from August 2003 until December 2011 when the position was removed from the structure of the company.

- (i) Mr Speaker, the position for Operations and Marketing Manager no longer exists in the company. As such the position cannot be localised.
- (ii) The non-citizen who held the position was promoted to Director-Agricultural Business Development in 2012. The incumbent holds a Bachelor of Commerce with 30 years' work experience.
- (iii) Prior to his promotion to the position of a Director, the incumbent was granted a work permit from August 2003 until December 2011. The incumbent was also granted a work permit as Director-Agricultural Business Development from January 2012 until December 2018. In all these cases, the company had demonstrated that they could not get a suitable local to do the job. Upon renewal of his permit, the Regional Immigrants Selection Board rejected the application on the 16<sup>th</sup> November 2018. The company then lodged an appeal which was also rejected on the 21<sup>st</sup> January 2019 for the reasons that the employer does not show any commitment to localise the position. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Supplementary. I thank you Mr Speaker. I thank you Minister. Do you not see anything sinister that the Haskins (Pty) Ltd is doing, for they took a position of the Operations and Marketing Manager and changed it to become Director-Agriculture Research, wanting the same person to do the same job that he was doing? Holding the Operations and Marketing Manager position? What have you done Minister to qualify that indeed that person is no longer holding the position of Operations and Marketing Manager?

**MR MABEO:** I thank you Honourable Nkaigwa, Haskins. In the body of my answer Mr Speaker, at the end, it is evident that a permit was requested for that employee.

**MR SPEAKER:** It is called 'teseletso' Honourable Member in Setswana.

**MR MABEO:** Pardon me Mr Speaker. I had a problem with coming up with that word. It seems like the permit was rejected at the Regional Selection Board. They appealed it with the Minister, meaning myself and I denied him the permit. We are talking about the things that happened in January 21<sup>st</sup> 2019. Therefore, I thought this issue was closed. As for conspiracy Mr Speaker, I do not know and I cannot really know what caused them to restructure as such; maybe that is what the company deemed appropriate to work for the company. Thank you Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Supplementary.

**MR SPEAKER:** Let it be the last one, we do not have time Honourable Members.

**MR REATILE:** Supplementary. Thank you Mr Speaker. I thank the Minister for the explanations that he just gave us. Minister, how much are you trying to ensure that when you give these Chief Operations Managers licenses, there are Batswana who understudy those positions such that at the end of their contracts there are Batswana who are ready to take over? How many Batswana understudies have you confirmed?

**MR MABEO:** Mr Speaker, our procedure is such that as they make permit applications, we want them to show us their plan especially for foreigners. We want them to show us what they intend to do to ensure that going forward, the job can be done by Batswana; localization and training plans. So we request them to present those when they apply for permits. Apart from that, when there is something suspicious at the time of application, we send a delegation to check if what they are saying is true. Mostly when we find that what they are saying is not true, we reject the permit. Thank you Mr Speaker.

#### **ECONOMIC STIMULUS PROGRAMME (ESP) PROJECTS AT DITSWELETSE JUNIOR SECONDARY SCHOOL**

**MR S. LELATISITSWE (BOTETI EAST):** asked the Minister of Basic Education to update this Honourable House on the Economic Stimulus Programme (ESP) projects to be carried out at Ditsweletse Junior Secondary School (JSS) and to state:

- (i) the scope of the ESP project;
- (ii) reasons for the delay in delivering the project in the Financial Year 2018/2019;
- (iii) when the school management or regional office will be made aware of the projects; and
- (iv) when the projects will be delivered and their impact.



**MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (MR ARONE):** Thank you Mr Speaker.

- (i) Mr Speaker, it is true that under Economic Stimulus Programme (ESP), my ministry planned to undertake an expansion project at Ditsweletse Junior School which included additional six classrooms and a science laboratory.
- (ii) The original plan was to execute the project using cost effective non-conventional materials and the project was tendered for through Expression of Interest (EIO) during 2018/2019 financial year. Though there was an overwhelming response from bidders, all the bidders failed to pre-qualify at compliance stage of evaluation as they did not provide proof of certification that such materials can be used in a commercial setup and as such the tender could not proceed.
- (iii) My ministry is currently exploring options of fast-tracking the re-tender for the project to be implemented during the 2019/2020 financial year.
- (iv) Mr Speaker, my ministry does communicate ministry plans with our stakeholders in the region and this includes expansion plans and updates on the expansion of Ditsweletse Junior School project. The construction of the additional classrooms will help alleviate the current shortage experienced in Ditsweletse Junior School. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR LELATISITWE:** Supplementary. Minister, I hear your answer. I guess you are aware of the situation at Ditsweletse since the closure of the BCL and if I recall very well, it is like there was a dining hall in the initial project and as I hear you now, you are saying that it is not there. Have you decided that it is no longer needed at Ditsweletse? When should we expect this to be done since you are new in the Ministry?

**MR ARONE:** Thank you very much Honourable Member. Let me say this Mr Speaker, that I have admitted in the past when answering these questions that most of these schools have been affected and we are classifying them as hotspots. Obviously there will be new... based on the outcome of our discussions at the moment; we would then be able to communicate what we are going to do in the shortest period to find response to the issues. We are aware of them Mr Speaker.

**EMPLOYMENT OF PEOPLE LIVING WITH ALBINISM AND OTHER DISABILITIES UNDER THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS**

**MR M. R. REATILE (SPECIALLY ELECTED):** asked the Minister of Health and Wellness:

- (i) how many people living with albinism and other disabilities are employed under his ministry and the breakdown by district, date of employment and gender;
- (ii) if the number meets the country's target of the United Nations (UN) Sustainable Development Goal (SDGs) Number 8: decent work and economic growth by 2030, to promote inclusive and sustainable economic growth, employment and decent work for all; and if not,
- (iii) when the target will be met for compliance;
- (iv) to state if the sunscreen used by people living with albinism is available in all the clinics across Botswana; and if not; why.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR G. B. BUTALE):** Thank you Mr Speaker.

- (i) Mr Speaker, my ministry does not keep a database of employees on the basis of their disability and is therefore unable to respond to how many employees in our employ have albinism and other disabilities by district, date of employment and gender.
- (ii) Mr Speaker, the recruitment strategy of the ministry does not include a deliberate move towards recruiting the said groups but rather we recruit as per qualifications and competencies for each cadre. The process is inclusive for as long as the job seeker meets minimum requirements for the job.
- (iii) The ministry therefore has not set out a plan to meet the target.
- (iv) Sunscreen used by people living with albinism is included in the Central Medical Stores (CMS) list and can be ordered and/or requested by all clinics and hospitals in Botswana. It is prescribed by both general nurses and doctors. Thank you Mr Speaker.



### CURBING THE IMPORTATION OF POOR QUALITY GOODS

**MR B. M. MOLEBATSİ (MOCHUDI EAST):** asked the Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry what Botswana Bureau of Standards (BOBS) is doing to assist in curbing the importation of poor quality goods such as corrugated iron sheets that are easily damaged by heavy rains and hail storms into Botswana.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MR GOYA):** Thank you Mr Speaker. My ministry through the Botswana Bureau of Standards (BOBS) is responsible for developing national or Botswana Standards based on regional and/or international standards, where they exist. There are two types of standards: voluntary standards which are not mandatory, and compulsory standards which are obligatory and are made for products and services that are likely to affect the health and safety of people, animals and the environment. These are enforceable by law and are provided for in the Standards Act. In exceptional circumstances where standards for certain commodities do not exist in other relevant jurisdictions, standards are initiated with the involvement of technical expertise from the industry. This approach is adopted to ensure a balance of interests in the Technical Committees that assist BOBS in the development of these standards.

In this regard, two Botswana national standards were developed in 2017 as voluntary standards; these being, BOS 726:2017 galvanized steel (plain and corrugated) sheets and BOS 669:2017 aluminium alloy corrugated and troughed sheet. However, no local manufacturer has applied for certification to these standards as yet.

Mr Speaker, it is the expectation of my ministry that once the national standards are available, any procurement entity, both private and public, desirous to use products covered by these standards will ensure that the products being procured and used do comply to these standards. It is for this reason that my ministry has not placed these products on the list of prescribed standards and regulated products. Consequently, these cannot be subjected to the Standards (Import Inspection) Regulations. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR NTLHAILE:** Supplementary. Minister, it is now clear Minister. Let me understand this, does your Government not see it fitting to protect Botswana especially since we are talking about issues that have to do with accommodation and shelter. Do you not think it is vital that we use international standards in this situation, since we do not have the national standard for Botswana?

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MR GOYA):** Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you my colleague. In my response I stated that the ones that my colleague is talking about fall under voluntary standards, as such the one who is selling them has the responsibility of ensuring that, he protects the lives of Botswana like the Honourable Member asked, whether private or public. If you are selling them, then responsibility lies with you to find a way of protecting the lives of Botswana; the procuring entity.

**MR MOLEBATSİ:** Supplementary. Thank you Mr Speaker. Minister, did I hear you clearly when you said the responsibility lies with those selling the goods that endanger the lives of Botswana, you as Government are not accountable, Botswana can just die? These corrugated iron that I am referring which were damaged by either hail or rainfall, endangered the lives of Botswana in the constituency starting from Ramotlabaki up to Artesia. These corrugated iron were for sale. It is best you give up ruling if you are failing to...

**MR SPEAKER:** No, now what are you doing.

**MR GOYA:** Mr Speaker, even though I did not understand the question very well, I can respond by saying, I explained to the Honourable Member the standards that these corrugated iron fall under. That is why I told him that it is the responsibility of the one who is selling them to ensure that they are safe. If those who bought them have a problem, they should go back to the seller and tell him that the corrugated iron did not...or they pose a certain kind of danger. The responsibility will then lie with the one who sold them. That is what I am elaborating. Thank you.

### TRAINING OF ENGINEERS BY DEBSWANA DIAMOND COMPANY (PTY) LTD, MORUPULE COLLIERY AND BOTASH

**MR M. R. REATILE (SPECIALLY ELECTED):** asked the Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security to state the number of engineers sent for further studies at Masters level or specialisation for the past five years by Debswana Diamond Company (Pty) Ltd, Morupule Colliery and Botash; and if not, why.

**MINISTER OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY (MR MOLALE):** Mr Speaker, neither Debswana Diamond Company, Morupule Coal Mine or Botswana Ash, has sent engineers for further studies or postgraduate



specialisation in the past five years. However, the companies have financial assistance policies through which employees are encouraged and assisted to pursue self-development programmes including postgraduate studies.

The reason these companies do not undertake training in postgraduate specialisation courses is that the principal qualification requirements for professional engineering roles is a bachelor's degree. Specialisation in the various fields such as Electrical Engineering, Mechanical Engineering, Civil Engineering, Structural Engineering, or Automation and Instrumentation, Rock Mechanics, Mining Engineering, Metallurgy, Chemical Engineering, Process Engineering and other streams is attained at first degree level. All professional engineers (graduates and/or postgraduates) therefore, regardless of level of qualification, have to undergo an on-the-job training, which prepares them for the demands of the roles they have been identified for. The companies do not emphasise higher-level (e.g. Master's Degree) professional progression. The first degree is deemed good enough to create the necessary base or foundation and the major focus thereafter is on building experience and behavioural transformation to drive superior performance. To this end, mining houses generally have robust tools that assist to assess both technical and behavioural competencies with the aim of building a fully-fledged, all-rounded qualified person. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Supplementary. Thank you Honourable Minister. I just wanted to know whether the policy you said these companies have to promote self-development, is a policy that is codified in any document and whether it entails granting employees study leaves or sponsorships? What sort of policy exists? How do they exactly assist in self-development?

**MR MOLALE:** The information I have just given the House is the one that I got from these mining houses, and it is the information which exists as of now. If you need more written information, we will gather it and give it to you. I thank you.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Further supplementary.

**MR SPEAKER:** Last one. We are running out of time, Honourable Keorapetse.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** I hear you Honourable Minister. Just a quick one, do you think it is good for our economy to not have people at postgraduate levels for the disciplines that you have alluded to earlier in your

answer? Why do big companies like these find it fit and just okay to have professionals at the levels of just degrees?

**MR MOLALE:** The point you are raising may be a point for debate, but from my own point of view, additional higher level qualifications would be more required in the areas of research and design and not necessarily in the field of general work like they are doing now. That is why the Government has taken it upon themselves that they will develop some of these cadres right up to PhD level, so that now when they come back to join the mines, they will be at that level where they will perform these non-traditional functions which have to do with research and design and so forth. I thank you Mr Speaker.

#### ASSISTANCE OF ELDERLY PEOPLE AND ESTABLISHMENT OF OLD AGE HOMES

**MR W. B. MMOLOTSI (FRANCISTOWN SOUTH):** asked the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development to state:

- (i) the number of elderly people staying alone with nobody to take care of them in Francistown, Palapye, Selebi-Phikwe, Gaborone and Lobatse;
- (ii) the number of those assisted by Government through social programmes; and
- (iii) when his Ministry intends to establish old age homes or facilities to assist them.

#### ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT

**(MS TSHIRELETSO):** Mr Speaker, the total number of elderly persons staying alone with nobody to take care of them at the said urban areas is 73, broken down as follows:

Francistown	-	24
Palapye	-	5
Selibe Phikwe	-	15
Gaborone	-	7
Lobatse	-	22

Mr Speaker, all these 73 persons are benefitting from the Old-Age Pension Scheme as a universal coverage for all citizens aged 65 years and above. They therefore receive P430.00 on monthly basis. Furthermore, 56 of



these elderly persons receive an additional benefit of both food basket and its associated package of services as well as Destitute Cash Allowance of P250.00 on monthly basis from the Destitution Programme. 14 out of the 15 of these elderly persons staying alone in Selibe Phikwe are beneficiaries of the Destitute Housing Programme.

Mr Speaker, my ministry has no intention to establish Old Age homes, instead we have facilitated the establishment of such facilities by the Private Sector and Civil Society. In this regard, our intention is to draft guidelines for elderly day care centres and old age home to facilitate service provision, pending the drafting of legislation on the same. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Supplementary. Honourable Minister, I think you should clarify this issue to us; in the 10<sup>th</sup> Parliament Honourable Siele pointed out to us that after Parliament passed a Motion that I had presented before it, regarding the building of old age homes; Mr Siele pointed out that the Government was already far ahead regarding the project. He even went to Botswana Television (Btv) to feature in a programme called Molemo wa Kgang and he informed the nation that they have already started, and that there are some houses that they would like to start with in Gaborone. Therefore, Honourable Minister, maybe you should clarify what you mean when you say you will facilitate the private sector.

The second question is that, you have just informed us that some parents are assisted with the P250 destitute allowance; my point is, have you not realised yet that this allowance is no longer valuable at all, hence it needs to be seriously looked into?

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Mr Speaker, I am not quite sure about the Molemo wa Kgang television programme issue, but I remember responding to questions along those lines, that were asked by some Members enquiring when we were going to build an old age home. However, we have been explaining to them, because for instance yesterday, one of the Leaders of Opposition said, it is Honourable Gaolathe; he said we are not supposed to put everything on the shoulders of Government. For some of the things we need to come up with ideas as people. In any case, as Government, we think having old age homes is a good idea; we need to give it to the private sector to carry it out because they have the necessary expertise to do so. I know we once had a certain house that we were given, but unfortunately, we did not follow

through with the idea. We then thought we should give others a chance to carry through with this project and do it to the best of their abilities.

On the second one, you had asked about the elderly who are aged 65. Well, we also give them the old age pension, and then we add the P250 on top. However, just as we are considering other allowances, we do agree with you that it is too minimal, and as there are adjustments, the P250 will also be increased. But basically the P250 was just for toiletries because all the food items such as the flour, maize meal and tea would have already been bought, and we would just be thinking they need to buy some toiletries as a way of boosting their dignity; as I said we have built houses for some of them. I thank you.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Further supplementary.

**MR SPEAKER:** We do not have time, so that is the last one Honourable Mmolotsi.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Yes, but Honourable Minister, you are not coming out quite clearly on the issue of Ministry of Local Government, which made an undertaking in this very House that they were starting that project. To prove that they were indeed on it, Honourable Siele was featured at Molemo wa Kgang and he explained to Batswana how they were going to commence this programme. So I was saying you should inform us whether you have abandoned it completely or what is going on? Therefore, when you say you do not understand the one concerning Molemo wa Kgang, I am not sure about that because even then you were still the Assistant Minister at Local Government.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Well, I am unmovable when it comes to being an Assistant Minister; I am untouchable here. What I am simply saying is that I was not watching Molemo wa Kgang then, hence I am not aware whether he said that or not. What I can say for sure is that I do not remember that sitting, but if there was an answer to that effect, you could furnish me with it. In any case, I seldom watch or listen to programmes such as Molemo wa Kgang. Thank you.

#### **DELAY IN OPENING OF MAHALAPYE CENTRAL POLICE STATION FOR COMMUNITY SERVICE**

**MR J. MOLEFE (MAHALAPYE WEST):** asked the Minister of Defence, Justice and Security if he is aware that Central Police Station at Mahalapye has not been open for community services since its refurbishment; and if so,



- (i) when the police station will be open for community service;
- (ii) to state the cause of delay; and further state;
- (iii) when the police station will be provided with vehicles.

**MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR KGATHI):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Let us thank Honourable Mangole, a man of principle does what you just did.

- (i) Mr Speaker, I am aware that the Mahalapye Central Police Station has not been open for community service since its refurbishment. However, I am pleased to indicate that the office is planned to be opened for community service in July 2019.
- (ii) The project was delayed by the necessary improvements such as enhancing the security of the armoury, provision of a standby generator, expansion of the registry office and improving for accessibility into the station by people living with disability, which include provision of a ramp, handrails and ablution facilities. The variations, which were not part of the original scope, have resulted in cost variation and procurement processes. In this context, the project variation works were commissioned on the 25<sup>th</sup> of January 2019 and the site was handed over to the contractor on the 30<sup>th</sup> of January 2019 and works commenced on the 11<sup>th</sup> of February 2019 and it is anticipated to take four months.
- (iii) Once the station is completed and handed over to the Botswana Police Service (BPS) for use, all operational resources including vehicles will be available. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Mmatli! Okay, he is not here. Let us go back to question number two by Honourable Kebonang. Who will take questions for Honourable Kebonang?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I will take question number two.

**MR SPEAKER:** It seems Honourable Majaga is the one who has been assigned to assist. Honourable Moswaane, for Honourable Kebonang.

#### **GOVERNMENT DECISION NOT TO SELL MORUPULE COAL POWER PLANT**

**MR S. KEBONANG (LOBATSE):** asked the Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security:

- (i) to confirm whether Government has reneged from its earlier decision not to sell Morupule Coal Power Plant; and if so:
- (ii) to state the reasons for such change of heart; and
- (iii) when an open and competitive tender that will see citizens participating in the acquisition of Morupule Coal Power Plant will be floated.

**MINISTER OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY (MR MOLALE):** Thank you Mr Speaker. I assume that by Morupule Coal Power Plant, the Honourable Member for Lobatse, since he is never available in Parliament, is referring to Morupule B Power Station. On that understanding, I wish to respond as follows:

- (i) Government has not reneged on selling the Morupule B Power Station. Instead, as with other Government-owned assets, the Government wishes to keep its options open on the plant, and will continue to review the strategic and economic case for divestiture from the asset; focus has for now been on remediation of the major defects to restore usability and value. The case for divestiture at the time was for the Chinese company that built the power station to buy back and pay back to Government, all loans and matters incidental and material thereto. No other investor would or was interested to buy at prime, whilst acquiring a defective plant.
- (ii) There is therefore no change of heart. This is an evolving but sensitive issue that has to be handled with care.
- (iii) Mr Speaker, if and when Government decides to divest of its financial interest in Morupule B Power Station, it will also, depending on the strategic and economic rationale, decide on the most prudent method of such divestiture in accordance with the law. As it is Government policy to facilitate meaningful participation of citizens in the economy, I can assure the Honourable Member that citizen economic empowerment will be at the time be factored into that decision.

We still have a power deficit. We have gone to tender for alternative sources of energy and citizen participation has been and is being encouraged outright or through joint ventures. I thank you Mr Speaker.



**MR MMOLOTSI:** Supplementary. Minister, are you in a position to update this House on the performance of the plant as of now?

**MR MOLALE:** At this moment, I am not but I can do that.

**MR NTLHAILE:** Further supplementary. Honourable Minister, maybe you should elaborate further to this House when you intend to complete the care and maintenance programme that the Government is focusing on currently, how long it is going to take?

**MR MOLALE:** Mr Speaker, it is not care and maintenance, it is remediation, remedying the defects that were identified at the time the plant was handed over. Each unit will take 12 months, the first unit we have started on it, and we are expected to have it back in operation by next year. 12 months from September, that is, August next year then they will start on the second and so forth and so forth. The interesting thing for the Honourable Member is to know that this remediation is at the cost of the company and the Chinese that built the plant. It is not at the cost of Government. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Further supplementary, the last one.

**MR SPEAKER:** We do not have time.

#### REGULATION OF ELECTRICITY PRICES

**MR P. MAJAGA (NATA-GWETA):** asked the Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security if he will consider coming up with a model to regulate the increase of electricity prices in the country and state:

- (i) why power connection is still expensive in Botswana than in other countries in the region;
- (ii) if it is true that Botswana still owes some companies that were hired to construct power stations by Botswana Power Corporation (BPC), and
- (iii) when the power shortage crisis will be resolved.

**MINISTER OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY (MR MOLALE):** Mr Speaker, electricity in Botswana is regulated through the Botswana Energy Regulatory Authority Act in conjunction with the Electricity Supply Act and the Botswana Power Corporation Act.

All this covers generation, transmission, distribution and sale of electricity. Botswana Energy Regulatory Authority, for instance, is responsible for ensuring that tariffs in the regulated sector are fixed on the basis of a tariff methodology that has been set up in a transparent manner, taking into account Government Policy on cross subsidisation.

Botswana's electricity tariffs compare favourably in the region, when compared to other power utilities. As an example, Botswana's current average tariffs stand at 104 thebe/kWh compared to Namibia's average tariff of 170 thebe/kWh. Other countries with higher tariffs in the region than Botswana include Tanzania, Swaziland and Zimbabwe. Countries whose main source of generation is hydro based like Zambia would ordinarily have a lower tariff compared to Botswana due to the low cost of hydro generation facilities.

Mr Speaker, Botswana does not owe any companies that were hired by Botswana Power Corporation (BPC) to construct any power station. What we owe at Morupule B are bank loans that we borrowed to finance the project, we are not owing any company other than those banks that I am talking about.

Mr Speaker, currently there is adequate power supply to meet the Country's demand from the domestic generation facilities. The local generation facilities are supplemented through picking plants; one in Orapa and the other in Matshelagabedi and also supplemented through power imports. Measures are in place to gradually reduce reliance on power imports through the return of Morupule A to commercial operation and defects remediation of Morupule B Power Station.

Lastly Mr Speaker, ordinarily, there should be no power crisis but when inefficiencies creep in, this manifest themselves into a crisis. For example, when constructing power lines, there should be gadgets commonly referred to as auto-reclosers which should be installed along the power lines so that they should be able to isolate a part of a power line that has a fault at any given time. Without such, the whole line easily gets disabled and therefore rendering the whole line without power to the rest of the places that are fed by that line. I have noted that sir and BPC are going to do the needful to make sure that this does not happen as we did see it happen over the Christmas holiday. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Supplementary.



**MR SPEAKER:** The time for questions has elapsed but I will allow brief supplementaries.

**MR NTLHAILE:** Minister, your answers make sense Sir, even though electricity is not as expensive in Botswana as it is in Namibia and other countries you have mentioned, do you not consider it important for Government to continue with the development of the 100 kilowatts solar plant which was planned for around Jwaneng-Mabutsane? This will be an attempt to reduce the prices for electricity so that they match the cost of setting up manufacturing in Botswana because right now electricity is still expensive.

**MR MOLALE:** Mr Speaker, it is true that we are going to construct a 100 megawatts solar power plant but the rationale along which the question is asked does not hold because solar power is more expensive than thermal power that we are generating at Morupule. As long as the price remains above that of the thermal power generation, it will not be something that we can say will then offset the higher prices that are alleged under thermal power. I do appreciate...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MR MOLALE:** Look, the AK47 failed you...

**MR SPEAKER:** No Honourable Molale, focus on the question quickly so that we move on. Leave those who are disturbing you.

**MR MOLALE:** Sir, we are quite mindful of the fact that the prices of renewal energy are continuously going down but as at this point, they are still above those of thermal power. I must, as I will be telling this House during my Committee of Supply Speech, we are beginning to focus more on the renewable energy side to try and complement the power supply that we have. I thank you Mr Speaker.

### QUESTION WITHOUT NOTICE

#### ACUTE WATER SHORTAGE IN NKANGE CONSTITUENCY DURING THE PAST FESTIVE SEASON

**MR E. J. BATSHU (NKANGE):** asked the Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services to state:

- (i) reasons for the acute water shortage in the Nkange Constituency, particularly Tutume, Matobo, Goshwe, Senete and other villages during the past festive season; and
- (ii) if it is true that there is a looming retrenchment at the Water Utilities Corporation (WUC) and whether he can rule out the possibility of sabotage as a result of inherent disgruntlement in the organisation.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LAND MANAGEMENT, WATER AND SANITATION SERVICES (MR MOIPISI):** Mr Speaker,

- (i) Water supply interruption in the Nkange Constituency villages that occurred in December 2018 was due to pipe blockages created by calcrete siltation and BPC power outages.

**Table 1. VILLAGES IN NKANGE CONSTITUENCY THAT EXPERIENCED WATER OUTAGE DURING FESTIVE**

No	Village	Date of Interruption	Cause	S o l u t i o n / Action	Date resolved
1	Maitengwe	24 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 14.50hrs	Power outage (8 hours)	Power restored	24 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 22.55hrs
2	Dagwi				
3	Nkange				
4	Changate				
5	Senete	24 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 14.50hrs	Power outage (8 hours)	Power restored	24 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 22.55hrs



6	Tutume	17 – 19 <sup>th</sup> December 2018	Pipe blockage at Mangana ward	Pipe replacement	19 <sup>th</sup> December 2018
		19 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 19.43hrs	Power outage (5 hours)	Power restored	20 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 00.45hrs
		20 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 15.50hrs	Power outage (4 hours)	Power restored	20 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 19.45hrs
		24 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 14.50hrs	Power outage (8 hours)	Power restored	24 <sup>th</sup> Dec 2018 @ 22.55hrs
7	Goshwe	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 24<sup>th</sup> Dec 2018</li> <li>• 30<sup>th</sup> Dec 2018</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Power outage (8 hours)</li> <li>• 300mm pipe mains failure</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• P o w e r restored</li> <li>• Pipe restored</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 24th Dec 2018 @ 22.55hrs</li> <li>• 31st Dec 2018</li> </ul>
8	Matobo				
9	Makuta				
10	Nswazwi				

The long term solution to addressing water insecurity in Tutume Sub District is to connect the constituency to Ntimbale Dam through the North East District-Tutume Sub District Water Supply Project. Design stage for this project was completed in December 2018 and Tender Documentation for construction was finalized in January 2019. Consultant is currently in preparation to procure contractor to commence construction phase by June 2019.

- (ii) Mr Speaker, Water Utilities Corporation (WUC) has a restructuring project that has been going on for over 2 years. It commenced in September 2016 and expected to end on the 30<sup>th</sup> November 2019. The purpose of restructuring is to ensure the correct job fit/match, improve core processes and to have a more customer centric organization. The implementation of the new structure has commenced and as is the case with most restructuring exercises, some people will be retrenched. However, the overall number of employees will not change significantly because WUC's objective is not to reduce numbers.

Mr Speaker, as per the response to question (i), the water shortages arising from power outages and blockage of pipes by calcrete siltation cannot be associated with acts of sabotage by the Corporation employees since the causes of water shortages could not be influenced by WUC employees. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR BATSHU:** Supplementary. Thank you so much Honourable Minister for a very honest answer, but two questions; because of the power outages which impact on your services, do you propose to have your own standby generators so that when the power fails, water can always be supplied? Lastly, because of the magnitude of the problem as you see it arising from the quality of the water that goes through the pipes, would you like to consider fast-tracking the delivery of water services from Ntimbale dam to avoid these pipe blockages that are caused by the bad quality of water? Thank you.

**MR MOIPISI:** Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. Yes, indeed the standby generators are a good idea, but the problem with the generators Honourable Member with due respect, is that if we have 20 dams for example, each dam will require its own generator, so, that poses risks related to security, vandalism, etcetera, etcetera. That would mean doing that for the whole country. So, surely it is economically a challenge.

The other question on the quality of the water and whether indeed we are working on the water transfer; the North East District Tutume Sub-District water supply project. Yes, indeed that is ongoing. As we have always indicated, the long term solution to addressing water insecurity in Tutume Sub-District is to connect the constituency to Ntimbale dam through the North East District Tutume Sub-District water supply project. Design stage for this project was completed in December 2018, and tender documentation for construction was finalised in January this year. Consultant is currently in preparation to procure contractor to commence construction phase by June 2019. So, indeed we are fast-tracking it. I thank you Mr Speaker.



**APPROPRIATION (2019/2020) BILL,  
2019 (NO. 1 OF 2019)**

**Second Reading**

**(Resumed Debate)**

**MR SPEAKER:** Order Honourable Members! Honourable France, call Honourable Moswaane. I want him to come and take his seat. Honourable Venson-Moitoi, go back to your seat. Order Honourable Members! Order! I thought that Honourable Moswaane is speaking to someone on the phone because I saw him going outside carrying a phone. Honourable Members, we are resuming the debate on this Bill. When the House proceedings were suspended yesterday due to air conditioner failure, nobody was on the floor debating. The floor is open.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT**

**(MS TSHIRELETSO):** Thank you Mr Speaker. I would like to thank His Honour the Vice President of Botswana Mr Slumber Tsogwane before thanking the Minister. We recently encountered a heart breaking tragedy at my Constituency where three children under the age of ten years died. That incident hit me hard as a leader because just days before it happened one child also died the same death. The government of Botswana comforted and stood by us during that time. Honourable Arone who is the Minister of Education and His Honor the Vice President came to offer their condolences, when one is grieving they deserve to be comforted, so keep it up your Honour. I am saying this because I have worked with you and I know that you are a respectful and loving man who has good relations with people. When I submitted your condolences, Shakawe people asked me to come and thank you on their behalf. It is within our Setswana culture to attend funerals therefore I am grateful that you and the President are doing that.

Minister Matambo, this is a big year of elections and you had so much zeal when giving the budget speech. We were enjoying that because you were also enjoying it. You spoke freely.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** He was enjoying.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** You have a huge responsibility of managing the public funds. It is not easy but when you are just talking, it seems easy. It is not easy to have the responsibility of allocating the budget of a nation to different ministries; Ministry of Health, Ministry of Roads, Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development and so on, though some might think it is.

I am happy that the democracy that we enjoy in Botswana was changed by Honourable Boko; Leader of the Opposition, coming with his ideas. I want to thank Botswana Democratic Party for having given him the attention, when he came while you were presenting, he was captured making funny faces but we listened to him because we like to hear what they have to say.

Honourable Ndaba Gaolathe was also given a chance and he came up with ideas. I want to thank our BDP government because it is not easy and not often ... we watch in other countries like the State of the Nation Address (SONA) in South Africa which was presented on Thursday by the President. Thereafter, we have not seen Leader of the Opposition or even of the Minority being given a chance to respond.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** What are you saying? Let me give you a chance.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MR NKAIGWA:** Clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Minister. No, Minister, all countries after the Minister or President finishes presenting his or her Budget, other opposition parties are also given an opportunity to present their position. What I am trying to explain is that you cannot say this Minister because ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I am talking about State of the Nation Address.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Minister, you cannot say that because that is a practice carried out everywhere. We were wondering why the BDP government is not carrying out that practice. Why do you refuse to give us television coverage as Honourable Members?

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Thank you. I am saying State of the Nation Address was presented recently. I have appreciated Ndaba. I do not know what he is talking about. Did you not hear me appreciating?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Was I not clear when I said I appreciate that ... I then went on to say, just recently we witnessed State of the Nation Address; I am now reverting to the leaders of the country. In addressing it, I expressed my satisfaction. Let me leave it at that



because he is delaying me; he does not understand me. I was talking about other countries that unlike them, after State of the Nation Address they are given a chance to respond; he is talking about Budget. I normally see other neighbouring countries fighting. When one tries to talk, they will be taken out before being given a chance to debate. As politicians, we watch and listen. I am already done with Honourable Gaolathe's issue. That is the democracy we want. Instead of appreciating the coverage of your leaders on live television ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Forget about that. He cannot gossip about me, he is a child. In continuing let me say, ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** ... (Laughter!) ... Again the Budget that Honourable Matambo presented here is ... Yes, that is the reason why when you try to talk about his leader, Honourable Ndaba Gaolathe, and then someone just rises and interrupts you and you even fail to appreciate the person that he likes which means that he does not like him. Let me advice you that you are not supposed to do that. When I talk about Honourable Gaolathe and Honourable Boko and you are an opposition member, you should not interrupt me. Right now I did not say anything; I have moved on, maybe I would have said something that you are not aware of.

This is His Excellency's Mokgweetsi Masisi's first Budget. I want to explain to this House that in preparation of the Budget, most of the ideas come from the President. The President of this country who will never allow a Budget to be presented here without having been briefed on what he will say to Batswana. We want to say that we are hopeful that with the input from President Mokgweetsi Masisi, we are going somewhere as a Government. Honourable Members, we are in a year in which we need to promise Batswana a lot. I would like to appreciate you Honourable Matambo for such leadership that we have in Botswana. You called Budget Pitso as the Finance Minister. You once invited people from the Council Minister. Tomorrow one, anyway let me not talk too much, I want Honourable Matambo to listen.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** When you talk about a person and they are busy talking, you do not know what to do because we are saying we support the Budget. When I talk, there is no problem because I am a nobody but when as a Minister we comment on what you said ...

Mr Speaker, let me request ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** What are you saying; we do not understand you.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** No, I am done with it.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Are you scolding Honourable Matambo?

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I am not scolding anyone. I am addressing Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** As we are going for elections, we must check what we have for Batswana. That is what I was saying. I want to say to Honourable Matambo that, the Budget he presented has good benefits for us as Batswana.

The main issue that I want us to comment on is unemployment. All of us who spoke here, Minister Matambo, Honourable Boko, Honourable Gaolathe; the issue that we are decrying especially us who are in power because we have a burden, we are in trouble. Pains are felt by an expecting mother. Any other person does not understand anything. Our colleagues from across the aisle are talking but they are looking at us. Everyone is looking at the rulers.

The issue of unemployment requires us to move quickly and see how we can deal with it. I want to mention that we can face unemployment differently. There are different special programmes such as Poverty Eradication but we can approach it differently because we wasted a lot of funds on people who know nothing about business. We gave people chickens; they died from Newcastle disease and only chicken coops remain. We financed them for tuckshops; they are closed, only buildings remain. I am not saying we are wrong; we were trying to help. Unfortunately, they used stock to entertain visitors and the profit is lost. After everything gets finished, that person will not know what to do while we financed him or her. We assisted those in garden business. Right now we know that we have been hit by drought in Botswana, there are no rains. Though we try to save water in Jojo tanks, it gets finished. We also assisted tailors.

As Government, we took an advice to lean more in the direction of cooperatives to assist us. I was impressed while visiting Mauritius, men and women came together to form a cooperative and the Government pitched in to assist as a way of Poverty Eradication. I am not sure if Mauritius is the one on top. I realised that they are trying



by all means though they are an island. They made it in such a way that all the tailors come together in one place. One cuts the pattern, the other one sews on a button and the other one does the finishing touch. They spend the entire day sewing. It can work Minister because in my constituency, Honourable Makgato's constituency and others, there are some tailors whom when asked to sew school uniform they ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Supplementary.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs) ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Laughter!) ...  
Clarification.

**MR LELATISITWE:** Clarification. Thank you so much Honourable Tshireletso. I commend you for your good debate.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MR LELATISITWE:** Honourable Tshireletso. You are hard rock. Okay sorry!

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Lelatisitwe!

**MR LELATISITWE:** Honourable Tshireletso, I am happy with your debate. Do you not think we should therefore start by coming up with an Act instead of policies considering the fact that the public officers do not care about these things?

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** You are telling the truth because... I was indicating that in Mahalapye East, Tswapong, Ramokgonami, Shoshong and other areas, there are tailors there. If we could organize a decent place for these people in Mahalapye and maybe equipment so that they make school uniform for the schools in that area. That could be a good market and Batswana could come and buy uniforms for their children there. Currently we are faced with challenges, people from foreign countries copy our dresses. They have even copied our German print even if it is not of good quality. If we are serious, we could form cooperatives and come up with some sort of 'copyright' to protect our products. Nowadays our German print comes out when washed and they are sold by these mushrooming shops of foreigners. Even if our main aim is to lure them to come and invest in our country, they should however create employment, proper jobs not to come and take the businesses that were supposed to be for Batswana. The German print that Batswana used to sell is gone, they cannot sell it

anymore Honourable Matambo. We therefore have to be careful and make sure that the investors that we lure to this country, do not end up copying our products. If we decide to organise cooperatives for them, they would be able to make different German prints...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** ... that type of fabric... I am not going to allow any clarification; you are wasting my time. We cannot afford clarifications the whole day.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Pardon me Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No, do not be angry at him...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I withdraw; I am not going to entertain any comment...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Tshireletso do not be angry at him, just say denied and then proceed. **MS TSHIRELETSO:** I am not doing that... (Laughter!)...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I am mainly concerned about the rate of poverty that has affected Batswana even though some people live a wealthy life. People copy our products and cross over to their countries and come back with cheap products. This is so because we do not have laws that protect our own products. The tailor businesses that were owned by women have since closed down, it is just a few left because their fabrics and patterns have been stolen by some people. I am not suggesting that we should not work with them...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** They are not even paying tax.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** ... they do not even pay tax. This is why I think we can eradicate poverty, and you will find that at our labour offices, people queue there seeking employment and if you are a Member of Parliament, it is not easy to pass there. The other day I even ran away, wondering how they will react when they see me. There is high rate of unemployment but again our minimum wage is very low. I therefore believe that the idea of reviving the cooperatives could remedy the situation. The other challenge that we are faced with is the people that we have appointed to assist people, there is no monitoring. My concentration is mainly with them.



The other point that I want to raise is that since we have been tasked with poverty eradication, we should maybe organize an area where we will be keeping chickens. This project is currently done by some people. If you are to give a Motswana 10 chickens, if they increase who will buy them?

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** This is one thing that we should talk about in this Parliament without any hesitation. We may create employment if the chicken and goats production is done in a form of cooperatives. We know that some people have already reached the age limit but...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** ... you should be the ones who buy...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** ...

from these people. Instead of copying their idea, you can buy from them. There is another point that I do not want to leave out and I would not talk about it during the presentation of the ministries, I will therefore summarise. We talk of good health for all and we are grateful that we have what we call treat all; of HIV/AIDS. Good health basically means happiness and democracy. Before I retire, there is another issue that I want to raise. It would really break my heart if the Minister responsible could not address the issue of intersex people. I want to speak Russian, I repeat, if you are a Russian, the brainwashing of a person is when you repeatedly talk about one issue over and over again. I am advocating for these people and want the government to take action. When they are born, it should be recorded that they are intersexual. At puberty stage that is when they will have the right to decide which genitalia to retain and which one to forego if they so wish. We should also have appropriate pieces of legislation that will decide the hospitals that we will be doing these surgeries at since we do not have such in Botswana. In the past, we have been doing them in South Africa. The doctors, nurses and parents should work together in this matter and make sure that the intersex people make that decision. The thing is as you grow, you might start developing some beards, the voice might also change...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** ... the voice of a girl. This is why we are saying, since we are a government that cares about the health of our people, we should ensure that these people are given a fair chance. If they grow up like that, some of these people end up bathing at night if they are students; 3 a.m. they shy away from how their fellow students would react. Let us take responsibility...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Elucidation.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** ... as Botswana...

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):**

Elucidation. You should not leave out those who physically look like girls but scientifically inside they are not. Our concentration should not only be on those with two genitalia, also those who are ambiguous.

Lastly, we should make it a smooth transition and avoid taking the matter to court. That should be done privately on the basis of what the health practitioners say.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I thank you very much. I was still going to talk about it because my child was beaten by people in Mahalapye. I thank you Minister. He was assumed to be a boy when he was born, apparently scientifically inside he is a girl and when he grew up he started behaving like a girl. He was beaten the other day in Mogoditshane. These are the things that we are talking about, like Honourable Makgato was implying, some of them even end up in court wanting to change. The legislation should be clear, these people should be given the right to live like me and you and enjoy their rights. They are denied children's rights, they do not have that right...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** ... because they are ... are you saying clarification, I am not going to yield, so forget it.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Lastly...

**MR MOLEBATSI:** On a point of elucidation Mr Speaker. Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Tshireletso. You are debating so well, but jealousy will disadvantage you. It is necessary that as Parliament, we should take this transgender issue seriously so that these people can also live well and be accepted. Thank you.



**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Thank you Honourable Member. Let me conclude by saying, there is also another group of people who are not accepted; the prostitutes. These people are not born prostitutes, maybe some circumstances have pushed them to what they are doing. They are currently suffering. They...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I cannot tell you how that happened. I do not know what happens when someone goes to steal. I do not know what happens for one to be a womaniser. You know where those people are found. We meet them and we do not do anything. I can meet them. When Honourable Makgato was still the Minister of Health, she allowed us to meet them and we met at President Hotel. They shared their stories and why they ended up as prostitutes. My problem is that we are not thinking of anything, but when they get to clinics, they are castigated for their illnesses and they are linked to prostitution. They can share and men are said to be taking these women to the bushes and they do not pay them and leave them there. When some law enforcement officials catch these people, they say, "if you can give me, I will not arrest you." So these people are suffering.

So, I am calling on the Government to do something. Other countries have accepted this. When you go to other countries where I travelled with Honourable Gaolathe, I took them to the red street and they saw these people. There are places where...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Laughter!)...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** No, I never said they went there. I said we passed by and I showed them. I was with Honourable Molatlhegi, Honourable Boko and Honourable Gaolathe.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Laughter!)...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Honourable Members, I never said they did anything, no please! So I conclude.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Tshireletso.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Sir.

**MR SPEAKER:** I will never travel with you... (Laughter!)...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** No, we were only seeing their spot. I am saying let us see what we can do about them. With those remarks Mr Speaker, I am thankful...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification Honourable Tshire before you sit down.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** There is no time. I thank you Mr Speaker, for giving me the opportunity. I wish you good luck and good health as you have not been well. I am also not well as I go for physiotherapy at 4 o'clock. Thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Let me start by thanking God for giving me the opportunity to reply to the Minister's presentation. I thank you Minister for your presentation. Let me also thank my President Honourable Ndaba Gaolathe as well as the President of the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC) Honourable Duma Boko. I thank Batswana in general. I thank God for giving us this peaceful country, Botswana. Honourable Members, Botswana is of God and we should always think of Him because he created the earth. God created the leadership of this country. During times like these, we should look unto God. We should ask God to lead us.

What I can request Hard Rock to relay to the President is that this country needs prayer. Therefore, it is necessary that the President looks at the calendar and declare a national prayer day at least once in a year where we can all converge either be at the national stadium or Dikgotla and pray for our country and pray against death in our country. We should seek God's mercy. We should also pray for rain and good livelihoods. There should be rain so that animals can also live well. I believe that if we could do that, we would have done ourselves justice in Botswana.

Honourable Members, I did not see anything new in this budget, rather, I heard the same rhetoric that I always heard in the past years. In most instances when I speak I say, for me to believe that the Budget is well done, I want to see Honourable Matambo having a special dispensation for the two cities that we have in this country. We cannot have cities that are now becoming white elephants. We no longer know if our cities are cities or they are becoming villages. I said in this Parliament Minister that when you make a budget, there should be a special budget that is given to the two cities for the upkeep of the infrastructure. We cannot have the two cities whose state of roads is bad and have pot holes all over. We cannot have a city which does not have proper drainage facilities and during rainy seasons, people experience flooding. Honourable Members, there is a need for a special dispensation. At



least budget for us P1 billion for Gaborone City Council to address infrastructure of Gaborone and P1 billion for Francistown City Council to address infrastructure of Francistown to ensure that these cities are always maintained to show that indeed these are the first cities of our country, Botswana.

Minister, the other thing that I thought you would share with us is implementation. I am hurting that every year we dispense funds but when you look at implementation or how these funds are used, most of these funds are misappropriated and we cannot see results. For example, in 2010 when I was still a Councillor, we talked about funding from the World Bank which was for improvement of the Gaborone road infrastructure and up to now, we are still talking about these funds in your budget and if you are to check Government records, you will realise that we have started paying this loan whereas there is absolutely nothing on the ground that we can point out and say the Gaborone road infrastructure has improved.

I may think that I was lied to when I was told that there are going to be roads from Gaborone to Molepolole, Tlokweng, Lobatse and Francistown (A1) as top priority.

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** Point of order. Honourable Speaker, is it okay for Honourable member to say that he was told lies in Parliament? Is that parliamentary? If it is, I want to know because I want to debate. When I debate, it will be about the lies of Gaborone City Council in the past years. That is, if that word is allowed.

**MR SPEAKER:** Who told him lies?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Nkaigwa, who told you lies?

**MR NKAIGWA:** I withdraw that word Mr Speaker, maybe they just failed to tell me the truth. Our town Mr Speaker, as you enter Tawana, Phiring and Botswana Housing Corporation (BHC) houses, we still have dusty roads. If you go to New Naledi where I stayed, where you and I grew up, we have dusty roads which are said to be in Gaborone. We cannot talk about Self Help Housing Agency (SHHA) areas; there is just too much dust that is covering our people in Gaborone. One may wonder, for 55 years, the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) being in Government and we still have dusty

roads in towns and do not have proper drainage systems as well. No Honourable members, it is really painful. I believe that maybe Christians in this country fail to pray effectively; perhaps something is blocking our prayers because I believe that if Christians in Botswana were praying effectively, they could pray for Domkrag to leave governance. That should be their prayer, day and night so that they can lose during elections because they have failed.

The other thing which I want to talk about is, we long talked about taking the services back to where they were before. I am talking about water, that time when water was managed by our councils, we never experienced water shortages as it is the case today. When Water Affairs was responsible for water issues, we never experienced water shortages in rural areas. But ever since the sewerages were handed over to Water Utilities, it became a disturbing situation even in Gaborone. Domkrag used over P2 billion in trying to construct the sewerage infrastructure in Gaborone, we were told that the intention of the Government is to get rid of pit latrines within Gaborone. We praised them for their excellent effort, the most shocking thing is, if you can ask the Government how many people are connected to the sewerage infrastructure in Gaborone today, we still have many houses in our SHHA areas which up to today are not connected to the main sewer lines on the basis that Batswana who are there, cannot afford to connect into these sewer lines. We also asked in Parliament, we asked the Minister of Finance for a Special Fund which can be given to Gaborone City Council to go and facilitate the process of getting rid of the pit latrines in Gaborone so that we can have a friendly Gaborone where the underground water is not contaminated by the sewerage, but it is not possible Mr Speaker, it is not possible even today. I cannot talk about my constituency because it is a shame. We do not have water in Gaborone North farms, sewerage and roads; we just do not have anything. The thing is, residents of Gaborone North farms are voters just like everyone else, you will see members of Domkrag asking for a vote from them although they do not care about the lives of these people Mr Speaker. That is why I believe that if at all the Government was serious and wants Batswana to have hope in them and continue to send them, Domkrag could be aware that human life comes first. Water is a basic need of life; you cannot deny a person a right to life by denying them water just because they live in a freehold land. It is very unfortunate to have such kind of a Government.



Mr Speaker, I want to talk about business; funding of young people. The Government of Domkrag has been funding the Youth Development Fund (YDF) every year, but when you look at the value for money, do they earn profit from these businesses which we fund? The youth are in debts, they have been thrown there, they have been taken to foreigners' warehouses which they rent with high prices and as such, their businesses cannot move forward. We are still limiting them to the P100 000 grant or P50 000 loan which I have never seen in a business in the whole world which can be sustainable at P100 000 funding. All I am asking from the Parliament, from the Minister, from this Government is that, give Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) more money; let us not care about whether it will make profit or loss; our interest should be to develop entrepreneurs in our country. Let us not say that we gave Honourable Ngaka Ngaka money and he failed, then conclude that he is a failure. No, let me tell you the secret around entrepreneurship, you can be funded to start a business right now, then it fails but that does not mean that if you get funded again for a different business or to expand what you intended to do at first, then you will fail. To build an entrepreneur does not necessarily mean that if this entrepreneur failed today, then it means that it will fail again tomorrow. That is why I am asking you to expand and try to build our people as well as accommodate that risk that indeed it does not take a day to build an entrepreneur.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Elucidation. Thank you Honourable Member. You are on point. When you look at big companies, including Toyota, they were built for many years. When you take a company like Kia, which transports Honourable members, it was built for many years, at some point it faced collapse but was rescued by the South Korean Government. Now we are impatient with our people, we registered them through "in the matter between," instead of trying to improve their businesses.

**MR NKAIGWA:** You are on point Honourable. Honourable Members, our health system is in a crisis, those of us who come from BH3, Honourable Makgato knows it very well, I used to discuss it with her. BH3 and BH2 are buildings which do not have drugs and nurses, but they operate for 24 hours. In BH3 where I am, we have a generator that facilitates maternity ward only, other areas are not working. If we do not have electricity for 24 hours, they use candles for lighting in Gaborone, I never said in Malatswai, I said in Gaborone. Those

are painful issues Honourable Minister which I believe you have to pay attention to. When I talk about Princess Marina Hospital, no Honourable members, even though you chased Honourable Moswaane, Princess Marina and Nyangabgwe are the same; they are slaughter houses. When you look at us; I will not say "you," but "us," we do not go to Princess Marina but South Africa or India as I heard that someone was taken to India, to another country because we do not trust our own facilities. I once asked Minister for a district hospital, Gaborone hospital. Princess Marina is a referral hospital; we need Gaborone hospital which will be able to cater for the needs of the community of Gaborone. We request for permanent doctors in our hospitals or clinics like BH2 or BH3 who will live there, not those who will visit at a time when patients will not be there at all. We request of you, nurses graduate each and every year; University of Botswana (UB), our Institutes of Health Sciences (IHS), train nurses and doctors every year; let us employ them so that they can work and assist Batswana so that we can live a bit longer. Let us show our people some love.

I told you for a long time that, the economy of Botswana is in the hands of foreigners Honourable Matambo. If at all they are a Motswana, they would be naturalised. Even if you were to look for the top 10 richest people in Botswana, you cannot find a black Motswana who looks like Honourable Matambo, I swear on my mother!

That is why I am therefore saying, even if we come up with legislation; that is where the Leader of Opposition was talking about the indigenous policy; I am saying it is important that you should let us start to consider bringing laws that shall empower a black Motswana like you and I. We are not saying we are against them; that is not what we are saying. We are saying we have been economically disadvantaged for so long, so it is time that we came to par with them. If we could do so, we would be showing love to our people of Botswana, people who are loved by God.

Honourable Minister, there are businesses that can be reserved for Batswana, and totally be taken away from people who come from outside the country, as Honourable Tshireletso was saying. Selling German prints (*mateisi*) and tyres, or simple trading businesses can be done by Batswana, without having to involve foreigners. If people come to Botswana and we talk about a foreign direct investor, it should be someone who will add value...



**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of clarification, Mr Speaker.

**MR NKAIGWA:** ...in our country, rather than to just come and trade; simple trading with products, which is what we see happening.

The other thing that we should come up with is legislation that bars fronting. We have seen an influx of foreigners Honourable Members, using our native Batswana. We need to come up with a law that will combat fronting. In my area, in Phakalane, there are bottle stores that are run by foreigners, but they are registered under the names of Batswana and it would be purported that that bottle store belongs to a Motswana. These funds...the Minister of Investment Trade and Industry knows, I have told you. The funds go to someone who is not a Motswana, and a Motswana would be paid P1, 000.00, yet you would be saying the bottle store is theirs. That is why I am saying we need to correct these things, because they are not right.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of clarification, Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Honourable Member, you have just said...

**MR SPEAKER:** Whom are you yielding for Honourable Member? Which Minister are you referring to, Minister of trade? Honourable Makgato?

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** Thank you very much. I would like him to assist us here, because when I was Minister of Trade at the time, the biggest problem that we had was that Batswana who were given reserved businesses; after being given those businesses they handed them over to the Chinese, not the Chinese getting them from them or any other nationality for that matter. What should we do to such people because it is something that is happening now, and that is where the challenge is? You reserve and they go and rent themselves for a thousand pula; they give others instead. What would you like us to do in such instances?

**MR NKAIGWA:** As you investigate where the funds in our accounts come from, you should probe the people who come here, and find out how they could afford to open a bottle store. Where is all the stock coming from, because people get money from these foreigners, set up these bottle stores and butcheries that are reserved for Batswana. A poor Motswana who does not have a single

thebe; then you wonder how you gave them a license yet you would be seeing that they are getting the money from this foreign man. That is what I am saying, but we shall buttress this further at the Committees.

The other thing that breaks my heart Mr Speaker, is with regard to so much land which happens to be the inheritance for our children. This really breaks my heart. Last time I was mobilising people in my constituency saying we need to petition this Government that she is not concerned about giving us residential plots, that she is concerned about foreigners and they give them land which we refer to as prime land in Gaborone, Mr Speaker.

Corruption; there is a lot to say about corruption...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Moswaane, acquaint yourself with switching off the microphone after switching it on.

**MR NKAIGWA:** ...there is so much corruption it is disheartening. Last time when I spoke here; there is a company that has been given a contract of 15 years to maintain, upgrade and install new street lighting in Gaborone. We are wondering whether one company could be given all the streetlights in Gaborone. Mr Speaker, as we shall be passing the budget here, maybe Gaborone City Council will be given P100 million geared towards addressing the electricity issue, it therefore means all those funds are going to be given to that company. Are you going to say this corruption is not visible Mr Speaker? My heart bleeds Mr Speaker. Last time Honourable Mokgware asked a question right here in Parliament, when we talked about a certain Chinese company, alone they were given tenders amounting to P8. 5 billion and then you would say all is well, that there is no corruption. There is a lot of corruption in this Government. I believe this corruption should not be selective. Everyone who has been involved in corruption should face the wrath of the law. Even those who run to you Your Excellency President Masisi, supporting you yet having committed crime, let them face the wrath. I believe that the God that I serve can actually answer my prayers; because I believe by so doing you would be doing it for the good of this country and not for the good of a few. We know some people who are close to the President yet they are implicated in corruption, and they think because they are close to President Masisi, he will not prosecute them. Therefore, I am praying to my God that one morning when they wake up, they should find law enforcers next to them. Then we would know that people are busy working Mr Speaker.



Mr Speaker, I would like to talk about tertiary institutes that are all over our country. It is necessary that Botswana Qualifications Authority (BQA) should make a serious audit into all these tertiary institutes, so that we would ensure that they are robust enough to continue endowing our children with education. By so doing Mr Speaker, we would know how we are supposed to support them, so that they would be strong enough to give our children quality education. What I am asking from you Honourable Matambo is that our children who are in tertiary institutes, their allowances are very low. We have not adjusted them. We only increased it last year by P200.00, but increasing an allowance by P200.00 is too minimal. Maybe if you could consider giving them P2000, 00 it would be much better so that these students would be able to overcome the challenges that they continue to face on a daily basis.

The Minister of Infrastructure and Housing Development said the Government was going to build houses for the youth, for them to be able to buy them, and they were deemed as instalment purchase scheme. The surprising thing Mr Speaker is that these houses are getting finished. The Government has changed and they are saying that the youth should go and get loans from banks. How can they go and get loans from banks, do they even have payslips? No, they do not have them! Others are entrepreneurs, so they do not have payslips. They thought this instalment purchase scheme, would accord them an opportunity to pay the Government around P1,000.00 or so towards the house so that after 20 or 25 years, the house would be theirs. The Government has backed down on this, and she is saying they should go to Stanbic and Barclays Bank to get loans. Even now as I am talking to you Honourable Makgato, there is no one who has occupied them, maybe four or ten young people who have managed to secure loans from the banks, but the rest of the young people have not managed to secure loans from the banks. This means that indeed we do not know what we are doing. You come here and say you want to empower women through the women empowerment programme, funds that maybe benefitted less than 200 women in Botswana. You ask yourself why you would come up with such a good policy with which at the end there would be no implementation; as Vee would say *dololo!* (which means nothing).

Therefore, Mr Speaker, it is necessary for us as a country to create employment. There must be jobs and we must review the Internship Programme and the allowance which this youth are given during this internship. Their allowance is too little and there is a need to review it Honourable Matambo, to ensure that they live a better

life. Even the Tirelo Sechaba allowance is low. Our soldiers and Special Constables work long hours in the scorching heat, controlling traffic, helping us to have good traffic flow...even when there is an armed robbery, the Special Constables are the ones who are dispatched to attend to it. Our soldiers who deal with the poachers that side Honourable Members, are protecting us as a country, are we saying we do not care about them? No Honourable Members, let us do something for them Honourable Matambo.

The teachers who taught us; what I wished Honourable Matambo could talk about is that maybe the salary scales A and B are going to be done away with, because we have always said when someone is earning at salary scale A and B, how are they supposed to live? I thought in your amending, since you are in the process, you would take the lower C band and covert it to A, and go higher like that. If you had done that, I was going to love you even more. I am telling you. I was going to give you accolades throughout my debate.

As I conclude, let me thank God, thank Him for the life of President Ndaba from my party. I am saying to him that he should hold on. I listened to President Ndaba's speech talking about the de-monopolisation of the beef industry. Indeed it is a good suggestion that this industry should be de-monopolised because Batswana currently rear cattle but it is of no use to them, it does not help us any how Mr Speaker. When you rear something, it should be useful to you, give you and your children a source of livelihood. That is why I believe it does not take magic for the BDP to make this happen because the suggestions we come up with, we do not mean for you to sit on them and not be implemented. You have to implement them so that it helps take our country forward.

When I conclude Mr Speaker, I would like to indicate that we had wished that maybe this year we would have made a noticeable difference between us and the BDP. I can see that the devil is making us fight as the opposition parties.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)

**MR NKAIGWA:** But the Lord is there Mr Speaker, he will be compassionate towards us and make us realise that indeed we need each other, we need to work together as the opposition parties to fight the devil called the BDP because if we do not do that, the devil will end up winning the elections. You can see what it implies to Batswana.



**MR SPEAKER:** Order Honourable Nkaigwa!

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order!

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Nkaigwa, wait, before you sit down. Stand up and withdraw, I do not believe when you say “the devil called the BDP” you are being polite to them. Stand up and withdraw those words.

**MR NKAIGWA:** I do not know which word to use Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No, you know the correct word.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Ok, I withdraw the word ‘devil’ Mr Speaker. I meant to say the enemy called the BDP, the enemy towards democracy, the enemy to Botswana must lose the elections.

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** Thank you very much Mr Speaker. I am thankful for this moment that...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order!

**MS MAKGATO:** Hey, order?

**MR SPEAKER:** Wait Honourable Makgato, let us take a break, we should be here by 4.30 p.m.

**PROCEEDINGS SUSPENDED AT 4:00 P.M. FOR APPROXIMATELY 30 MINUTES**

**PROCEEDINGS RESUMED AT 16:30 P.M.**

**MR SPEAKER:** Please be seated. Order!

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** We are one-member short sir.

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes, you did not count yourself.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, Honourable Olopeng went outside.

**MR SPEAKER:** When you start counting, start with yourself. Continue Honourable Makgato.

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Let me say I am not surprised that we struggled with quorum, predominantly our colleagues from the opposition have left, but they have told me that they are leaving because they suspect I am going to be on their case. I am just an ordinary person who does not know how to attack anyone. I am going to debate like everyone who has debated before me.

To start off, let me thank Honourable Matambo for the Budget proposition that he has put in front of this House, it was very comprehensive, and covered a lot of areas that Botswana were hoping it would cover. I think it is also important Mr Speaker, that we judge Honourable Matambo’s’ budget over a period of time. If you go into the details of his Budget, you will see that he did not confine himself to 2019/2020, he took us back to the yesteryears so that he can track clearly how far we have come across the various sectors, across our developmental path, that is why he was talking about consolidation because his Budget is not coming out of a vacuum.

Before I start commenting on the Budget by Honourable Matambo because it is the only one before us, I must express my disappointment with our opposition Mr Speaker, they say we are ruling together. When you rule with people, they should oppose having something to oppose with. I am waiting for a Budget from the opposition that can talk to the Budget; our budget and oppose it. Enabling us to see clearly how they are going to do things should they win elections, using which instrument; deriving their revenues from where, how they will operate for their operational expenses, and how they will do their developmental agenda.

Anyone, even a mad man or a mad woman can stand up and promise that when I become the Government, I will build everyone a mansion, everyone will get a salary of P1 500 or P3 000. From where? Until and unless you can tell us where you are going to get that money from, forgoing what? That is when we can listen, here you talk to just impress the nation without being held accountable... I have not seen a Budget; I am waiting for a Budget from Honourable Boko. I have perused through that of Honourable Ndaba, what I see is various theories and various policy propositions of what they would do, if it was them, what will they do. I am specific to a Budget, it is okay to talk about all those nice things like we also do, but give me an alternative Budget that I can read into, that I can compare with the Budget that we have presented before this nation, then you and I can talk about how real you are about your proposition of P3 000 and the X amount of jobs that you are going to create growing Marijuana.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)...

**MS MAKGATO:** I still want to revisit the issue that the only alternative is to plough a hectare of Marijuana, to employ people.



**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** It is hemp.

**MS MAKGATO:** No, hemp? In Setswana it is called '*motokwane*', I do not want to speak English. Marijuana is called hemp in English, after ploughing in those farms, will you teach people that it is not smoked, you extract the syrup to make hand lotions and with that, we will transform this economy. Really now? let us get real.

I believe that Batswana have to see for themselves (*go iponela*) and to hear with their own ears that there is no seriousness here.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Makgato, order! Correct your statement, Batswana cannot see for themselves (*go iponela*), they can see with their eyes (*go bona ka matlho*), seeing for themselves means something else.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)

**MS MAKGATO:** I did not say Batswana will peep through themselves but I accept that correction Mr Speaker. Batswana will realise as time goes on that what they are being promised, until and unless our opposition gives us an alternative Budget, then they are just talking, and it is talk and nothing else, and talk is cheap because talk that is not backed by facts, honestly it cannot take us anywhere.

Before I debate also on the Budget, or comment on the Budget, I want to be political because clearly we are here for politics, it is the year of elections. Members are saying what we think a Motswana at home wants to hear, we are not concerned about helping Honourable Matambo allocate funds, advising him on what to fix, where to increase and where to decrease. We want Batswana to hear what we said when we spoke in Parliament. Like we heard Honourable Haskins Nkaigwa who ran away, saying he came here to pray because he has lost hope that as opposition parties, they cannot work together to fight the BDP, at least pray to God to intervene. We also heard those who spoke before him making empty promises because they are trying to posture to Batswana to vote for them and not the BDP party. I want to say no, we are going for elections and we want to be re-elected. The BDP which has been in Government all these years has demonstrated clearly that it can be trusted, can run successive budgets and sustain development of a nation. You just have to go to paragraph 6 in the Budget Speech that talks about the economic performance. It talks about the Gross Domestic Product (GDP), which I believe... if Honourable Segokgo, I heard you talking about GDP

per capita mocking it. Let me explain that it is important because we do not work as an island, as a country, we are a country amongst other nations, we must have measures that can relate and compare us with others, so that when people make decisions to invest or make decisions to check whether we are doing things right, they must be working on something that is uniform or that is standard. So your GDP per capita that you were mocking saying it depicts that all people are rich, no sir, it is an indicator that is critical and shows how the economy is performing. It does not mean that everyone will be given US\$7 000. It is not like that. I heard you speaking on the radio and decided to come and face you here in Parliament.

**MR SEGOKGO:** On a point of order. Thank you Mr Speaker. I take it that Honourable Makgato does not understand. She is saying that I stressed that everyone is rich, no. The truth is vice-versa. Not everyone is rich so she is imputing improper motives on me. I did not say that. She should withdraw that statement and approach me outside so that I clarify it for her.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Makgato, Honourable Segokgo is saying that you are distorting what he said hence you should withdraw your statement.

**MS MAKGATO:** No, I am not distorting anything. The point I was trying to make is, I was listening to the Honourable Member this morning on Duma FM, how disparaging he was when he talked about this indicator and I was worried that to a lay person out there who does not understand to the same level that as us, it is actually confusing that it is something that is not good for Botswana. A high GDP per capita which we are talking about is good for the country because it is an indicator that is measurable, that can be compared and can show where the economy is. Mr Speaker, I am not going to withdraw what I have said because I was just talking about how I interpreted what he said.

I want to continue and go on to Paragraph 7; on Paragraph 7, the Minister of Finance and Economic Development demonstrates clearly in terms of employment that grew significantly from 29 000 in 1966 when I was born to currently just over 400 000. That is a significant number; it is not enough, it is not everybody that is employed but we are able to demonstrate our progress of which I am coming close to half a million of employment that I have created; that is called performance.



The Minister of Finance and Economic Development has given us other indicators which are there for all to know. He has indicated in Paragraph 8; he has talked about the life expectancy...

**MR KGOROBA:** On a point of order. Mr Speaker, I hear the Honourable Member saying that she has created half a million of employment opportunities I therefore ask her to give us evidence on what she just said.

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes, do not use a point of order Honourable Kgoroba, you are supposed to use clarification. Honourable Makgato, answer him.

**MS MAKGATO:** No, he should go and read the speech. It has been availed to him so that he can read and interrogate it so that he can question the Minister of Finance and Economic Development if at all he does not see that Batswana have jobs. If you do not see employed Batswana like Chilly then I have nothing to say to you because I am stating facts about what is happening in our country.

Right now, the other indicator that we talked about is that of literacy; the literacy rate that has grown. I do not see it here but I know that it is at around 87 per cent from around 34 per cent.

We also talked about life expectancy which has grown from 55.5 years to 68 years. These things are there because something right is being done. For instance, if we talk about the life expectancy, there was the deliberate effort by the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) Government to start treatment when others were still doubting, to then go and treat-all, to do all the necessary. That is how we were able to move these figure to where they are, where other nations are looking at us and saying look at Botswana, Botswana has basically done well.

It is so sad to sit here in this House with the opposition that is denying everything. To be in opposition does not mean that you must deny everything, it means that you must show the gaps but also come with a counter-strategy or an alternative to say, if you were to put me in power, I will do it better because of the following.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MS MAKGATO:** There might be shortages of medications at the Hospitals but it does not take away the fact that this Government dealt with AIDS to the extent it has and it has resulted in an increased life expectancy. The fact that there are no medications is not good enough for you to deny the fact that the

government is trying. We are not playing marbles here. During the game of marbles when one wanted to oppose someone after losing the game, just like you have lost to Botswana Democratic Party (Domkrag) he would take all the marbles and say that the game is not fair. Let us debate about real things. You should not deny what Botswana Democratic Party has done and in the process pray that they lose elections. Pray for your own wisdom so that you can come up with a counter-strategy, a counter-budget that can basically talk to our Budget and show the nation, clearly articulating how you are going to do it differently. You have not said anything; you have just said stated that you are going to pay people P3 000 and P15000 salaries. Where are you going to get the money from? Demonstrate where you are going to get the money from, so that you can be able to answer us when we ask you how you are going to fill the gap that you are going to create when moving funds to the salaries. We will then have a reasonable discussion of people eager to govern not that of people who want to trick Batswana so that they can be loved.

Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development, I have looked at your Paragraph 20 that talks about diversification, with particular reference to Special Economic Zones (SEZs). Granted, they have not been implemented as fast as we had wanted them but we cannot give up and say because it has not happened at the pace which we would have loved, now we must leave it. We are affected by the development of the SPEDU Region in particular at Sefhare Ramokgonami Constituency. We are well known for farming and we are very much anxious for the Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry to finish so that we can also partake in this rather exciting SPEDU project.

Mr Speaker, I also want to talk about the Public Private Partnerships (PPPs). Minister of Finance, I think this is an area where much as we are happy that you have set up the unit and we have run workshops, we would like now to get to a point where we can deliver projects that we have looked at, assessed or analysed, that can basically take away the burden from Government because Government clearly does not have all the necessary resources that are similar in appetite level to what the development of this country needs. But we acknowledge and commend you that you have realised it is a space that we have never been into, it is a dangerous space if you can go into it without any understanding because you will be dealing with people that probably understand it better than you do. You would not be equipped to negotiate, you will



be negotiating in darkness and at the end of the day, something that should have given you the right levels of return will actually cost you more. I know, I have been in ministries where we have wanted to go that route to outsource certain services because we believe it will be cheaper for Government, only to find that Government was paying threefold. So steady, but increase your pace Minister so that we can get all that we can harvest out of the PPPs that we so much want to see.

I also liked your last but one paragraph, which talks about civil servants. It is Paragraph 83. I do not know why it is so difficult for the opposition to acknowledge goodness when they see it. For the first time in this country, Government has managed to sit down with unions, negotiate a two-year deal. It has never happened in this country. For the first time the Government has sat down and had peaceful discussions with the Unions who even took videos. You want to turn your backs on them yet it was fun and games when you talked about us saying that we should be toppled. Now that you realise that they have lost hope on you and have given us a chance you go behind the scenes saying that they should be fired. Honourable Members, you are not doing the right thing because we should be treated equally. Do not be jealous when they realise that we are capable and that we deserve to be given a chance since we are doing things the right way. Find an alternative strategy that you can use so that they can also give you another chance in the future. They have lost trust in you because they have realised that you have been cheating them therefore they now want to collaborate with Botswana Democratic party (Domkrag) deal with it!

Mr Speaker I want to talk a little bit into my Constituency.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MS MAKGATO:** What evidence?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MS MAKGATO:** Do you not have ears and eyes to see...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MS MAKGATO:** Seek clarification so that I answer you. I want to drink water.

Mr Speaker, we are suffering in our constituency and we were looking very much to this Budget. We have challenges of water and electricity at Sefhare-Ramokgonami, the dilapidated school infrastructure,

in particular at Ramokgonami village where there is overpopulation and very old buildings that were built 50 years ago. The same goes for Mokobeng and Chadibe; very old buildings, overpopulation where students-teacher ratio is at around 50 or so to a teacher. This contributes to low performance at Sefhare-Ramokgonami. What I like is that the Minister of Education has assured us that in the Committee of Supply, he will be addressing all those but we are anxiously waiting for the resolution of those.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Clarification. Sorry Mr Speaker. I want a little bit of clarity; do we still form a quorum if one member is sleeping?

**MR SPEAKER:** We are busy working and you are joking around. I do not expect anyone to sleep in Parliament. Proceed Honourable Makgato.

**MS MAKGATO:** No, you have a tendency of giving people tablets here when they have a headache and when they get drowsy because they have flu, you take their pictures. That is wrong.

In continuing with what I was talking about, I was saying, the issue of the buildings and the classrooms, laboratories, shortage of resources; chairs and others, my request is that we must help the Minister of Basic Education on how he is going to address it. It is one issue which requires swift response to find where funds can be sourced to assist there because we will be investing in our children's future.

One other issue that is worrying is of land. It is a pity the fake pastor is not here. I wanted to debate the issue of land in his presence. The issue of land is worrying because we have to be alive to the environment within which we live. In the past, when we made our laws and agreed to allocate land to the church and that it should not pay tax due to the fact that it is a church. Whether we like it or not, churches have transformed themselves into businesses, thugs and criminals. That is the current status. Even in the Bible it is written that there will come a time when false prophets manifest. The Bible states that there will be false prophets. These are the current happenings. If you take the fact that churches are now for individuals, and individuals form churches every day, as they form churches every day, each and every person wants a piece of land that belongs to them...

**MR BATSHU:** Point of correction. My colleague should emphasise that some churches not all of them. Thank you.



**MS MAKGATO:** Correction accepted; some churches. Nowadays most of them are these churches that I am talking about. They are more than the churches we are used to, churches that have been there for a very long time. You never find a pastor caught with gold inside his robes. You will never find a pastor with a briefcase full of money. I am saying all these things deliberately because when they start fighting, they come to you as Honourable Ngaka Ngaka and tell you that, “we are from church so and so, we have been crossing Botswana border with P20 000 taking them to so and so.” They will come and tell you that they have been breaking the law of Botswana doing this and that, they tell you this after they fight. Now I was saying it in relation to the benefits as a nation which loves religion and churches. I do not think we said now people who come frequently who had one today, four tomorrow, we are giving them land at the expense of land that we can utilise for investment or allocate it to Batswana. I think we need to look at this thing, be real and serious about it.

Some of these churches when you read in their literature, they state that there is money in Botswana. Even when they come and position themselves in our neighbouring states, the bulk of their money comes from Batswana. So, maybe the fake pastor who said is praying that the Botswana Democratic Party be removed from Government, he should have prayed for Batswana who are cheated out of their belongings. You will find a woman with children, leaving her home, selling the house and car and take the proceeds to a false pastor as offerings and remain poor. Right now if you go into social media, a certain pastor who gives people anointing oil when they have problems is trending. Right now he has engaged the best lawyer that money can buy, so that he can be scot-free. So, these things we must look at. Land is a challenge.

I want to talk about reserved businesses. In making a request to have certain reservations in certain businesses, we should also reprimand sternly because there are Batswana who when we have reserved businesses, case in point, clothing business, bottle stores; and butcheries, but when it is time to do business, Motswana finds it easy to go and say, “if you give me P1000 you will trade with my licence.” Thereafter Opposition faults it to the Botswana Democratic Party Government and do not admonish Batswana who are denying themselves their rights by giving them to foreigners and they continue to live in poverty while the foreigners get rich. We must be responsible leaders, we must talk to our constituents, we must advise our constituents so that they may also be able to live at our level.

Corruption; I am happy with the steps that my President is taking. I am happy with the steps that are being taken by... when I say the President because he has said it in His State of the Nation Address, he said it in the Budget Speech at the same time, but the institutions...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MS MAKGATO:** I cannot talk about a coward who ran away. The institutions have also increased their pace. I agree with those who say, this must not be selective, but let us increase pace so that even those who wanted to test, should not even think about it.

In conclusion, I am supporting the Budget that is before us because it does to the best of the Minister of Finance and Economic Development’s ability, address, certainly with limitations... I am sure if there was money everywhere, where he could get it, he would give us more, but he has demonstrated in this Budget which is narrative as to why he has given us a Budget of this stature.

Lastly, roads. As the Minister of Roads, I do not know what I am going to do, I wish I could ask all of you give me a little from your ministries. I do not know if it is possible Honourable Minister for my colleagues to give me their 5 per cent to go and construct roads. I will very happy if they could all agree to give me so that I could help each and every one of you in the challenges that you are experiencing. Hurricane Dineo has destroyed our roads, it has been a while since we carried out maintenance, I am just saying. Thank you very much Mr Speaker.

**MR LELATISITWE (BOTETI EAST):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Minister Makgato. I believe that ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR LELATISITWE:** Thank you madam. Hey! Just keep quiet. Thank you Minister Makgato for your Budget. I want to talk. I am still talking. She was talking about you as Opposition Members. Thank you Minister, thank you so much Mr Speaker. Honourable Matambo, thank you so much for delivering the Budget.

Maybe firstly, let me thank God for giving me this chance to stand here as a Member of Botswana Democratic Party. Moreover, thank God to have allowed this country to be under the rule of this party; Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) for these 50 years. Looking at the recent



events on Facebook, especially in Gaborone Central, it is clear that if this Budget was across the aisle, we could be in big trouble. God has made it possible today we are here, this Budget is still with Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) and it is delivered yearly on time. Mr Speaker, this is the year of elections...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Ah! Mr Speaker ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Why are you panicking?

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Lelatisitswe there is something which is causing a disturbance there.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Yes Mr Speaker there is a cell phone ringing just in front of me, I do not know what the Standing Order says in that regard.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Molao! Make sure that you are not disturbing the other member with a cell phone.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MR SPEAKER:** If it rings again I am going to confiscate it. Proceed Honourable Lelatisitswe.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Mr Speaker, I stand here today to contribute to the debate of the Appropriation Bill carrying the voice of the trusted constituents, who mandated me today or for the past four years to be their voice in this Parliament. My contribution as their representative and mouthpiece is thus, this Budget must empower them; bringing about positive change now and in the future.

Mr Speaker, as a Member of Parliament, I have the honour and privilege to also serve in several committees of Parliament; where we perform our mandate; oversight. I planned to therefore, exhibit a bias towards the broader objective of the budget as it relates to promotion of good governance, climate change, budgeting and achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG's). Just a few minutes ago you were indicating that you have added me in that committee Mr Speaker.

The budget as defined is a process consisting of series of activity relating to expenditures to a set of goals or it is a process through which public expenditure are

undertaken, while considerations of revenue constraints and taxation are inherent in a budget process within the contexts of Parliamentary framework. Budgeting is generally treated as part of the expenditure process rather than as revenue.

Government Budgets play an essential role in planning and controlling the economic activity of a nation while to us; policymakers, it is an implementation list to the business community and entrepreneurs. It is akin to a tender document and an employment opportunity for many of our unemployed youth. There are three economic functions of a Government Budget; allocation of resources, distribution of income and wealth as stabilization of the economy. The budget therefore, has to resonate with the aspiration of Botswana and must deliver a better quality of life. A key feature of the budget process therefore, relates to how the budget is formulating and who...

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Point of order. Speaker, I thought we are supposed to respond to the Budget as read by Honourable Matambo but what Honourable Member is doing is telling us what the budget is supposed to do, what the budget is. I think that one we know and what we expect from him is to debate the Budget.

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes, Honourable Mmolotsi I think the Member is still making an introduction.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MR SPEAKER:** He is talking about the general principles of budgeting as he sees them. Allow him to do this.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Wynter, just relax your time will come sir, so, you can come and talk about Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) and Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC).

The budget therefore, like I said, has to resonate with the aspirations of Botswana and must deliver a better quality of life. A key feature of the budget process therefore, relates to how the budget is formulated and how it is evolved in it and what is entailed. I believe in order to ensure this, as a Parliament, there is a need to ensure that Parliament holds a debate on budget policy prior to a tabling of executive budget proposals and approve recommendation for the upcoming budget, ensure that Parliament committees examine and publish reports on yearly budget implementations online, consider setting up an independent budget office to help



us on this process. His Excellency; the President's road map endures on good governance and the Rule of Law and implementing the above will certainly transform not only our budget process, but also significantly influence and contribute to our budget oversight, good governance, improved public participation.

Mr Speaker, moving to the budget itself, where Wynter wants me to move to. A key concern coming out of the budget remains, lack of implementation. According to the Minister, the total expenditure and net lending for 2018/2019 shows a decrease of P2.68 billion from the original budget of P67.87 billion to P65.19 billion due to the continued underperformance of Development Budget. The Development Budget 2018/2019 is revised from the original figure of P19.31 billion to P16.62 billion to reflect the implementation capacity of both the public and private sectors to execute projects.

The Development Budget is our economic growth driver and should provide opportunities for employment creation and this lack of capacity to deliver projects needs a critical review and one key aspect is the long overdue Monitoring and Evaluation Framework which should be supported by a robust project implementation authority. Our drive towards being high income economy must be anchored on efficiencies such that as we open up the investment, we are able to match the needs and the requirements of investors.

The 2018/2019 budget proposals are informed by the need to consolidate the country's gains in various areas of development and address challenges to achieve sustained economic growth in supporting employment creation and poverty alleviation. Therefore, the focus must be placed on high impact infrastructure development, Human Capital Development, especially Technical and Vocational Education, National ICT Backbone, a Revamp Agricultural Policy and Industrialization Strategy.

### **Sustainable Development Goals and Vision 2036**

As the primary political and economic expression of Government policy, the budget is the natural starting point for the integration of agenda 2030 and its Sustainable Development Goals. It is therefore, important that this budget allocation reflect the aspiration of our vision towards achieving the SDG's. To achieve this, we need to see more integration on the SDG's into our budget proposal and actually monitoring and reporting budget performance against the SDG's. In that manner, we then

realize some coherence, accountability, and international comparability. This will mean maintaining some of the recommended budgetary allocation according to international averages such as in agriculture, huge potential for employment and food security of 10 per cent and above of the National Budget.

Boteti is an Agricultural Hub and it needs investment in infrastructure as in access roads and electricity in order to support production and stimulate growth on downstream industries. We have cluster farmers in villages around Khwee. We need roads to empower those people so that they can produce. In order to diversify from diamond based economy, Boteti requires investment now in developing its fast tourism potential. This is what will create employment and better lives for our people. What now obtains that some of the allocations might not be sufficient to significantly move us towards achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), this also includes strategies towards climate change mitigation and climate change finance, which are very key if they are to realise our Vision 2036 and achieve the SDGs. It is also commendable that Government will continue to implement social welfare programmes such that its efforts address poverty among the most vulnerable groups of the society. In order to bring impetuous on the fight to end abject poverty, our funding for key human development programmes need to be robust. Already significant allocations are apportioned to Ministry of Education and we should be specific about intended result and should be in a position to report impact as far as the return on investment is concerned. Such investment therefore ought to be geared towards producing market related skills, self-sustaining skills and human resource in the form of teachers to address the student-teacher ratios with an intention to improve results and performance, infrastructure development, classrooms, laboratories, staff houses and so forth.

Investment on Information and Communications Technology (ICT) development and use will not only propel Botswana into a Fourth Industrial Revolution, but it will provide great opportunities for employment of especially young people. As a country, ICT and developing knowledge based economy must be priority for Government and the budget...

**MR KGOROBA:** Point of procedure. Mr Speaker, this is sheer plagiarism by Honourable Lelatisitswe, copied exactly from Honourable Ndaba's policy address. This is plagiarism. We should not allow this in Parliament. He knows nothing about the Fourth Industrial Revolution.



**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MR KGOROBA:** He knows nothing!

**MR SPEAKER:** No. Maybe the Honourable Member also searched in Google and got that information.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Thank you so much. I do not blame the Honourable Member across the floor because he might think these things...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs) ...

**MR LELATISITSWE:** No, listen. Let me go to Ministry of Basic Education...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Elucidation.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Let me decline first. Ministry of Basic... Wait, wait...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Yield for him.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** He has left. Education remains the single most important legacy and wealth bestowed upon the nation, hence we see the largest share amounting to P8.24 billion or 7.5 per cent of the total ministerial going to recurrent budget. I must indicate that this thing does not reflect well, to have a recurrent budget this big under Ministry of Education. It shows that the projects that we are expecting at our constituencies... let me indicate that schools are not in good state, there is shortage of classes. It shows that this situation will continue to be as it is.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Point of clarification. Do I hear him well that there is shortage of classes?

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Thank you so much Honourable. I think I will answer you when we are outside. The budget under the Ministry of Education will cater for the ongoing investment in human capital development with expenditure in items covering payments of teachers' salaries and allowances, maintenance of existing facilities, provision of text books, food supply, stationery and so forth. At 90 per cent of education, budget spending on salaries and other recurrent items is quite dangerous based on the international standards. Anything above 80 per cent suggests their serious spending inefficiencies within the education system, which needs to be addressed.

Mr Speaker, as an elected representative of Boteti or people of Botswana, I dearly want the education budget to address itself to offering learners three main results. These are; to fit well into the society, cope with modern types of employment and to continue with self-education after their school days. Commercially and industrially, Botswana is becoming increasingly integrated into global village especially with ICT development, that plus national pride in oneself should provide enough incentive. In this Budget, I want free and subsidised extra teaching and if need be, better teacher remuneration as incentive to introducing extra classes. There should be more technical colleges, craftsmen should be encouraged to take on apprentice and that the income of both should be subsidised. This will drive our industrialisation as a country with appropriate skills to be able to create downstream industries for identified high value sector such as agro-processing, mineral beneficiation and manufacturing. Where is that black dude? He is outside?

Ministry of Health; the second largest share...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Lelatisitswe, we do not have black dudes in this House, we have Honourable Members.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** No, I withdraw sir. The second largest share, we saw it being spared to Ministry of Health. Honourable Members, let me indicate that where I come from in Boteti, we have a problem; a hospital and has long being identified to be included in the National Development Plan (NDP) 11. It is our wish that this hospital may be constructed because since the closure of BCL, now the hospital is crowded and can no longer accommodate the population that exist in Letlhakane or Boteti East. It is necessary that this should be taken seriously. The hospital should be delivered because the expansion of the mines in the area indicates that more people will be coming soon. The Government should not be left behind in terms of health issues in the area. It is my hope that this Budget will translate to drug availability and more health personnel to reduce congestion, over loads and waiting periods for our people. I believe that is the issue that I am trying to put through.

The Government also seeks to improve health care infrastructure, provide and upgrade medical and surgical equipment. I believe this will also help at Nyangabgwe, where one Honourable Member was taken out while talking about.



Local Government Mr Speaker; an amount of P6.3 billion which is 13.7 per cent, being the fourth largest share of the proposed recurrent budget is allocated to the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development. This will cater for the transfers in the form of revenue support grants to district and urban councils, gratuity for Councillors whose term of office would be coming to an end in the next financial year, maintenance of infrastructure, social welfare schemes for the needy and elderly people. We just want to show that where we come from, there are remote areas. Let us show that where we come from, is very remote. It is our wish that this Budget serves the needs of these people.

Mr Speaker, when we talk about youth; youth unemployment is a major policy concern that deserves urgent attention, because it has come as a threat to socio economic and political stability of the country. It leads to a variety of social ills, including; poverty, alcohol abuse, crime and social exclusion.

Policy and programmes; the challenges of youth unemployment are many and varied, but addressing them has almost taken the form of social welfare provision and less on the provision of practical education and training. Government has often spent funds on short-term unemployment, quick fix and unsustainable programmes with little impact on job creation.

I stand here Mr Speaker saying, the Youth Development Fund (YDF) programme needs to be revised. The ministry has to come up with programmes that will hire a lot of youth. The P2 million that hires only 20 people in a constituency is not how we can fight unemployment with the YDF. We should come up with other programmes or policies that will bind ministries to support local businesses, so that they can hire a lot of youth in this country.

Agricultural sector is faced with a lot of challenges. Major challenges facing the sector include production volumes, efficiency, lack of infrastructure, support services that hamper production and are themselves a result of a number of systematic gaps. Many of the production farmers are scattered, making it difficult to provide services such as roads, electricity, water, telecommunication and extension services. Among these challenges, the country is faced with little or no rainfall with extreme temperatures, which comes as a great challenge for crop production.

Mr Speaker, before I started I told you that you have chosen me to be in different committees. Now I will talk to this Budget in relation to climate change. Climate

change is going to affect in particular, the core business of finance ministries relating to physical policy, Government budgets and public debts. Climate change planning shares some common challenges with other national policies where multiple interests needs to be managed.

We recently went to Poland with Honourable Wynter Mmolotsi, he is the one who was helping me to write. As we consider the national budget against the backlog of the Paris Declaration and Ketosis Roadmap, it will be important to see strategies not only reducing our carbon footprints, but also mitigation strategies under various policy areas for climate mitigation. Ministry budget request and allocation must also reflect this priority concern. Climate change if not addressed, will reverse all past gains and severe impact in the achievement of Vision 2036 and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Therefore, we need to prioritise our transformation towards renewable energy, starting with national renewable policy strategy.

Some of our employment targets as a country will be attained under these priority areas; given an abundance of sunlight concentration, the landfills we currently have and the amount of household waste generated, which all provide opportunity for recycling and conversion into clean energy. However, the national policy and climate change legislation accompanied by robust monitoring and reporting may remain necessary towards adaptation and mitigation. Are you listening Honourable Haskins Nkaigwa?

In conclusion, Mr Speaker, the 2019/2020 Budget proposals are presented against the backdrop of the roadmap of our President, His Excellency President Dr Mokgweetsi Eric Masisi, to transform the economy, which requires concerted efforts to achieve the high-income status that Botswana aspires in 2036. The projection deficits for 2018/2019, 2019/2020 of 3.5 per cent of the GDP of each are close to the set limit of 4 per cent of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP). The deficits exclude any additional expenditures that may arise from Government decisions during the course of the year or emergency spending occasioned by the national disasters such as drought and outbreak of animal diseases. Most of these by the way, are climate change driven. So, an approach like climate change budgeting will ensure that these are included within the fiscals instead of being reactional mitigation expenditures. The Government continues to leverage on its purchasing



power to stimulate the growth of the private sector, which in turn should create sustainable jobs. In total, a P67 billion expenditure planned for the 2019...

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** On a point of procedure Mr Speaker. Just a slight worry Mr Speaker. It seems like the Honourable Member is quoting Honourable Matambo's words from the speech but he never said that he is quoting. So, if it is true, it is important that...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MS MAKGATO:** No, I am not the enemy here, if he is paraphrasing it is okay. Just be careful, that is all I am saying.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Member, are you quoting or paraphrasing?

**MR LELATISITSWE:** I am paraphrasing because I am on the Budget that was read. So, there is no way I can talk without referring to that.

**MR SPEAKER:** I agree with Honourable Makgato that when you quote, you must say so and where you are quoting from. It is not wrong, it is allowed. Proceed Honourable Member.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Mr Speaker, our Vision 2036, National Development Plan (NDP) 11 and SDGs must provide the framework within which we strive to achieve better livelihood for Batswana while adhering to high standards of financial management and inclusion. Encourage line ministries to speed up the implementation part so that this Budget can benefit the whole society or the nation. That is why I am saying that on the basis of this debate, even if Honourable Mokgware is at the farms, he has to feel this Budget, it includes him. Thank you Minister. With those words even when Honourable Mokgware is at the farm, he has to feel this Budget, it includes him. Thank you Minister.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND FOOD SECURITY (MR MARKUS):** Thank you. Thank you Mr Speaker. It seems like I will be like Honourable Makgato and bring politics into my debate. I do not wish to say much. All I want to do is to support Matambo for the Budget.

I support you because drafting a budget is not an easy task and I got to experience that when we had to draft our P10 million budget. When you draft you will get to see that it is a lot of hard work, just P10 million. But

people were standing to criticise you, saying that you are failing whereas they are also failing to budget for a mere P10 million. People are insulting them because they are failing. I just wanted to set the record straight Mr Speaker, it is not an easy task. Let me applaud him, he should continue doing a good job. Do not give up sir.

Honourable Members however I have a complaint you should address Minister. We tend to forget the need to maintain our infrastructure. For example, Maun-Nata road, this road has long been constructed but it takes a long time to maintain it. These are things that cause concern Honourable Minister. Maybe the time has come for Parliament to should suggest the establishment of Ministry of Maintenance which will be focusing on the maintenance of our infrastructure, being entirely for that because we know that once something is built, it should be checked whether the structure is wearing out or not, to check where maintenance could be done. Even funds allocated for maintenance Minister, you should ensure that you apportion sufficient sum because we built these structures using a lot of funds, so for us to neglect them like that and allow them to get dilapidated the way they are is not right. Honourable Minister we should find a way of looking into these things. If you look at the roads, and some Government buildings there are not in good shape. Honourable Members, we need to address these things.

The other thing Honourable Minister is that we do not properly utilise the budget that we allocate our Ministries. When you allocate funds to a certain ministry you do so wholeheartedly so that those funds can be utilised optimally. If funds are returned, it shows that as a Ministry, myself included, we are not delivering to the fullest. We have to ensure that as Ministers we talk to our officers and we become strict with the Permanent Secretaries to ensure that there is service delivery, it very, very important. There should be service delivery so that funds are not returned to the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development. When funds are returned it shows inefficiency on the part of those who have been given the responsibility to utilise them so please we need to seriously address this inadequacy. No country can develop when the funds keep being returned at the rate at which it is happening because developments need to be carried out, but that fails to be the case because we are unable to utilise the funds allocated to us.

Honourable Members, there is an issue of land. The issue of land delays developments in our country. When one wishes to do something for themselves, they end up diverting the funds they had previously reserved for



such due to our long processes of allocating. Even the foreign investors, end up losing heart on the way because we take a long time to allocate land. This thing delays development in our country Honourable Members so we have to ensure that we address this anomaly. I will not be long like others, I will only mention a few points that I arose to say.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Murmurs)...

**MR MARKUS:** What is going on?

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MR MARKUS:** I am the one debating not you...I am the one holding the floor, you are just making noise there! Hey! Hey! Keep quiet!

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Markus, do not allow them to derail you.

**MR MARKUS:** No, I am talking to this old man. Keep quiet, your turn to speak will come. You have not debated yet old man so I am still debating this side...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Markus!

**MR MARKUS:** If I may give an example of where we have come from, where Botswana has come from, when she was still called Bechuanaland Protectorate, we had nothing, absolutely nothing. Through the governance of the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP), we gained independence and took this country forward step by step.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Point of order. No, Mr Speaker, we cannot go back to 1966, please call the Honourable Member of Parliament to order...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Laughter!)...

**MR MMOLOTSI:** He is completely out of order; talking about the tarred road from Lobatse in 1966. No, Honourable Member, we are progressive, let us move forward, and talk about how the Budget could assist us.

**MR SPEAKER:** No, he was just doing his introductions, please allow him to debate, he will come back to the Budget. Proceed Honourable Member.

**MR MARKUS:** No, I am not introducing, I am merely stating facts that we had but through the current Government, she was steadfast and ensured that the country was developed to reach the status we are at. This is what I am saying.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Markus.

**MR MARKUS:** Sir?

**MR SPEAKER:** I was trying to protect you, now you are getting me into trouble.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Laughter!)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Proceed Honourable Member.

**MR MARKUS:** No, leave them to me, I will address them, I am okay. I just want to point out that the opposition members claim that we are not progressing, we are stagnant. I wanted to show them where we came from and where we are going, and what we have accomplished to date, that the Botswana Democratic Party (Domkrag) Government is the one who did all these, including the ties they are wearing right now. I am pointing out that we had nothing, but the BDP (Domkrag) Government ensured that the country reach where we are today. The Government was not assisted by any Government out there.

#### **MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):**

Elucidation. Honourable Markus, just be clear that there is nothing wrong with you starting from 1966 because even in Honourable Matambo's presentation, on Paragraph 7, he took us from there to where we are now. Again, when they have no argument points they accuse us of failing for the past 50 years. So they want you to leave room for them to come and say something along those lines, they do not want you to show how we have beautifully progressed in the 55 years of us being in Government, and they call themselves the Progressives.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Point of clarification. I beg for clarification Honourable Markus because you are showing how you have performed beautifully, so my question is; who else do you expect to have made the developments you claim to have done because you are the ones who have been in Government all this time? Do you not think that if maybe another party was in charge, it could have done better than what you have done so far?

**MR MARKUS:** No, I am sorry Honourable but there has never been such a party, so I cannot talk about a non-existent thing. What I am saying right now is that...

**MR NKAIGWA:** Point of order. Mr Speaker, even if we could say his microphone was off, but the Honourable Member on the floor has insulted us. I cannot say exactly



what he said into the microphone, but he has insulted us. Please call him to order, and ask him to withdraw those words although they were not uttered into the microphone.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Otherwise, we are going to hit him out there.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MR SPEAKER:** No, I did not hear what he said. Honourable Markus, if you used profane language, please withdraw those words, but they were not recorded.

**MR MARKUS:** No, I did not insult anyone; they are not telling the truth Mr Speaker, as you can see that they are denying the truth.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs) ...

**MR MARKUS:** I did not insult anyone. What I wanted to point out Mr Speaker is that even though they are saying the BDP (Domkrag) did not do anything, it has worked hard, it has brought development in the country. Every development was brought by the Botswana Democratic Party. Even if they can say point of order, as a way to delay me, I will debate this issue until I use up all my minutes, and I will not spare even one of them.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Point of order. Thank you Mr Speaker. With all due respect Honourable Markus, I know you are a good man who is also humble and loves peace. As the Honourable Member and the Speaker have asked you to do, you have insulted us, so withdraw those insults; we do not want to repeat them. Just withdraw them nicely...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Did you say I should say the words? I can do that...

**MR SPEAKER:** No, Honourable Mokgware, I said I did not hear him using any profane language. Why would you say such on the microphone if the words were not uttered into the microphone?

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** No, you heard him. It is only that his microphone was not on Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No, I did not hear anything.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Ask him to withdraw them nonetheless...

**MR SPEAKER:** I said if indeed he used vulgar language, he should withdraw. Honourable Markus...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** The reason why Honourable Matambo was laughing is because he heard him very well!

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Markus, you must have said something inappropriate, please withdraw what you have said if at all you said something. I did not hear you, but please just withdraw.

**MR MARKUS:** How can I withdraw something that I do not understand Mr Speaker? I do not understand. I asked him to remind me Mr Speaker, but he is not saying anything either.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MR MARKUS:** Please remind me sir, so that I can correct it. I mean, I do not know what I said.

But Mr Speaker I want to indicate that the developments which we see in Botswana of roads, schools and hospitals were built by the Botswana Democratic Party. We are moving forward and making budgets, we are not stagnant yet people claim that we have done nothing in the country. I wanted to indicate that so that the nation can hear that Botswana Democratic Party brought developments and it will continue doing that because they have people's lives in their hands. That is my point.

Another issue is that although we are busy with the developments there are some shortcomings, we cannot achieve everything because some things do not go according to plan. We are rectifying these irregularities Honourable Members and we shall succeed. Let me thank our President who is currently fighting corruption and doing everything in his power to combat it. Honourable Members corruption should start at the top, if we fight it from the bottom then we shall not eradicate it. So I am thankful that currently we are not arresting the small fish, we are arresting the big fish which indicates that our President is serious.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of correction, Mr Speaker.

**MR MARKUS:** No, not at the top or not there. It has to be fought from the top, and then down the ladder, that is when we can be able to eradicate it. But now when corruption is being fought...



**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of clarification, Mr Speaker.

**MR MARKUS:** ...you are talking.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Minister. I was saying I agree with you that corruption should be combated. But now do you not think that now it is selective, that those who do not support the President and those of us in the opposition, we seem to be targeted? Why can we not see a person such as Honourable Vice President Slumber Tsogwane being investigated as he once changed his names so that we can be convinced that indeed corruption is not biased?

**MR MARKUS:** No, you are saying things I have no knowledge of, where does he get that information? I know nothing of that sort, what crime has the Vice President committed?

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** On a point of procedure, Mr Speaker. Procedure is that we are recording. So sometimes when we debate we cannot hear ourselves so my colleague holding the floor, when he wanted to say, "to fight corruption must start from the top", he said, "corruption starts from the top." When he says that it is not articulated properly especially when talking about the President, he has to correct for the records.

**MR SPEAKER:** No but he ended up correcting. You can correct again Honourable if they did not hear you but I heard him correct.

**MR MARKUS:** I was advised that I did not articulate that well but I did correct that corruption should be fought from the top not that it starts from the top. I have corrected sir.

**HIS HONOUR THE VICE PRESIDENT (MR TSOGWANE):** On a point of elucidation, Mr Speaker. The Elucidation point is that you are debating well although some are scared. There is no selective dealing with corruption; corruption has to be fought whether a person is a church pastor. If it selective and some people are not prosecuted then bring evidence. I heard him mention my names, those are my names sir. Tsogwane is my father's name, Mmolawa is my grandfather's name, I did not change names. Moreover when you change names, you do it officially. You simply go to records and fill in the application form that you request

to change your surname from your grandfather's to your father's. The records are there. When you commit crime at church thinking that you have changed your name then you are just wasting your time.

**MR MARKUS:** Honourable Nkaigwa is also out of order. You cannot just come and accuse an elder of changing names. Where did you get that information? Ask for forgiveness because you are out of line. You cannot speak like that to another person, it is wrong. How can you say such bad things, what kind of person are you?

Let me indicate that Honourable Members that our President's mandate was to fight corruption and he is doing that. We commend him for what he is doing. If I as a Member of Parliament for Maun East, I am involved in corruption then I should be investigated to establish whether the vehicle I am driving was bought legally. There should be serious investigations with no fear.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** On a point of clarification, Mr Speaker. I hear that you are acknowledging the good job the President is doing, but you are forgetting to thank him for giving you the position you did not even deserve.

**MR MARKUS:** I am unlike you, calling yourself vice president. You are going to die before you become one.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)...

**MR MARKUS:** You will never ever become one. That is your problem. At least you are a happy man. I am not going to entertain your petty talk. All I am saying is we thank the President for what he is doing at the moment.

Honourable Members let me also indicate that there are complaints regarding unemployment rate and that Botswana Government is failing. But as the opposition you are part of the Government, why can you not come up with ways of creating employment and put them on the table. This is what we mean but you do not. All you do is to point out that we are failing to create employment. What are you doing and what is your intention for the future, if you were to take power? What are you doing; zero? All you do is talk about Marijuana. Are you going to use Marijuana to create employment?

You talk about your plans and all that..., Honourable Members when you increase a person's salary, you inform him/her that I will give you P1 500 and you do not stop there. You know that next year he/she is going



to want more. Or are you going to increase and set the amount at P1 500 for the rest of their lives? You should know that in the coming years, there are going to be salary increment demands, so where are you going to get such a huge amount of money? Everyone wants a piece of the pie. Everyone wishes, I also wish for salary increment but where will the money be sourced from? There is no where we will be able to source such funds if we follow such pattern, we should bear that in mind Honourable Members.

Minister, there is an issue of crime. Crime cripples our economy. We have to take action to see how we can control the high crime rate in our country. Currently if they are potential investors, some are afraid because of the high crime rate as they feel unsafe. What can we do so that we fight this crime? People are committing murder, murdering people in their own homes at night. While you are sleeping at night, a person will break in through the window, stab you and steal your belongings. Honourable Members, people hear of such stories and even see them so perhaps we should reinforce and enlist police who can patrol at night. Even if the can be enlisted on temporary measures for four or five years from them we downsize so that these people can see that we are combating crime. I said I will not be long; I will stop here. I am very happy. Thank you Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Elucidation.

**MR SPEAKER:** He is already done. Thank you Honourable Markus. The floor is open.

**MR GARE (MOSHUPA-MANYANA):** Thank you Mr Speaker for giving me a chance to debate. I will make an introduction. Honourable Minister, thank you for the Budget. I am grateful for the numerous points I saw on this Budget which I think we should discuss.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Molao, I can hear what you saying from here.

**MR GARE:** Firstly I am happy that this Budget is premised on the good governance and respect of the rule of law. I believe that we cannot make laws which talks about diversifying the economy and creation of jobs if we do not policies in place. It is an important issue and I am grateful that you have highlighted it on your Budget.

I have noticed that in your Budget you indicated that we are expecting an average of 4.5 per cent growth 2019/2020 this is very good. The growth percentage is low but I am happy because you have indicated that

without necessarily stifling our people from getting services, you tend to implement controls to ensure that our spending is controllable to avoid recession and also to ensure that our economy remains sustainable.

It is also important that a larger share of budget will focus on supporting the private sector. We believe that the private sector can improve our economy as well as to create job opportunities for our people.

Still on that, this budget shows that most of the funds will go to issues of diversifying the economy so that we do not depend solely on diamonds. It shows that we are serious and do not want to depend solely on diamonds but find other ways of generating more income.

Like I have already stated in the beginning, a large share of our budget will focus on supporting the private sector. I am concerned about the fact that even though we have Private Public Partnerships (PPPs) and privatisation of state-owned enterprises, it is still not clear as to what we have for our entrepreneurs more especially those who are at the informal sector. I am saying this because our entrepreneurs have a challenge when it comes to accessing the finance. We might be having Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) and other existing programmes but if you look at the turnaround time of CEDA you will realise that it is not in uniform with our aims to develop entrepreneurs. When you put your application through CEDA, it will take about three months minimum before you get funding and most of the time you do not receive the funds you applied for. First of all they are slow and from there they underfinance the project which I believe it is the reason why in most cases we find our entrepreneurs in 'in the matter between' cases due to the fact that they fail to make profits. Their failures are caused by the fact that we delay them and during that time prices on the other hand increase. If one had already taken a quotation, after receiving the funding he will find that prices have increased but the funds are little. We should have a program which will ensure that the issuing of funds is fast and that people get the exact sum they ask for.

Furthermore we have a challenge of security. It seems like when a person comes up with a business idea, irrespective of whether it is bankable or not, they never get assistance when they do not have security. We should carry out an evaluation so that those projects which are viable and have the potential to contribute to the economy are supported. That is all that I wanted to say about entrepreneurship.



Mr Speaker, the Minister talked about water and electricity services. I agree with my fellow Honourable Members that these services are important when it comes to attracting potential investors as well as for our daily livelihood. However it is quite embarrassing that our water and electricity services are still poor. An example is that of the situation at Moshupa; when it becomes windy we experience power cuts. Electricity is important. If we want to attract potential investors then we should have reliable electricity. For us to think about attracting potential investors we should be having reliable electricity.

We have water challenges. At Moshupa there are pipes which have never carried water for about six years, even the *Jojo* (water tanks) tanks which have been given to us can go for two to three weeks without water. When a Water Utilities Corporation (WUC) vehicle with a “we keep it flowing for you” branding passes by, I always wonder what they are talking about.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Yes, on that point of ‘we keep it flowing for you,’ you will proceed tomorrow Honourable Gare.

#### MOTION

#### ADJOURNMENT

**LEADER OF THE HOUSE (MR TSOGWANE):** Mr Speaker, I move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and **agreed to.**

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until Wednesday 13<sup>th</sup> February, 2019 at 2:00 p.m.



### **HANSARD RECORDERS**

Mr. T. Gaodumelwe, Mr T. Monakwe, Ms T. Kebonang

### **HANSARD REPORTERS**

Ms T. Rantsebele, Mr M. Buti, Ms N. Selebogo, Ms A. Ramadi,  
Ms D. Thibedi, Ms G. Baotsi, Ms N. Mokoka, Mr J. Samunzala, Ms Z. Molemi

### **HANSARD EDITORS**

Ms K. Nyanga, Ms C. Chonga, Mr K. Goeme, Ms G. Phatedi,  
Ms B. Malokwane, Mr A. Mokopakgosi, Ms O. Nkatswe, Ms G. Lekopanye  
Ms T. Mokhure, Ms B. Ratshipa

### **HANSARD TRANSLATORS**

Ms B. Ntisetsang, Ms. M. Sekao, Ms. M. Rabotsima, Ms. B. Mosinyi, Ms. V.  
Nkwane, Ms. N. Kerobale, Ms K. Alepeng, Ms T. Motsau, Ms O. Phesodi

### **HANSARD LAYOUT DESIGNERS**

Mr B. B. Khumanego, Mr D. T. Batshegi, Mr K. Rebaisakae

