

DAILY HANSARD

YOUR VOICE IN PARLIAMENT



THE SECOND MEETING OF THE FIFTH SESSION OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT

THURSDAY 14 FEBRUARY 2019

ENGLISH VERSION

HANSARD NO. 193



DISCLAIMER

Unofficial Hansard

This transcript of Parliamentary proceedings is an unofficial version of the Hansard and may contain inaccuracies. It is hereby published for general purposes only. The final edited version of the Hansard will be published when available and can be obtained from the Assistant Clerk (Editorial).

THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY SPEAKER
The Hon. Gladys K. T. Kokorwe PH, MP.
DEPUTY SPEAKER
The Hon. Kagiso P. Molatlhegi, MP Gaborone South

Clerk of the National Assembly	- Ms B. N. Dithapo
Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly	- Mr L. T. Gaolaolwe
Learned Parliamentary Counsel	- Ms M. Mokgosi
Assistant Clerk (E)	- Mr R. Josiah

CABINET

His Excellency Dr M. E. K. Masisi, MP	- President
His Honour S. Tsogwane, MP. (Boteti West)	- Vice President
Hon. F. S. Van Der Westhuizen, MP. (Kgalagadi South)	- Minister of Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. D. K. Makgato, MP. (Sefhare - Ramokgonami)	- Minister of Transport and Communications
Hon. N. E. Molefhi, MP. (Selebi Phikwe East)	- Minister for Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration
Hon. S. Kgathi, MP. (Bobonong)	- Minister of Defence, Justice and Security
Hon. O. K. Mokaila, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Environment, Natural Resources Conservation and Tourism
Hon. B. Arone, MP. (Okavango)	- Minister of Basic Education
Hon. M. N. Ngaka, MP (Takatokwane)	- Minister of Nationality, Immigration and Gender Affairs
Hon. O. K. Matambo, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Finance and Economic Development
Hon. V. T. Seretse, MP. (Lentsweletau - Mmopane)	- Minister of Infrastructure and Housing Development
Hon. T. Olopeng, MP. (Tonota)	- Minister of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology
Hon. Dr U. Dow, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of International Affairs and Cooperation
Hon. T. Mabeo, MP. (Thamaga - Kumakwane)	- Minister of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development
Hon. Dr A. Madigele, MP. (Mmathethe - Molapowabojang)	- Minister of Health and Wellness
Hon. E. M. Molale, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security
Hon. K. Mzwini, MP. (Mmadinare)	- Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services
Hon. T. S. Khama, MP. (Serowe West)	- Minister of Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development
Hon. P. P. Ralotsia, MP. (Kanye North)	- Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security
Hon. B. J. Kenewendo, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry
Hon. B. M. Tshireletso, MP. (Mahalapye East)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. M. M. Goya, MP. (Palapye)	- Assistant Minister, Investment, Trade and Industry
Hon. D. P. Makgalemele, MP. (Shoshong)	- Assistant Minister, Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development
Hon. F. M. M. Molao, MP (Shashe West)	- Assistant Minister, Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology
Hon. K. K. Autlwetse, MP (Serowe North)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. G. B. Butale, MP. (Tati West)	- Assistant Minister, Health and Wellness
Hon. T. Kwerepe, MP. (Ngami)	- Assistant Minister, Basic Education
Hon. I. E. Moipisi, MP. (Kgalagadi North)	- Assistant Minister, Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services
Hon. M. R. Shamukuni, MP (Chobe)	- Assistant Minister, Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration
Hon. K. Markus, MP. (Maun East)	- Assistant Minister, Agricultural Development and Food Security

MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT AND THEIR CONSTITUENCIES

Names	Constituency
RULING PARTY (Botswana Democratic Party)	
Hon. Dr P. Venson-Moitoi, MP	Serowe South
Hon. S. M. Guma, MP	Tati East
Hon. C. De Graaff, MP	Ghanzi South
Hon. P. M. Maele, MP	Lerala - Maunatlala
Hon. L. Kablay, MP	Letlhakeng - Lephephe
Hon. S. Lelatisitswe, MP	Boteti East
Hon. J. Molefe, MP	Mahalapye West
Hon. P. Majaga, MP	Nata-Gweta
Hon. M. I. Moswaane, MP	Francistown West
Hon. B. H. Billy, MP	Francistown East
Hon. E. J. Batshu, MP	Nkange
Hon. S. Kebonang, MP	Lobatse
Hon. K. S. Gare, MP	Moshupa-Manyana
Hon. M. R. Reatile, MP	Specially Elected
OPPOSITION	
(Umbrella for Democratic Change)	
Hon. Adv. D. G. Boko, MP (Leader of Opposition)	Gaborone Bonnington North
Hon. G. S. M. Mangole, MP	Mochudi West
Hon. A. S. Kesupile, MP	Kanye South
Hon. N. S. L. M. Salakae, MP	Ghanzi North
Hon. Dr. T. O. M. Mmatli, MP	Molepolole South
Hon. S. Ntlhaile, MP	Jwaneng -Mabutsane
Hon. M. I. Khan, MP	Molepolole North
Hon. Kgosi Lotlamoreng II	Goodhope - Mabule
Hon. D. L. Keorapetse, MP	Selebi Phikwe West
Hon. S. O. S. Rantuana, MP	Ramotswa
Hon. K. M. Segokgo, MP	Tlokweng
Hon. B. M. Molebatsi, MP	Mochudi East
(Alliance for Progressives)	
Hon. W. B. Mmolotsi, MP	Francistown South
Hon. Maj. Gen. P. Mokgware, MP	Gabane-Mmankgodi
Hon. N. N. Gaolathe, MP	Gaborone Bonnington South
Hon. S. Kgoroba, MP	Mogoditshane
Hon. Dr P. Butale, MP	Gaborone Central
Hon. H. G. Nkaigwa, MP	Gaborone North
(Independent Member of Parliament)	
Hon. T. Moremi, MP	Maun West

TABLE OF CONTENTS
THE SECOND MEETING OF THE FIFTH SESSION
OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT
THURSDAY 14 FEBRUARY, 2019

<i>CONTENTS</i>	<i>PAGE (S)</i>
QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER	1 - 6
TABLING OF PAPERS	
Botswana Investment And Trade Centre (BITC) Annual Report For The Financial Year, 2018.....	7
Statutory Instrument No. 195 Of 2018: Botswana-United Arab Emirates Double Taxation Avoidance Agreement Order, 2018.....	7
Appropriation (2019/2020) Bill, 2019 (No. 1 Of 2019) Second Reading (Resumed Debate).....	7 - 30



Thursday 14th February, 2019

THE ASSEMBLY met at 2:00 p.m.

(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)

P R A Y E R S

* * * *

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER

FARMING ALONG RIVERS AND MAJOR DAMS

MR W. B. MMOLOTSI (FRANCISTOWN SOUTH): asked the Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security what his ministry is doing to encourage farming along rivers and major dams like Shashe, Letsibogo and Ntimbale in Botswana.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND FOOD SECURITY (MR MARKUS): The Ministry of Agricultural Development and Food Security (MoA) does encourage irrigated farming along rivers and dams through its extension service. In addition, the ministry has water rights for irrigation purposes at Lotsane and Thune dams.

Furthermore, my ministry has provided electricity connection to 29 farms in the Ditladi/Gulushabe horticulture cluster. A perimeter fence has been constructed for Gulushabe rain-fed cluster situated along Shashe River. Additionally, there is irrigated crop production activities along Limpopo, Notwane, Motloutse, Tati and Metsimotlhabe rivers.

To avoid possible pollution of water bodies due to agricultural practices, farming along Shashe, Letsibogo, Ntimbale and Gaborone dams is restricted as these provide water for domestic use only.

I am pleased to inform you that my ministry is already embarking upon several initiatives as a way of promoting fish farming in Botswana. Fish farming projects are being implemented in Letsibogo, Dikgatlong and Thune dams to name a few. Thank you.

MR LELATISITSWE: Supplementary. Thank you so much Minister for your answer. I just wanted to know from you the Minister of Agriculture that, since you are the same person who is doing this programme of distributing seeds as Ministry of Agriculture, and also encouraging integrated farming, why is it difficult for you to give people who are at the cattle posts seeds because integrated farming is a concept which is under your ministry. Why is it difficult to increase food security?

MR MARKUS: Honourable Member, I was asked about Letsibogo Dam, that one about seeds is a different question, you can bring it and I will get an answer for you.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Further supplementary.

MR SPEAKER (MR MOLATLHEGI): Let us take the last one Honourable Mmolotsi.

MR MMOLOTSI: Minister, now that there are some farms not too far from the dams that you have just talked about, especially Shashe dam, are you amenable to allowing them to draw water from the dams for them to irrigate their crops?

MR MARKUS: Indeed sir, if there is viable ploughing there that we could possibly agree to, definitely we will agree to such an initiative.

LAND ALLOCATION FOR CHURCHES

MR A. S. KESUPILE (KANYE SOUTH): asked the Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services if he is aware that churches are increasing in the Southern District and urgently require land; and if so,

- (i) to explain the refusal by Government to grant Batswana owned churches land;
- (ii) if he will allow the continued use of residences for church services for those awaiting allocation; and
- (iii) if there are plans to waive a business plan as a condition for consideration of land allocation.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LAND MANAGEMENT, WATER AND SANITATION SERVICES (MR MOIPISI): Thank you Mr Speaker.

I am not aware that churches are increasing in Southern District for the reason that applications or registration of churches are not done by the ministry that I am the Minister of.

- (i) The Government has not refused to allocate Batswana owned churches land. The procedure is that all civic and community plots (these are plots that can be used for schools, churches, etc) are planned and surveyed before allocation through national open competitive public tender in accordance with the Botswana Land Policy of 2015. This is done for transparency and fair allocations.



- (ii) The Government's position is that residential plots should only be used for the intended purpose, therefore churches may not use them in order to avoid land use conflict.
- (iii) My ministry through various land boards and Department of Lands does not require business plans from applicants applying for civic and community plots, but rather requires submission of a management plan. The management plan explains how the land will be utilised and managed. Therefore, the ministry does not have any plans to waive management plans as it is the ministry's mandate to ensure that the allocated land is utilised and managed prudently. I thank you.

MR NKAIGWA: Supplementary. Minister, how many civic and community plots have you allocated in the Southern District in the past five years? Among those, how many plots were allocated to churches? You also indicated that they should be advertised, but then why do you allocate these plots to foreign companies in some areas without having advertised them yet you always emphasise advertising?

MR MOIPISI: Thank you Mr Speaker. The records that I have here show that the last time the Ngwaketse Land Board allocated a plot to a church was in 2017 at Moshupa and it was one church. That answers question one. Yes, indeed civic and community plots are advertised and we do just follow that procedure. I do not have any information to the fact that some private businesses or private individuals have been allocated plots that are meant for civic and community. I thank you Mr Speaker.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Supplementary.

MR SPEAKER: Last one Honourable Mokgware.

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: Supplementary. Thank you. Minister. I hear you well, but nationwide, not just the Southern District, churches have a belief that they are deliberately disadvantaged, looking at the statistic from 2017, only one church was actually allocated. Can you just for the benefit of everybody else and churches which are nationwide, state how many churches were allocated plots in the last five years? I think that you disadvantage them.

MR MOIPISI: I think with due respect Mr Speaker; it will be very unfair for me to answer that because the Honourable Member is requiring me to just indicate in

the last five years how many churches were allocated in the country. In a nutshell, I will have to go back to seek that information from all the land boards in Botswana. I thank you Mr Speaker.

RESOURCE AVAILABILITY AT LETLHAKANE POLICE STATION AND LETLHAKANE POLICE DISTRICT HEADQUARTERS

MR S. LELATISITSWE (BOTETI EAST): asked the Minister of Defence, Justice and Security to update this Honourable House on the resource availability at Letlhakane Police Station and Letlhakane Police District Headquarters; and to state:

- (i) the number of vacant positions at the above offices, length of time they have been vacant and how this has affected service delivery;
- (ii) if the vehicles are sufficient; and if not, when more vehicles will be provided;
- (iii) the condition of offices and furniture in the two offices; and
- (iv) which police stations fall under the Letlhakane District Headquarters.

Thank you Mr Speaker and happy Valentine's Day.

MR SPEAKER: He is young, he said "happy Valentine's day." I am waiting for elections sir, I do not care about that.

ACTING MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR SHAMUKUNI): Mr Speaker,

- (i) currently there are four vacant posts in the staff complement of the Letlhakane District, and these are to be filled through the Botswana Police Service Promotions and Transfers Board, which will be sitting in March 2019.
- (ii) Letlhakane Police Station was allocated one vehicle in 2016, one in 2017 and three vehicles in 2018. Nonetheless, the Police Station like other police stations in the country faces a challenge of insufficient vehicles. However, supplementary transport is sourced as and when necessary from Orapa and Rakops Police Stations, which fall under Letlhakane District.
- (iii) Letlhakane Police Station does have general maintenance challenges, which we have only been able to respond to through regular minor maintenance works. Regarding the furniture, a decision has been taken to board and replace worn out furniture during the financial year 2019/2020.



- (iv) Letlhakane District Headquarters covers Letlhakane, Orapa and Rakops police stations.

Mr Speaker, by way of information; I should indicate that processes for the construction of the new Letlhakane Police Station and staff houses planned in National Development Plan (NDP) 11 are on-going. Consultants have completed the designs and are currently compiling the scope of work to pave way for tender preparations. The completion of the new police station, I believe, will usher in a long term solution to the challenges alluded to by the Honourable Member of Parliament for Boteti East. I thank you Mr Speaker.

CONDITIONS OF SERVICES FOR EMPLOYEES OF SHANA GAS IN PHAKALANE

MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH): asked the Minister of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development if he is aware that:

- (i) employees of SHANA Gas in Phakalane work without safety equipment; and if so, what is being done to address this anomaly;
- (ii) employees work long hours without overtime pay; and
- (iii) employees are not paid risk allowance despite the type of work they do.

MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT, LABOUR PRODUCTIVITY AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT (MR MABEO): Mr Speaker,

- (i) my ministry conducted a joint factory and labour inspection at Shana Gas on the 8th February 2019. It was established that although employees were provided with protective clothing such as safety boots, pair of overalls and leather gloves, this provision is not adequate as some employees were not provided with all these items. The employer was advised to give all employees protective clothing with immediate effect. The feedback received from the employer is that all employees has been given protective clothing, with the exception of only three employees who are waiting for the supply of protective boots. The protective boots are expected to arrive on 15th February 2019.
- (ii) Mr Speaker, it was established that employees who work overtime are given time off in lieu of payment. The employer was advised that this practice was not in conformity with Section 95(5)

of the Employment Act which provides that; "If an employee is required to work in any one day more than the number of hours in the ordinary daily working period, the number of hours so worked in excess shall be deemed, for the purpose of this Act, to be overtime, and the employee shall be paid for such overtime, one and a half times the wages he would have been paid had the time worked not been overtime". The employer was therefore advised to pay employees for overtime worked, and he undertook to comply.

- (iii) Mr Speaker, the employer confirmed that there was no risk allowance paid to employees. Since there is no provision for payment of risk allowance in the Employment Act, the employer and employees were advised to take the issue up as part of the collective bargaining process. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR NKAIGWA: Supplementary. Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Minister. Thank you for the good answer from you. I want to appreciate from you whether these employees would be paid back pays for overtime that has not been paid for?

MR MABEO: Thank you Honourable Member Haskins Nkaigwa. Indeed, when we engaged the employer he promised that any back pays would be paid. Thank you Mr Speaker.

GOVERNMENT'S OBLIGATION TO PROVIDE WORK TO ITS EMPLOYEES

MR D. L. KEORAPETSE (SELEBI PHIKWE WEST): asked the Minister of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development if Government as the employer has an obligation to provide work and:

- (i) if he is aware that an employee at salary scale of D3 in the ministry has not been allocated work for 18 months following a transfer dispute and if so, to confirm whether Government lost the court case against the said employee; and
- (ii) why the Permanent Secretary cannot be surcharged for the loss of money through payment of work not done and the court case costs. Thank you Mr Speaker, that 18 months turned to 24 months now.



MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT, LABOUR PRODUCTIVITY AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT (MR MABEO): Mr Speaker,

- (i) I am aware of a D3 salary scale officer who was transferred from one department to another in the former Ministry of Labour and Home Affairs on 28th September 2016. The officer did not honour the transfer claiming that she was not given work by the Director at her new duty station. This was however not supported by written evidence. She was transferred to where her services were needed most and she was required to report and execute her duties at the new duty station. The officer could not be allocated work in the Ministry of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development as she was substantively an employee of the Ministry of Nationality, Immigration and Gender Affairs. The officer later challenged the administrative decision to transfer her at court, and the court made a decision in her favour on the 24th January 2019, and she is occupying her original position of Principal Industrial Relations II, in the Department of Labour and Social Security.

Having said that Mr Speaker, I have spoken to the concerned officer just before I came to Parliament, and she has regrettably confirmed to me that even though she has been reinstated, she is not being given work. I will be going back to engage the executive at my ministry because this is administrative.

- (ii) Finally Mr Speaker, surcharge is provided for in Section 43 of the Public Finance Management Act Cap: 54:01. The circumstances under which the power of surcharge may be exercised are varied, but mainly involve wilful default or negligence pertaining to custody of public finance and property. As such, this provision is deemed irrelevant to this particular case. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR KEORAPETSE: Supplementary. Thank you Minister Minister. What I fail to understand is, I heard you saying that the officer did not honour the transfer to the Ministry of Gender. Are you aware that this officer specialises in industrial relations, and she was supposed to be taken to the Ministry of Gender; misplaced if you may. Also that where she was transferred, the scheme of service for the position that she was being transferred to, was for a degree level and she is a holder of a Diploma. I just wanted to find out if you are aware?

Secondly, if you are aware if this officer has been paid up to nearly half a million for two years, that is the total of around P498 000 but without work.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs) ...

MR KEORAPETSE: No! No! You just need to look at the scale and then estimate how much she has been paid for two years. You think the Permanent Secretary (PS) should not be surcharged for paying somebody half a million with no work. How does that work in your Government?

MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT, LABOUR PRODUCTIVITY AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT (MR MABEO): Thank you very much Honourable Keorapetse. Mr Speaker, I know Honourable Keorapetse did ask my officials the same question at Public Accounts Committee (PAC), and apparently, he is bringing it back again this time around.

Having said that Mr Speaker, I think I do not deny that the officer was not given work. As I have said, I have just talked to the officer. The fact that she has been reinstated but even up to now she is not being given work is something that really is appalling, honestly. It is appalling because we cannot keep on paying an officer that is not doing any work, it is unacceptable. That is why I am saying I am going to follow up this matter. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR KEORAPETSE: Further supplementary. Honourable Minister, do you realise that you have a problem with your Permanent Secretary, in the sense that there will be many such cases of litigation, where the ministry is losing cases, and you are still telling us that it will not be proper to surcharge the Permanent Secretary? Are you aware that your Permanent Secretary is bullying her staff to the point where some people are even suffering from strokes? What is wrong in that ministry? Why are you not addressing problems in your ministry? You know, I have several questions coming your way regarding your Permanent Secretary. What is it that you are doing substantively and properly to deal with the Permanent Secretary? Just for the record, on the day your ministry appeared, I was not at PAC, it is Honourable Ntlhaile who was asking these questions.

MR MABEO: Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Thank you very much Honourable Dithapelo Keorapetse. I think Honourable Keorapetse, you must acknowledge the fact that I am saying, and I am going to be following up on this matter. I do agree with you, like I have earlier



alluded to. There is no way we can be paying an officer who is just sitting in the office, who is supposed to be providing a service to the people. I fully agree with you, it is very awkward. What I am saying is, and you must understand this, that some of these decisions are administrative, so you cannot really be saying, "Minister what are you doing and why are you not doing this". I do agree with you that something needs to be done. I thank you Mr Speaker.

POOR WORKMANSHIP AT SESUNG AND SELOKOLELA ROAD STRIPS

MR A. S. KESUPILE (KANYE SOUTH): asked the Minister of Transport and Communications if she is aware:

- (i) that the Sesung and Selokolela road strips are experiencing a repeat of poor workmanship that could result in serious wastage of resources and damage the reputation of the Roads Department and greater suffering to the general public; and if so,
- (ii) she should state what her ministry is doing to ensure that the road strips are of high quality and standard.

ACTING MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS TSHIRELETSO): Thank you Mr Speaker.

- (i) My ministry is not aware of a repeat of poor workmanship on Selokolela access road which is 9.6 kilometres and Sesung access road which is 7.9 kilometres. I must, however, state that defective work detected are rectified at the contractor's expense.

Details of remedial work are that: the Selokolela access road was initially constructed up to surfacing and could not meet the contract specifications. The contractor was instructed to rectify the failing portions of the road at his expense. The failed section, which was six kilometres out of the 9.6 kilometres was then subjected to surface riding quality (smoothness) and pavement strength tests on the 14th and 27th November 2018, and was found to meet the contract specifications.

Similarly, four kilometres of the completed construction works (up to road surfacing) on Sesung access road, was rectified and subjected to the same tests on the 24th October 2018 and 9th November 2018. The section

was found to meet the requirements of the contract specifications. That is the position on those works; unless the Honourable Member is talking about new or fresh incidents.

- (ii) Mr Speaker, my ministry continues to closely monitor quality on these and other roadworks, generally; in order to ensure that they are constructed as per the contract specifications and designs.

Where non-compliance is detected, the contractors will be compelled to rectify any defective works, at their own expense before the works could be accepted. Thank you Mr Speaker.

REVIEW OF PENSIONERS' ALLOWANCES AND FOOD BASKETS FOR ORPHANS AND THE DISABLED

MR B. M. MOLEBATSI (MOCHUDI EAST): asked the Minister of Local Government and Rural Development if he will consider:

- (i) increasing pensioners' allowances from the current monthly rate to P800.00; and
- (ii) revising the value of food baskets given to orphans and the disabled.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MS TSHIRELETSO): Mr Speaker,

- (i) My ministry is aware that Old Age Pension has not been reviewed over the years except for the inflationary adjustments made whenever there was an adjustment to salaries and allowances of the public service.

Taking into consideration the various needs that the elderly have, which include but not limited to health and transport, consultation with relevant structures was made to review the current Old Age Pension which stands at P430 per month.

Based on these consultations, my ministry will make an announcement for the next steps with regard to revision of the Old Age Pension and other allowances including that of people living with disabilities.

- (ii) Mr Speaker, the food basket for orphans currently range from P650 to P750 depending on the locality and dietary needs of the children. The amounts are not adjusted in accordance with inflation



as they are based on the allocated budget. My ministry is however working towards rationalising and standardising services to promote equity among orphans, thereby availing the limited welfare resources to those in need. Furthermore, rationalisation will assist in identifying ... (Inaudible)... intervention for the varying needs of orphans and assisting accordingly. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR MOLEBATSI: Supplementary. Thank you Honourable Minister for that hope filled answer. How do you feel when it is said one identified to be a destitute if they do not earn more than P300, that is they are identified through earnings or expenditure; so if they earn more than P300 are they not needy?

I would also like to tell you that P800 has been overtaken by events, my leaders are saying we should now be at least P1 500, so please increase your pace Honourable Minister. Thank you.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MS TSHIRELETSO): Thank you Honourable Molebatsi. We are reviewing those cases as you request Honourable. Thank you Mr Speaker.

CONTINUOUS SHORTAGE OF ESSENTIAL EYE DROPS AND DRUGS AT SCOTISH LIVINGSTONE HOSPITAL

DR T. MMATLI (MOLEPOLOLE SOUTH): asked the Minister of Health and Wellness to apprise this Honourable House on the continuous shortage of essential eye drops and drugs at Scottish Livingstone Hospital.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR G. B. BUTALE): Mr Speaker, I wish to inform this Honourable House that indeed there is shortage of some eye drops in Scottish Livingstone Hospital.

Currently there are three types of eye drops that are not in stock and these are Homatropine 2 per cent which has been out of stock since September 2018; Tetracycline 1 per cent ointment which ran out in the first week of February 2019 and Tetracaine 0.5 per cent eye drops which has been out of stock for more than six months.

Homatropine and Tetracaine drops are difficult to source from the market. However, all the three types of eye drops have alternatives.

Mr Speaker, the policy of my ministry is that where a drug is not available, prescribers are encouraged to use alternatives. My ministry will ensure that information flows well between the patients and the service providers. Thank you.

MR MOLEBATSI: Supplementary. Thank you Minister. These people come from far areas looking for medication. Is there no other way your pharmacists can write prescriptions for them so that they can get it from other places looking at the fact that, they are underprivileged and elderly from Mochudi?

MR G. B. BUTALE: Thank you Honourable. Those who come from Mochudi should not go to Molepolole but can get them in Gaborone. Honourable Member I explained is that there are alternative medicines not the ones I have mentioned but they treat the same infection. Thank you Mr Speaker.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Supplementary.

MR SPEAKER: The last one.

MR SEGOKGO: Supplementary. Thank you Mr Speaker. Minister, how is the stock level for those alternatives? If they are also not available knowing well there should be alternative for those other ones, that does not help the situation for patients to be assisted.

MR G. B. BUTALE: Mr Speaker, according to my knowledge, alternative medication is available, if it was not then I would not be have said there is an alternative. Thank you Mr Speaker.

ENGAGEMENT OF COMPANIES BASED OUTSIDE BOTSWANA BY BOTSWANA TOURISM ORGANISATION (BTO)

MR M. R. REATILE (SPECIALLY ELECTED): asked the Minister of Environment, Natural Resources Conservation and Tourism to state:

- (i) the amount paid by Botswana Tourism Organization (BTO) to companies based outside Botswana to advertise local tourism online for the past three years;
- (ii) why the companies were tasked to perform those services instead of engaging Batswana;
- (iii) the costs of the 2018 Broadway trip;
- (iv) the criterion that was used to select the organization/company to represent Botswana tourism in Broadway; and
- (v) those who were involved in the selection process.



Later Date.

TABLING OF PAPERS

The following papers were tabled:

BOTSWANA INVESTMENT AND TRADE CENTRE (BITC) ANNUAL REPORT FOR THE FINANCIAL YEAR, 2018

(Assistant Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry)

STATUTORY INSTRUMENT NO. 195 OF 2018: BOTSWANA-UNITED ARAB EMIRATES DOUBLE TAXATION AVOIDANCE AGREEMENT ORDER, 2018

(Minister of Finance and Economic Development)

APPROPRIATION (2019/2020) BILL, 2019 (NO. 1 OF 2019)

Second Reading

(Resumed Debate)

MR SPEAKER: When the House adjourned yesterday, Honourable Biggie Butale was on the floor and he is still left with 12 minutes 11 seconds.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR G. B. BUTALE): Thank you Mr Speaker. As I was saying yesterday Mr Speaker, for us to change the trajectory of our economy, we need to embark on some major mega projects that will not only create employment but create wealth, so that we take pressure off the Government revenues where people want and hope for wealth created through receiving grants and salary increments. Some of the projects that I have been talking about ever since I became a Member of this House, include the coal to liquids plants that will convert Botswana's huge coal resources into petroleum products and other downstream chemical industries.

Mr Speaker, Botswana is smack in the middle of the Southern African Development Community (SADC) region and we are well poised to become the regional transportation hub; be it air transport, road transport or rail transport. I am aware of Government plans to build a railway from Kazungula right down to meet the Moseitse Railway and onwards from Gaborone to Walvis Bay. These projects need to be acted upon urgently if we are to realise this dream.

There is the Agro-Zambezi Project in Pandamatenga and this again has a potential of becoming a new engine of growth for the economy because this project

also has the potential of spinning off other economic growth generators like the food industry and packaging industries, and so on and so forth.

Finally, of course Mr Speaker, leveraging on our greatest resource diamonds. Mr Speaker, for Botswana to truly become a diamond...

MR MOREMI: Clarification. Minister, from the projects that you mentioned, has the Agro-Zambezi and the project which leads to Walvis Bay ever been given a timeline or will they be implemented?

MR G. B. BUTALE: Mr Speaker, I am not quite sure if there was ever a timeline, but timelines are very important. I agree Honourable Moremi, we need timelines, otherwise these good intentions become just that.

Mr Speaker, one way again to grow our economy is no doubt to increase the productivity of the labour sector in Botswana. We need to be, not only time conscious Mr Speaker, but also to deliver on projects under our watch, to do our work timeously, and up to a certain standard. There is no country in the world apart from perhaps countries that have been blessed with mineral resources, that have been able to reach prosperity levels without the *concomitant* increase of productivity levels. Botswana and Batswana are not well-known for productivity levels, and for the past 30 or 40 years, Government has spent millions of Pula copying countries like Singapore, Malaysia, Japan and others in Asia and Europe. I am sure some of the programmes that we have transplanted from these countries have helped somewhat, be it Work Improvement Programme Teams (WITs) or the Botswana National Productivity Centre (BNPC) and other such products, but still there is this nagging feeling that out workers, be it in public or private sector, are not pulling their weight as they should.

The Government should also Mr Speaker, come up with a way of investing some of our assets, our finances Honourable Matambo, in research and development. Again...

MR SPEAKER: Order! Hold it right there Honourable Butale, those people are disturbing you. Move from there.

MR G. B. BUTALE: I think it must be the spirit of valentine Mr Speaker. As I was saying Mr Speaker, the countries that are doing well, and that will continue to do well, are those that invest in research and



development, but I know, as Africans, there are certain things that we think are a waste of money, like most Africans and I think Batswana included, we do not believe in maintenance; maintenance of buildings, cars or machinery. We think that it is a waste of money, as well as research and development, but in the long term, if you do not maintain your car, your house or whatever it is, you are going to end up paying more than if you had. In the same vein, if we do not put any money as we are doing currently, any money at all in research and development, it will catch up with us, and we will end up paying more by buying ideas and patency from those countries that had put in the necessary investment.

Mr Speaker, I have also said this before that some of the money wasting programmes like Ipelegeng, Youth Development Fund (YDF) and Gender, should be scrapped. In my mind, you can win elections with Ipelegeng and Youth Fund, giving every young person money to go and buy a tent. Like in my village, Masunga, we have ten young people given tents for catering, and the catering business just collapsed in Masunga. Maybe those young people will think Honourable Olopeng is a brilliant Minister, and they would vote for his party, (my party), but in the long term, that is going to catch up with us Mr Speaker. It is actually a low level economic way of doing things, very rudimentary, and we have to up our game. It is my belief that programmes like Ipelegeng should not be for young people at all. We should not be cutting grass in the 21st century; cutting grass and bushes. Nowadays, it rains, and two weeks later, you cannot even point at what these people are doing. I think that is a crime to our future generations, dissipating the diamond bonanza on cutting grass. Spending P1 billion giving young people tents and catering equipment, and all those billion Pula over the border into South Africa, the tents are there, they are being damaged by termites. Totally unacceptable. It is a good way to win elections, but like I said, we are doing a disservice not only to ourselves but to our future.

Mr Speaker, I have said before that the private sector should be in the forefront of creating employment, and wealth, and the Government should move away from certain...

HIS HONOUR THE VICE PRESIDENT (MR TSOGWANE): Clarification. Mr Speaker, I just want to seek clarification from the Honourable Member holding the floor, whether he understands himself well when he is talking about Ipelegeng and tents, because I do not

think Ipelegeng and the tents are linked. When you are talking about tents, it should be a different programme, not Ipelegeng. Ipelegeng is temporary employment, not the provision of tents. So, I do not know whether you have realised you are mixing the two different things.

MR G. B. BUTALE: Thank you Your Honour. I will continue. Ipelegeng; it is true; it does not deal with tents. If I said that Your Honour, I made a mistake. I think I said Youth Development Fund, but you are right.

The private sector should take the lead, but our Government and especially our civil servants have a hangover of the 60s and 50s where socialism was 'the in thing'. I am guilty of that too, where I believe that the Government should start this and that, whereas the private sector should be encouraged to venture in all of these areas that we feel there is need to do so. The idea of going to Europe and America telling people to come and invest in Botswana, will not take us anywhere, and has not taken us anywhere. What we need to do is to set up the infrastructure, the vision, the plan to say, for instance, we want to do a leather manufacturing plant in Lobatse, and then ask those investors who are interested to come there. When you just tell them; "Botswana is a beautiful country, we are peaceful, come," we will be saying the same thing after 20 years and we are not going to get anything Mr Speaker.

MINISTER OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MS KENEWENDO): Clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. I just wanted clarity from the Honourable Member, was that your position that you were asking people to come to Botswana without a clear vision and strategy when you were at Investment, Trade and Industry? Thank you.

MR G. B. BUTALE: It is a good thing I have run out of time. So, I will let that pass.

MR SPEAKER: Your time is up Honourable Butale.

MR G. B. BUTALE: Thank you Mr Speaker.

MR MMOLOTSI (FRANCISTOWN SOUTH): Thank you very much Mr Speaker. I thought I would respond in this Budget after some time. Mr Speaker, I feel compelled because I think ...

MR SPEAKER: Wait Honourable Mmolotsi. It is noisy, I do not understand what is it about.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs) ...



MR SPEAKER: Honourable Tshireletso, Honourable Goya, Honourable Maele, silence! Disperse from there! Proceed Honourable Mmolotsi.

MR MMOLOTSI: Thank you. Mr Speaker, I had huge expectation about this Budget which is the current President's first one, that it is supposed to pave a fresh path that we are supposed to take which is different from how we have been doing things. We have mentioned in the last State of Nation Address (SONA) that our nation is at a stage of do or die. As it is, there is need to improve how we do things so that we can see that we and our children will lead improved lives looking at how we budgeted for our country. We had issues which were worrying us before the President was inaugurated. I had thought these serious issues will be dealt with in the current budget.

Maybe let me address the issue of health for example. I had hoped that this ministry would get a better share to address issues of concern. A person's life is sacred and should continue to be treated as such if the situation of health can be treated accordingly. We continue to realise that the health of the nation is not being treated seriously. That is why Honourable Moswaane was escorted outside by hefty men because of the issue of lack of resources at Nyangabgwe.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR MMOLOTSI: There are no resources in Botswana hospitals. The equipment in Botswana are not serviced; they are damaged. The state at Nyangabgwe is even worse. Everything is dilapidated, nothing functions optimally and this current budget does not answer how Francistown residents and the North are going to have an improved health situation. This budget does not give me any hope that we will get assistance.

Right now the whole of the North has a serious shortage of doctors. Those who need to consult gynaecologists are booked for four years. Who is the Minister of Health and Wellness here? You wonder if one is supposed to see a doctor after four years, is that sickness on leave? Mr Speaker, these things are indicative that if we do not prepare our budgets well, our people will perish.

I am saying this today so that the nation may be aware that at Nyangabgwe Hospital, there are four gynecology specialists, the fifth one at Serowe is a general practitioner who is used because of his experience. These specialists handle 50 patients a day and this results in people getting booked to see a doctor after

four years. Most of them die before they see doctors. Now with the current budget having been presented as it is, it does not show how things are going to be done differently this time around to ensure that this situation of shortage of doctors gets improved.

Francistown clinics, there are so many vacancies and when you ask, you are told that there are no posts, but there are vacancies. That does not favour us because when you take Masego Clinic for example, it should have 14 nurses but it operates with 10, you wonder how they manage to do their work. Take the whole of the District Health Management Teams (DHMT) of Francistown for example, which is supposed to have 23 doctors; we are running with 10 doctors. You can see that it is not the people's budget. It is a wrong budget which cannot assist Batswana to get resources they need at the moment.

Drugs are unavailable in hospitals. We have a challenge where most of the drugs are unavailable and each and every time you ask a question in Parliament, you will be told that no, drug availability in hospitals is 85 per cent. It always remains at 85 per cent, it is never 84 or 86. So, you ask yourself, what kind of an answer is that one. We have a challenge. Our parents go to hospitals and find that there are no tablets even for High Blood.

Recently I went to buy myself tablets at Pharma North Pharmacy in Francistown. So, I met women who are of Honourable Kenewendo's size.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!) ...

MR MMOLOTSI: I asked them ...

MINISTER OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MS KENEWENDO): Point of order. Mr Speaker, I am just here minding my business and get provoked. I want Honourable Mmolotsi to explain which size is he talking about? A very Honourable Member of this House. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Mmolotsi, your initial statement was alright when you said women of Honourable Kenewendo's age. I do not know why you had to add the other one. Withdraw that.

MR MMOLOTSI: Let me withdraw 'size'. Women of Kenewendo's age ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: And Honourable.



MR MMOLOTSI: ... and Honourable Kenewendo. I asked them because they were from my Constituency, what the problem was. They told me that it has been months in all the hospitals in that city without the injection used to prevent ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR MMOLOTSI: ...to prevent pregnancy. That one. Therefore, they had gone there to buy it. So, we might find that by the end of the year, the situation of people getting pregnant without plans of getting pregnant has increased tremendously. That is why the supposed people's Budget should address people's concerns. Minister, I believe going forward, we must look into ways of reinforcing the Ministry of Health and Wellness budget.

MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (MR ARONE): Clarification. No, Honourable Mmolotsi, one would be curious to know how come out of all these drugs which are unavailable these women choose to talk to you about that particular one?

MR MMOLOTSI: I am saying, I was there, I went to buy my tablets as I was not well. I saw them lined up and I asked them jokingly since I know them. They told me that they came for ... When they get there they found the same situation. So, we must be serious in addressing health issues and ensure that essential drugs are available in Parliament. You are happy Botswana Democratic Party members because when it comes to issues of pregnancy, you are number one.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!) ...

MR MMOLOTSI: Let me move on to ...

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Mmolotsi, you are messing up your debate.

MR MMOLOTSI: Okay, I withdraw Mr Speaker. It is just that excitement of the likes of Arone.... ..

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Point of order.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!) ...

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MS TSHIRELETSO): Point of order. The thing is even if he can withdraw Mr Speaker he cannot say we are number one when it comes to pregnancy. We want him to withdraw that statement because we do not know whom he was referring to. Maybe he was referring to the likes of Molebatsi, Segokgo and Khan that side. It is a problem.

MR SPEAKER: No, he has withdrawn the statement. The reason why I have been telling him that he is ruining his debate is because he is starting to include other things that are going to disturb him.

MR MMOLOTSI (FRANCISTOWN SOUTH): I will leave that one and talk about unemployment which is a huge concern in our country. I have been talking about health, which presents an opportunity of employment creation. I was asking a question; when talking about unemployed people, we do have more than 200 nurses who are roaming the streets today. We have many hospitals in Botswana which operate with shortage eventhough we have qualified people for the job who are unemployed. If the plan was to create employment with this Budget, we were going to make sure that we absorb the unemployed nurses and doctors. That was one of our expectation for the Ministry of Health, the budget was supposed to answer that problem.

Education; Ministries of Education; both Basic and Tertiary, We have been given a budget that I was hoping would be different considering the fact that we are faced with a number of challenges in Botswana. Challenges in our schools that we are aware of includes the number of students in our classrooms. The number of students in our classrooms is high. We know that the Revised National Policy on Education of 1994, made a recommendation and that recommendation is the one that is used in the international schools of Botswana and even outside, which is the one teacher to 35 children ratio. We are however at 61, 45 in the classrooms. That is too much. When talking about trying to create employment, Honourable Arone should know that Botswana has two schools that we can actually split into two. If we can do that, we will be able to absorb the qualified teachers who are unemployed and now roaming the streets. If you take a class of 61 students and divide it into two, you are well within the prescription of the Revised National Policy on Education. Therefore, this is why we are saying, maybe this Budget should inform the Ministers that since we are unable to build more schools, maybe it is high time we increase the classrooms and also the number of teachers in our schools. By so doing this, we will be reducing unemployment in our country. I understand Minister Arone that building new schools could be a problem considering our Budget, so you can do what we call unified secondary schools. If you can take a Constituency such as Francistown, we have only two senior secondary schools. You have the whole of Francistown South operating without a senior



secondary school, therefore the students are forced to walk very long distances, so we could have one unified secondary school after changing one of those school in Francistown. That would increase employment and it will also make life...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR MMOLOTSI: ...easier for our children.

MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (MR ARONE): Clarification. Quickly I would not take too much of your time Honourable Member. Are you aware that the idea of unified secondary schools has been going on? Even in the school mapping, a document that I think you might be having, we have suggested some that we are going to propose in the National Development Plan (NDP) 11 Review. We are still working on the issue, from there we will take to the Cabinet the issue of the introduction of team teaching to deal with unemployment and the workload, are you going to be able to support it?

MR MMOLOTSI: Yes, you should not doubt my support for any initiative that would take this country forward. For now, I am mostly concerned about the distance that our students travel because in the process of these long distances, there are drugs, pregnancy and everything. We are exposing our children to a lot of ills, if they were travelling short distances they were never going to be exposed to such. I suggest that we move to that direction.

Agriculture and employment; we should know that Agriculture can create a lot of jobs. I am not talking about marijuana; I mean agriculture in general. We can be able to create more jobs through Agriculture and everyone could end up being employed. What we should understand is that; the key thing in agriculture, the only thing that can help us to achieve self-security and self-sufficiency in this country, is water supply. How do we do that? Once Alliance for Progressives (AP) takes over from the current government, one of the things which will be considered first is to make sure that serious farmers are provided with water. How do we do that? We will make sure that we drill for serious farmers...

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Mmolotsi, speak Setswana.

MR MMOLOTSI: ...we drill boreholes for farmers who are serious because we know that if there is enough water in the farm you can be able to produce for the whole year. We can even go further and do what we call, if you

allow me to say Mr Speaker, 'Greenhouse technology.' We would be able to plant everything, controlling the temperature, the moisture and everything in the soil. We will then be in a position to produce all year round and export to other countries. We can then cut imports considering the fact that the Ministry of Agriculture can even import grain from Brazil. Honourable Markus does not know because he is new, they can import from Brazil. You know that we do not need to import sorghum and maize from nowhere, we can produce that locally and be self-sufficient in food production if we follow that route. That is why I am thinking that one thing that we should think about is to see what we could do to ensure that the farms are supplied with water so that they produce all year round. People can end up migrating to the lands from the urban areas to practice farming on fulltime basis. This idea is not only doable in arable farming, even in pastoral farming it is doable, if you have good supply of water you do not need to give people six by six size of farms. No! you can give them just a 16 hector farm and make sure that you supply water so that they plant lablab for their livestock. After they harvest lablab they plant Lucerne, and after harvesting it they plant something else. Their livestock would have supply and as a result they would not go anywhere. Therefore, you do not need big farms, you can just demarcate them and give them to a number of Batswana who can use them for different purposes. Therefore, Mr Speaker, agriculture is one of the ministries that we really have to revisit and see how through it Batswana could get jobs.

The monopoly of Botswana Meat Commission (BMC) has been disadvantageous to our farmers. At the North, BMC has been closed down and that means the farmers in the North have nowhere to go. The thing is if we liberalise the sale of beef, we should do away with this monopoly because we do have established farmers such as Mr Mosojane and Mr Phumaphi who have high quality breeds, whom if we can liberalise, they can find themselves the market anywhere they want. This can create employment to Batswana. It can take Batswana from poverty. It would motivate Batswana to keep cattle knowing that they have the market.

MR MOLEBATSIS: On a point of clarification Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. You are debating very well. While still there, are you aware that Batswana are being cheated because in Europe, a kilogram (kg) of meat would P200.00, P300.00, P400.00 yet Batswana have never seen a kilogram of about P30.00 when they sell as producers?



MR MMOLOTSI: That is the case, people who buy beef from us make more money than us producers of meat in the country. Therefore, that is exploitation of the worst kind. Like we are saying; Alliance for Progressives (AP) believes that we should allow people to find themselves markets where they can.

I was talking about dam tourism earlier on. This is how other countries managed to realise food security; they allowed dam tourism. The Minister recently indicated that our dams are for domestic consumption and therefore dam tourism may contaminate these water bodies. I am saying, if we are not innovative, creative, then we can say that. If we are innovative, we will know that we can keep distances, but still allow people to carry out some activities close by the dams so that if they want water for fountains and stuff, at least the dams are close by. If we want to be creative, dam tourism is possible. We can also help people who live close by dams to use this water to produce food. We have a challenge of high bills of water in Botswana. In Francistown, we have a serious problems of high water bills, which come out as P11, 000.00, P9, 000.00. Government needs to deal with it once and for all. Explanations came and we were told that it is estimates, next time they say something else.

I brought a Motion in this House requesting Government to provide Botswana with prepaid water like we did with electricity. Let us do that so that they can buy themselves water and not owe anybody. I am repeating this Minister responsible, this has impoverished Botswana. You cannot eradicate poverty while we continue impoverishing Botswana by ripping them off through all time ridiculous bills. I call this Ministry to stand up if they want Botswana to come out of poverty because they are the ones who are impoverishing them. Let us put in place systems through which we can buy water like we do with electricity.

Minister Kenewendo, you should stand up and see what you can do in Francistown. Yesterday I said that Francistown has been seriously neglected by this Government. Selebi Phikwe is better because everything is taken there, but mines have also been closed in Francistown like it happened in Selebi Phikwe. We currently do not have avenues where people can get jobs.

Honourable Kenewendo, if investors want to come and invest in Botswana, we have land in Francistown. Gerald Estate is two times bigger than the old Francistown. Therefore, we can give you land. We can allocate investors land so that they can do business in our city.

Our children are not working and some of them are those who suffered from Kgathi's teaching while he was teaching there, and they are all at Ipelegeng. Minister, I request that you make a special dispensation to see how we can be assisted.

Security and employment; Botswana are no longer safe in their jobs, whether in industries or where, Botswana are not safe. They are fired every day. They are not being paid, let alone to be paid what they were promised and this is the result of our law. This also happens because we do not have enough personnel. I would urge Government that in this Budget, let us try to see if we cannot have enough inspectors who from time to time will go to different work places to see how Botswana are treated and to check if labour laws are being followed. At the moment Botswana are suffering in their own land. That is why we wish this could be done.

Security companies are also a contributing factor. I do not remember any good security company in the country. Security companies in this country ill treat workers. There are security companies which make their officers go around carrying big dogs and they are not paying them for that. So whoever the Minister responsible is should look into security companies and ensure that these companies treat Botswana well and they pay them. We deal with their cases every day in our offices. Had it been possible, we could close down all of them and establish new ones because the existing security companies are awful.

Let us ensure that people who work in mines and security companies have insurances. Right now people who worked in mines are suffering because they did not have insurances. So Minister, our Budget should show that we are moving from where we have been to a point where we are going to do things in a better way. As I speak Mr Speaker, if you could call workers of all these security companies, none of them will say they are paid on time. When some of them go around looking for jobs,, they are told that they will not be paid overtime and it is either they take it or leave. So, since there are no jobs, they end up taking these jobs and they will not be paid overtime. If Government is not going to protect her people, we are going to live with this. Minister, that is why I am saying, let us look at this Budget and inspect certain sectors to check if really we are channelling our finances well.

The other thing is experience that is required when the youth seek employment. Let us do away with this prerequisite experience, they will gain experience on the



job. Where will they get 10 years' experience when they just finished school? That is another excuse why our youth are not working.

Honourable Members, we believe so much that we should discuss and come up with a reasonable minimum wage, from which Batswana can live well as well as to progress the economy of this country. We need a conversation around this matter. We need a debate around this matter. There is a formula that can help us because when we say minimum wage, we mean that everyone whether a maid or a herdsman should be paid that amount. That is why we are requesting that let us have a conversation around this matter. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR SEGOKGO (TLOKWENG): Thank you Mr Speaker. Let me also say a few words, if not a lot of them, regarding that which the Minister has put in front of us. Bear with us Mr Speaker, we are troubled by flu.

Let me start by saying that looking at the allocation, it looks as if we are really going to leave a lot of our people behind; the Budget does not seem to speak very eloquently to all the sectors. It is therefore, very important that we try and plug the gaps that seem to be very, very apparent. Mr Speaker, it is actually or indeed disheartening and heart-wrenching to hear the figures that are being thrown around which do not translate into anything that is tangible for Batswana to take home. Take for instance, Paragraph 6 of Honourable Matambo's Budget Speech of 2019, allow me to quote there Mr Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: Go ahead.

MR SEGOKGO: It reads, "Real per capita income increased manifold from around US\$70 in 1966 to the present level of over US\$7 000." What does that really mean to Batswana? Does this mean that there are less unemployed Batswana and that everybody is living above the Poverty Datum Line? No, it does not mean that. It does not spell out anything. Despite the so-called increase in the real per capita income, we have astonishing statistics which show that as Batswana, we are not doing very well. A survey that was done by the Ministry of Health and Wellness on the indices of malnutrition of children under the age of five which was conducted in 2017 has actually revealed the following, despite the US\$7 000 per capita income; we have underweights, or children who are underweight and that

makes 9.1 per cent. Those who are stunting, it makes about 22.4 per cent. Those who are wasting, it makes 3.6 per cent. That is just amongst others. Well, that together makes about 35.1 per cent.

MR MOREMI: Point of clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Segokgo, you are aware that US\$7 000 per capita that is being explained, its' backdrop or our Gini coefficient is 0.65, is one of the highest in the world. So US\$7 000 upwards is always taken by those who are that side, those who always steal Government money while majority of us never get it.

MR SPEAKER: No Honourable Moremi, which side?

HONOURABLE MEMBER: There!

MR MOREMI: There! There! There far away!

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Laughter!)...

MR SPEAKER: Proceed Honourable Segokgo.

MR SEGOKGO: Thank you very much Mr Speaker and Honourable Moremi. Yes, indeed the Gini coefficient is very high and that is the more reason why we have to show this statistic that apparently we have these many children who are underweight, stunting and wasting at that staggering 35.1 per cent. Honourable Minister, I say that is not a permissible thing, it is actually embarrassing. Now that we are speaking of transforming the country from upper-middle income to high-income status as envisioned by Vision 2036, no, hold on Minister. If you look at it, it means, what would actually happen to these poor? It means that the country will just forge forward leaving people the way they are. Why would you want to be talking only about status? There are no jobs, especially for our youth; schooled or not and it is the same. They have grown more and more despondent and they know that help is not coming very soon if you look at this Budget.

Our Health Sector is also in disarray. We find that all the time, there are no medicines. Like the question that was asked today where eye medicines were scrutinized. You would find that the Minister would actually, even kind of avoid giving proper answers to such questions.

The primary schools as well; if you look at the education system, it leaves a lot to be desired. All the time we are speaking of changing it, making it better but the result is that we end up with people failing or the failure rate also is not declining as such. Children that are underweight and stunted, it means we are going to have a problem because their growth is not going to be very normal so to speak.



The other thing that we see is that this Budget is not speaking to people who are into these Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises (SMMEs). Why do I say that? Those who try their very best are not helped the way we would like to see them being helped. For example, there are several companies or small to medium companies that are operating at Tlokeng Border Post, just next to the road reserve. They were allowed to operate there for some time, but a few days back, a letter came in, indicating that they have to leave those spaces within seven days as if the powers that be were not aware that these people have been there for some time. So in actual fact, it looks like those who are trying their very best to put food on the table, we do not help them in accordance but rather we would want to stop them from doing whatever trade that they are doing.

Mr Speaker, Batswana need to view proceedings of this House on television. They have long waited and want to understand how things actually run in Parliament, how the debates go about, is that right Honourable Mabeo? At one point, I have actually seen some footage from here that was aired on television (TV). It was not very clear, but it sufficed. That in itself tells me that we only need to improve on the quality of that which we see here and air on Botswana Television (BTV), instead of always talking about not having enough budget for the debates to be viewed on TV. Improving the quality will not take a lot of money, but since going live seems to elude the powers that be, then the recordings can be taken and broadcast instead.

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: On a point of elucidation, Mr Speaker. Thank you very much Honourable Segokgo. It is surprising as you have mentioned. Take fire churches for instance, they are able to broadcast their services. Do you want to tell me that a serious Government in power can fail to broadcast Parliament live, or even to record the proceedings and broadcast them at a later time? Fire churches! It shows broadcasting is not impossible, it only shows that they are not interested! Honourable Molale once said here that some funds have been set aside so that the live broadcast would commence in 2017, up to now he is still here; nothing has happened. Instead, he is busy reading Page 3 of The Voice newspaper.

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Mokgware, leave him alone.

MR SEGOKGO: Thank you very much Honourable Mokgware. Thank you Mr Speaker. It seems there is no zeal whatsoever on their side to do that, but...

MR KEORAPETSE: On a point of procedure, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, Honourable Molale should not read alone, he should lend us too.

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Molale, if you are reading a newspaper there, please close it and put it far from you. Just leave those papers.

MR SEGOKGO: Mr Speaker, clearly after broadcasting local content on BTV, after sometime during the course of the night I guess, we switch on to France 24. Maybe that could be the time, if we cannot go live, that we could be taking these recordings and play them there so that Batswana could see what has been transpiring here. That would be better than not airing the proceedings of Parliament at all. Even though the recordings will be coming a bit late or hours after, it would be better than nothing. We should be able to see ourselves debating, if somebody says 'shut up' to Honourable Mabeo like they sometimes do or 'shhh' to Honourable Madigele and so on, we can be able to see what is happening here. I do not know how difficult that is.

Mr Speaker, I would also want to think that there is a problem now when we...

**MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT, LABOUR
PRODUCTIVITY AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT**

(MR MABEO): On a point of order. Mr Speaker, I would like to tell my friend Honourable Segokgo that Mabeo is just a sweet soul. He never says anything to anyone; so he should withdraw the statement that Mabeo would be saying something to other Members...I never say anything Mr Speaker. You know the people who talk sir, please guide him.

MR SPEAKER: Well, since you are neighbours, I never hear you; maybe he sometimes hears you. Honourable Segokgo, you can correct your statement since the Honourable Member is complaining.

MR SEGOKGO: Thank you Mr Speaker. It means Honourable Mabeo was not listening very attentively. I was just saying that if somebody says 'shut up' to him and not him saying 'shut up' to somebody else. Anyway, I will withdraw that Mr Speaker.

Mr Speaker, while growing up there was this adage that 'time is money' which was used a lot. I still believe time is money and if lost it cannot be recovered, but this adage does not seem to coax the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) Government to save time and indeed save money for itself and the populace. Take for example,



maintenance works that are currently being done in our roads in Gaborone here; the maintenance or construction of such roads take place during the day even at the peak of the rush hour. Traffic becomes so congested. One might even take over two hours just to traverse the city centre; small as it is. You can imagine what happens to a business person who loses so much time on the road as he or she might end up losing money. Why can we not copy just what is being done in other countries like next door in South Africa, where maintenance of roads is done overnight and in the morning those roads are actually used because the technology is there? In all fairness, the amount of money that we end up using is more or less the same with that of the new technologies that are available.

If you were to go into the rural areas Mr Speaker, or to the lands and cattle posts where we are supposed to produce, there is arable and pastoral farming. We are incapable of coming up with proper ways in which we can make a lot of agricultural produce available. That is because or some of the reasons being that the Government does not think it is important to build bridges across drifts and streams so that these can facilitate movement to the lands and the cattle posts during the rainy seasons. During this time, you would find that people are incapable of going there. I know there is a bridge where you are going Honourable Molale. There are also no dams for these farmers. It is important to actually be able to harness water, so we must be able to come up with ways in which farmers can be able to harness water to use this water in whatever production that they need to do. In that way, Government can also be able to help the farmers come up with cash-crops in an area where if properly and scientifically conducted, we might know or we be told that these areas and that area, the cash-crop that can be grown there is this one, because that will be dependent on the topology, climate or soils of that area. It will differ from one area to the other.

Mr Speaker, we have a problem throughout the country where there is no electricity. In this era, where everything or almost everything is being driven by electrical power, if we need to use our computers or laptops, cell phones, fridges, you name it, we need electricity. Honourable Molale, it does not look like your people are on top of their game. I know English is the problem Honourable Molale, if you do not understand there is nothing I can do to help you. Botswana Power Corporation (BPC); we are always having those power cuts all the time. The story always changes, today they will give you this, but

the following day, they will say something else. When you know some people who work for this corporation, you will get to know that, it is just one persistent problem that the corporation is incapable of solving. So there is that very important element where we have to be very open about problems that we have, so that we can be able to solve them.

Issues of Water Utilities Corporation (WUC) are also a problem. We need to maybe distribute or have other offices out there. You can imagine, if I were to give an example of Tlokweng, where I will talk of sewage, Honourable Molale, where we have to be speaking to people at Glen Valley.

MINISTER OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY (MR MOLALE): On a point of order. Honourable Speaker, can you please reprimand Honourable Segokgo, I have long ignored him now if he compares me to a sewage I do not know what he means. I ask you to withdraw those words.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!)...

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Segokgo, he has long ignored you, leave him alone.

MR SEGOKGO: Thank you Mr Speaker. Honestly Honourable Molale is saying a lot of things. When I try to speak he is also talking on that side so I was saying he keep quiet till I finish then he can speak? Now because he is not speaking on the microphone Mr Speaker he is disturbing me. Yes, let me withdraw those words, I did not say you look like a sewage Honourable Molale and I do not see how you can look like it, that thing is very ugly.

I was just talking about problems that we have actually with the sewage system in Tlokweng. We have to contact the offices in Glen Valley, and everybody else I think around this place or in the greater Gaborone would do the same. Definitely if that is the case, it would mean that they are overwhelmed, and as such we will have drains overflowing for the longest time even after reporting. In Tlokweng, in a place like Ranfurwa, you will find that the sewage system has long been put underground, but it is impossible for the residents to connect because of how it was done. The intervention is needed from this Government actually to take a proper look because this problem has been there for the longest time, the council is incapable of solving it, and as such we would need that intervention.



The whole of this Budget must be able to speak to all of us so that in the end, everybody can be able to identify with it and know that at one point, it will bring him something that would be of good use. By now I hear a lot of speakers, especially from across the aisle who have in the past said that solar power is very, very expensive, but if you get started, then it is a good thing, it is a very good investment that we need to critically look at. Somebody can tell you that something is expensive when they have not even done much projections on it, and taking whatever studies were done from far field out there rather than close by or from our neighbours. So we need to revisit it, if at all we think that it is too expensive but we do need power Mr Speaker.

Mr Speaker, having said that, just to thank you for choosing me to talk about this Budget, though I would have loved to have spoken on issues of land, the other time I kept on going up and down but to no avail. Thank you.

MR SPEAKER: Thank you Honourable Segokgo.

MINISTER OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MS KENEWENDO): Thank you Mr Speaker. I also want to thank you for giving me this opportunity today and send well wishes to Madam Speaker, Mrs Kokorwe. I hope that she will return once more to this House, but until then we are praying for her.

Mr Speaker, I also want to thank and support the Minister of Finance and Economic Development, Sir Matambo, for this Budget Speech, and for being very candid and entertaining during the delivery of this speech, he made it quite enjoyable, I must state. I also want to support it because given the resource constraints, the revenue that has been collected by the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, they have tried their level best to capture the vision that has been set out by His Excellency the President Sir Mokgweetsi Masisi. As you know Mr Speaker, even Mr Matambo is very well aware of it, it can never be a 100 per cent. We are celebrating, we welcome it, recognising the many challenges that this Budget has faced, and the fiscal restraints that come with having to set a National Budget such as this one.

Mr Speaker, I should just start off by saying, as the Minister of Trade and Industry, I believe that some of the issues that are very key to us and what we are trying to do have been covered. Those that are termed economic enablers, that might not necessarily be investment that is needed at the Ministry of Trade and

Industry but that is needed more broadly in the country to ensure that we do reach the economic transformation agenda that we have set out for ourselves. I am very pleased Honourable Matambo, when you were talking about the top five investments that this Budget will be looking at, it includes; power, water, roads, Information and Communications Technology (ICT), education and health. Those are very key when we are talking about the transformation agenda.

We can also point to the fact that since His Excellency took over in April, he has been talking about work towards a knowledge-based economy and an apprenticeship economy. Here, I really want to note what you also stated, the partnership there with the Rutgers University towards more work in this knowledge-based economy as well as the VDA, the Germans that are working with Honourable Mabeo in regards to creating more engineer based apprenticeship programmes. It has been a few months Minister Matambo, we are hoping that this Budget will be able to move directly, really impact and create change where His Excellency has set out and where we can start to see visible results.

Mr Speaker, I also want to highlight that there has been a focus on private sector growth and private sector development in this Budget. Once again, as has already been really elucidated upon by the members of Business Botswana and others in the financial sector, the Budget does pose some opportunities for the private sector, especially in opening up on Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) space and the Government budget for procurement which has been very well elaborated upon as well as the development expenditure. As it has already been said Mr Speaker, the challenge is not the Budget and not necessarily the allocation. The challenge is really on implementation because year in and year out the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning releases some funds and they still receive some funds back. That is really where the challenge is and that is where we should be more concerned about. We should ask when 100 per cent delivery in these projects will happen. I have some hope because in the same Budget Speech, Minister Matambo spoke about the Project Management Office (PMO) which will be coming up. We are hoping that it will be focusing on the implementation, monitoring and evaluation of projects. We will start to see some timely delivery of projects because once again when we do not implement, we are really facing a missed opportunity in economic development and in the prospects for job creation in the country.



MR MOREMI: On a point of clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Kenewendo, clarify this for us; we used to have the Minister of Finance and Development Planning office which was managed by the Vice President. When Khama became the Vice President, things changed and he was moved from Ministry of Finance and Planning to focus on government projects. Botswana National Productivity Centre (BNPC) was founded, National Strategy Office followed later on and now we have a new office called Project Implementation. Do you think the duplication and changing names will speed the implementation of the projects?

MS KENEWENDO: Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Member. I do not think it is about calling a new name, it is really more about what the office will do. As it has already been stipulated, I will talk more about this later on in my deliberation. We are really looking at implementation, conversion and closing the deals. We need to have a very clear and determined political will. His Excellency the President, Dr Mokgweetsi Masisi has said this over and over again, that this will be one of his key pillars in the transformation agenda and taking Botswana forward.

Mr Speaker, I would like to move on to that once again. The issue is not about a budget. We do not want to see more unspent millions going back to Finance, but we should be seeing real tangible growth in the economy. We want to see projects...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MS KENEWENDO: I refuse to yield for now, thank you. We want to see more projects really taking off so that we can see some growth. The implementation and delivery as I have already said, is important but delivery of quality projects. This is not only a requirement for Government but a requirement for the private sector that is servicing the Government. We need to all challenge ourselves to ensure that the delivery of quality infrastructure and services is met and it is a commitment for all. It does not only need political will but also requires technocratic will as well as private sector will.

Mr Speaker, I want to also lure as everyone has said, the efforts on fiscal management by the Ministry of Finance and this Government of Botswana. We have been doing great when it comes to public finance management. We have a great sovereign debt rating but we should use this to our advantage to attract more investment especially in the large economic and transformational infrastructure such as those in Information and Communications Technology (ICT), roads, storage unit for oil and so

forth. We should encourage PPP participation while at the same time creating jobs, opportunities and expanding the economy. This is because a great sovereign wealth rating when it does not bring anything else, it does not add value. I am so glad that in this year's speech, it has been very pronounced the kinds of project that the private sector can participate in that are for Government and the kinds of projects where we will be seeing PPP participation. It is one area where the private sector has really been yearning and asking for more participation in.

Mr Speaker, in this regard, it is very important to also note what I stated last year, that we need to relook at our calculation of the statutory debt limit and look at the contingent liabilities versus real liabilities and how we calculate guarantees in this debt limit. If we relook that and how we await the guarantees and the contingent liabilities, then we will be able to give ourselves more space in how we finance other projects because we have to agree that Government cannot self-capitalise everything. For us to really get real economic transformation, more progress in infrastructure development, we have to allow the private sector to play a part in the development of large scale infrastructure. The participation is not only the financing but also the design and the building. This infrastructure as I have already said, will enable the private sector, unlock economic growth and allow us to start positioning ourselves as a start-up capital, as a regional economic and trade gateway because we would have invested in good roads, ICT and in all of this enabling infrastructure. It will allow us to even tap on further to the trade agreements that we have already found and that are giving us fantastic market access for many of our products.

Mr Speaker, we are working on various accompanying major strategies to enable and prepare Botswana to get ready to tap into these markets, but the infrastructure needs to be in place.

MR SPEAKER: Order! Pause right there. Let us break for 30 minutes. We will resume the debate at 4:30 p.m.

**PROCEEDINGS SUSPENDED AT 4:00 P.M. FOR
APPROXIMATELY 30 MINUTES**

PROCEEDINGS RESUMED AT 4:30 P.M.

MR SPEAKER: Order! Honourable Members, please take your seats. Honourable Kenewendo, continue you where you left off.



MS KENEWENDO: Thank you Mr Speaker. I was saying that we need to be ready to tap into these markets as they open up. As we have been stating that there are many opportunities coming up, including with the ASEAN Free Trade Area (AFTA) where we have quotas for lamb and beef, the recent African Continental Free Trade Agreement (AFCFTA) and the private sector. Botswana as a whole, need to be prepared to tap into these markets, and to be prepared to compete with the rest of the continent and the world. Here it is very important that we focus on the value chain, and we implement the meat sector strategies and others that we have identified.

I would like to also go back to the issue of infrastructure Mr Speaker, because that is very important. The way we deal with infrastructure development should not solely focus on Government self-capitalisation. It should allow private sector participation. I want to further elaborate on the issue of contingent versus real debt. If we still calculate contingent liability as real debt Mr Speaker, we will not be able to adopt and have more Public Private Partnership (PPP) projects, especially in large infrastructure, as that kind of debt and guarantee will be limited by the statutory debt limit. So, we need to start looking at risk waited contingent liabilities when we calculate our statutory debt Mr Speaker.

Over the last couple of months Mr Speaker, we have been quite aggressive in investor attraction and in visiting different places, looking for people to come and invest here. We have been very deliberate about the kind of sectors where we want investors to participate in, and there has been a very clear political will not only at the Minister's office, but at His Excellency the President's officer. I want to further state Mr Speaker, that wooing an investor is a process. It does not happen overnight, and though it does not happen overnight, I am happy to state that we have seen some of these investor missions bearing fruit. We have seen some coming here for scoping studies; others returning for more preliminary investigations. This is giving us hope that they will come back and truly invest here. We should be patient with them Mr Speaker, because it is a process. Wooing an investor is a process, but we are lucky that some of them, the first time we just meet, they decide that they want to come to Botswana. As we speak Mr Speaker, just to give an example, we have a Venture Capital (VC) founder here who we met in Davos, who is currently meeting young entrepreneurs in the start-up space because he bought into the vision of setting Botswana or

positioning Botswana as a start-up capital in Africa. He wants to look at the start-ups that are here, and see if he cannot start processes of investing in those companies and giving them exposure and mentorship in the global space.

Mr Speaker, we are dedicated to facilitating investors, and I have to be very clear that it is not only investors of those who are of a foreign nature, including domestic investors. I want to also state that we are opening facilitation offices by Botswana Investment and Trade Centre (BITC), both in Gaborone and Francistown in order to really lure investment in these major capitals, but also serve the surrounding areas. We have been meeting domestic investors who are willing to expand their businesses, but once again, a relationship with an investor, it takes time, it is development. Even investor's confidence has gone up; we need to work on rebuilding it. I am happy to say that we have been doing quite well at that. Mr Speaker, I will continue to talk more about issues around investor attraction later on, on the 4th of March, I believe when we are talking about the Budget that is specific to the Ministry of Investment, Trade and Industry (MITI).

Mr Speaker, still just on investor confidence, we need to enhance our transparency and information sharing capacities, and just share more knowledge, more information with the public, our investors and the media to instil confidence in that the things that we are doing are right, and that we are committed to fighting corruption. So, in that regard, not only in the corruption matter, but in the knowledgeable population, we need to ensure that our websites and all our databases are up to-date, and that we engage the media as His Excellency has been doing.

Mr Speaker, I want to also state that we need more gender sensitive policies and finances, especially when it comes to our police and our justice system. We need a police force that is sensitive to Gender Based Violence (GBV), gender and children issues. We need to increase their budget in order for them to have units that can deal with these issues. We have seen an escalating rate of GBV cases in Botswana, and challenges that are being reported by women when they go and report their cases. So Mr Speaker, if it takes going back for training, I implore this Government, and the Ministry of Defence, Justice and Security to put more money into those very specific interventions that deal with gender sensitivities and the protection of Children's Rights.



Mr Speaker, I also want to draw an attention to the special funds and once again to corruption. I am happy that the special funds oversight has been brought back to the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development. We need to further tighten the screws and ensure that the financial integrity that has always been associated with this country returns, and to ensure that the money in the special funds are used as it has already been stated through this Parliament.

Mr Speaker, corruption has plagued this country, and we need more deliberate efforts in fighting corruption. I want to state that I believe we can even change the way the tender system works. We need to shift the tender committees and make them ad hoc and anonymous, invite the many professionals that we have in this country, that are experienced in evaluating projects, in sealing deals, in structuring deals for them to participate in these ad hoc tender committees. Corruption truly stalls economic growth through failed or late delivery of projects. It is time that we just truly use the people that we have spent so much money on in their training, and ensure that they too participate more actively in the development of this country. Mr Speaker, I want to also reiterate the case that in fighting corruption, it is not only a case of political will, but it needs technocratic involvement, as well as the private sector in being committed to fighting corruption. As they say, "it takes two to tango" Mr Speaker, not only on the Government side. Still in this as I have said, we need to use our private sector, and our very experienced professionals in structuring and closing the PPP deals that we have already committed ourselves to doing. Batswana Mr Speaker, once again are very talented and well-trained, and we should tap into that pool.

We have said over and over again Mr Speaker, that we are concerned with the lack of jobs in this country, and that we are concerned with the stalled economic growth though at a global level, four point something per cent is quite comparable, and it can be said that we are doing well, because if you look to South Africa for example, their growth rate is at about one point two (1.2) at most to 2 per cent. Mr Speaker, we need to ensure that our Budget speaks to that in implementation, not only in the figures, but in the implementation that there is delivery and that we would be able to create jobs that we will create opportunities, and that we will open doors and facilitate wealth creation in Botswana, economic ownership by Batswana. This brings us actually Mr Speaker, to the issue where we reserve businesses for

Batswana and they end up fronting. This is a concern; because as a Government, you reserve a business for Batswana, and then there is fronting. We need to take a deliberate action and punishment against that act. That is stealing from Batswana who are deserving. We need to stop that in its tracks.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF YOUTH EMPOWERMENT, SPORT AND CULTURE DEVELOPMENT (MR MAKGALEMELE):

Clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Minister, the issue of fronting, how serious is it, and how are you dealing with it in your ministry?

MINISTER OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MS KENEWENDO):

Mr Speaker, fronting is a big issue and we are currently looking at those cases to see how many are involved especially in the reserved spaces, but it then become a legal issue beyond the Ministry of Investment, Trade and Industry. Mr Speaker, we should not always relegate some issues to the law. It should be upon us; as people to ensure that the empowerment sticks with us and that we do not give it away. The same with where opportunities are coming up, where trends point to opportunities, that we do not sell those assets but we protect those assets in the cases of filling stations and so forth, where it is alleged that now in Gaborone, very few; if not none are owned by Batswana. That is the case where Government is maybe working on a policy of enabling and empowering that sector but Batswana are leaving that sector because others are offering them what seems like a good deal for now, but the long term vision actually possesses greater opportunity and we need to share this as leaders, in this House and in this nation. Sometimes short term gratification is not worth it because the long term is coming and it comes loaded with much greater satisfaction.

Mr Speaker, I also want to say that we need to support local products. We need to support things that are made here. When we are talking about Economic Diversification Drive (EDD), it is not a Ministry of Investment, Trade and Industry Policy; it is a Government of Botswana Policy but it should be a Botswana Policy, a Botswana stance that we do not export jobs, that we are keeping them here, where we know a Motswana is producing even if for household consumption that we support as Batswana to keep those jobs here.

There is another Honourable Member we were in negotiations with and we asked them to purchase something from Botswana. He said why would I export jobs, yet when we impose restriction here Mr Speaker,



import restrictions, we, including the leaders in this House, complain that, we do not want to buy Botswana made products because of the quality maybe. Who will support those industries if we; ourselves are not committed to doing so?

Mr Speaker, EDD should not only be a Government issue, each and every individual should commit themselves to buying local, to supporting local and to keeping the jobs here in Botswana. It is only then that we will be able to truly see economic growth with great impact that create jobs, that sustains this economy because the two of Foreign Direct Investment (FDI), Citizen Economic Empowerment, economic empowerment in Botswana are not mutually exclusive. I want to dispel the issue that has always been said that, if we are looking for Foreign Direct Investment, it means we are not looking to empower Batswana; it is not so. We have been very clear in our deliberate attempts where you bring in foreigners with a lot of money to invest as anchor industries so that they are able to create linkages for the value chain where Batswana can participate. So, we should not encourage the kind of spirit that seems to be xenophobic in Botswana because there is no great nation including the likes of South Korea that Honourable Ndaba was talking about, Singapore that Keorapetse likes to talk about, Dubai or whatever; where there is no Foreign Direct Investment. Let us stop closing ourselves off and say we do not want foreigners because we do, there is no great economy that was not built without foreigners.

Mr Speaker, I want to state for the record that we are four Citizen Economic Empowerment, but that policy as well as EDD should not just be for Government. We should all be committed as Batswana to ensuring that we are buying and supporting local. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MINISTER OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY (MR MOLALE): Thank you Mr Speaker. I want to comment on the good speech that was presented by Honourable Ontefetse Kenneth Matambo. He is one responsible man. His input is evident in what we call a credible Government because he prepared this Budget wanting to take Botswana forward. We know that our mandate is to take Botswana forward and when some people get lost on the way, we take Botswana forward, I am talking about us this side of the aisle.

When he started on page 3 Honourable Matambo, he talked about...

MR KEORAPETSE: Procedure. Honourable Speaker, earlier on I talked about the spirit of togetherness. They are refusing to share with us The Voice newspaper Mr Speaker.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!) ...

MR SPEAKER: I do not know why Honourable Keorapetse is so uptight. Apparently there is something on page 3 of The Voice newspaper, that is what is making him complain this much. Please lend him if you have it, he should stop disturbing us.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR SPEAKER: No, pass it to him, you finally got it, maybe you will allow us to proceed. Proceed Honourable Molale.

MR MOLALE: I thank you Mr Speaker. I ask that you explain this to us, earlier on you were reprimanding me saying I should not read a newspaper in the House eventhough I was not reading. Right now you are permitting Keorapetse to read it and that he should focus on a specific page.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!) ...

MR MOLALE: Mr Speaker I needed clarification on that. ... (Laughter!) ...

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Molale proceed with your debate.

MR MOLALE: Yes, Sir.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Point of order.

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Makgalemele, what is your point of order?

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF YOUTH EMPOWERMENT, SPORT AND CULTURE DEVELOPMENT (MR MAKGALEMELE): Point of order. Thank you Mr Speaker. I wanted you to make a ruling on the issue of newspaper reading in the House because for some, it was prohibited and some you allowed it. So, can you make a ruling Sir?

MR SPEAKER: In my ruling I said, give Honourable Keorapetse the newspaper, there is something that is making him to disturb us this much. I said it should be given to him and he shall go and read it at his own spare time. Give him the paper and we proceed. Let us proceed Molale.



MR MOLALE: I thank you Speaker. In paragraph 11, we will realise that he is stating that development is not an event. It is true, development is ongoing. So if the process has been ongoing, in English what becomes constant in that process is change. Mostly those who do not have vision would continue to complain that there is no change in Honourable Matambo's speech. Throughout the debate, we shall continue to point out the changes that really show that indeed development is not a once off thing, it is a process. For us to proceed we should however keep checking if the journey that we are taking is the real one, whether we are on the right track.

Honourable Matambo mentioned that since 1966 we are continuing to develop. It was not a once off thing, and in the process we are going to have changes. We have five to six years and we have what we call Mid Term Review in every financial year. We sit down and review our programmes. That is an example; for you to sustain your process of development, change must remain constant and continuously review and change things which can improve what we want to do. Honourable Mmolotsi said he does not see any changes, maybe there is need to conduct a workshop for them on how developments are done. It is the changes which sustain that path; we have done a lot of things. We have had Vision 2016, and at the moment, we have 2036 which we review time and again to check if we are still on the way to improving the lives of Batswana. By so doing, it is change that becomes constant to introspect, amend and revise so that we reach where we intend to go. In this Budget, Honourable Matambo also talks about sustained economic growth; that it is sustaining us to move forward in this process of development. It is not about economic growth that I want to emphasise, but it is the word "sustained economic growth", meaning that you continually support and protect what you have so that it grows and progresses. That is what the BDP Government is doing. For you to be saying you do not see any changes in this Budget, it shows that we do not understand it.

Minister Matambo went on to talk about maintaining stability. As developments progress, we maintain their progress such that even if there may be challenges, we would be on the way to realizing our goal. He talks about economic consolidation and maintaining governance and security. Mr Speaker, all these show that the BDP led Government is doing well even though some people do not want to see or believe. Those who like the truth have indicated that this is a credible Government. I am

happy Minister Matambo that you have this huge input into making our Government a credible one. We have heard the so called alternative budget speeches here; I heard English 'from those who swipe' and they spoke with arrogance, they want to cheat Batswana with their English. We did not hear what they will offer us should they get into Government. Honourable Matambo, I suspect that if it happens that they get into Government, they will come to you at night to recruit you so that you can run the Finance portfolio. Where is Boko to counter this? They will say that, but the problem is that they will not...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR MOLALE: ...the chance to take Government.

MR KEORAPETSE: Point of clarification. I hear you Honourable, but I want to say that in the opposition, we have economists up to the level of Professor, so we would not need Honourable Matambo, that is the first thing.

Secondly, did you not hear about our intention to create 100 000 jobs in 12 months? I know you feel that it is not possible, do you feel the need to set targets, but Cyril Ramaphosa has set a target of 275 000 jobs every year.

MR MOLALE: Honourable, if you are used to opposing, you will oppose even the obvious. You always tell Honourable Matambo that he is doing well, it is only that he is from another party.

MR KEORAPETSE: Point of procedure. The only thing that we talked about with Honourable Molale is that we can think of placing him as the District Commissioner at Borolong, maybe Honourable Matambo could be in the planning office, somewhere there, but not a Minister. No.

MR MOLALE: We will refuse to take those posts Honourable Matambo.

MR SPEAKER: Wait Honourable Molale. Honourable Keorapetse, you could not have said procedure. We are in order. Talk to Honourable Molale if you want clarification, elucidation or correction.

MR MOLALE: Really! We would turn down those offers. Even if you can come to me because I know that you can do that, I will refuse because you will be misleading us.



I congratulate Honourable Matambo for this comprehensible Budget and it is action oriented. I said development is a route which should be taken at all times. We know that that process is interspersed with events. It is also showing that the ability to deal with these events shows stability on the part of Government of the day because we have had challenges, the latest being the economic downturn of 2008 and Botswana was one of the countries which stood up and safe guarded her economy. We did not experience some challenges which we saw happening in our neighbouring countries and the world at large.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR MOLALE: Social worker, we are talking economics...

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!)...

MR MOLALE: ... budget sharing. It is on that basis Mr Speaker why I say Honourable Matambo's Budget is comprehensible and it has a roadmap on how we should go about it despite someone saying we are talking about things from 10 years ago. A Setswana proverb says, "*letlhaku le le sha le agelwa mo go le legologolo*," meaning that the past is the foundation of the future. So when we talk of the present, do not forget the past. That is why you have been chased from the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC).

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!)...

MR MOLALE: Mr Speaker, I...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Procedure.

MR MOLALE: ... I wanted to comment...

MR MMOLOTSI: Point of procedure. Mr Speaker, I thought you would call Honourable Molale to order, if Honourable Mmatli was kicked out of Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC) we would have been informed in Parliament. But now Honourable Mmatli is sitting on the UDC bench and Honourable Molale is kicking him out. Please call him to order because you are the one responsible for this sitting arrangement, let it not seem as if he belittles the leadership of this House.

MR SPEAKER: No, do not involve me in your issues please. They are yours and do not concern me. Proceed Honourable Molale.

MR MOLALE: Thank you. I withdraw those words my friend. We are friends, you are no longer friends with the one who is sitting behind you.

Let me comment on a few points to support Honourable Matambo's work. We usually talk about citizen economic empowerment. It is a well-founded program and has yielded more results. You have been invited to come to Boipuso Hall tomorrow to witness how steady the poverty eradication program is. I assume that you all received your invitations. If not, Honourable Molefhi asked me to invite you so that you can see that indeed we have a steady poverty eradication program. With citizen economic empowerment Mr Speaker, I want Honourable Matambo to introduce an important component called Enterprise Development. Going to Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) alone to collect development financing and being on your own is not adequate. That is why sometimes a company or projects collapses. I thought Enterprise Development, development financing, quality of the product, entrepreneurial skills and other important things which aid in running a business so that it can grow, expand and become one of the big companies, we wish to make it part of citizen economic empowerment. We have some companies which are not owned by the Government, we can invite them to take part in this program. Because development finance alone is not the end of citizen economic empowerment.

DR MMATLI: On a point of clarification Mr Speaker. I heard him inviting us to go to Boipuso Hall to see poverty eradication program projects. My question is; does it mean that it has failed where we come from, does he agree that it has failed in areas where we wanted to see it, from our people such that we now have to go and see it at a hall? That is the only place where we can see it Because it has failed where people wanted to see it flourishing.

MR MOLALE: I have been feeling sorry for you as I answered you and went on to ask you for forgiveness. But you are now poking me. You are laughing. Look, Poverty Eradication is a national exposition (expo). It has been introduced to your constituencies, they were raising awareness to the people that indeed we have lively Poverty Eradication Programs. We have it in Molepolole and Lentsweletau. Let us go so that I can show it to you. Do you think that I forgot where we have those projects? Stop denying things. Last time Honourable Khan left this place after shouting that there is no money for sewerage at Molepolole. He interrupted Honourable Matambo while he was still on the floor. Refrain from that because people will laugh at you. What is wrong with you?



The Enterprise Development, Honourable Matambo, I could advise you that when you get funding for maintenance of schools, clinics, and anything else, you have to pass it through this process, so that youth and women whom we want to empower can do these jobs, you can teach them all the components such that their businesses will not collapse. It has to be done properly so that they can grow and become big businesses.

Let me remind you that we did that in the 80s. That is how companies like Aga Kgalagadi, Tlhora Boroko and others upgraded. I think we have to go back to that and find ways of empowering it so that we can do it again. It should not be like we are failing to use maintenance funds every year although maintenance is required in schools, hospitals, roads and many more. This can help us to buy equipment for the people, train them so that when they go to work, they have all the factors of production, not just capital alone but where we have others including entrepreneurship. That is what I wish we could partner together and do as a Ministry of Finance and Economic Development; Investment, Trade and Industry; Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development and others, and develop it quickly. Because like we both said, development is a process not an event.

I also want to talk about the issue of value chain. We have agriculture and other chains of economy. Sometimes when we give a certain chain a task to perform, we quit halfway through. That will be as a result of omitting what is called a value chain, where if one grows vegetables, like I heard Honourable Mmolotsi for the first time saying something that makes sense, we have to find out what to do with those tomatoes. Some people take all the necessary measures until they reach the market. That is where there is a lot of work, not only at Enterprise Development. For example; the food that is eaten in schools is not supposed to be bought from South Africa, because the budget for food at primary schools, I do not know how much it is Honourable Van Der Westhuizen, I think it costs just around P100 million; at secondary schools, hospitals, barracks and other places. Now this money could be going back to farmers through this value chain. That is one thing which we need to consolidate just as you said Honourable Matambo, that we have to maintain the momentum and embark on this economic consolidation. That is very important.

Some of us are farmers. Honourable Salakae knows it even though sometimes he behaves like a hypocrite and says that he was not allocated a farm and that I was favoured. But I worked hard for that farm with my money, I bought it with my own money.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!)...

MR MOLALE: ... (Laughter!)... Please tell Honourable Mmolotsi to stop misleading me Mr Speaker. Now this is another entry point for job creation, just as I said at Enterprise Development. These things are very important.

The third point Mr Speaker is that, now our ability including members of the opposition, is to communicate the innovations which we agreed to in this House, to go and improve the lives of Batswana. Not where we become selfish, saying that this one is mine, I am the only one who will talk about it, I will taint Domkrag. Let us talk to Batswana and stop telling them that Domkrag programs are useless. Let us instead tell them how those programs can be improved, not just condemning like Honourable Mmatli has been doing, saying it means poverty eradication is in Gaborone, without even listening to me. His problem is that he never listens. Therefore, communicating these innovations and a very strong extension team is necessary.

The last point Mr Speaker, on the solutions I have proffered, is the issue of procurement, that the Enterprise Development and the value chain should be realistic. Honourable Matambo, I request that we should consider the procurement process for Government goods and assets. Currently what is happening is similar to this allusion, I do not know if the likes of Honourable Keorapetse would know some of these things, but I will just say it anyway, maybe if he refers to history books he would know. During our school days at secondary school some years ago, we used to take photographs using films, and once this film got used up, one would wind it up and then take it to a dark room to go and print the photos, and come out with them. If I can compare the current procurement procedure and this darkroom, it seems we collect pictures because we provide tender documents, and then on the other side so and so would instead be given a tender. What happens in between, is similar to a darkroom, it cannot be seen. That is why I wish we could amend this law somewhere, and I am not saying politicians should be involved. I would like some procurement processes to be emended, so that we would deviate from this darkroom phenomenon and go where transparency is evident throughout the procurement chain because the way it is not being done properly right now, we are even pointing fingers at each other in Parliament as you have heard others calling us



thieves, but we also know that they are thieves. People who should not be talking about procurement are the ones talking about it, and I think this is a symptomatic problem to something that is existing. We must look at the cause-effect relationship here. So I wish we could review this procurement regulation, and amend it and move from the darkroom phenomenon where we ask ourselves many questions concerning how things were done; wondering what really transpired. Let me give you an example, this morning I halted a Botswana Power Corporation (BPC) tender. It was released on the 28th of January, and it was said to close on the 22nd of February, yet these are things that need to come to Botswana and they are not here. So think of someone who wishes to try their luck; when are they going to go to South Africa, China or whichever place to go and buy that equipment? When are they going to talk to banks, and sort out the appropriate documents? Can they be able to do that in three weeks? That is not possible. We must be realistic about these things, and it should be clear that we are doing these things in a transparent manner; we should move away from this darkroom phenomenon. Mr Speaker, I have run out of time, so I will stop here, I thank you.

MR SPEAKER: Thank you Honourable Molale, the floor is open.

MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS AND COOPERATION (DR DOW): Thank you Mr Speaker, for giving me this opportunity to contribute to the ongoing debate on this Bill, whose purpose is to share out the national cake. Let me also thank the Honourable Minister who is presenting the Bill, for I believe it is a very forward-looking Budget. We must first appreciate that it is never easy to share out the national cake. There are competing interests and priorities; digging more to health, education, sanitation, then to water that goes into the house and you spend more on cleaning the water. It is tough; it is not easy.

I want to take this opportunity to also thank the officials behind this ministry because they have to work very hard and negotiate with various stakeholders and other ministries. There are constant demands and questions on them and I think they deserve a special thank you because it is not easy being in that ministry...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

DR DOW: Not at all.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!)...

DR DOW: You know, not at all. I often say if I...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

DR DOW: No, it is not easy. If you do not know Honourable Matambo, try to approach him and increase your budget. He will pull his face and say, "where do you think I should cut?" because if you have got P100 and you have to divide it among 10 items, you have to decide. Deciding on priorities is not easy at all. So, we appreciate the hard work Minister and appreciate the hard work of your officials to getting us here.

Having said that, let me also say that we appreciate this Budget because I think it appreciates that what brought us here, the last 52 years, will not take us forward without some major structural and other innovative changes. What brought us to the middle-income status. I think we all know even at the personal and business levels, breaking it to the next level is always particularly hard because we need different paths and ways of breaking that particular ceiling. It is particularly tough during these times when globally, the economic growth, year on year is fairly slow; very uncertain times, particularly hard in a country like this one that actually is dependent on a few sectors. First of all, diamonds and the mining sector, very low tax base and of course, tourism. Talking about the tax base, I think it is particularly tough in this country where people's mentality has been raised on diamond revenue. It is not easy to persuade people or individuals that tax is important. Historically we have not had to push that hard in that front. So, I think it is also important that we continue to emphasise the importance of paying your tax because only then we can raise the national cake and have more money to share amongst ourselves.

When we look at this Budget again, thinking about Botswana like every other country in the world in 2015, it made 17 promises to its citizens. Amongst the 17, we promised better health outcomes, education, eradication of poverty and safer cities. These are what we call the Sustainable Development Goals. Again the question always is, how do we prioritise these 17 priorities? There are two that I want to speak to. One of them is the strengthening of institutions, those partnerships, monitoring institutions within the country and outside and therefore we speak here to the importance of institutions that ensure the delivery of the other 15 promises. What are these institutions that I am talking



about that we believe require greater strengthening and therefore they require greater resourcing? Here we are talking about institutions like the courts, Directorate of Corruption and Economic Crime (DCEC), Directorate of Intelligence Services (DIS) or institutions like those that collect data, because you cannot plan without data. All these institutions are important if you are going to deliver the other 15 promises. For my part, being the Minister of International Affairs and Cooperation, also the importance of partnership, which is one of the promises we made that we will actually establish and reinforce partnerships within the countries, across aisles and with stakeholders because realising that no one entity, not even Government, Parliament, Judiciary and not anybody or the private sector, can take this country forward without the participation of all of us.

Lastly, of course now when I talk about my own ministry; the importance of bilateral and multilateral relationship with other countries. Here I want to reiterate what Honourable Kenewendo said, that we should not be heard in this Parliament as if we are xenophobic or use language that suggests that we believe that we can take this country forward without the participation of others. What is more important is that language matters. Some of the language that is used in this Parliament if it was used in any other Parliament, people would have lost their jobs. At the end of the day, we must recognise and it is important for me as the Minister of International Affairs and Cooperation, for my ministry as a whole, that the language that comes from this Parliament be critical. There is nothing wrong with that, but please let us not use the language that suggests that we are xenophobic and that we do not want people from outside. You talk about language like “indigenous Batswana”; that is the language that is divisive and is not expected from leadership.

MR KEORAPETSE: On a point of clarification, Mr Speaker. In a short period of time, Sunday Standard published an article which I deem anti-Semitic, that your Government has foiled an Israeli attempted coup, and I have not heard anything from your ministry. I just wonder whether you could actually talk about us talking about indigenous Batswana as deserving of empowerment before you actually address this reckless reporting by Sunday Standard. I, in fact, penned an article in Mmegi saying that I truly think that it is probably the President who has sponsored the article.

DR DOW: Thank you Mr Speaker. I think the Honourable Member raises various points. First of all, he is suggesting that using the word ‘Jewish’ or ‘Israeli’; I cannot remember the word you used; is by its

nature anti-Semitic. That cannot be. People in Israel are called Jews and there is nothing anti-Semitic about that, unless you are saying what is anti-Semitic is actually the statement that they have actually tried to coup the Government. First of all, the question that whether it is a matter of fact; I do not know whether..., what I am just saying is that let us assume that they had, just for purposes of argument... Assuming that they had done that; saying that they have done that will not be anti-Semitic. That is a different point of view, it is a completely different issue. It is like saying the Sudanese did something; that is not anti-Sudan. South Africans did something; that is not anti-South Africa. The question is whether that is actually a statement of fact that they did that, I believe that you are correct. That is a very serious statement to make about any other country.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Have you seen it?

DR DOW: Personally, I have not seen that. I can tell you that we monitor newspaper articles on a daily basis and we determine whether or not to respond. It is quite possible... and I can tell you that there would be a statement somewhere in my office about... if indeed that happened, whatever you say or anybody says, that we believe touches on our relationship with some other country, we study. There is an office that does that, and they escalate if there is anything to escalate. It is quite possible that, that statement like you say was made, that something was framed around that, that it was escalated as well or if indeed in terms of the language used that actually demands escalation. Now that you have said that, I will look and see what we say to that. It does not matter what the country is about. When there is a statement about a country, that we believe either came from the office or came outside and may actually spoil or somehow affect our relation with that country, we raise it with them. Sometimes we send a note to that country to say look, this is not the view of the country; it may be a view of an individual journalist. If for example that was said, it is quite possible that a note was sent. Otherwise, I can tell you that if anybody sort of sponsored that, I would have gotten a note from the other Government and we would have sat down. We do that every day, because certain things happen around those issues every day.

I think the important point is that, when you say something in this Parliament; one arm of Government is saying it, even if it is an individual. Therefore, what we



say is important because it will suggest to the rest of the world what we think of other people, but thank you very much for raising that particular issue.

We were talking about the language that comes out of this Parliament...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: On a point of clarification, Mr Speaker.

DR DOW: Clarification.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Thank you Mr Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: Wait, you are not Honourable Moremi.

DR DOW: I am yielding to Honourable Tawana.

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Moremi; clarification.

MR MOREMI: Honourable Dow talked about strengthening DIS, DCEC and other different institutions in order to elevate productivity. These offices are all grouped under Office of the President and going further, judges are also appointed by the president. Does it give local entrepreneurs and investors the confidence that there is transparency and fairness which is a necessity when they want to come and do business here?

DR DOW: Thank you Mr Speaker and thank you Honourable Member. Let me first talk about the Judiciary, because that is an institution that I served for more than 11 years in my previous life. I believe I speak for every Judge in that sector when I say that, one of the most respected relationships between the Executive and the Judiciary in this country is at least non-interference. Total non-interference; I can tell you as a matter of fact, that when I was a Judge for 11 years, I had two phones. One was a direct line and anybody could call me; one came through my Secretary. It would be a miracle if you went back to my records, and found that that direct phone ever even rang more than five times during that 11 years. There is almost an expected and accepted position that you do not call a Judge directly. It is a tradition that was kept and I do not have any reason that it changed at all. You do not see a Judge on your own, if you have a case before them or on a personal matter, it does not matter. One of the things that I think we can be proud of with our Judges is personal independence in decision-making, especially in terms of decision-making. The independence you are talking about that you may want to look at and may want to maybe explore and see whether there is anything to develop there further is...

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: On a point of procedure, Mr Speaker. Thank you very much. Thank you very much Honourable Minister. Do not use your example as if all the Judges are behaving that way, because we can show clearly by going to ask for phone records for the judges and then I will tell you that during the 2011 strike a certain Minister and a certain Judge were communicating almost daily. So I dare you Judge Dow to say that red phone did not ring, you did not talk to him, but do not use it to say that is the custom of all Judges because that is not so. You can vouch for yourself but not for the rest of the Judges.

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Mokgware, you should use clarification or correction, you should not involve me in your debate.

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: No, I was saying ...

MR SPEAKER: No sir, I did not ask you to repeat yourself, I heard you. I was saying you should not use procedure because it will require me to respond yet you are addressing Honourable Dow. Honourable Member, proceed.

DR DOW: Thank you Mr Speaker. I will not try to follow that particular thought or suggestion because I think he was misunderstanding me. I am talking about a line that... there is only one direct line in the Judiciary, it is Chief Justice and the Registrar, no other Judge actually has a direct line to the rest of Government, at all. So let me just clarify that and move on.

The point I was going to make; the question was whether or not foreign investors, local investors or even the public should have trust in the Judiciary. I want to say that, it is my view that our Judges and our Judiciary... You may not agree with the decision, there is always two sides to a story, okay. You may not agree. At the end of the day, I think it is because of our system because every decision of the High Court has to be written and that is not the case in all jurisdictions. When you have a system where a decision must be written, and that is going to be a permanent record, you are more careful about your decisions because they will come back in future to bite you, if they were motivated by ill will, malice or favouritism. So that system forces people to think when they offer a decision. Again, I want to say that at the end of the day, it is important that yes, we have an independent Judiciary which we and the world can trust. It may not turn around as fast as people want and that may be something that we want to look at, but in terms of the integrity of their decisions, I want to say that we should be proud of that.



Then you talked about whether or not placing the Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime (DCEC) or Directorate of Intelligence and Security (DIS), under the Office of the President (OP) that it necessarily compromises, suggesting that if they are under Foreign Affairs, Labour, whatever, that somehow the President is removed from their influence. I do not think that is the subject of the case, but at the end of the day, Ministers sit in Cabinet both with His Excellency, if you believe there is going to be interference, then it can be interference even if it was...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

DR DOW: I do not yield anymore my dear friend. I am sorry. I believe I have addressed the questions that were raised by yourselves.

Moving forward to my ministry, when you look at the budget that we have, it is never enough, it will never be enough for any particular ministry. I think we can be proud that it allows us to not only maybe expand our missions by at least one or two in the next year, it also gives us an opportunity to expand the kind of work we do. It is the plan for example, to consolidate the efforts between ourselves and the Ministry of Investment, Trade and Industry, to make sure that with a new view, new outlook and new path, our diplomacies, economic diplomacy, first of all it is strengthening existing relationships, and more than that, creating new relationships, increasing our bilateral and multilateral work. Most importantly, it is actually to look at how we can bring investors to Botswana and make sure that those investors who are already here, stay.

I think there was an issue that was raised by somebody yesterday and I agree with them completely, about how to grow the national economy and to grow business people here. I think it is high time, one important thing is that it does not matter how big a tender is, it should be possible to give it to a local, and I will explain why. If the Government can put a tender out there and somebody in Senegal, China, France, wherever can respond to it, and if the Government can find the person, then somebody who is here, who may be small should be able to find that person themselves. When you do that, you are creating a relationship between the local business person or the local company and an international company in a way that actually is going to grow the local one. Let me give you an example, if you particularly have a huge tender, maybe in the building of roads or a bridge, it does not matter what it is, and you decide that okay, it is going to

be open to local businesses that can find the appropriate international partner, so it is now that particular local business person, who is given the tender and say to him or her, you have three or six months to find a partner. If you are convinced that the partner would be the same way if the Government would have actually assessed the partner, and the partner is in partnership with a Motswana, what will happen is that the boss will be local. What will happen is that at the end of that particular project, they would have gained skills. What will happen is that you probably would have created a millionaire at the end of that because you are talking about a multi-million project. It is very important to say that if Government can find that particular Japanese, a local can find that person as well, so let us give it to the local person to look for that particular one.

The second one is to suggest, building on what Honourable Kenewendo said about making sure that we take out... because we are a small country, if we are in the Ministerial Tender Committee (MTC), we know everybody, even if you did not say, "you know, the surname is Dow, this person must be my relative, the relative is a Diswai." So, I really think we should come up with a blinding system so that for example, if you have a tender, the MTC should not know who the tenderers are. One way of making sure that happens is actually blinding the tender system. For example, we decide that, obviously the regulatory policy issues like citizenship, that envelope will be opened last. The first envelope that must be opened would be the technical envelop, that should not have any names. There should be a blind system where it is a, b, c, d situation and that the front must be exactly the same. You should be disqualified if there is anything in your tender that actually identifies who you are, so that at the end it is just a, b, c, d blinded. At the end of the whole system, then we can match who (a) was, but we did not open the name envelop until at the end.

MR MMOLOTSI: Clarification Mr Speaker. Maybe I should have called for elucidation. In the publishing industry, what happens is that if you submit books for prescription, they require dummies. So you just bring dummies, you will never know whether they are from Heinemann or Longman.

DR DOW: Thank you very much and I agree with that. Some people have said, but if you do that, people who tender want to see the tenders opened, that is fine. Then I say, have a one-way mirror, so they can see the opening



of the tenders but there is no communication that if you see me biting a pen, you should know that (b) is mine, or some other signs that can identify. So I think it is important to do that.

The last one Mr Speaker, is that we lose a lot of money in projects that are actually abandoned, or we use a lot of money, when there is a dispute in projects. The result is that nothing happens, two years pass, everything. I think we should review our Invitation to Tender (ITT) or our contracts. We should have a very simple process. If there is a dispute that actually is so serious that we need to go to court, the project should continue and there should be an agreement, that part of the clause that says, in the event it is found that the tenderer was wronged, there will be a financial compensation. What is happening right now is that we have half built, everything is stopped, the things get dilapidated, there is nobody looking after the project. The Ministry of Infrastructure and Housing Development, I think needs more than just a lawyer, it needs a unit of lawyers, a team of lawyers whose job is to make sure that they come up with contracts that are actually beneficial not just to Government but to the other side as well. We do not want to see for example; a situation where Government decides to discontinue just to the detriment of the contractor, but on the other hand, I think it is sympathetic that we see around the country, half-built project when people are still litigating. Five years later, everything is destroyed, the Government has to go back to tender. Let us relook at our agreements to allow for a continuation of work against making sure that in the event the other party wins, there is a financial compensation that is justifiable, that makes sense because at the end of the day, if we wronged that person, they must actually be paid.

At the end of the day Mr Speaker, I want to thank the Honourable Minister for this Budget, of course there will be greater debates when we come to the Committee of Supply. Thank you Mr Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: The floor is open.

MR MANGOLE (MOCHUDI WEST): I thank you Mr Speaker. Let me also commend the Minister for the Budget Speech, that I believe it is different. As you have already indicated, it is the first one under the new administration. We were therefore expecting a lot from the first Budget under the new administration, hoping to see a difference when we compare it with the previous ones. In the process, we shall keep pointing out our dissatisfaction in the speech.

Minister, firstly, I want to point out that I am seeing something that is a bit different. In the previous speeches, you have been reporting on the Monetary Policy Side; what is happening on the movement of interest rates, foreign reserves and exchange rates. If I am not wrong, I believe that is what you have been reporting on and we have been finding comfort from that report. We should be informed by our Monetary Policy as to whether we are doing well or not.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Should I respond now?

MR MANGOLE: No, Honourable Member, you will respond Sir, you might use up my time. I thought you had highlighted that in the previous ones. It will be interesting to know why you changed this time around.

If we may continue Minister, on the part of economic diversification that you talked about, you mentioned that we should concentrate more on the export sector. I totally agree with you because the success of our private sector and reduction of unemployment depends mostly on the export sector. In the past, it has shown that concentrating inward and domestically is not working for us that much. At the end, the companies that make an effort fail because of lack of market. Therefore, I agree with you that it is important to extend our market.

Honourable Minister, one thing that really worries me that we have been complaining about is the development of the export sector. I really do not understand what could be the problem because it looks like we are not making much progress in that respect and that is where we are supposed to be concentrating. Maybe you should explain to us where the problem is emanating from.

You talked about Special Economic Zones (SEZs); just like other economic sectors it depends on whether we have a market available. Then it goes back to say there is need for the government to give the development of the export sector first priority. This is because we would have SEZs, but at the end of the day, they collapse because they will produce and there will be no market.

You mentioned that Selebi Phikwe is one of the areas where we are going to have SEZs and you further stated that the revitalisation of SPEDU will be given priority. I am concerned Minister, and I would like to request that you come forward and explain to us because our efforts to revitalise the economy of Selebi Phikwe come a long way, 20 or so years back. We kept complaining that the copper will suddenly finish and we were told that you were trying to diversify the economy of Selebi Phikwe.



The government lost a lot of money because we kept setting up companies, giving them special treatment and they took advantage of the government and afterwards when they were asked to privatise, they run away. From here Minister what is it that we are going to do to ensure that we have a permanent solution to the diversification of Selebi Phikwe moreso that the mine has been closed down? The people of Selebi Phikwe are more desperate than ever they want Selebi Phikwe to be resuscitated. The situation at Selebi Phikwe is really bad. I believe the Honourable Member for Selebi Phikwe will talk more about it, I will therefore stop there. I was actually using it to clarify a point on the SEZs.

Honourable Member, if I am not mistaken, we came up with the SEZs policy in 2011. Why is it taking us so long? Are we progressing if we are going to implement the SEZ in every Budget whilst nothing is being done? Maybe this time around Honourable Minister, you should give us assurance that there shall be some implementation.

Privatisation of Government entities; I agree with somebody; I do not know if it was Leader of the Opposition who was saying the Government has always liked privatising entities. In my view, the investment that we have put in Public Enterprises Evaluation and Privatisation Agency (PEEPA) is enough. It is even more than what we have gained from PEEPA. For this long, they were given a mandate to privatise government entities and after 15 or 20 years, we are talking of privatisation of only one entity, the question is, are we going anywhere? Is this body PEEPA making any progress or we are still going to talk about this for the next 50 years? This is a concern Minister. Like you were saying the aim of privatisation is so that Batswana could have shares as much as we possibly can reach.

Given the current economic situation of Batswana, I am wondering if we are not running the risk that should we privatise, are we not going to have a situation whereby it will be the same few individuals who will be owning those entities in terms of the shares all because Batswana do not have money to buy shares? Minister, maybe you should enlighten us on those as well because that is the fear that we have.

I now want to talk about electricity and I want to say, to a very large extent I want to congratulate efforts made by Government to connect electricity across Botswana. I think where credit is due, we must give it. For instance, I am happy that every village in my constituency has electricity and that is commendable. However, my concern is that, it is like we are worried...

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF YOUTH EMPOWERMENT, SPORT AND CULTURE DEVELOPMENT (MR MAKGALEMELE):

Clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Mangole. I would like to know how it has been possible that every village in your constituency is electrified. Maybe you should share with us since not all villages in our constituencies are electrified.

MR MANGOLE: Honourable Member, direct that question to Honourable Molale not me. I do not want to lie, but what I can tell you is that I am happy that my constituency is electrified. Ask Molale that question. There is a question Honourable Molale.

However Minister, it is like we are in a hurry to have electricity, which is good, but have we ensured that Batswana have access to this electricity? Is this electricity accessible, affordable and available to Batswana or is it just connected to the school or Kgotla while Batswana do not have it? I understand that Government has subsidised electricity connection charges, but is this enough?

There are places which we have declared Remote Area Dwellers (RADs), where we find people who have low to no income like New Xade, Kgomodiatshaba, and others and these people cannot connect electricity. In my view, it is a loss to the corporation which has connected electricity because people are not benefitting from it. It is a disadvantage to the very people in those places because there is electricity in their village, but they cannot use it.

I have posed a question to Honourable Molale to tell me how many households have connected electricity since it was connected to Kgomodiatshaba, I need an answer and you would be very surprised that many people have not connected electricity in Kgomodiatshaba. Minister, can you not think of a special dispensation for such villages to connect electricity for free, then they can buy electricity and enjoy the benefits of having electricity? I do not know how they manage in South Africa, but what happens there is that when a settlement is established, electricity is connected immediately and the connection is free at individual and residential level. Only the business community pays for connection. Maybe we can go and learn there. They know that at the end of the day, people will buy electricity, rather than have their infrastructure there laying useless yet they would have spent money on it. Maybe it is high time as Botswana, we think of taking that route. My concern mainly regards



villages where we have connected electricity yet people there cannot afford to connect electricity, can we have a special programme for them to be connected freely.

I want to concur with you here Minister, no I am changing, I do not agree with you. During the past three or four Budgets, you have been saying you are doing your best...

MINISTER OF INFRASTRUCTURE AND HOUSING DEVELOPMENT (MR SERETSE):

Point of order. Mr Speaker, is it right for the Honourable Member whom I know is honourable to indicate that he concurs and immediately changes and disagrees...

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Member, it is his decision. It is not wrong to do so. Proceed Honourable Mangole.

MR MANGOLE: Yes sir. There is...

MOTION

ADJOURNMENT

LEADER OF THE HOUSE (MR TSOGWANE): Mr Speaker, I move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and **agreed to.**

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until Friday 15th February, 2019 at 9:00 a.m.



HANSARD RECORDERS

Mr. T. Gaodumelwe, Mr T. Monakwe, Ms T. Kebonang

HANSARD REPORTERS

Ms T. Rantsebele, Mr M. Buti, Ms N. Selebogo, Ms A. Ramadi,
Ms D. Thibedi, Ms G. Baotsi, Ms N. Mokoka, Mr J. Samunzala, Ms Z. Molemi

HANSARD EDITORS

Ms K. Nyanga, Ms C. Chonga, Mr K. Goeme, Ms G. Phatedi,
Ms B. Malokwane, Mr A. Mokopakgosi, Ms O. Nkatswe, Ms G. Lekopanye
Ms T. Mokhure, Ms B. Ratshipa

HANSARD TRANSLATORS

Ms B. Ntisetsang, Ms. M. Sekao, Ms. M. Rabotsima, Ms. B. Mosinyi, Ms. V.
Nkwane, Ms. N. Kerobale, Ms K. Alepeng, Ms T. Motsau, Ms O. Phesodi

HANSARD LAYOUT DESIGNERS

Mr B. B. Khumanego, Mr D. T. Batshegi, Mr K. Rebaisakae

