

# DAILY HANSARD

YOUR VOICE IN PARLIAMENT



## THE SECOND MEETING OF THE FIFTH SESSION OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT

FRIDAY 15 FEBRUARY 2019

### ENGLISH VERSION

HANSARD NO. 193



#### DISCLAIMER

##### Unofficial Hansard

This transcript of Parliamentary proceedings is an unofficial version of the Hansard and may contain inaccuracies. It is hereby published for general purposes only. The final edited version of the Hansard will be published when available and can be obtained from the Assistant Clerk (Editorial).

**THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY SPEAKER**  
**The Hon. Gladys K. T. Kokorwe PH, MP.**  
**DEPUTY SPEAKER**  
**The Hon. Kagiso P. Molatlhegi, MP Gaborone South**

Clerk of the National Assembly	- Ms B. N. Dithapo
Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly	- Mr L. T. Gaolaolwe
Learned Parliamentary Counsel	- Ms M. Mokgosi
Assistant Clerk (E)	- Mr R. Josiah

**CABINET**

His Excellency Dr M. E. K. Masisi, MP	- President
His Honour S. Tsogwane, MP. (Boteti West)	- Vice President
Hon. F. S. Van Der Westhuizen, MP. (Kgalagadi South)	- Minister of Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. D. K. Makgato, MP. (Sefhare - Ramokgonami)	- Minister of Transport and Communications
Hon. N. E. Molefhi, MP. (Selebi Phikwe East)	- Minister for Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration
Hon. S. Kgathi, MP. (Bobonong)	- Minister of Defence, Justice and Security
Hon. O. K. Mokaila, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Environment, Natural Resources Conservation and Tourism
Hon. B. Arone, MP. (Okavango)	- Minister of Basic Education
Hon. M. N. Ngaka, MP (Takatokwane)	- Minister of Nationality, Immigration and Gender Affairs
Hon. O. K. Matambo, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Finance and Economic Development
Hon. V. T. Seretse, MP. (Lentsweletau - Mmopane)	- Minister of Infrastructure and Housing Development
Hon. T. Olopeng, MP. (Tonota)	- Minister of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology
Hon. Dr U. Dow, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of International Affairs and Cooperation
Hon. T. Mabeo, MP. (Thamaga - Kumakwane)	- Minister of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development
Hon. Dr A. Madigele, MP. (Mmathethe - Molapowabojang)	- Minister of Health and Wellness
Hon. E. M. Molale, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security
Hon. K. Mzwini, MP. (Mmadinare)	- Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services
Hon. T. S. Khama, MP. (Serowe West)	- Minister of Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development
Hon. P. P. Ralotsia, MP. (Kanye North)	- Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security
Hon. B. J. Kenewendo, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry
Hon. B. M. Tshireletso, MP. (Mahalapye East)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. M. M. Goya, MP. (Palapye)	- Assistant Minister, Investment, Trade and Industry
Hon. D. P. Makgalemele, MP. (Shoshong)	- Assistant Minister, Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development
Hon. F. M. M. Molao, MP (Shashe West)	- Assistant Minister, Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology
Hon. K. K. Autlwetse, MP (Serowe North)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. G. B. Butale, MP. (Tati West)	- Assistant Minister, Health and Wellness
Hon. T. Kwerepe, MP. (Ngami)	- Assistant Minister, Basic Education
Hon. I. E. Moipisi, MP. (Kgalagadi North)	- Assistant Minister, Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services
Hon. M. R. Shamukuni, MP (Chobe)	- Assistant Minister, Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration
Hon. K. Markus, MP. (Maun East)	- Assistant Minister, Agricultural Development and Food Security

## MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT AND THEIR CONSTITUENCIES

<b>Names</b>	<b>Constituency</b>
<b>RULING PARTY (Botswana Democratic Party)</b>	
Hon. Dr P. Venson-Moitoi, MP	Serowe South
Hon. S. M. Guma, MP	Tati East
Hon. C. De Graaff, MP	Ghanzi South
Hon. P. M. Maele, MP	Lerala - Maunatlala
Hon. L. Kablay, MP	Letlhakeng - Lephephe
Hon. S. Lelatisitswe, MP	Boteti East
Hon. J. Molefe, MP	Mahalapye West
Hon. P. Majaga, MP	Nata-Gweta
Hon. M. I. Moswaane, MP	Francistown West
Hon. B. H. Billy, MP	Francistown East
Hon. E. J. Batshu, MP	Nkange
Hon. S. Kebonang, MP	Lobatse
Hon. K. S. Gare, MP	Moshupa-Manyana
Hon. M. R. Reatile, MP	Specially Elected
<b>OPPOSITION</b>	
<b>(Umbrella for Democratic Change)</b>	
Hon. Adv. D. G. Boko, MP (Leader of Opposition)	Gaborone Bonnington North
Hon. G. S. M. Mangole, MP	Mochudi West
Hon. A. S. Kesupile, MP	Kanye South
Hon. N. S. L. M. Salakae, MP	Ghanzi North
Hon. Dr. T. O. M. Mmatli, MP	Molepolole South
Hon. S. Ntlhaile, MP	Jwaneng -Mabutsane
Hon. M. I. Khan, MP	Molepolole North
Hon. Kgosi Lotlamoreng II	Goodhope - Mabule
Hon. D. L. Keorapetse, MP	Selebi Phikwe West
Hon. S. O. S. Rantuana, MP	Ramotswa
Hon. K. M. Segokgo, MP	Tlokweng
Hon. B. M. Molebatsi, MP	Mochudi East
<b>(Alliance for Progressives)</b>	
Hon. W. B. Mmolotsi, MP	Francistown South
Hon. Maj. Gen. P. Mokgware, MP	Gabane-Mmankgodi
Hon. N. N. Gaolathe, MP	Gaborone Bonnington South
Hon. S. Kgoroba, MP	Mogoditshane
Hon. Dr P. Butale, MP	Gaborone Central
Hon. H. G. Nkaigwa, MP	Gaborone North
<b>(Independent Member of Parliament)</b>	
Hon. T. Moremi, MP	Maun West

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**  
**THE SECOND MEETING OF THE FIFTH SESSION**  
**OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT**  
**FRIDAY 15 FEBRUARY, 2019**

<b><i>CONTENTS</i></b>	<b><i>PAGE (S)</i></b>
<b>MINISTER'S QUESTION TIME</b> .....	1 - 7
<b>QUESTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE</b> .....	8 - 13
Government to Carry Out Land Audit <i>Motion (Resumed Debate)</i> .....	14
Reconsideration of the Decision to Stop Use of Plastic Bags <i>Motion</i> .....	15 - 24
Referendum on Presidential Elections and Appointment of Ministers <i>Motion</i> .....	25 - 27



Friday 15<sup>th</sup> February, 2019

THE ASSEMBLY met at 9:00 a.m.

(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)

**P R A Y E R S**

\* \* \* \*

**MR SPEAKER (MR MOLATLHEGI):** Take your seats Honourable members. Order! Good morning Honourable Members.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** Good morning Sir.

**MR SPEAKER:** We have a Minister's Question by Honourable Keorapetse.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF YOUTH EMPOWERMENT, SPORT AND CULTURE DEVELOPMENT (MR MAKGALEMELE):** On a point of procedure, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, there was a question in the Notice Paper from our Ministry which was supposed to be in the order paper today. Does it not mean that if an item is in the Notice Paper it will automatically appear in the Order Paper?

**MR SPEAKER:** It can change. The only problem is that I do not know which Notice Paper you are referring to, which question, who it is for and when it appeared in the Notice paper? Those are the questions you should have asked when we were at the office so that I can find out what happened with it. Let us proceed; Honourable Keorapetse.

**MINISTER'S QUESTION TIME**

**MINISTRY OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY**

**THEME: PROSPECTS OF RE-OPENING THE BCL AND TATI NICKEL MINES**

**MR D. L. KEORAPETSE (SELEBI PHIKWE WEST):** Thank you and good morning Honourable Speaker. I have five minutes; right? The question is about re-opening of the BCL mine. I just wanted to understand if the Minister is prepared to admit that closing BCL mine was a big mistake. Is he now in possession of a document titled 'Business Report – BCL Mining Operation in Botswana'? Mr Speaker, the truth is that nickel and other metal prices have bounced back as predicted in 2016. Is the Minister aware that nickel, copper and other metal prices are back and that there is

need for serious consideration of the mine re-opening? Is the Minister aware that the recent spectacular performance of the Anglo-Group was its Copper and Nickel Division? Is he also aware that according to the National Australian Bank, copper exceeded expectations in 2017 as demand proved stronger than expected?

Mr Speaker, the BCL model is that of nickel and credits, and I just want to understand if the Minister knows that the BCL mine can be re-opened tomorrow, provided an obstacle called the liquidator is removed. Is he aware that BCL has sufficient mineral reserves or resources that can last well into the future, and that these reserves can be mined commercially to end of mine life? For example Mr Speaker; official BCL resources stand at 25 million tonnes at grades of 0.66 nickel and 0.77 copper; 2.7 million tonnes measured resources at 0.86 per cent nickel and 0.98 per cent copper. Do you know Honourable Minister, that two of the BCL mine shafts, and one from Selkirk can be opened immediately? The two shafts I am referring to are the Selebi shafts and not the Phikwe shafts. We have a fully developed and well-defined ore body at these areas, and these are high grade high tonnage areas. The idea Honourable Minister, can be to mine, concentrate and sell. This will generate revenue that could be used to resuscitate the smelter, because we warned in 2016 that the smelter will need high capital to restart. The base metal industry in Zimbabwe Mr Speaker, is doing well with this model of mining, concentrating and selling without smelting. Even Nkomati in South Africa is doing the same thing. We know that this model can work.

I am reliably informed Mr Speaker, that some copper mines in the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), are interested in sending their concentrate to Phikwe for smelting. Mines such as Kinsenda Copper Mine, Frontier Mine, Kipoi Mine et cetera. These mines are currently smelting in Zambia which cannot keep up with their volumes. We are aware, Honourable Speaker, that investors have been scarred away by the liquidator who is profiting heftily from the process by asking prospective buyers to assume what he says is the P2.8 billion environmental rehabilitation liability. Does the Minister also believe that the liquidator, with this figure of P2.8 billion, is deterring investors? One such investor is none other than the Eurasian Resources Group (ERG), which owns and operates mines across the world. Mr Speaker, with or without this liability the mine can be sold and re-opened. I have also presented another alternative to Government in the form of cost-sharing of the environmental liability.



Lastly Mr Speaker, is the Government aware that the liquidator is damaging the mine by flooding the southeast extension and the Number 3 shaft, acting against the advice of the Director of Department of Mines and experts, and that the asset is unsafe under this liquidator? What is the current state of the asset Honourable Minister? When are we having back the more than 200 care and maintenance staff, which the liquidator fired late last year? Is the Minister aware that the consequence of flooding the shafts is that Phikwe is now engulfed by earth tremors which scare residents every day? When is the official explanation and immediate attention on these vibrations coming from the Minister? In summary, that is the question Honourable Speaker. I thank you.

**MINISTER OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY (MR MOLALE):** Mr Speaker, this is ambush. How can someone ask so many questions in an Order Paper, he asked two questions, how does he expect me to answer them?

**MR SPEAKER:** No, make an attempt Honourable Minister. He was under the impression that since it is your issue, you know.

**MR MOLALE:** Mr Speaker, that Setswana word 'iteke' (make an attempt) is not appropriate.

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes, okay answer Honourable Minister. Pardon me, that Setswana word will lend me in trouble.

**MR MOLALE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Keorapetse, I will not and I shall not admit that we made a mistake in closing down or in liquidating BCL. The circumstances at the time were conducive for such a situation to take place and as you have rightly pointed out, at the time it was bad. The Government, as the sole owner at the time, could not manage because we did not have money. When that took place, it was with the full notion that there are all bodies that can be exploited by other interested parties. We have the report which says that Phikwe can be viable if copper and nickel prices do an upturn, and they have made an upturn as it has always been the case. That is the most volatile kind of market for copper and nickel because one time it is up and one time it is down. At the time of liquidation, it was down to the point where it was no more economical to mine, and to run the mine. I cannot admit that it was a mistake. It was a rational decision at the time.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of clarification, Mr Speaker.

**MR MOLALE:** Honourable Boko, we are not swiping cars here; I am answering a question. Just wait. Mr Speaker, it is possible that in the past year, the performance of Anglo improved as a result of the copper-nickel prices in the world. It is known and therefore, even if I have not seen their report, it is not a surprise because when the minerals are doing well, the company will make profit.

Yes, we have said that because this mine was run by the Government, at the time of liquidation we said, one thing that we will do is to float the mine to interested bidders. We are still doing that, there have been people who have come to say, we think we can mine. Therefore, if they come and they are ready to open, they can even open tomorrow as you say, given the prices of copper and nickel in the world. It is fine, no qualms with that whether we could open tomorrow or...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of procedure.

**MR SPEAKER:** What is the point of procedure for Honourable Boko?

**MR BOKO:** I think the Minister is either misleading the House or...

**MR SPEAKER:** Please stand up and speak, you cannot talk to me whilst you are sitting down.

**MR BOKO:** Sorry, I think the Minister is either misinformed or deliberately misleading this House. BCL is under liquidation, meaning that all the assets of that entity will at the conclusion of the process be sold by the liquidator, you have no control over the process. I have written you a letter to say, take BCL out of liquidation and put it under judicial management. The process you are describing is a process that would properly be undertaken if that mine was undergoing judicial management, not what you are doing, so you are wrong and you are actually being dishonest in my view.

**MR MOLALE:** He is just wasting my time.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Boko, you should have asked for clarification or correction, not procedure. Everything is according to procedure. Let him respond, you will keep asking him questions as he continues with his response. Go ahead Honourable Minister.



**MR MOLALE:** I think what he wanted to do Mr Speaker, is to tell this House that he wrote me a letter, other than that there is nothing substantive in what he said, there is nothing. I do not know where you are coming from, you have not been around and everything was calm, ah!

Mr Speaker, I say it is a fact, we have done as a Government previously, as well as the BCL itself and the Geoscience Institute, done surveys and whatever prospecting there, and there are known ore bodies in the area, whereas Honourable Keorapetse was saying, "if Selebi Phikwe could be sold, "we could start operating the mine tomorrow". That is what I am saying, so I do not know what you are talking about.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Boko, I will not have you shouting in Parliament, I will not have you doing that, and I will not reprimand you for the second time.

**MR MOLALE:** Mr Speaker at one point in time... (Inaudible)... made a comment in the British Parliament that, "when the popularity of the Conservative Party weans, so does their taste of good manners." I think it can be applied to Honourable Boko, his popularity is weaning and therefore, so does his taste of good manners, behave yourself man.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Should I respond to him Mr Speaker?

**MR SPEAKER:** No, that is not how we do things.

**MR MOLALE:** We are aware Mr Speaker...

**MR SPEAKER:** You have to request to interrupt; you do not just blurt out and speak as you are doing.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** May I interrupt?

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes, please go ahead.

**MR BOKO:** Look, Honourable Molale, focus on the issues that are before you, and desist from idle and frivolous talk because if you choose that route, you will find yourself in deep trouble, so please do not do that Honourable Member. I will pounce on you in a way that will embarrass you. Do not ever try that on me; try it elsewhere not on me, never! There! There! You should go and play there!

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order! That is enough. Order! Honourable Molale, please continue with your answer Honourable Member.

**MR MOLALE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I am not going to succumb to threats from Honourable Boko. Go ahead; we shall meet in the air boy...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)...

**MR MOLALE:** We shall meet; I am not scared of you...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Laughter!)... Not here, Boko there! There!

**MR MOLALE:** I still insist on what I said, because Honourable Keorapetse was saying, the BCL once sold can open tomorrow, and I am saying yes, I am not defining the process by which it is being sold or whatever. So do not digress us from the questions that have been asked by Honourable Keorapetse, just relax.

I am aware Honourable Keorapetse that when that smelter was working, we were looking at the regional mines; Zimbabwe, Zambia, but at a time when BCL closed, there had not been such agreements made, so the smelter as part of the BCL was not making any money. There is opportunity that in the event the mine opens, we could dialogue with the Zambians as we always talk on binational or on regional basis that yes, now the smelter is possibly available for you to come and work from, just as the Zimbabweans may possibly do. We are going to be having a binational commission with the Zimbabweans very soon, and those are the possibilities that we will be discussing whether in the event the mine reopens and the smelter starts operating, they would come and smelt in Selebi Phikwe. Those are possibilities, us as the Government, we are also looking forward to those possibilities. Here, I am not defining the process of how the BCL assets are going to be sold once it is liquidated.

The environmental issues; we are working on them, and as it is always the case, the law defines in a manner that if the mining company has failed and there are environmental issues arising out of that, and are a threat to the public, the Government has to take over the liability. That is why we have taken over the environmental rehabilitation issues in Selebi Phikwe, it is ongoing, so it is not much to be concerned about, and we are quite alive to the matter.



Yes, I am aware Honourable Keorapetse. Contrary to my plea because I can only plead with the liquidator, contrary to my plea and contrary to professional advice from the Director of Mines, the liquidator went ahead and flooded some shafts. In the process...

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Procedure Mr Speaker. Pardon me Honourable Minister, just on that point, we have the Mines, Quarries, Works and Machinery Act which empowers the Director of Mines to take charge if anything goes wrong in any mining environment, and I am just worried by what the Minister says, saying that he can only plead with the liquidator in respect of flooding of the shafts. I thought the law was very clear that when it comes to that, it is now his purview as the custodian of the Mines, Quarries, Works and Machinery Act and his subordinate, being the Director of Mines. I thought the position of the law is clear that he cannot actually plead, he can direct that do not flood the shafts because it is an environmental hazard. I just wanted that, I do not know if I...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Keorapetse, it is not necessary for you to say procedure. Ask him why he is not using the law because it is there. Please go ahead Honourable Minister.

**MR MOLALE:** Mr Speaker, I am quite alive to the fact that there is a law, and I am describing what happened despite the existence of the law, because the Director of Mines did instruct but it failed. That is why now we had to follow the defined process that Honourable Boko has mentioned that we now have to take this case to the Registrar and Master of the High Court, who is the supervisor of the liquidator. That is why I am using the word 'plea' and 'plead' because the law was violated with impunity.

Coming to your second question, I have had a counsel from the Registrar and Master, with his advice, I should let you know that the matter of the removal of a liquidator in any liquidation matter is one within the control and authority of the Master of the High Court in terms of the Companies Act, Cap.42:01 as the BCL liquidation is ongoing, the matter of the removal of the liquidator as at now is *sub judice*.

You will remember Honourable Keorapetse that, at the last session of Parliament I did answer to a question from you, if I am not mistaken, about this issue. I told you what I am going to do, I took that decision and as it is now, I cannot say anything beyond what I said the other ... (Interruptions)...

Mr Speaker, the prospect of opening the mine, gone there is opportunity. Again in the process of liquidation, there have been people who have come to the liquidator showing that they are interested. As it is now, he is the one who can then say yes, whether he is selling or otherwise. I can go on and further say that given what I told Parliament last time when this issue was discussed, I said at the time that I have set up a taskforce of professionals from my ministry who are going to be working with the liquidator to fast-track the process to see the feasibility of selling this thing, the professional aspects of it, how they can be done. I have given them up to the 30<sup>th</sup> of June this year.

Having said that, the taskforce reported to me and their second report was two weeks ago. They have had to discuss with the liquidator and the liquidator has said, it is possible that he can give us the mining assets and see how we dispose them off, hence coming to the point from Honourable Boko that, if that happens, we can then put these under judicial management and dispose them off such that companies that are interested can buy and start mining and we remain with the environmental liabilities, that in any case, we are continuing with. We are at that point and therefore, there are other matters which I said are sub judice which are within the purview of the Registrar and the High Court. I was saying I am not refusing the points that Honourable Keorapetse mentioned, I am refusing where he says it was a mistake.

The earth tremors, yes, it is possible that when a water body like in the case of water which was not drained in the shafts, penetrate through the rocks there is bound to be some earth tremors. I am not a professional, I am still awaiting a professional report from the Geo-Science Institute, who are on site trying to determine the cause of the tremors. What is evident is that, it becomes very difficult to access where shafts are already flooded. They are trying their best to make a determination of these tremors, where they come from, what happened. Ordinarily, common sense will dictate that as water sips into the features of rocks in the shafts, there is bound to be movements of rocks and then culminating in earth tremors.

Mr Speaker, I have answered the one for removal of the liquidator that we cannot discuss it here and I pray for your indulgence Honourable Member that you give us a bit of time. The June 30 deadline is still there and it still stands. I thank you Mr Speaker.



**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Minister for your response. Honourable Minister, I want to appreciate from you, even during care and maintenance, during the judicial process or judicial management that you spoke about and liquidation, we had investors coming to Botswana with an interest to buy all the BCL assets or buy BCL as a going concern, but it looks like there is a lot of resistance from the liquidator. I wonder why your Government is taking long to make a decision, to go back to court and go against this because it is the Government of Botswana that went to court and applied for liquidation. I believe you should be in a position to say to us as Parliament that indeed, protecting the interest of this country, protecting the interest of the nation and our people, it is time for us now to make a decision as Government. Will I be wrong to suspect that since we have been losing a lot of money to the liquidator, this might be a fund raising exercise by the ruling party, the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) because we are in the election year and whatever has been paid to the liquidator, there are possibilities that your campaigns might also be benefiting out of what the liquidator is getting on a monthly basis from this liquidation process? I thank you Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Let there be peace in the house.

**MR MOLALE:** Mr Speaker, I think Honourable Nkaigwa should have taken the cue from that comment made by Honourable Boko, where he was emphasising the process, and I telling him about the status. What you are talking about is a process that people have shown interest to the liquidator. Those people have come to us but we have pointed that the liquidator is the right man. In the event as I said if he agrees that we take the mining assets, then the people who will come, we will try to expedite the process according to how we have agreed.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR MOLALE:** I do not know because we do not know the stance from the liquidator, but I asked that you should not drive me to that one because I do not want to upset another independent Arm of Government which is the Judiciary. There is a process ongoing, I stop there.

Now this one of suspicion Honourable Nkaigwa, that is tantamount to hallucinatory statements that we are doing a fundraising statement. This is a serious matter, so do not make such statements that are inflammatory and out of order. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Let there be peace Honourable Mokgware! Honourable Mokgware! Order! Order!

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs) ...

**MR SPEAKER:** Ask Honourable Boko.

**MR BOKO:** Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Minister, you seem to be at the mercy of the liquidator and it is understandable because what is going on is a liquidation. Have you considered approaching the court, you Government, together with other major creditors of BCL as you are entitled to, under the Companies Act, to seek a removal of BCL from liquidation and its placement under judicial management which would then enable a more proactive approach by yourselves (Government)? That is the first question.

Have you considered, in other words, have you taken the advice that I have rendered to you freely in the letter that I wrote which you have neither acknowledged or responded to, that remove BCL from liquidation, place it under judicial management? The effect of which would be to freeze all processes until some of these things that need to be addressed are addressed.

The second is, you were saying the matter of the removal of the liquidator is sub judice. I want to indulge you as you want to be indulged, although you are not entitled by law to any indulgence in this regard on the sub judice principle. Let me ask you this, just simple confirmation, have you approached the court, not saying get into how far it is along; have you sought the removal of the liquidator so that the matter can then decide to be under active consideration sub judice? Have you done that? Those are the two issues. Thank you.

**MR MOLALE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Boko is an officer of the court, he is free to go and ask that question at court, not that it should come from me...

**MR BOKO:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR MOLALE:** Yes, you are, but you are an officer of the court, go and ask the court, do not try to push me into a corner where I will actually violate the procedures of the court. You know them very well...

**MR BOKO:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR MOLALE:** You know them very well.



**MR BOKO:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MR MOLALE:** I did law too, maybe you do not know.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Laughter!)...

**MR MOLALE:** You say, I seem to be at the mercy of the liquidator. You say things without thinking first Honourable Boko. A moment ago, you were talking about the very same process asking why I am not following it. I am following the process, now you are saying I am at the mercy. What a contradiction? This is why your voters do not want you anymore. They should vote for me as their leader.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Laughter!) ...

**MR BOKO:** Point of order. You are being rude. If we are going to address each other in a rude manner, let us agree so that we all do that. What you are doing is rudeness and disrespect. Old man, do not use that route because it will get you in trouble. Stop being rude.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Boko, even if he provoked you, you should not refer to someone who is older than you as rude. That is bad manners. Withdraw that statement and use proper words Honourable Boko.

**MR BOKO:** What you are doing is behaving in a bad manner for a person of your age. If it was not you, I could be saying rudeness but just because it is you I will say something similar to that.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Boko, you are out of order! Speak properly to show you are talking to someone older than you. Honourable Boko, withdraw the words which you used when addressing your elder. Speak in an acceptable manner.

**MR BOKO:** I have been asked by Mr Speaker not refer to the issue that you have just mentioned as rudeness, which is how I see it as far as I am concerned. Sir, what you are doing will get you in trouble. Stop it.

**MINISTER OF TERTIARY EDUCATION, RESEARCH, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (MR OLOPENG):** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Olopeng, our time is running out. Proceed Honourable Molale.

**MR OLOPENG:** No, point of order, Boko did not withdraw his statement.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Molale, continue with the answer.

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATION (MS MAKGATO):** Point of order Mr Speaker.

**MR MOLALE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I repeat my words that I will not succumb to the threats Honourable Boko's threats. If he thinks he can scare me, I dare him. I am not afraid of you. Mr Speaker, yes, I received a letter on December from Honourable Boko.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Murmurs)...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** look! Order! Please leave Honourable Molale to answer for himself. Let Honourable Molale put this issue in order.

**MS MAKGATO:** Point of order Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Makgato, Honourable Ralotsia, I said let Honourable Molale put this issue in order.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, we are talking to Honourable Boko.

**MR SPEAKER:** Leave Honourable Boko. I said Honourable Molale should answer. What is wrong with you?

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Murmurs).

**MR SPEAKER:** No, proceed Honourable Molale.

**MR OLOPENG:** Procedure Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Sit down Honourable Olopeng. Take your seats. I said Honourable Molale should answer. Switch off the microphone.

**MR MOLALE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I was saying, I received a letter from Honourable Boko on December saying that I should follow some processes such that we take BCL out of liquidation and place it under judicial management. I am still investigating the officer who leaked that matter to Honourable Boko for him to write me a letter about a matter that I was doing. I am still looking for that officer. You will help us with investigations on how that official information was leaked.

So Mr Speaker, what I am saying is that we should know that this House has the right to seek information from ministries, but individual members of this House should not go and seek information from ministries when this House is not sitting. That has to be corrected Mr Speaker.



**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Murmurs) ...

**MR MOLALE:** Look Honourable Ntlhaile, do not ask me who I am. I will answer you boy. I will answer you. You think that people are afraid of you.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Molale, do not let them take you out of order. Answer only the questions that you have been asked and give them a chance to ask you questions. Give each other a chance to answer and ask questions.

**MR MOLALE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. So, Honourable Boko never gave me free advice, he is misleading this House. He never gave me free advice. Mr Speaker, let me sit down and give other Honourable Members a chance to ask meaningful questions, not aspersions cast by Honourable Boko.

**MR BOKO:** Procedure Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No, wait Honourable Boko. Honourable Keorapetse, ask.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. What I want to know from the Honourable Minister is whether there is an application in court to have the liquidator removed or to remove the BCL from liquidation into judicial management? I just want to understand whether that application has been made. Let me also say Mr Speaker that, if that application is made, a confirmation that it is made or has not been made is not a sub judice matter, because if you apply to court, the question is whether you have applied or not? I do not want the merits of the application, I do not want him to discuss the case, I just want a confirmation. Have you instructed the Government to remove BCL from liquidation into judicial management? That is what I want to know.

Secondly Mr Speaker, what Honourable Nkaigwa was saying is not far-fetched because there is corruption that is rampant at BCL mine. Our taxes are being wasted. We have people staying in hotels up to two years now since the closure of the mine. We have people who do not know what they are doing and come to BCL saying that they conducting geo tax studies. As a matter of fact, I know that Honourable Molale does not have a report on that geo tax studies because it was just a scam to steal Government money. There are invoices which other people refused to sign because they could see that this is theft.

So, what Honourable Nkaigwa is saying about corruption being rampant and possibly money being siphoned to sponsor campaigns is not far-fetched. So I just wanted to understand if you are aware Honourable Minister.

Honourable Minister you said that it was not a mistake to close BCL. We think that it was a monumental mistake because your reason, which we would not accept, is unreasonable and inadequate. Metal prices have gone down before and the decision to liquidate was never taken. So, why was it taken especially at the time when we knew prices would bounce back in 2017? So, why do you still say this was not a mistake? I thank you Honourable Speaker.

**MR MOLALE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. The first answer, *sub judice* or not, let me read this sentence again that the Registrar and I agreed on. "As the BCL liquidation is ongoing, the matter of the removal of the liquidator is *sub judice*." From this, you can deduce whether the application has been made or not.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Procedure.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Members, why do you ask questions and not give the Minister a chance to answer them? Give him a chance to answer Honourable Keorapetse.

**MR MOLALE:** Corruption at BCL is a matter which can be investigated if you have reported it. I am not the authority to do that. I know and I have received reports that there could be some untoward behavior that is not conducive with the way in which public funds should be spent and that is a matter for investigation. Therefore, Honourable Keorapetse, you are messing up your question by supporting what was said by Nkaigwa. Let us just debate BCL as a serious issue and finish. Do not add on unnecessary things that you get on the side.

I have mentioned that, I will not admit and I shall not admit that BCL liquidation was a mistake. A statement was made here in Parliament by the then Minister on what the reasons are and those reasons still stand. Maybe Honourable Molebatsi was not yet here. You can go and check for those reasons in the Hansard. They still stand. So it was not a mistake. Thank you.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Procedure Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Keorapetse, I am expecting a question. Are you asking for procedure?

**MR KEORAPETSE:** It is procedure.

**MR SPEAKER:** Proceed, there is three minutes left.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** It is a procedural matter. I will appeal to you Honourable Speaker to maybe ask the Parliamentary Counsel (PC) to clarify this matter.



If Government has made an application in court to have BCL removed from liquidation into judicial management, it is a court application and the Minister must just tell us. Have you made the application or not? How can that matter be *sub judice* matter? Maybe the PC should clarify, if there is a case... I wanted to ask Honourable Speaker, whether or not the application has been made. I do not think it is a *sub judice* matter.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Keorapetse, let us allow the Minister to respond. I do not want to involve Parliamentary Counsel in a matter that she does not know; issues of Honourable Molale's office. Ask a question.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Molale, my question is on flooding of the shafts...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Sir! On flooding of the shafts, whether there is a plan that has been submitted to the Director of Mines on how the water can be drained out on the cost and other related matters. I just want to understand because I do not think it is too late to drain water from the shafts.

**MR MOLALE:** No, it is not too late Honourable Member. That is why the Director and other professionals are on site. I did say at the last sitting, those shafts were flooded contrary to our professional and legal advice, it was not supposed to be like that. We strongly believe that we can salvage the damage that has been done there so as to recruit the value of the asset. So, I agree with you that yes, it is not too late and that is why my team is on site.

I did say at the last sitting, in answering you that, some of those people who were hired by the liquidator had not been licensed by the Director of Mines. When we were supposed to take action, I have a lawyer, if a lawyer advises me that no, even though there has been a violation of law, take this route, I have to listen to my lawyer. That is why he advised that, take the route of contacting and having audience with the registrar. I had to do that because we have to do things in accordance with the law. So, I agree with you and this thing pains me just as it pains you because there has been a violation of law, assets have been damaged. I admitted to that in the last sitting of this Parliament, and I am still doing that. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** The time allocated this question is over. We are done with it. There are two Questions Without Notice. The first one is by Honourable Batshu.

## QUESTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE

### DAILY POWER CUTS EXPERIENCED IN NKANGE

#### CONSTITUENCY

**MR E. J. BATSHU (NKANGE):** asked the Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security to give a detailed account for the daily power cuts experienced in the Nkange Constituency particularly the villages of Maitengwe and Dagwi during the past festive season, which badly affected businesses and also caused severe damages to electrical appliances, and to further explain whether Botswana Power Corporation (BPC) is ready to make good, through compensation to those affected.

**MINISTER OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY (MR MOLALE):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, during the just ended festive season, power supply to the North East Region as a whole including Maitengwe and Dagwi villages was adversely affected by the damage caused by lightning strikes on the main 66 kV power line from Francistown to Masunga and Tutume areas.

In addition, Maitengwe and Dagwi villages experienced power supply interruptions due to overloading of the 500 kVA line or the 33 kV Dagwi Substation transformer. The substation is supplied from the 66 kV line from Francistown and intern supplies the villages of Dagwi and Maitengwe as well as the Water Utilities well fields of Maitengwe.

To address overloading of the Dagwi Substation transformer which usually occurs during the festive season, BPC is in the process of replacing the current 500 kVA transformer with a 10001 which will double the substations capacity. The work is to be completed next week, the 25<sup>th</sup> of February. In order to improve reliability of the 66 kV line from Francistown, we are currently doing the design with a view to replacing it with the one that is less acceptable to lightning interruptions and damage.

With respect to compensating customers for damage to electrical appliances due to this power service, Botswana Power Corporation (BPC) only considers compensation if the damage is determined to have occurred as a



result of negligence by the corporation. That is a matter of individuals talking with the BPC. In addition, as power surges are an inherent picture of power systems, consumers are required by law to protect their sensitive equipment and appliances.

In conclusion Mr Speaker, I wish to state that to date, no reports have been received by BPC from Dagwi and Maitengwe, and if there are any, let them be submitted to BPC immediately. Even when they are received, each case will be considered on its own merit. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR BATSHU:** Supplementary. Let me thank you Minister for that answer that seems to be carrying a lot of truth in it. Those who were questioned replied by saying there is load shedding. The question is, if many people have connected electricity and there is load shedding, how come they are not informed in advance what they should expect?

Honourable Minister the other thing, are you aware that we still experience power cuts in our constituency because up to quarter to seven yesterday there was no electricity for almost 48 hours? Even as we speak there is no electricity.

The third question; he should explain the amount of electricity that is left that we source from South Africa. Since Eskom is faced with a lot of problems, should we expect the same problems we experienced in the past?

The fourth one; if there is no electricity it means there is no water because water is pumped using electricity as it has already been mentioned. What should be done about the problems of electricity and water to improve the situation?

Lastly, if there is a problem like this, why can we not announce on the radio and inform people so that they may know what to expect. I thank you Honourable Member.

**MR MOLALE:** Thank Honourable Batshu. The procedure is that if there is going to be a power cut, the person responsible in BPC should go and announce at the radio and advertise in the newspapers, and through the internet. All along I have been seeing this happening in many sectors. If that cannot be done in Maitengwe and Dagwi, it should not be intentional, it should have been a mistake that people were not informed on time. We shall correct that one Honourable Member.

Yes, I am aware that even as we are talking, some places including there, there is no electricity. There are a number of problems, the other one I answered earlier when I mentioned that when inefficiencies creep in, they manifest themselves in lack of power. Last time I mentioned that in some lines auto-reclosers were not included, in that if there is a problem in an area, they isolate it. In other areas if a specific area encounters problems and these things are not there, they affect the whole line. I have requested that you correct that because it is not a big project that would need more money. That is why I was saying when inefficiencies creep in, they manifest themselves into these problems. I have owned up on that in this very House, that we made a mistake and that we shall correct. That is what we are doing.

Yes, it is true that when there is no electricity a lot of things including water pumping stops because the electricity is very essential in our lives. Honourable Mzwinila has advised that we should try by all means to preserve the electricity in the well fields. That is what we are doing.

At Eskom; right now there is a problem, there is shortage of electricity. The one that we purchase from them is the one that is in the river villages of Kgatlang, Southern District along the Molopo river and Kgalagadi District. When there is load shedding that side, they are also affected. The rest of the country; the three generators in Morupule and the picking plants that are there, for now they do and we will have power. I repeat we made a mistake, we now take the blame and we shall correct the mistake. I thank you.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Further supplementary.

**MR SPEAKER:** I wanted us to take question two for Honourable Moswaane, we shall however take the last supplementary by Honourable Mangole.

**MR MANGOLE:** Further supplementary. I thank you Mr Speaker. Minister the answer that you are giving for Maitengwe is a problem that is there countrywide, it does not only affect those who are connected to Eskom. In fact, the problem is bigger than that time when you used to inform us that there was going to be load shedding. I therefore request Mr Minister that you inform Batswana when you are planning to stop praising the electricity challenges that we are faced with and when should they expect the supply of electricity that is consistent? Can you give us an assurance as to when you will be able to solve this problem?



**MR MOLALE:** Mr Speaker, me and the Honourable Member are not talking about the same thing. I have never praised any problem, infact we are fighting it, we need solution. I even gave a deadline to which he should hold me accountable that, on the 25th of February the problem will be solved. The fact remains, this is not going to be a constant problem, where there is a problem, it shall be fixed. I said this and I am still repeating that where inefficiencies creep in, they manifest themselves in this. We are dealing with those inefficiencies, which is an internal process at BPC. We are dealing with the issues, maybe Honourable Member, there could be some impatience which I understand however, we are not praising those problems, we are resolving them. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**SHORTAGE OF EQUIPMENT AND DRUGS AT  
ALL REFERRAL  
HOSPITALS**

**MR M. I. MOSWAANE (FRANCISTOWN WEST):** asked the Minister of Health and Wellness if he is aware that:

- (i) all referral hospitals are white elephants and are without equipment and drugs;
- (ii) Nyangabgwe Referral Hospital theatre equipment is malfunctioning;
- (iii) boarded equipment is still being used at Nyangabgwe Referral Hospital;
- (iv) 50% of patients leave medical facilities without being given the prescribed drugs due to their shortage; and if so;
- (v) when will he address the situation.

**MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (DR MADIGELE):** Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker,

- (i) We have three referral hospitals in this country, namely; Nyangabgwe Referral Hospital, Princes Marina Hospital and Sabrana Hospital; which is actually a psychiatric hospital. We have challenges occasionally relating to shortage of drugs and equipment in these facilities, and we are continuously addressing these through procurement as the need arises.
- (ii) Nyangabgwe has four theaters; theatre one is mainly for orthopedics and neurosurgery. Theatre two is mainly for general surgery, urology and

Ear, Nose and Throat (ENT). Theatre three is for gynaecology (gynae) and theatre four is mainly for obstetrics and labour. We have had problems Mr Speaker, especially with theater one, which is being used primarily for orthopedic surgery and neurosurgery. There are currently problems with chillers which means that occasionally, there are problems of high temperature which leads to theatres not being used for surgery. In this particular instance Mr Speaker, we have managed to refer patients to Mahalapye for surgery as and when this particular theatre is not working. There is a contractor on site who is repairing these chillers. He has been on site since December.

With respect to question three Mr Speaker; there are autoclaves that have been boarded at some point at Nyangabwe Referral Hospital. Then again they were repaired and were put to use. As a ministry we have started procurement, not only for Nyangabwe Referral Hospital but for most of the hospitals in the country for autoclaves, as we have found that most of them are not working optimally to our satisfaction.

With respect to question four Mr Speaker; I am not aware that 50% of patients leave medical facilities without being given medical drugs due to shortage. I will admit that there is indeed a shortage, especially with regard to the necessary drugs. You will recall that there are three classes of drugs, namely the vital, essential and necessary drugs. We have had challenges with respect mainly to necessary drugs, which are drugs that include among others the creams; your multivitamins, Vitamin B complex and Vitamin C, which we have had problems with. We have through our procurement strategy allowed districts to procure and we have actually given the district including referral hospitals micro procurement money. In this instance Nyangabwe was given P5 million at the beginning of the financial year. This January it was given an additional P2 million to procure additional medication as and when it is needed.

With respect to question five Mr Speaker which talks to issues of how we are addressing this situation of shortage of drugs, the shortage of drugs problem is multifaceted. In the supply chain of medicines, we are not only talking about Central Medical Stores (CMS), we are talking about the headquarters. What are the regulations that are obtained there? We are talking about the offices responsible for essential drug listing. Essential drug listing is the catalogue of medicines



that we need as a country. We have had a situation where this list has been there a long time without being reviewed. You would remember that pharmaceutical industry is always dynamic Mr Speaker. We have had a situation where the Essential Drug List (EDL) office has not been capacitated enough to make sure that they continuously update the medications. We have taken steps to make sure that we put additional personnel in terms of pharmacists, to make sure that we continuously update the essential drug list. At CMS Mr Speaker, there is also a plethora of problems. There are about 2000 lines of medicines, reagents and consumables that are being procured by CMS but we only have two or three procurement officers. We only have two or three contract managers. This leads to many problems that sometimes occur. For instance, if there are 2 000 lines Mr Speaker of consumables and medicines and we have a couple of contract managers, most of the time you would find that suppliers then conform to the contract as they are and sometimes you have late or inadequate deliveries. We have taken steps Mr Speaker to address this by training more pharmacists to do procurement, trained our legal people also to do procurement, to address this particular issue at the CMS.

With respect to going towards the district Mr Speaker, because the CMS would then supply the district warehouses. The district warehouses would then supply the facilities in the country. From the CMS to the districts, to the facilities, we have not been able to leverage on technology to make sure that the supply chain becomes continuous or the continuum of supply chain becomes as smooth as possible. So we are developing a system Mr Speaker with the help of global fund and The United States Agency for International Development (USAID) to make sure we link CMS directly to the facilities so that we can have updated real time data coming from the facilities so that we can be able to project shortages and orders coming from the districts and the facilities, so that we can attend to this problem Mr Speaker.

Furthermore Mr Speaker, there has been a mistake that was done in the last financial year, in that the necessary drugs were not ordered and we have had delays now. Since we realised that they were not ordered we have had delays in procuring, because there have to be a lead time to the manufacturer, to manufacture the drugs in question. We believe that through the micro procurement we have been able to reduce the problem of shortage of drugs. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR MOSWAANE:** Supplementary. Minister, you talked about autoclave, and you also talked about the temperature component of the theater machine. I would like to ask how long this machine has not been working because I hear it has been on and off for over five years and at times, patients narrowly escape from theater. How long has it been according to you because the autoclave machine has not been working for 10 years? I want to understand that Minister and go on to say, it is alleged that it has been six months since the Computed Tomography (CT) scan has not been working. It is also said that it has been three years since the Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI) machine has not been working. It is also said that some x-ray equipment at Jubilee which are used alongside those at Nyangabwe are also not working. The x-ray at Nyangabwe is also said to be not working well, when will this be resolved? Furthermore, the mortuary which has 30 trays is alleged to have only 12 trays working for the past three years or so and 18 trays are not working. This ends up compelling relatives of the deceased to hasten to take corpses because they will be sharing trays. How do you see this Minister and how does it display us as Batswana? Can a Government 52 years old not afford to buy a computer system which will control stock? I need an answer because the ones that are there were bought in about 1989 or 1972. Thank you.

**DR MADIGELE:** Thank you very much Mr Speaker and thank you Honourable Member, Francistown West. There has been a delay Mr Speaker. I acknowledge that autoclaves particularly, the Honourable Member is correct, it has been almost 10 years, but they were declared to be boarded. Like I said that decision was reversed after it was found that they could actually be repaired and they were indeed repaired. Although they have not been functioning optimally, they have been doing their job most of the time. Like I said, procurement measures have been put in place to procure these autoclaves countrywide for most of the hospitals apart from Marina, which got its autoclaves last financial year.

With respect to the chillers Mr Speaker, like I said in the body of my answer, there has been a problem especially with theatre, Theatre 1, which is responsible for operations for orthopedic surgeries and neurosurgeries but we are attending to it as the contractor is on site.

Mr Speaker, there is indeed a problem with the computerized tomography (CT) scan as well, of which there are contractual issues with the person who installed and is supposed to maintain the CT scan and also the



Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI). So there have been problems there, of which we are working on. We are in the process of engaging the manufacturers themselves because we have found that dealing with the distributor and the contractor, we are not getting value for money.

Mr Speaker, with respect to the mortuary, I am not aware of the non-functionality of the 18 trays. I will investigate that Mr Speaker, and revert to the Honourable Member on that particular answer.

Mr Speaker, when we talk to issues relating to the software; the health service management software, indeed there is a software called Integrated Patient Management System (IPMS) provided by Meditech, but we have found that although the system is good on paper, in terms of practice, it is also not giving us value for money. For instance, we have developed the Logistics Management and Information System (LMIS) which is supposed to link Central Medical Stores (CMS) to the facilities themselves so that we have real-time data that I spoke about. The problem now is that this IPMS has to be upgraded so that a proper interface can be achieved from the LMIS to the IPMS. But now the upgrade is very costly Mr Speaker. We are exploring other means to have a soft-landing to make sure that we intergrade these systems. The amount that has been thrown about is that we need about P280 million to upgrade IPMS to new starters, so that we can be able to interface and that money Mr Speaker, to me is a lot of money, that I have talked to my officials that we should open up and explore other avenues to make sure that we attend to this problem head-on. I thank you.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Further supplementary.

**MR SPEAKER:** Let us take the last one from Honourable Mmolotsi.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Further supplementary. Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Minister, are you aware that at Nyangabgwe hospital for example, there is serious shortage of specialists, especially gynaecologists to a point where right now patients are booked to see the doctor in 2024? Are you also aware that the few specialists that are there are made to handle about 50 patients a day? If you are aware Minister, what is it that you are doing to actually deal with this situation which is very, very unfavourable to our people?

The second one Minister is that you often talk about nurses to say if there is shortage of drugs in their clinics, they can actually use private pharmacies. Are you aware

that, that has presented difficulties and patients have had to buy drugs for themselves? Some who do not have money have had to give up and not get the prescribed medication. Lastly, are you aware Minister that there are patients who are hospitalised at Nyangabgwe hospital awaiting to be taken to the facilities outside the country who have been there for months now? Are you also aware that there is one particular patient who has been hospitalised in Nyangabgwe, I think for 15 years now? If you are aware, what are you doing about these things?

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Minister, summarise them, we spent a long time on questions.

**DR MADIGELE:** You are rushing me now Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No Sir, just answer.

**DR MADIGELE:** Thank you very much Honourable Member. Indeed, there is a huge shortage of specialists throughout the country and also in Nyangabgwe, especially like the Honourable Member has said, gynaecologists. Mr Speaker, this problem is brought about by the uncompetitive working conditions for the specialists, including the fact that we cannot compete with other countries in terms of paying the doctors and specialists to work in this country. To the extent that we have long waiting lists of people who are supposed to undergo gynaecological procedures. What we have done Mr Speaker is that we have since taken the decision to engage the private sector so that we reduce the waiting lists. A tender is about to be awarded to various citizen gynaecologists to help with the waiting lists. They will be performing procedures on behalf of us at our various facilities Mr Speaker. We believe that we shall roll out this process of engaging the private sector, not only for gynaecologists, but other disciplines, including general practitioners.

Mr Speaker, with respect to shortage of drugs, like I said, the ministry has engaged the various health districts and given them micro procurement monies to make sure that they at least replenish their inventories, especially with drugs that are vital and essential to make sure that we get to provide quality health services to our people. Occasionally, yes there are challenges of not getting medication Mr Speaker, but we are doing our best to make sure that, that does propagate into a huge problem.

Mr Speaker, all along we have been using the South African health facilities for our referrals, especially some specialties and other quaternary care of our patients, but we have experienced problems with the



middleman who was connecting us to the various South African health facilities. That ended or culminated in the contract ending or not being renewed because of the multiple problems that we experienced, including the possible hemorrhaging of funds Mr Speaker by the various facilities and health groups that were engaged. We have taken steps Mr Speaker to empower the private hospitals that are in the country as well because most of them are coming up to provide the services that we need in terms of the subspecialties. We are also opening up our quaternary facility, namely Sir Ketumile Masire on the 26<sup>th</sup> of April. We shall be opening up the doors of this prestigious facility and it will help us to make sure that we provide the tertiary care that our people need in this country. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Procedure Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No Honourable Moswaane. Your procedure must not be associated with these answers because I want to proceed.

**MR MOSWAANE:** No Mr Speaker. Perhaps you should have given me a minute to ask him if he is aware that the people of Francistown live in fear, they gave that hospital a name "*laela mmaago*," which means "say your goodbyes" are you also aware that ...

**MR SPEAKER:** No Honourable Moswaane...

**MR MOSWAANE:** ... 10 doctors went to school but they were never replaced?

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Moswaane, you are out of order.

**MR MOSWAANE:** I want that to go on record so that when problems arise, the people of Francistown will understand what is happening.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Moswaane, order! Sit down, you are out of order.

**MR MOSWAANE:** No, we are dying Mr Speaker.

**LEADER OF THE HOUSE (MR TSOGWANE):** Point of procedure. Mr Speaker, address what happened earlier on. We are Africans, we have our own culture. So, if someone behaves like Honourable member for Mochudi giving us his back, we all know that the only animal that does that is a dog and by doing so, it would be communicating something by the way. So please call him to order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order! Well, although your comparison is a bit strong Honourable Leader of the House, it is actually not appropriate. I am still mystified as well, that although he is free to do as he pleases, is there a whole Member of Parliament whom when they reach the isle and they are supposed to bow as he was taught, instead he does so facing the other way? I am still puzzled. I wonder why he chose to do it that way. Maybe I should talk to him in private; and not castigate him in front of other Members. I am only seeing this for the first time, ever since I came to Parliament. Let us continue Honourable Members.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of order, Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Let us preserve time; not you because you have already wreaked havoc. We shall dialogue privately.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** On a point of procedure, Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, I am extremely worried about the procedure of this House. The Minister's Question Time or these Ministers' Questions are very, very important questions but I can see that we are veering off the course because instead of optimising on the time, now we are becoming so playful and noisy that we fail to get what we want to get out of these questions. The question that was asked by Honourable Keorapetse is a very critical and very important question but it is unfortunate because a lot of us were just taking it for a joke. Really, I am so disappointed because some of us could not get time to ask questions and yet we have very important questions that we wanted to ask. Mr Speaker, you really need to control this House especially during that time because right now that question is gone but very few people managed to ask questions; most of us did not and we still want to ask a few questions because our people are crying every day. I am really worried Mr Speaker that we are veering off the course and we really need to do something about this.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Thank you Honourable Mmolotsi for noticing that most of the time you are never serious. I thank you very much for that. If you could be serious with your business, there would not be any problem; you asking questions and Ministers responding. Strictly asking questions and not playing as you are. I am glad because you have made that observation, but since we do not have much time, let us address some of these issues further at the General Assembly. I am also tired of chasing people who do



not behave accordingly out of Parliament; it really wears me down. Let us go back to our Parliamentary procedures and respect this House, and do our job as we are supposed to. Let us continue with the business. There are important Motions before us.

## GOVERNMENT TO CARRY OUT LAND AUDIT

### Motion

#### (Resumed Debate)

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Members, when we parted last time on Friday, this Motion had been debated and we were just left with voting. So let us commence right here with a division; ring the bell for two minutes so that those who are outside may come inside upon hearing it; then vote so that we move on to the next Motion.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of order, Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of procedure, Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No, we are going to vote first, and then we shall go back to the procedures and orders. The House was divided as follows: those who said ‘Yes’ are 15 and those who said ‘No’ are 20 and one Member has abstained. Therefore, the Noes have it.

Question put and **negated**.

**MR NKAIGWA:** On a point of order, Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Nkaigwa, I know what you want to request me to do; we talked about it last week, so let it not be a point of order. I will give you a chance to do what you want to do.

## RECONSIDERATION OF THE DECISION TO STOP USE OF

### PLASTIC BAGS

#### Motion

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Members, the next Motion is by Honourable Nkaigwa. Honourable Nkaigwa has requested, through my office, that I allow him to swap his Motions Number Two and Number 13 so that today he presents Number 13 and that Number Two will be relegated to the 13<sup>th</sup> spot. According to our procedure, only the House can approve that. I will allow him to make the request and ask the House for approval.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of order, Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No, please wait. Let him give reasons why he wants the request. Someone is saying point of order Honourable Nkaigwa; let us listen to Honourable Segokgo.

**MR SEGOKGO:** On a point of order, Mr Speaker. Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker the challenge is that you were saying “most of the time...” It was clearly said that most of the time we are never serious. That did not sit well with me Mr Speaker. How can we be here most of the time and then it is said most of that time we are never serious? No, Mr Speaker; please reconsider that statement and really verify whether most of the time we are not serious sir.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Segokgo, it means I failed to put it in a better way; most of the time “some of you” are never serious. If I put it like that, it should be all right because there are those who are like that; some.

**MR NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** Thank you Mr Speaker for affording me an opportunity to ask the House for the re-arrangement of the Order Paper today. I stand as per Standing Order 30.2 to ask this House for the re-arrangement of the Order Paper by swapping Motion 13 with Motion two. They are both my Motions. The reasons being that Motion 13 has now become urgent. My people in Gaborone North farms do not have water. It has been three to four weeks now without potable water and I believe that indeed this Motion has now become urgent.

Mr Speaker, water is a basic need of life. We cannot have the people of Gaborone North farms still ferrying water using water bowsers; still drinking water from the standpipe. We cannot have the people of Gaborone North not having sewerage facilities. It is an environmental concern Mr Speaker. I also want to believe that even my colleagues across the aisle will agree with me that there is a need for us as Government to give this Motion priority and be able to accede to my request. I thank you, Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Members, Honourable Nkaigwa has moved in accordance with Standing Order 30.2 and that Standing Order entitles him to make such requests. Honourable Mzwinila, I will give you a minute so that I hear why you are standing up.



**MINISTER OF LAND MANAGEMENT, WATER AND SANITATION SERVICES (MR MZWINILA):** Thank you Honourable Speaker. It is just to advise that this Motion is something that the Honourable Member has already reported to our ministry and we thought according to the numbering, we are going to present and articulate it, not today sir, so our request is that let us proceed with the ordering in the Order Paper. I thank you.

**MR SPEAKER:** I did not hear you properly, you all shouted, now I want division so that I hear what you are saying. Two minutes, ring the bell.

Question put and Division **Ordered.**

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Close the door, sit on your chairs so that you vote. Honourable Members, Honourable Nkaigwa's request is that you allow him to swap his motions, Motion number two moves to number 13, then we discuss number 13 today. Do you agree? I am activating so that you vote. Those who agree will press two, those who do not agree press three, those who do not want to commit themselves press four. Vote.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** I believe you all voted, I am stopping this side. Order! Noise, order! Those who said "yes" are 16, those who said "no" are 18, two did not vote. The Noes have it.

Question put and **negated.**

## RECONSIDERATION OF THE DECISION TO STOP USE OF PLASTIC BAGS

### Motion

**MR NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** Thank you Mr Speaker for the opportunity. It is very unfortunate that I thought my colleagues across the aisle will agree with me that indeed it was important for me to swap my Motions looking at the fact that I also have people. We have people residing in Gaborone North farms who need water on a daily basis, but they are currently suffering for portable water because there is...

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** Point of order. Mr Speaker, you have to reprimand unacceptable behaviour in Parliament. If someone knows there is procedure which is straight forward that when one has

a motion, they have to give the Minister time to prepare for it and then he comes right now saying he suggests the Motion be discussed which he knows the Minister is not ready for, as he is expecting it in weeks to come. From there he stands up and talks about members being treated like children, and that Parliament is a circus, saying we are not debating his Motion...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of procedure.

**MS MAKGATO:** Keep quiet! I am talking! Saying we are not debating his Motion because we do not care, that has to be reprimanded. No, why are you giving the Speaker your back, you have no right to speak, switch that thing off! Have you seen anyone giving the Speaker their back? You came here saying you want to represent the people, when you get here you give the Speaker your back, you have to obey the Speaker, what are you doing? You have to be reprimanded.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** No, Order! Order! Wait first, Honourable Boko, wait.

Honourable Nkaigwa! Let him speak. He is hurt that you did not agree with him, now instead of counselling him and listening to him speak, you bombard him with unsavoury comments. He was using a Standing Order that you agreed on, 30.2, it allows him to make that request. Now because he is sad, let him catch a breath, you hurt him, then he will continue with the plastics Motion.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you. I am not surprised Mr Speaker, there are hypocrites in this House. Honourable Makgato has got potable water in her own house in my Constituency at Gaborone North in Phakalane. She also has water in her own farm in Tswapong area. I am talking about people in Gaborone who do not have potable water, so you can afford to say all these things because when you go to your farm, you have water, when you go to Phakalane, you have got water, so it is totally different.

**MINISTER OF LAND MANAGEMENT, WATER AND SANITATION SERVICES (MR MZWINILA):** Procedure. I thank you Mr Speaker. No, the Honourable Member is out of order, because where we are right now, we are not talking about Gaborone North farms. The policy of this Government is not to provide water to



farms nor to provide to freehold. Now he is making us debate, please call him back to order, we are on number two, we are on Motion number two on plastics. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No, order! Honourable Members, Order! I said we are at motion number two which talks about plastics. Now Honourable Nkaigwa is introducing, in his introduction he is talkative because you hurt him.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)

**MR SPEAKER:** Let Honourable Nkaigwa introduce, then he will go back to the Motion on plastics, I am listening to him then we shall continue with the issue. When a person introduces, we listen to them. Yes, he is hurt.

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** Point of procedure. No I am correcting procedure that if in this House the likes of Honourable Nkaigwa are allowed to introduce, why is he introducing at my House?

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)

**MS MAKGATO:** Why does he not introduce somewhere else, what does he want at my house and farm? Why not introduce citing his house?

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order! Honourable Members! He only spoke for one and a half minute, you cannot already be fighting. At this juncture, let us stop here, 15 minutes! Go for tea break and be back by 11:00 a.m. so that we continue with Motion number two.

**PROCEEDINGS SUSPENDED AT 10:45 A.M.  
FOR APPROXIMATELY 15 MINUTES**

**PROCEEDINGS RESUMED AT 11:00 A.M.**

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order Honourable Members! Honourable Nkaigwa, continue with the Motion Sir, they say your introduction causes delays, so just go to the main issue.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Mr Speaker. Let me now go back to the Motion. Mr Speaker, Government introduced a compulsory standard for plastic carrier bags, 186:2006 in 2006. It was expected Mr Speaker that after the introduction of the standard for plastic carrier bags, Government will come up with a policy of the collection of Plastic Levy from businesses. Mr Speaker, this has not happened since 2007 and retailers continue to charge consumers a levy on plastic carrier bags with

no benefit to the Government. Businesses are now making more profits to the sale of plastic carrier bags. In real economic sense, when a product is priced, the price also includes the price of packaging. Therefore, it is unfair on consumers for retailers to continue charging them a levy on plastics when there is not policy for the collection of such levy.

Mr Speaker, late last year, we had reports from the Ministry of Environment to the effect that Government wants to stop the use of plastic carrier bags. Such a decision will impact negatively on the country's economy. Jobs have been created in the industry and such jobs will be lost through such a decision. The decision to stop the use of plastic carrier bags will be cumbersome on consumers. The introduced environmental friendly carrier bags are way too expensive for Batswana as the cheapest carrier bag cost around P25.

Stakeholders were also not consulted when such a decision to stop plastic carrier bags was made. It is unfortunate that such a decision reverses the economic gains the country can make through the formulation of a policy on the collection of Plastic Levy. The levy charged was introduced as part of measures to combat littering of plastic carrier bags and reduce their negative effects on the environment. The main objective of environmental taxes is to pass on the cost of pollution on the polluter. Government has neglected the burden of waste management and the Plastic Levy is not being used for the purpose it was intended for due to failure by Government to come up with a policy for the collection of levied monies from business owners. The use of plastic bags is still high despite the levy charged by businesses.

Mr Speaker, since the introduction of the levy in 2007, consumers began paying between 15 and 25 thebe for a plastic carrier bag. Currently most of the shops are charging 50 thebe to P1 for a plastic bag. Consumers continue to pay millions of Pula to retailers that could have been used to fund environmental initiatives which cannot be achieved due to lack of policy by Government. Instead, the money that should have funded environmental initiatives is only benefiting businesses since there is no policy for the collection of such money from retailers. None of the money collected from plastic bags has been used to recycle plastic bags and none of the money has been used to create jobs in the recycling industry.



Mr Speaker, the levy in its current state with no policy, continues to enrich the business owners in the name of environment. It has been almost 10 years since retailers started charging consumers levy on plastic carrier bags. My plea to Government is to reconsider its decision to stop the use of plastic bags and also come up with a policy for the collection of Plastic Levy. Such a decision will help retain jobs created in the plastic industry and also help grow the industry in return, helping the efforts by Government to create jobs.

Botswana is a developing country which needs to embrace all types of industries that can help the country create jobs. Even in the developed countries like United Kingdom, they continue to utilise plastic carrier bags which has created jobs to their own people. The standard of carrier bags and the flat bags should be maintained by businesses. Government should also continue to educate consumers on the danger of plastic carrier bags on the environment. Government should also encourage research and innovation on the adoption of environmental friendly carrier bags not made from plastics and be adopted over time without compromising the relevant industries.

Mr Speaker, I therefore plead with Honourable Members across the aisle and my colleagues this side to support this noble Motion that shall help the Government to increase its revenue base which shall help Government in its efforts to raise more capital for development.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF YOUTH EMPOWERMENT, SPORT AND CULTURE DEVELOPMENT (MR MAKGALEMELE):** On a point of clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Member. Before you sit down, you mentioned that failure to have a policy has resulted in situations where retailers continue to charge consumers a levy on plastic carrier bags with no benefit to the Government. I thought that you might have a rough estimate of what kind of figures we are looking at.

Still on your debate, you talked about the potential job creation of this industry. You stated that with proper management, this industry can create employment opportunities. Maybe you have forgotten about the figures at hand. What kind of numbers potentially are we looking at?

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Honourable Member. I will try to gather information with regard to the monies that have been collected by retailers, it was not easy Honourable Member. I want to believe that it is very

clear that indeed, retailers, if they have been charging 50 thebe per plastic and looking at the volume of their businesses, it is very clear that millions have been lost to the Plastic Levy which has not benefited us as a country; which has not benefited our people but we continue to be levied on plastics whilst it is not benefiting us as a country. That is why I believe that if indeed such a policy can be introduced and money collected, it will help this Government in its efforts to create jobs. It will help this Government in its efforts to increase its economic base because really you might think that 50 thebe is a small amount, but when you look at the value of plastics produced by even KPI as one of the players in the industry, they produce millions of plastics each and every year. On estimation, it is very clear that indeed over 100 million yearly, is produced out of the Plastic Levy looking at the volumes of plastics that KPI currently produces for the country.

I also want to believe that this will help the environmental industry which has not been given priority. What pains me a lot Honourable Makgalemele is that the Ministry of Environment, it seems like its priority is more into wildlife and tourism. They have not given priority to environmental issues because the environment on its own, when well-presented and adopted, it can actually create jobs that your Government is actually looking at because the environment itself can be a business for our own people. Waste can be tuned into energy.

Plastics; there is value out of plastics which we have not realised as a country. That is why I am saying to you as colleagues that let us agree that time has come for us now to come up with a policy for the collection of such levies. We cannot continue to lose money whilst the Minister of Finance and Economic Development comes here and says, Government does not have enough revenue whilst we know very well that the revenue from plastics could have been used to even give us a better budget which is not the current state as we speak.

Therefore, Mr Speaker...

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Further clarification Mr Speaker. I can only agree with you if the funds will go to the constituency community projects. Mr Speaker, if I was listening to him well, he mentioned boosting education. Since the use of plastic teachings have always been there, Mr Speaker I want to ask the Honourable Member to tell us where he feels we are not doing enough as well as the ideas he has which can enhance the teachings.



**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I think even you have to ask the Honourable Minister of Environment, Natural Resources Conservation and Tourism on his annual budget on public education in regard to waste in our country, it will be very, very minimal. I might even say there is no budget to that effect because I have never seen any public education being done by the Government of Botswana in regard to waste. What I have seen is that the private sector has played a pivotal role in terms of trying to empower and educate Batswana on the need for us not to litter. I do not know Honourable Makgalemele whether your Government has a budget for public education. I have never seen your Government doing that. I mean, it is very unfortunate that, like I said, environmental issues in this country are not given priority and not considered to be issues that can really have value in terms of creating jobs, creating value even for the economy of our country. I have always said, even in my days as the Mayor of Gaborone, that the environment in itself presents viable opportunities for job creation and for growing the economy of this country, but we are not doing that. Priority seems to be given to wildlife and tourism. That is why I am saying to the Honourable Minister, let us start with a policy on the collection of levy, and for sure, by the end of the year, the levy that we would have collected out of plastics would be of value to this country and the people of Botswana. Maybe my cry for Gaborone North farms that they should be given water and facilitated to have water, it would no longer be a cry because we would have enough money to facilitate even my people in Gaborone North to have potable water. Even young people that we have, to educate them and empower them on recycling, on environmental issues, it creates jobs. Growing industries in the environmental sector also creates jobs. That is my plea to you Honourable Members that, let us agree that indeed time has come for Botswana to have a policy on the collection of plastic levy. I do rest my case, Mr Speaker.

**MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, NATURAL RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND TOURISM**

**(MR MOKAILA):** I thank you Mr Speaker, and I thank the Honourable Member of Parliament of Gaborone North. I wish to say Mr Speaker, that Government has already reconsidered its position. The ban that was in place has been withdrawn, and we are being encouraged to go and engage with the private sector and Trade and Industry in terms of what can be done.

I will draw his attention to when I was the Minister then, the whole intention is as spelt out in terms of creating a National Environmental Fund for the plastic levy, for exactly the purposes that he spoke to and that is where we have gone back. The Government has taken a step back, and we are engaging with Trade and Industry, plastic manufacturers and other stakeholders basically to say, what can be done and how we can arrive at that. So, while the Motion is here, I can confirm that we have already reconsidered that position. I do not know how we proceed Mr Speaker because we have reconsidered, and we are doing exactly what he says he is asking for in this Motion.

Mr Speaker, I do not see the value of the Motion because as I say, there is actually even a Statutory Instrument somewhere, I can find it for you, that withdrew that ban. The things that we are speaking to Mr Speaker, are things that we are talking about; sorting from waste, from source, because in terms of generation of jobs, that is where you will create jobs by that separation and cleaning up, and the real things that will create jobs. That is exactly where we are Mr Speaker. You can imagine if you are sorting your waste, children will go and pick up bottles, plastics, they will carry them; that is what jobs are about. So Mr Speaker, as I said...

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Clarification. Two quick questions Honourable Minister. The first one is on not seeing the value of the Motion. Do you not think there is value in Honourable Members debating this Motion and putting ideas on the table, and you and your officials listening to Honourable Members' ideas? Do you not think there is value in that? Do you not think that there is also value in Parliament also pronouncing on an issue, notwithstanding that the Executive may have taken a decision on the matter? Do you not think that there is value that Parliament in exercising its functions should pronounce on matters?

The last question Honourable Minister is whether you have a taskforce or a team where representations can be directed?

**MR MOKAILA:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I am mindful of the fact that it is 2019 and therefore, sometimes things become clouded by politics. Not being a very good politician myself, I would want to give Parliament the benefit of doubt to debate and express their views. I think that is right and that should be allowed. There is value in that discussion, provided it takes a tone and character of wanting to improve what is there. I accept that.



Taskforce; we are in the process of the modalities. Just yesterday I was sitting with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) for them to assist us with how we can set up the very taskforces that we need to arrive at this very thing we are doing. So, that is very...

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Further clarification. I just wanted to understand if you are amenable to representations being made to a team that you will set up?

**MR MOKAILA:** The basis of consultation is that you should have that. You should want to have a wide representation as possible. So, I am amenable to it for sure. Mr Speaker, the Motion, for me it can be debated, just for a...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Mr Minister. I think you were aware that this Motion was going to be debated today, and you have been aware all this time that there is this Motion in the Order Paper. It would have been better or a little bit organised if you could have come with evidence to say, we are doing this as a ministry, we have started on this and this is how far we are, rather than just coming with a blunt statement to say no, we are doing something on that. You have been a Minister before in this particular ministry, and I remember you sitting somewhere here, there was a question which was brought, and then you said, "we are doing something on that." You left that ministry, you went to another ministry, but nothing has been done so far.

Honourable Khama was in that ministry, I asked a question myself because I was concerned about the environment in my area. He said, "we are doing something on that," and he did not consider the fact that plastics are not supposed to be allowed, and he will be issuing a statement very soon. Now he is somewhere at another ministry, nothing has happened. Can you just reassure this House, even the general public? So, I do not want to have this impression that most of the time when people come with Motions here, Government just simply wants to deceive them that no, "we are doing something with that," when in fact nothing is being done. Please, if you could have organised yourself, being the professional that you are, come here with evidence, to say no, we are doing this, where we can even have timelines. When you talk about yesterday that you met some World Bank officials somewhere else, and you are even talking of...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** No, I am not debating man. Boko is coming. So please Minister, can you just help us understand, we want to trust you indeed.

**MR MOKAILA:** Mr Speaker, he should trust me. This was subject for discussion in Cabinet, and the decision was taken by Cabinet to put a hold on the ban. His Excellency directed, "go and consult." This was when I was still in Transport, for that matter.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MR MOKAILA:** No, the current President, and I moved to this ministry on the 14<sup>th</sup> of December, and that is what I am beset with right now, to ensure that we do that. I am not curtailing the debate, I am saying, the debate would be useful because I want to listen to what others are thinking, but I was just giving you a feel of what I was doing then, with the intention of this plastic levy. It was to:

- (i) set a National Environmental Fund to deal with issues of environment;
- (ii) it was to make sure we create jobs through the separation of waste, and we actually did some pilots;
- (iii) we wanted to go to schools to ensure that every school started by making sure we culture our children the right way, so as they grow and go through the system, by the time they come out of the system, they know that there is value to waste, because that is what the whole objective is Mr Speaker. It is that waste has value and by recycling, you create more value and you look after the environment. So, I am not curtailing the debate, all I am saying is that, it is work in progress.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF YOUTH EMPOWERMENT, SPORT AND CULTURE DEVELOPMENT (MR MAKGALEMELE):**

Clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Mokaila. I just wanted to confirm this Honourable Minister. Part of the request from the Motion is that there be a policy for the collection of plastic levy. So, I just wanted to confirm whether what you are saying the ministry is doing now, is going towards development of a policy in line with what the Honourable Member is requesting?



**MR MOKAILA:** Mr Speaker, I will be putting the cart before the horse because I am yet to consult. I think it will be presumptuous of me to say we will come up with a levy if the consultations are just otherwise. If the consultation yields that yes, it is important to come up with the levy that would be what I will come back to Cabinet with. So, I am not presuming anything. As I was saying, the intention in the beginning was do exactly that but you must be mindful as well Mr Speaker that things are changing in the world. Currently, countries are burning plastics. I know right now that United Kingdom (UK) is thinking of burning completely plastic and others are thinking of burning plastics. I know that right now in this country, there are only 300 jobs that we are creating by the industry that is dealing with manufacturing of plastics. So, if we can come up with an argument and create more jobs than what we have right now, it may be an alternative. I think we should not be presumptuous and say this is what will come. Let us come up with something that will deal with issues of environment, job creation and a very good clean Botswana.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MR MOKAILA:** No! I said so. I said I support this; it is what we are doing. So, I have no stress. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR MAJAGA (NATA-GWETA):** Thank you Mr Speaker. I stand to support this Motion. This Motion is very good and it has come at the right time taking into consideration that we are currently doing our deliberations on the Budget Speech, where we seek more funds to develop our country.

If you take the issue of plastic bags, there is a serious outcry of plastics which are being used on a daily basis and Botswana tend to pay for those plastics. At the end of the day, there is no levy collected by the Government; which in turn could be helping us to pursue our development like the Alcohol Levy. We have seen it doing a lot of developments that the Government had planned to do.

Mr Speaker, the plastic bags... as a member of the committee which sometimes discusses issues regarding wildlife and nature, you find it difficult for us or for me not to support this Motion which the Honourable Member has put before us. Like the Minister is saying, clearly they are doing something. It is up to this House as well to debate and support this, even though the

Minister and his ministry are doing something. This must be done as soon as possible because in the past, I came up with a Human Wildlife Conflict Policy, I asked about it several times in this House but I was told, soon the policy will be before this House. So, we cannot be waiting to be told that these things will be coming soon. We want this thing to be done as soon as possible for the benefit of Botswana and for beneficitation of this country.

Mr Speaker, Honourable Nkaigwa, has researched and brought a good presentation. We found that there will be a lot of ... meaning to say that creation of employment will be associated with this Motion. Maybe even our country will be clean because even in rural areas or in farms, you find plastics almost everywhere; even on our roads. Mr Speaker, if this Motion is adopted or passed, we will make our Botswana clean like countries such as Namibia (Swakopmund). Paying levy; we have taken a long time; we should have done this before. A lot of these companies and shops which are associated with selling this plastic bags have accumulated a lot of money in turn, and now they are richer because they are using this selling of plastic bags for their profits and not to help people, their consumers or customers in turn.

Mr Speaker, I do wholly support this Motion and it is one of the Motions which we cannot waste time on as leaders or Members of this House. We just have to give it a blessing so that it can be passed for the good of Botswana, to make good for the country and for our people who are struggling to raise 50 thebe or 25 thebe because of lack of employment. Even in some outlets, they now charge 75 thebe to P1. 00, so you can see how much money which was supposed to be going in the so called Plastic Levy is being lost on a daily basis.

With those few remarks Mr Speaker, I tend to support this Motion. Thank you.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE (GABANE-MMANKGODI):** Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Let me thank Honourable Hankins Ngaigwa for coming up with this good Motion, because we all have been complaining about plastics. I also want to thank Minister Mokaila for acknowledging that it is the matter that they support and are still working on it...

**MINISTER OF TERTIARY EDUCATION, RESEARCH, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (MR OLOPENG):** Correction. No, I just wanted the Honourable Member to correct Honourable Nkaigwa's name because it might be captured as Nngai...



**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Nngaigwa.

**MR OLOPENG:** In future his grandchildren might mistake his motions for another's person's name thinking that it was not him.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Mokgware, but the name is written somewhere there.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** No, I pronounced it correctly.

**MR SPEAKER:** You were saying Nngaigwa.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Okay! My hundred apologies Mr Speaker. Thank you very much Minister.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** I am not going there Honourable Member. ... (Laughter!) ... No sir! No sir! The idea of plastics Honourable Members if you want to see the challenges brought about by plastics just go out of Gaborone or surrounding areas of Gaborone such as Gabane-Mmankgodi Constituency, you will see how the plastics pollute the environment. It seems like everybody who feels lazy to go and dump the waste at Gamodubu dumping site, dump the waste at the nearest space that they see when they reverse the truck. These plastics do not only pollute the environment; they also kill livestock. Cattle and goats eat these plastics and this is a disadvantage to the farmers because if a farmer is keeping a cow or a goat intending to use it at some point, they cannot be sure because their life may be cut short by plastic. The sad reality is that those who sell these plastics and are benefitting from them are not paying tax. We recently discussed here that one of the ways Government can use to increase the money which could go towards our Budget is through Plastic Levy. Are we being fair to Batswana to keep charging them plastic levy for the past ten years? It is true as Honourable Majaga alluded here, a plastic costs 50 thebe, imagine people who buy from Choppies supermarkets, each of them buy plastics and not one or two, at least a minimum of three plastic bags. It means they spend P1.50. Then you go on and look at some shops where people can buy a minimum of 10 plastic bags. This means it becomes 10 times 50.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** They buy food. What do you think they buy? This is a lost opportunity to us as Government because this is the money that could be getting into our coffers, and could be used to create employment. That is why I agree with Honourable Nkaigwa...

**MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, NATURAL RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND TOURISM (MR MOKAILA):** Point of clarification. Mr Speaker, I hear the Honourable Member putting and placing emphasis on raising money, rather than on creating more jobs and keeping our environment clean, the two which are the focus. I think we should not be preoccupied with the necessity of a levy, rather than the other alternatives that exist. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Thank you very much Minister. I am coming to that point. I just wanted to show one aspect of what we could do with plastic levy, of actually bringing revenue.

Secondly, it is what the Minister said, which I concur with Honourable Nkaigwa on that environment can generate a lot of employment. When you take other countries which use environment as the second income earner and employment creation sector, we can do the same. When you take Kweneng, they spend close to P500 000 a month, they say it is four hundred and something on the waste at Gamodubu. Managing this waste on its own is employment creation. If we could do something about it, we are going to benefit in terms of creating employment and health wise. Right now, there are a lot of talks regarding these things and if we could correct these things Minister and maybe call this levy an Environmental Policy Levy, we would know that we collect these funds. I agree with Honourable Makgalemele that these funds could even be allocated according to constituencies.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** No, environment levy, not only plastic. We could gain a lot. So I am humbly requesting Honourable Members that we concur here that this is a very good Motion which will actually enhance our thinking and the way we do things in terms of environment. Thank you.

**MR MOLEBATS (MOCHUDI EAST):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Nkaigwa. Thank you Disk Jockey (DJ)...



**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MR MOLEBATSI:** Sir. Okay. ...(Laughter!)... Mr Speaker, when I look at this Motion, it talks about plastics and it shows that we are not doing some things seriously. It has been a while since the establishment of this levy and those who were responsible for collecting it did their part but we failed to go and collect it until they believed that we have failed to collect this money and it became their money so they used it whereas Government could have hastened to collect this money and conduct some training on recycling. We do not have any firms in Botswana, instead we build malls which show that indeed we are consumers. All we see in Botswana is malls and we can build many of them in one place instead of building firms where we can recycle something items like plastics, at least to do a refuse bag. I heard the Minister saying that plastics could create employment for 300 people and I do not agree, they can hire more that. I have seen a few firms that make plastics including about two at Phakalane. Some make black plastics, I supply them with plastics.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MR MOLEBATSI:** In Kgatleng, we have made an arrangement of sorting waste. I am pioneering that through a company called Clean Conscious.

When we look at Plastic levy, it can help us correct the situation which is already bad on us which is environmental pollution. We may not have oceans around here, but this pollution starts here up to the oceans. Or rivers carry plastics which reach oceans...

**MR MOKAILA:** Elucidation. Just to enrich the debate Mr Speaker, I think we should include the cost of landfills. What people do not realise is that those things that do not decompose are taken to landfills, our landfills which should have 50-year life span, literally have a five-year lifespan, then they are full. This is why I was trying to steer the debate towards reuse/recycle, which is more sustainable than concentrating on the Plastic Levy. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR MOLEBATSI:** Thank you Minister. Minister, you are talking about an area which I understand whereby we have challenges with the landfill in Kgatleng that has been filled by Gaborone. It could take us somewhere...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Murmurs)....

**MR MOLEBATSI:** No Gaborone. We are in trouble because of a city which does not benefit us, instead it makes us suffer. If it was beneficial to us, there could be a landfill in Dikwididi-Modipane, but Government states that there are no funds. You will realise like the Minister said that when a plastic reaches the landfill like Minister said, it does not benefit us, unless if it can decompose and used to harness electricity. We would be very happy if we all agree to this Motion and if the Minister could also bring some proposals so that we can add to it. Honourable Members we are all aware that God gave us the environment unpolluted but we have polluted it such that our oceans are so full of plastics as if we dumped them using trucks whereas there were carried there through our rivers. The ocean house many organisms which makes rain and contributes to our good health but the marine at the ocean is in danger due to plastics which comes from Botswana.

I also plead the Minister to seriously address environmental issue; we should have a department assigned to monitor environmental pollution. We once had some called Green Scorpions. That was a good step which requires specialists who can advise accordingly on issues pertaining to environmental pollution. We will never have another ozone layer, the first one has already been polluted and it cause unreliable rainfalls and current natural disasters. When we talk about environment it is like we are talking about a far-fetched issue. If we could stand and pass Honourable Nkaigwa's Motion we would have done ourselves justice. One thing which concerns me is that Motions are tabled in Parliament but there are approached in a political manner even the Minister was saying, "it is now 2019". So he also claims that he is working on it but does not bring tangible proof. He expect us to take his word for it and not proceed.

I plead with Honourable Ministers to take all the Motions that are tabled here seriously and appreciate their significance as they can assist the Government which some think belong only to them. It belongs to all of us in this House. When we talk about it, we have a right to be heard. Moreover, we are sent by people who need us to nurture them so that they know that they must take care of the environment. They should also know that when we take care of the environment countries affected by environmental pollution will notice us.

I was happy when Minister talked about United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). These are the people who can assist us if we preserve and conserve the environment. If they assist us we will not be like



an ignorant nation regarding tax issues and after this realisation they run around grasping at straws, suspecting people of owing tax. Thank you, I wish that this Motion can be successful.

**MR SPEAKER:** Thank you Honourable Molebatsi. Since you all support this Motion, why not finish up so that we proceed to the next one.

**MR MANGOLE (MOCHUDI WEST):** Thank you Mr Speaker. We agree with you that indeed it appears like we all support the good Motion tabled by Honourable Nkaigwa. The Minister stood and explained that, this Motion is redundant because what is being sought is in the pipeline. You see, the fact that Honourable Member tabled this Motion and it took a long time in the Notice Paper and Order Paper is an indication that this transparency which we talk about every day and preach, is not there. If Minister for the sake of transparency, Batswana and this House were updated every time regarding this issue since the decision to ban plastics, I believe then that Honourable Nkaigwa would not have tabled this Motion because we could all be on the same wavelength. Having clear information of what is on the ground. Our concern is that due to lack of transparency, many years pass by whereas there are claims that something is in the pipeline, at the end of the day, nothing is implemented.

I think Honourable Nkaigwa's Motion came at the opportune time because we are concerned. We are concerned because when the ban on the Plastic Levy was introduced we were told that the principal objectives is to reduce pollution and generate income for the Government. Ever since the implementation of the Plastic Levy these two principal objectives and others were never realised. Plastics are everywhere yet Batswana are paying tax. There is no money and has never been collected yet Batswana are paying tax. This alone shows that the Government is very slow to act and this ends up causing Batswana to work in a bottomless pit which will never be full. A lot of money that should have been collected though Plastic Levy Honourable Members was not successful. Therefore you owe Batswana a huge apology for such a huge mistake.

Minister, I agree with the proposal to lift the ban of plastic. Even though I supported very much at the beginning, you mentioned that the intention is to go and assess it, to assess how the environment can be conserved as well as how Batswana can get jobs through using plastics. This is very important and that is what the Motion seeks.

We believe that you must hurry up, bring a policy which will ensure that the Plastic Levy continues to be collected. Its main objective is that after being collected, it is going to drive job creation, assist Batswana to open industries which can recycle plastics. It should not be similar to Alcohol Levy, which intended to assist Batswana to reduce alcohol consumption and build rehabilitation centres. Now when the money collected is channelled to other projects, it failed to achieve what it intended at the beginning. Minister, if there is a law and a transparent policy we will have Plastic Levy in place to ensure that through it, the environment is clean and the money that is raised helps to recycle or put that plastic waste to better use.

The other challenge is this endless consultation. Perhaps Minister could stand and tell us... and this is I believe what the Motion seeks to achieve. Honourable Minister you should give us timelines as to how long our consultation process will take, that we should expect that within a certain period of time, things would be in order and see action. For you to keep saying "we are consulting, we are consulting," is what led to having ten or more years of collecting funds from Batswana, but the consultation regarding how those funds are collected is still on, we are failing to do regulations of how to collect the levy, and credit the funds into the Government's coffers, and allow Batswana to benefit from their hard earnings, because they literally work hard for those.

Honourable Minister we believe that, as we review an environmentally friendly use of plastic, as you were saying, we should have a clear policy that everything that will be used to make plastic, at the end of the day should be biodegradable; so that wherever we throw it, as you alluded, it should be able to break down and go back to its natural state, such that if it happens that cattle eat it; we would know that the digestive system of a cow would be able to digest it and just be in a normal state. We must be very careful about these things, because as the Honourable Members were saying, the misuse of plastic, since there are regulations as to how it should be used, it has affected our livestock sector. Cattle eat plastic in a shocking way and at the end of the day it affects our economy, Honourable Minister. I am standing here to request this House to accept this Motion, and this will somewhat encourage the Minister to say Parliament has passed this Motion in the public; it is in the public domain. Let us accept it, and see to it that the intentions it has are going to be implemented as soon as possible. We need a clean environment and



we need to use these plastics Honourable Minister so that Batswana can get jobs, and that our children would not suffer, so that they can come out of their poverty. I believe at the end of the day, it should not be... I do not want to use the word that was used by my brother in law which means the affluent (*Makgorwane*); they should not be the only ones benefiting from your hard efforts of cleaning up the environment. It should be in such a way that ordinary people, poor Batswana, would see the vitality of venturing into the business of ensuring that the environment is free from plastics. My request is that when you come up with a policy or whatever that you are going to bring, those things should be taken into account; to let it go down to the ordinary people so that they could receive profit. With those remarks, I support the Honourable Member's Motion. I thank you.

**MR NTLHAILE (JWANENG-MABUTSANE):** Thank you Mr Speaker. I rise to support the Honourable Nkaigwa's Motion. Let me point out that something that our country or our Government could do Honourable Molale is to coerce the industries to start making recycling industries everywhere they are working from. It should be one of the regulations that should be enforced so that we would combat the issue of plastics, because it is not something that we can stop with immediate effect. There are some industries like the meat industry where plastics are used, and there is no other way meat can be sold without wrapping it. So part of the solution is that industries should be established with a clear objective that the retail industry should be expected to contribute directly, there should be young entrepreneurs' factories that are focused on recycling in various districts, in every place where there are inventories for...

**MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, NATURAL RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND TOURISM (MR MOKAILA):** Point of elucidation. Just to thank the Honourable Member that five or six years ago when we did a study about the volume of plastics available to set up the industry, it was discovered that it was on the low side and purely because of the distribution of our communities. So, if you look at Gaborone and Lobatse, the volume that comes out was not sufficient enough to create a viable business. I am hoping by now things have grown and that is why the sorting from the source was a better option, but just as part of the elucidation to assist you.

**MR NTLHAILE:** Thank you Honourable Minister. As you are saying, I believe that is the approach; every year there is a difference, where the economy is growing, it could make the generation of plastic to go high as well. So...

**MR MOLEBATSI:** Point of clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. You are debating very well Honourable Member. The recycling that you are talking about, it could help Honourable Molale. We could take all the metals to the smelter in Selebi Phikwe, unfortunately he is watching a video right now; I doubt if he is aware that you could be helping him right now. They are busy watching a video.

**MR NTLHAILE:** Honourable Minister, the approach by Government should not be about recycling of plastics only. We could consider things like tyres as well; anything related to plastic and tyres, and see how we could establish factories that would be profitable, that would be able to create jobs that are so needed in our country; and reduce unemployment. So, Mr Speaker, I believe this was a very important exercise of establishing industries.

Secondly, we believe this waste sector, is one of the sectors that we could consider as a country to create employment through it, as we are currently considering tourism and mining as the leading sectors when it comes to job creation. I believe this environmental sector, of cleaning up the environment, needs special funding. It is a shame that when you consider the budget, since we are still debating it; when you look at the budget for the Ministry of Environment, the funds thereof do not show that we intend to use this opportunity of having a potential to create more jobs at Environment through plastics; waste in general in our country. This means the research and development budget, should be increased even more to allow us to come up with ideas, and give our graduates jobs to research further which other jobs we could do in terms of reducing the usage of plastics. I believe research and development need to be utilised more; the one that would be focusing on the environment, the waste sector to find out which jobs could be created, starting with research.

Mr Speaker, what bothers me is that currently, the Government has to take responsibility that she has failed, she has failed Batswana by allowing business entities that are in Botswana which sell plastic carry bags to take all the returns which are supposed to go to the Government coffer to be used at research and development in order to establish plastic industries. Minister Matambo is here complaining that we should come up with ideas on how levies can be collected while the Minister has failed to collect plastic levies. Mr Speaker, this issue has helped to maximise the profits



for business owners. Batswana were cheated through a policy which was made by the Botswana Democratic Party. Right now Botswana Unified Revenue Services (BURS) is fabricating charges against certain opposition politicians, they follow them around even those who the State does not want are being harassed. They are the ones who are being followed while the same ministry is failing to collect to plastic levies. Mr Speaker, this shows...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of Clarification!

**MR NTLHAILE:** Honourable Molale, failures of the ruling Botswana Democratic Party. Mr Speaker, I want to point out that I support this Motion and I also move that this Motion be agreed to. We should stop here because we have discussed it and agreed to it. Let us start voting. I move Mr Speaker with the relevant Standing Order.

**MR SPEAKER:** What do you mean by relevant Standing Order? Which Standing Order do you want?

**MR NTLHAILE:** If you can assist me, with due respect Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Members, the Honourable Ntlhaile has moved, and that will be in accordance Standing Order 55.1 'that the mover be now called upon to respond'.

Question put and **agreed to.**

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** On a point of procedure, Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes, what is your procedure Honourable Makgalemele?

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Mr Speaker, although many people stand in support of this Motion, do you not see it relevant to ask if there are those who do not agree with it so that we can have a chance to say something?

**MR SPEAKER:** I asked that question and many of you said yes while a few people said no.

**MR NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Let me take this opportunity to thank my colleagues and thank the Honourable Minister, for the progress that he has made so far with regards to issues pertaining to the environment, and in relation to the plastic levy. I can see the passion that you have Honourable Minister on this issue. It is unfortunate that

in 2014 when I came to this Parliament, I also thought I would be made to be a member of the committee on environment, because the environment has always been my passion. I know that there is a lot that we can derive out of the environment.

Without wasting time Mr Speaker, let me just move that this Honourable House agree with me that we request Government to reconsider its decision to stop the use of plastic bags, and also come up with a policy for the collection of the plastic levy. I do move that we adopt and pass this Motion. I thank you.

Question put and **agreed to.**

## REFERENDUM ON PRESIDENTIAL ELECTIONS AND APPOINTMENT OF MINISTERS

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order! This Motion is by the Honourable Paulson Majaga. He has 30 minutes to present his Motion.

**MR MAJAGA (NATA-GWETA):** Thank you Mr Speaker. I want to correct this Motion, if you allow me Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes, you are allowed to amend Honourable Member.

**MR MAJAGA:** To read "That this Honourable House requests Government to call for a referendum on direct Presidential elections and appointment of Ministers outside Parliament", because in the past I have said that it should be like that. I do not know how they wrote it like this again.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Majaga, I do not know who you are referring to because you did not say anything to me. Order! Honourable Members, there is an amendment proposed by Honourable Majaga. Honourable Majaga, did you write down your amendment? Bring it here.

...Silence...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Members, the amendment proposed by Honourable Majaga reads "That this Honourable House requests Government to call for a referendum on direct Presidential elections and appointment of Ministers from outside Parliament." It is now changing the meaning of the first Motion. I believe that if I could have met up with the Honourable Member before, I could have helped him on how to



construct his Motion so that it does not deviate too much from what he seeks. I do not know if the Honourable Member will agree to defer his debate in order for us to help him amend his Motion so that it can come back to the House clear ... I understand what he is saying in Setswana but it is not what is written.

**MR MAJAGA:** Mr Speaker, I am now in a dilemma because this Motion has been here since 2014, and I have tried to write it so that it comes nicely, that is why I have been today rectifying this, so maybe we will correct it on the floor.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of procedure.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Majaga, please do not be confused, I am trying to help you with your Motion. Agree with me that you will later date this Motion because at this point I cannot manage to advise you. Later date your Motion, let us meet and I will help you with your amendment ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR SPEAKER:** No, you are not going ... if you want to debate, you can go ahead but if you want me to assist you to ... I understand what you want to say but the way it has been written here is a challenge. You can go ahead and debate if you want to, say your piece they will hear you.

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MS MAKGATO):** On a point of procedure. Mr Speaker, but ... If Honourable Keorapetse can keep quiet. He was attempting to amend his Motion, unfortunately it changes the Motion itself. He can say ... Aah! Keep quiet please and listen. What is wrong with Parliament lawyers? You will get a chance to speak, allow me to speak. Mr Speaker, can you please reprimand this mischievous person I want to debate.

Mr Speaker, I was saying, he can debate this Motion as it is and it gets amended on the floor and we agree. Is that not the procedure Mr Speaker? We will be advising in this House not deviating totally from the gist of the Motion.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Procedure.

**MS MAKGATO:** What is wrong with you? I will soon attack you.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** I am helping you in terms of Standing Order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Makgato, I hear you. It is true that it is possible to debate this Motion. Honourable Member, you spoke and now I am responding to you but you are busy chatting, listen to me. It is true that the Motion can be debated as it is on the Order Paper and be amended during the process of the debate. It is allowed. The problem now is that the amendment which he is proposing does not agree with Standing Order 47.2.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** What does it say?

**MR SPEAKER:** Read your Standing Orders, I gave them to you, why are you asking me? Aah!

That is where the problem is ... He can debate the Motion as it is, if you do not finish, you will amend it next week Friday because it will be in progress, after assisting you with the proper amendment, now the ball is in your court.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Procedure Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Speaker. I want to plead with Honourable Majaga that what he seeks with this amendment, you can say it under this Motion because when you talk of appointment of Ministers, you will add that part in terms of what you mean. When you talk of Presidential elections, you will also qualify it that you are talking about direct election of the President. I think the debate can go on because if you later date this Motion it will go back in line, I mean terms of the rules of order and procedure.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, point of order.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** No, it does.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Well, I am on a point of procedure. Honourable Majaga, if the Minister is not available, then the Motion will not lose its slot but you as the mover of the Motion stands up and says, "later date" you cannot maintain its slot, it will go back in line. That is what has been happening, so please Honourable Majaga, I believe you can go ahead with it as it is.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Procedure.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Wait! Honourable Majaga, we are left with three minutes before Parliament adjourns. You can go ahead with the Motion as it is on the Order Paper, I will come and advise you on its amendment during the course of the debate. Standing Order allows you to amend.



**MR MAELE:** On a point of procedure. Mr Speaker, I think we will be messing up Honourable Majaga's Motion. If we start debating this Motion as it is, obviously we are going to say some of these things are in the Constitution as we speak. Honourable Majaga wants things which are not in the Constitution as we speak, which is direct election of the President and to appoint Ministers outside Parliament, that is what he wants. Now once we debate it like this, I am going to stand up and say, oh! It is in the Constitution what more do you want, so it does not make sense to debate the Motion as it is because it will be redundant. The best thing like you said Honourable Speaker is to have this Motion amended so that he can present it well because as it is, he is going to fail to present it because the first speaker is going to say, you are saying exactly what is in the Constitution, and then it will not make sense to debate the Motion as it is sir.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Order. Point of order Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Further procedure.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Makgalemele raised point of procedure first.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs) ...

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF YOUTH EMPOWERMENT, SPORT AND CULTURE DEVELOPMENT (MR MAKGALEMELE):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, they are making noise, I cannot even hear myself speak.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Makgalemele, be time conscious, proceed.

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Now it is better. Mr Speaker, I was saying, the advice you are offering Honourable Majaga needs assurance from your side because you are not assuring him that next week his Motion will be scheduled to come in first. What Honourable Maele said that these issues of Honourable Majaga need ...

**MR SPEAKER:** Wait Honourable, order! Order Honourable Members! I trust that Honourable Majaga has heard me. I only wanted to assist him so that I may not reject his amendment based on Standing Order 47.2 as it does not allow what he is proposing. Honourable Members, time to continue with debates is up. At this moment I will request the Leader of the House, but before I call on the Leader of the House to move, I want

to thank you Honourable Members. Since last Friday, we have been adjourning at 12:30 with the work done. I am very happy that you take Private Members Bill day very seriously to a point that we manage to adjourn at this time. Keep that up so that we may continue with Motions and finish.

## MOTION

### ADJOURNMENT

**LEADER OF THE HOUSE (MR TSOGWANE):** Mr Speaker, with those words, I move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and **agreed to.**

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 12:30 p.m. until Monday 18<sup>th</sup> February, 2019 at 2:00 p.m.



### **HANSARD RECORDERS**

Mr. T. Gaodumelwe, Mr T. Monakwe, Ms T. Kebonang

### **HANSARD REPORTERS**

Ms T. Rantsebele, Mr M. Buti, Ms N. Selebogo, Ms A. Ramadi,  
Ms D. Thibedi, Ms G. Baotsi, Ms N. Mokoka, Mr J. Samunzala, Ms Z. Molemi

### **HANSARD EDITORS**

Ms K. Nyanga, Ms C. Chonga, Mr K. Goeme, Ms G. Phatedi,  
Ms B. Malokwane, Mr A. Mokopakgosi, Ms O. Nkatswe, Ms G. Lekopanye  
Ms T. Mokhure, Ms B. Ratshipa

### **HANSARD TRANSLATORS**

Ms B. Ntisetsang, Ms. M. Sekao, Ms. M. Rabotsima, Ms. B. Mosinyi, Ms. V.  
Nkwane, Ms. N. Kerobale, Ms K. Alepeng, Ms T. Motsau, Ms O. Phesodi

### **HANSARD LAYOUT DESIGNERS**

Mr B. B. Khumanego, Mr D. T. Batshegi, Mr K. Rebaisakae

