



# HANSARD

YOUR VOICE IN PARLIAMENT

## DAILY HANSARD (PARLIAMENTARY DEBATES)

THE SECOND MEETING OF THE SECOND SESSION OF  
THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT

HANSARD NO. 182  
FRIDAY 26 FEBRUARY 2016

### DISCLAIMER

Unofficial Hansard

This transcript of Parliamentary proceedings is an unofficial version of the Hansard and may contain inaccuracies. It is hereby published for general purposes only. The final edited version of the Hansard will be published when available and can be obtained from the Assistant Clerk (Editorial).

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY



ENGLISH VERSION

**THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY SPEAKER**  
**The Hon. Gladys K. T. Kokorwe MP.**  
**DEPUTY SPEAKER**  
**The Hon. Kagiso P. Molatlhegi, MP Gaborone South**

Clerk of the National Assembly	
Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly	- Ms B. N. Dithapo
Ag. Learned Parliamentary Counsel	- Dr R.D. Dingalo
Assistant Clerk (E)	- Mr S. Chikanda
	- Mr R. Josiah

**CABINET**

His Excellency Lt. Gen. Dr. S. K. I. Khama PH, FOM, DCO, DSM, MP.	- President
His Honour M. E. K. Masisi, MP. (Moshupa-Manyana)	- Vice President
Hon. P. Venson-Moitoi, MP. (Serowe South)	- Minister of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation
Hon. S. Tsogwane, MP. (Boteti North)	- Minister of Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. N. E. Molefhi, MP. (Selebi Phikwe East)	- Minister of Infrastructure, Science and Technology
Hon. S. Kgathi, MP. (Bobirwa)	- Minister of Defence, Justice and Security
Hon. O. K. Mokaila, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Minerals, Energy and Water Resources
Hon. P. M. Maele, MP. (Lerala - Maunatlala)	- Minister of Lands and Housing
Hon. E. J. Batshu, MP. (Nkange)	- Minister of Labour and Home Affairs
Hon. D. K. Makgato, MP. (Sefhare - Ramokgonami)	- Minister of Health
Hon. T. S. Khama, MP. (Serowe West)	- Minister of Environment, Wildlife and Tourism
Hon. V. T. Seretse, MP. (Mmopane - Lentsweletau)	- Minister of Trade and Industry
Hon. O. K. Matambo, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Finance and Development Planning
Hon. T. Mabeo, MP. (Thamaga - Kumakwane)	- Minister of Transport and Communications
Hon. T. Olopeng, MP. (Tonota)	- Minister of Youth, Sport and Culture
Hon. E. M. Molale (Specially Elected)	- Minister for Presidential Affairs and Public Administration
Hon. Dr. U. Dow, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Education and Skills Development
Hon. P. P. Ralotsia, MP. (Kanye North)	- Minister of Agriculture
Hon. D. P. Makgalemele, MP (Shoshong)	- Assistant Minister, Presidential Affairs and Public Administration
Hon. K. K. Autlwetse, MP (Serowe North)	- Assistant Minister, Agriculture
Hon. B. M. Tshireletso, MP. (Mahalapye East)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. F. S. Van Der Westerhuizen, MP. (Kgalagadi South)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. M. M. Goya, MP. (Palapye)	- Assistant Minister, Education and Skills Development
Hon. F. M. M. Molao, MP (Shashe West)	- Assistant Minister, Education and Skills Development
Hon. Dr. A. Madigele, MP. (Mmathethe - Molapowabojang)	- Assistant Minister, Health
Hon. Sadique Kebonang, MP. (Lobatse)	- Assistant Minister of Trade and Industry

## MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT AND THEIR CONSTITUENCIES

<b>Names</b>	<b>Constituency</b>
<b>RULING PARTY (Botswana Democratic Party)</b>	
Hon. S. M. Guma, MP	Tati East
Hon. C. De Graaff, MP	Ghanzi South
Hon. L. Kablay, MP	Letlhakeng - Lephephe
Hon. M. N. Ngaka, MP	Takatokwane
Hon. T. Kwerepe, MP	Ngami
Hon. S. Lelatisitswe, MP	Boteti East
Hon. J. Molefe, MP	Mahalapye West
Hon. K. Markus, MP	Maun East
Hon. K. Mzwini, MP	Mmadinare
Hon. P. Majaga, MP	Nata-Gweta
Hon. M. I. Moswaane, MP	Francistown West
Hon. B. H. Billy, MP	Francistown East
Hon. M. R. Shamukuni, MP	Chobe
Hon. B. G. Butale, MP	Tati West
Hon. I. E. Moipisi, MP	Kgalagadi North

### OPPOSITION

#### (Umbrella for Democratic Change)

Hon. D. G. Boko, MP (Leader of Opposition)	Gaborone Bonnington North
Hon. G. S. M. Mangole, MP	Mochudi West
Hon. W. B. Mmolotsi, MP	Francistown South
Hon. T. Moremi, MP	Maun West
Hon. A. S. Kesupile, MP	Kanye South
Hon. N. Salakae, MP	Ghanzi North
Hon. Maj. Gen. P. Mokgware, MP	Gabane-Mmankodi
Hon. Dr. T. O. M. Mmatli, MP	Molepolole South
Hon. S. Ntlhaile, MP	Jwaneng -Mabutsane
Hon. M. I. Khan, MP	Molepolole North
Hon. H. G. Nkaigwa, MP	Gaborone North
Hon. I. J. Davids, MP	Mochudi East
Hon. S. M. Bathobakae, MP	Tlokweng
Hon. N. N. Gaolathe, MP	Gaborone Bonnington South
Hon. S. Kgoroba, MP	Mogoditshane
Hon. Dr P. Butale, MP	Gaborone Central
Hon Kgosi Lotlamoreng II	Goodhope - Mabule

#### (Botswana Congress Party)

Hon. B. Arone, MP	Okavango
Hon. D. L. Keorapetse, MP	Selebi Phikwe West
Hon. S. O. Rantuana, MP	Ramotswa

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**  
**THE SECOND MEETING OF THE SECOND**  
**SESSION OF ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT**  
**26 FEBRUARY 2016**

<i>CONTENTS</i>	<i>PAGE (S)</i>
Introduction of Tachograph Speedometers in all Public Transport Vehicles <i>Motion (Resumed Debate)</i> .....	21
<b>QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER</b> .....	5 - 12
<b>QUESTION WITHOUT NOTICE</b> .....	13 - 15
<b>SPEAKER'S ANNOUNCEMENT</b> .....	5
<b>STATEMENT ON DIPLOMATIC IMPASSE BETWEEN THE CHINESE GOVERNMENT AND THE GOVERNMENT OF BOTSWANA</b> .....	16 - 20

Friday 26<sup>th</sup> February, 2016

THE ASSEMBLY met at 09:00 p.m.

(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)

PRAYERS

\* \* \* \*

SPEAKER'S ANNOUNCEMENT

**MR SPEAKER (MR MOLATLHEGI):** Order! Order! Good morning Honourable Members of Parliament. We may now commence; we have two questions for Honourable Ministers. They will both take 45 minutes; 22 and a half minutes each.

MINISTERS' QUESTION TIME

MINISTER OF YOUTH, SPORT AND CULTURE

THEME: YOUTH DEVELOPMENT FUND (YDF)

**MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** Thank you Mr Speaker for giving me this opportunity this morning. Thank you for availing yourself today Honourable Minister. I just want to appreciate Honourable Minister for the progress that has been made by the fund from inception to date and also to appreciate how many young people have benefited out of this fund. What are the success stories of the fund? I also want to appreciate Honourable Minister, on how sustainable the fund is and also whether there are any plans to ...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Nkaigwa, explain which fund you are talking about for recording purposes.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Mr Speaker it is clear on the Order Paper...

**MR SPEAKER:** Stop arguing with me and do as you are told. Explain which fund you are talking about.

**MR NKAIGWA:** I am referring to the Youth Development Fund which the Honourable Minister is ready to answer. I also want to appreciate Honourable Minister the performance of the fund in terms of the return on equity and also the return on investment and the repayments. And also how much has been invested by Government in this fund and the success stories of this fund. Thank you Honourable Minister.

MINISTER OF YOUTH, SPORT AND CULTURE

**(MR OLOPENG):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member for your patience. I have to apologise for having taken so long to respond to your question. Mr Speaker, the Youth Development Fund (YDF) was introduced in the financial year 2009/10.

The fund follows the Out of School Youth Programme (OSYP), which started in the financial year 2000/01. The ceiling is P100, 000.00 and is in the form of a 50 per cent grant and a 50 per cent interest free loan. A penalty of 5 per cent interest per month is charged to defaulters on loan repayments. Still under the Youth Development Fund, my Ministry offers BWP 450 000.00 for establishment of Youth Industries (cooperatives).

As with all programmes the fund has evolved to put more emphasis on job creation and to contribute to the diversification of the economy and empowerment of the youth.

THE OBJECTIVES OF THE YOUTH DEVELOPMENT FUND ARE TO:

- (i) Promote active participation of youth in the socio-economic development of the country;
- (ii) Encourage the out-of-school, marginalized and unemployed youth to venture into sustainable and viable income generating projects;
- (iii) Promote the development of competitive, sustainable and growth oriented citizen-owned youth enterprises;
- (iv) Reduce rural-urban migration by making it attractive to start growth oriented enterprises in rural areas;
- (v) Create sustainable employment opportunities for young people through the development of sustainable projects.

OUR ACHIEVEMENTS AND COMMITMENT TO YOUTH DEVELOPMENT

During this year 2015/2016 my Ministry was allocated P120 000 000.00 and to date 1 061 youth enterprises were approved to a cost of P102 891 000.00. Of this amount a total of

P59 252 000.00 was disbursed to 566 youth projects, creating 1 002 employment opportunities.

Mr Speaker, we have experienced delays in processing of YDF applications attributed to our reliance on external stakeholders for appraisals and adjudication of youth projects. In light of this, the Ministry has resolved to undertake internal appraisals of youth proposals and continue to use the District Economic Development Committee (DEDC) to focus on adjudication of YDF projects. Further developments geared towards enhancing the programme include:

- Re-introduction of orientations as well as pre and post entrepreneurship training

- Opening and closing of applications (twice a year)
- Introduction of the screening tool and
- Registration of a business name/company as a requirement
- Improving turnaround time for processing of applications from receipt to providing feedback to applicants on progress or decisions to four (4) weeks.

We will also continue to capacitate our field staff on Project Management to enhance their competencies to better assist young people accordingly.

My Ministry is also experiencing high failure rate of funded youth projects due to various reasons including:

- Lack of commitment by project owners
- Conflicting interests of the beneficiaries
- Market penetration challenges
- Limited business management and technical skills
- High space rentals, which are not sustainable to new businesses

As a result my Ministry embarked on a Tracer Study of all YDF funded projects to determine the baseline, physical location, number and status of all YDF projects. This was undertaken from August 2015 to December 2015. Our Monitoring and Evaluation office is currently working on data analysis. This will guide in the development of remedial strategies aimed at ensuring sustainability of the youth projects. We have also started an internal process of mentoring and monitoring of these projects and also looking into outsourcing this part because we do not have capacity in the Ministry to be monitoring and mentoring these projects at full capacity or else we could have required to.

As we are all aware, that we are a small population, coming up with a thousand projects on annual basis. Since inception we are looking at around 5 000 projects and we have challenges or young people have challenges with access to the markets. This is why we have currently encouraged the local institution at every place like for instance in villages and constituencies to make sure that they actually source from these youth projects. If I can give an example, we have an instance where you will find that a school has to go and buy bread far places instead of supporting the local bakeries in the city.

My Ministry has embarked on various initiatives to support our young people and address these challenges, and these include the following;

- Reservations in procurement through the Local Procurement Scheme have been adopted as a means to support youth businesses and ensure employment creation. All Ministries are expected to implement and report on the 20 per cent quota reservation for youth businesses.
- My Ministry has come up with an initiative to re-finance successful youth businesses with the potential to create significant employment opportunities.
- In addressing the land issue, there is the Presidential Directive CAB 14 (B)/2015, which advocates for the youth to be given preferential treatment in land allocation and temporary use of vacant open spaces. Furthermore, my Ministry has profiled unutilised structures and land for development and lease out to youth enterprises. To mention but a few there is old Western Primary School in Serowe, old Magistrate Court building in Francistown, Gaborone Multipurpose Youth Centre and Sechaba Youth Enterprises Farm in Mmankodi. The Ministry is continuing to identify more of such areas throughout the country and at the same time developing an access model for occupation by the youth.
- In an effort to create an even more conducive working environment that supports youth enterprises, the Ministry has partnered with a number of institutions to come up with some quick wins. Such quick wins include the introduction of purchasing of Government tender documents at half price and reduction of the turnaround time for Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Board (PPADB) application to just a week.

In conclusion, I wish to reiterate that we are open to feedback to improve on the implementation of this programme. We also appeal to all community leaders to support the Ministry efforts in monitoring of these youth businesses. It is through such support that commitment on the part of beneficiaries will result in compliance to the repayment of the loans, which is currently a huge challenge. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Minister, I do not think you have answered me. I wanted to appreciate the performance of the fund in terms of the fund being a revolving fund, being a fund that I believe that Government, when you established it, you established it in terms that indeed young people would do business and would be able to repay back to Government whatever loans that have been given to them. So I wanted to know the success story behind this fund and how sustainable it is or we are just piling money in to the fund whilst there is no return on investment?

**MINISTER OF YOUTH, SPORT AND CULTURE (MR OLOPENG):** Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Member. The fund is performing though we have challenges. The last evaluation that we did last year August, has actually indicated that we have about 80 per cent of projects which are ongoing and about 20 per cent that have collapsed. For me that kind of information is an indication that the fund is doing well. This is why we will keep on monitoring this fund and monitoring the fund and the projects of young people and coming up with ideas of even introducing mentoring and monitoring process in to that to make sure that we have sustainability of these projects.

When we come to repayment, yes we are not getting much response as we had expected and we do not want to be too stringent because we realise how difficult conditions are out there in the markets and our objective is not necessarily to focus more on repayments of loans but instead on sustainability of projects so that young people could create employment for others in the economy.

**MR MAJAGA:** Thank you Mr Speaker, I want to ask the Minister what they are doing to improve the conditions of service for employees in various Ministries?

Secondly, how far are you with this programme to try and merge the youth in groups instead of being given projects individually because this does not seem to benefit them in the long run?

**MR OLOPENG:** Thank you my colleague, thank you Mr Speaker. In terms of the employees, we have an ongoing training, we have what we call business management workshops, where they are trained in the monitoring of youth projects so that they know what to look out for and so on. In terms of groups I have already explained, in this amount Honourable, up to P450 000.00 can be given the youth who have formed groups we are not giving them P100 000.000 as we give individuals. This is what we call the corporatives and we are also encouraging them to form groups. Some of the initiatives we will be submitting soon to request for them to be approved is to increase the amount in that if the group is made up of five members we can give them half a million because basically everyone qualifies for P100 000.00 so that it is not just one figure which is P450 000.00 if they are seven youths in a group we give them P700 000.000 if they are ten then we give them P1 million. Thank you very much.

**MR SALAKAE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank your Honourable Minister. You talked about a tracer study. I wanted to appreciate whether you covered the whole country or you covered a small sample? And if Ghanzi was included, can you share the kind of challenges that you unearthed or that you found with respect to Youth Development Fund (YDF) in Ghanzi? Honourable

Minister, can you try to reconcile the statement that you made that there are challenges with regard to appraisals, challenges with regard to market and the statement that you just made when you responded to the Honourable Member that the YDF is doing well? On the other side you are talking about the challenges that I found very encompassing and when you responded you are saying that the YDF is doing well. Thank you very much.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Guma, return to your seat.

**MR OLOPENG:** Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. The tracer study was conducted throughout the country because we have offices ...

**MR KESUPILE:** Point of order. Thank you Mr Speaker. The Honourable Member who switched on the microphone and was refusing to turn it off has now acted accordingly

**MR OLOPENG:** Thank you Mr Speaker. The tracer study was conducted throughout the country because we have offices in all the districts. What we did was that we did is that we sent forms to all our offices in the all the districts and encouraged them to call upon young people to come and register at our offices because one of the things that we want to achieve through the tracer study is actually to try and clean up our data base because at the moment our data base is not that clean. We want to really raise the integrity of our data base so that we could now look in to outsourcing the mentoring and monitoring of these businesses.

### Challenges

What I said is that yes, the fund is doing well because we are looking at the success rate. As I have already mentioned, when we looked in to the data August last year, we realised that about 20 per cent of projects had collapsed but the rest were still going on and that is what actually encourages us to look in to introducing mentoring and monitoring of these projects.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Thank you very much. Honourable Minister, your response is lukewarm. This is a very good project. I have been listening about the objectives of the project of this particular program but can you just share with us what you are looking at for you to say that the project is actually successful, is doing well? Reconcile it with the statement that payments are not forthcoming or are not being done accordingly because I assume this is a revolving fund, whereby somebody has to take a loan, repay back and then we are able to borrow another person. Can you share with us what are your targeted groups and areas? Because really in our constituencies out there in the villages,

information is not actually arriving there and less and less people are able to get loans as they apply from rural areas like Gabane and Mmankodi. I think it is the same everywhere, even in Tonota youth are unable to access this. What are you doing to try and solve that sort of problem?

The last one Honourable Minister would be for you to make us appreciate if it is necessary for us to continue funding or putting money in to this fund?

**MR OLOPENG:** Thank Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member I will try and make my response a little bit hot. I think first of all we have to understand the objectives of this programme, we are not running a commercial bank here. We are not emphasising on collecting repayments, interest rates and all the stuff. The main objective of this programme is to create employment opportunities for young people and also to empower our youth venture in to commercial entities. That is the main objective of this programme. So, for them to be failing to pay is not a big issue to me, they will pay when the business is doing and it is not my focus at the moment. I hope it is getting hotter.

I also like you to appreciate that you talked of the targeted groups, we are targeting the youth and youth category is 18 years to 35 years. That is the government policy at the moment. So that is what our target is. We are in all the 57 constituencies. According to the directive that talked to the investments of constituencies, every constituency is given P2 million on annual basis. It is very important for Members of Parliament and Councils to make sure that they know more about this programme, so that they could assist their people out there, even before elections, to see to it that this programme is used by young people and it benefits young people.

So we are in all the constituencies, I do not know why Honourable Member is saying people in Gabane do not know where to access this programme. I do not understand that question because we have offices in districts; we have officers at constituencies and so on. Our Ministry's doors are open for anyone to come in at any time and enquire whatever they require to know about this programme. I hope I have answered you. Thank you.

**MR MOSWAANE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I should commend the Minister and inform him that the program is progressing very well in Francistown. A decision however was made by the Ministry that they no longer accept proposals for projects such as hair salons, catering services, tent hire services and mobile kitchens, which I believe would do very well in today's market. I believe that there has been no study carried out that determined

that such businesses need to be stopped. What can you do about that point Honourable Minister? A lot of youth who attend the Francistown College of Technical and Vocational Education (FCTV), study hairdressing but they are not able to venture into this business because it is dominated by the people from Zimbabwe and Zambia.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Minister, you have 2 minutes 45 seconds.

**MR OLOPENG:** Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. We had reports from Francistown that the markets were saturated in this sector; hair salon and so on. But we have since lifted this up to say, let the business proposal speak for itself. So from this coming financial year, this will be funded according to business proposals submitted by the applicants. Thank you very much.

**MR LELATISITSWE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I just wanted to ask the Minister if he is still confident that this P100, 000.00 is enough for one to start up a business. Are they not considering increasing it maybe to P200, 000.00?

**MR OLOPENG:** Thank you very much Mr Speaker and Honourable Member. Yes, the P100, 000.00 seems to be small but I am looking more into introducing a refinancing model which I have already applied to Cabinet, as opposed to increasing the start-ups of P100, 000.00 because you know, it is sort of like a trial and error. You cannot make everyone an entrepreneur here. So if you put more money on start-ups, you are actually attracting more failures as opposed to just actually refinancing existing businesses of those who have already proved themselves to be entrepreneurs. So we are now looking into getting funding, and introducing a refinancing model of existing businesses or recapitalisation as opposed to financing start-ups with huge amounts. Thank you.

**MR SALAKAE:** Honourable Minister, you mentioned that you used the tracer study to clean the system. Can you try to make us understand what the tracer study was for, because it has never been meant to clean a system? I believe that it is meant to track records of success stories or failures of the intended recipients or the people that you have given the money. It was never meant to clean the system.

**MR SPEAKER:** Minister, try to limit your response to 30 seconds.

**MR OLOPENG:** No Honourable Member, what I meant was that through the data that we have collected through the tracer study we are going to clean our database using that. We want to start following up projects so that we

know the level at which they are, their status and so on. So it is within, it is not necessarily that it was only used to clean the database. Thank you.

#### MINISTER OF LANDS AND HOUSING

##### THEME: CONCESSIONS LEASE AGREEMENTS

**MR ARONE (OKAVANGO):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Very briefly, the question is just asking the Minister to help us appreciate why concession leases were transferred to Botswana Tourism Organisation (BTO) from Land Boards. In view of the fact that this Parliament passed the Community Based Natural Resources Management (CBNRM) Policy which among its aims was to empower communities and also make sure that they have ownership status to their land and resources around them. That is how brief the question is Mr Speaker.

**MINISTER OF LANDS AND HOUSING (MR MAELE):** Mr Speaker, it is not true that concessions have been moved to BTO. In this connection, I then have a challenge to answer this question because the foundation of the question itself is not correct. Therefore, I do not know how I can possibly answer it Mr Speaker.

**MR ARONE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. Since the Minister is saying it is not true, I think it is upon him to tell us what is true. What we know, what we have gathered from the communities themselves is that lease signing of concessions have been transferred from Land Boards. Even as we speak, many concessions in our area, I hope Honourable Members from Ngamiland will attest to this, do not have leases as we speak because there was a Cabinet directive that led to that decision. So it is upon the Minister to tell us what is the truth regarding this whole issue, so that he clears the confusion. I thank you.

**MR MOREMI:** On a point of order Mr Speaker. Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Maele misled the House when he first responded to what Honourable Arone asked. I say this because there is a correspondence MLH1/11/11/I (23) of the 20<sup>th</sup> January 2015 that instructs transfer of these sites. If the Honourable Minister says that he is not aware of the transfer and that there is no such transfer and therefore he cannot answer the question then he is out of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes, but you should not have called for a point of order. You should have called out for a correction so that the Minister could state his issue clearly. Honourable Arone asked him and so I believe he understands the question.

**MR MAELE:** Mr Speaker, the correspondence the 20<sup>th</sup> January 2014, does not talk about transfer of concessions to BTO. This is the question that I am answering. I am

saying it is not correct. The letter is not saying BTO! Now, if I have to answer because you are saying it is not BTO, what is it? The concessions have been transferred correctly so from Land Boards to Central Government, Department of Lands not BTO! And this is what the letter is saying.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Read it!

**MR MAELE:** If you want me to quote Mr Speaker, I can quote the letter that is being talked about.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! No, Honourable Minister, if you want to quote you, ask for permission to quote. You should not say, 'if I want you to quote.'

**MR MAELE:** May I quote the letter Mr Speaker?

**MR SPEAKER:** Go ahead and quote.

**MR MAELE:** The topic of the letter says, "Reservation of tourism sites to the Ministry of Environment, Wildlife and Tourism. The above subject matter refers; acting in accordance with the provisions of the Tribal Land Act Section 11 Sub Section II, His Excellency the President has directed that some of the tourism sites be transferred to the Central Government with immediate effect." It does not say BTO, it says Central Government.

**MR MOREMI:** Thank you Honourable Speaker. I think we can hear the Minister clearly saying the reservation of Tourism sites is at the Ministry of Environment, Wildlife and Tourism. According to what he wants to assert, they will be housed at Lands but are reserved for Environment, Wildlife and Tourism, that is BTO. So I do not know how he wants us to start when he is denying us an opportunity to start. He says the question is not correct. Could you proceed on that understanding that they have been transferred to Central Government, reservation for Environment, Wildlife and Tourism? At Environment, Wildlife and Tourism; those who deal with these things are BTO. Honourable Minister, can you not proceed to respond to the question; the substantive one because it is here? You can just go over it.

**MR MAELE:** Mr Speaker, it is in the Order Paper that I should respond to a question which talks about the transfer of concession leases from Land Boards to Botswana Tourism. I am saying, 'No!' The question is founded on wrong information that is not the case Mr Speaker. Therefore that is why I am saying if the person who asked the question wants us to talk about it the way it is, aligning it with the Central Government well, I am ready to discuss that one.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Thank you Honourable Speaker. I think the Minister is on the semantics, he is not serious at all. The reason why when a question is

asked and asked to put a theme and then you put notes, that is to guide the Minister as to what you will be talking about. You are not going to write everything and indeed if the Honourable Member has made an error, the Minister has the responsibility to correct that and inform this House what the truth is. "If we say it has been transferred to Central Government this is what we mean. Central Government we are referring to so and so who will be doing these things based on such and such reasons," so that we can move on. I mean these bullet points were giving him a guide so that he is aware of what is being talked about. He has that responsibility; he owes it to Batswana, to explain to this House as to where it emanated from, so that we are well informed.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** He is still going to answer it.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Yes! I am requesting him to answer the question just as he read it beautifully, and explain it clearly.

**MR MAELE:** Mr Speaker, let me point out to Honourable Mokgware that I take great exception in being told that I am not serious in Parliament, I am. I am very serious Sir and I have always said in this Parliament that people must make sure that they actually research on some of these things before they actually put them here. The fact of the matter is that if the Honourable Member wanted that question, he could have said to me, "this is the thing..." I would have assisted at that point in time, to say, "No, it is not BTO, it is actually the Central Government." Now it is coming as BTO, Honourable Mokgware is saying I am responding to a different question. What are we saying? I am answering the question before me. It has been noticed. I am saying I am answering the BTO one and I am saying it is not true that the lease concession have gone to BTO, it is not. I have indicated in the letter which was written which was referred to by Honourable Tawana that as a matter of fact it is not BTO. That is what I am saying. Thank you Mr Speaker.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Thank you very much Mr Speaker. I am struggling to hear exactly where the problem is and what difficulty the Minister has with answering the question. The substantive question for me is the transfer of leases. He says they were transferred to Central Government and we are saying we want to understand what informed that decision. Can he favour us with that information? This is because if we are going to be stuck on 'it is Central government not BTO', where in Central Government? That is the next stage of the question. So, if we can answer where in Central Government, then we will go back to answering the same question why and what informed this decision? That is what we want

to hear.

**MR MOSWAANE:** Procedure. I was thinking we could save this House time; can the Learned Parliamentary Counsel not clarify to us whether the Minister can deviate from this question and attend that side?

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! That is not necessary.

**MR MOSWAANE:** Sir?

**MR SPEAKER:** It is not necessary, Honourable Moswaane.

**MR MOSWAANE:** It is necessary because we take two hours discussing and arguing and in the interest of time...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order! Please listen. Ask the Minister questions were you do not understand and let him answer you. You still have 13 minutes 41 seconds. Ask him questions and let him respond to you so that you understand.

**MR ARONE:** Point of order. Mr Speaker, I think the Honourable Minister has taken this House out of order because he is responding to Point No. 2 which talks about BTO. The theme is very, very clear and the Minister agrees with the question that of course the transfer is there.

Point No. 2 talks about leases from Land Board to Tourism, he says 'no, then there is nothing that stops him from answering No. 2.' The theme is very, very clear and he is in agreement that indeed there is such transfer. Can you assist Honourable Speaker for this part to be answered because it is very, very clear and he is in agreement that the transfer is there?

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Yes, I get what you are saying Honourable Arone, the problem is that you are saying point of order. You should not ask me questions; you will ask the Honourable Minister of Lands and Housing. He should respond the way you want him to. Point out your questions to him. That which he does not explain thoroughly or clearly, enquire from him. You still have time to do that. Honourable Minister, please respond to Honourable Butale so that you make way for other questions.

**MR MAELE:** The question by Honourable Butale was, "Where in the Central Government has this been transferred to; Department of Lands."

**MR ARONE:** Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Minister because it is your role to give us the information. Now I want you to move onto Part 2;

what reasons led to that transfer of these leases to the Department of Lands and the consultation thereof?

**MR MAELE:** Mr Speaker, stakeholders in this matter were complaining about the sluggishness and expertise at the Land Boards. We then decided to take them out of places where there was no production and expertise and moved them to the Department of Lands which we believe services will be much better in terms of efficiency and expertise. Those are basically the main reason for the movement.

**MR MOREMI:** The Minister did not respond on the issue of consultation. Moreover, he highlighted yesterday that people have real rights on land and Land Board is there as the custodian which formalises the rights of the communities but those concessions were since transferred but where to? Lastly, do you remember that the land board once said it is not within the law to do what they are told to do?

**MR MAELE:** Mr Speaker, through your permission, can I quote the Tribal Land Act, Section 11 (2).

**MR SPEAKER:** Go ahead.

**MR MAELE:** It reads "the President may give to any land board, directions of a general or specific character and that land board shall give effect to any such direction." While it is true that the vesting of the land in a particular jurisdiction is vested on that concerned land board y, Section 11 (2) states that while that is the case, the President can give direction. Therefore, that is why he gave those directions being informed by Section 11 (2). That is what I wanted us to appreciate. It does not mean that the land board has got absolute power of that particular land; there are some exceptions informed by Section 11 (2) which explains that the President may give directions. That is what I wanted to relay.

In terms of consultation, the people who have been consulted of course are the land board and remember Honourable Moremi that the board for land board consist of Dikgosi as well. Therefore, we believe that by virtue of being part of the board, Dikgosi will relay the message to their communities which in this sense will be the consultation process.

Now let me talk about real rights versus user right. Yesterday when I talked about real rights, I realised that Honourable Moremi did not understand me. When it comes to tribal land, the rights are vested on the land board and state land on the Republic. That is basically what I was saying yesterday. Now in so far as real rights are concerned, I would like to make a distinction that when you have been allocated a piece of land...

**MR MOSWAANE:** Point of Order! Mr Speaker, if we allow incidents like this to recur, then this Parliament will be out of order because we are discussing an issue which does not exist in Parliament as we speak. There should have been an amendment to the question so that we are all on the same board. I am of the opinion that the Minister is discussing what is not on the business for today. Let us tread carefully there because now he is volunteering for the sake of peace, but the House is really out of order. I thank you.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Butale and Honourable Mmolotsi, return to your seats. I am on the floor and you are busy walking out.

Honourable Moswaane. I have noted that. I think the Minister is trying to respond to the question that he was asked. Do not be impatient, just listen to him and where you are not following, feel free to ask questions. You are left with eight minutes 59 seconds to do that.

**MR MOSWAANE:** Procedure.

**MR SPEAKER:** No you are going to while away time with procedure.

**MR MOSWAANE:** I said procedure. Mr Speaker, are you aware that procedurally, it is not allowed and it is illegal to discuss something that does not appear on the agenda. The Order Paper says Botswana Tourism Organisation (BTO) and now we are discussing something else. If you allow these things to happen, it will reflect favouritism habits. This House should be run properly.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Moswaane, I suspect that you are not interested in the issue on the floor, that is why you are disturbing. Forget about this question and let them ask supplementary questions. Why are you being impatient?

**MR MOREMI:** Thank you Speaker. The land in Mababe is owned by Basarwa occupying that land and they are called after Tshakedi. The same applies to Khwai. So are you saying Section 11 (2) of the Tribal Land Act allows the President under Section 8 of the Constitution to take over ownership of that land without any compensation?

**MR MAELE:** Mr Speaker, the Honourable Member is confusing the issue of adequate compensation and the one he was earlier on talking about of real rights. I am going to talk about Mababe because I am actually doing it as we speak. Mababe is a state land and the residents there for instance, want us to either tribalise it or allocate plots when it is a state land. You will ask Honourable Markus, who is actually dealing with this issue.

Now as we speak, they have surface rights where they are, the real rights are vested in the Republic because it is a state land. Therefore I do not believe we just repossess a plot but we do with adequate compensation. But where there is none that is when the President through Section 11 (2) will exercise it. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR ARONE:** Thank you. Honourable Minister, when you were quoting the Directive, if I heard you correctly, you said 'some tourism sites would be transferred.' I wanted to know the criteria used to qualify the repossession.

The other issue, as I was talking about the Community-based Natural Resources Management (CBNRM) Policy, trusts were formed countrywide more especially in Ngamiland vested the powers on the communities, the policy empowered the communities to use such resources. Though you are saying...

**MR MOREMI:** Correction. Let me assist Honourable Arone by saying, this policy was not empowering the community, it was just to formalise the existing rights. So it was not to grant but rather to formalise.

**MR ARONE:** Thank you, Honourable Member. I think the Honourable Minister gets where my concern is; that is how many Trusts were consulted. I hear you when you say land boards where Dikgosi also sit were consulted, but what about the communities themselves?

**MINISTER OF LANDS AND HOUSING (MR MAELE):** Mr Speaker, I am going to start with Honourable Arone's first question where he mentioned that, here I was talking about some sites, what about others. Department of Lands manages state land, some of these sites were in the state land therefore, there was no need to transfer them to the Department of Lands, because in any case they still belonged to the Department of Lands. So those are an exception. Therefore these other ones were in the Tribal land under land board, that is why we had to make that directive that, they should be transferred to the Department of Lands. Some of them it was not necessary because already they were in the Department of Lands. That is how it is.

The second question was; did we consult Trusts? Honourable Member, I want to be very honest, as far as I am concerned consultation was supposedly done. What I can explain therefore is that, these lease funds we are collecting, we take into account the fact that some concessions belong to Trusts and therefore there are funds allocated to Trusts. The government does not take all the lease funds. Royalties are given to Trusts from the money that we collect from these leases. Therefore we have not disadvantaged Trusts in any way because in

any case they have been benefiting from the money that we were collecting from these people. Thank you.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Elucidation. Thank you Mr Speaker. Minister, you spoke about stakeholders who informed a sudden change of these leases to central government. Who are these stakeholders Honourable Minister? Personally I respect you Honourable Minister and I believe you are not like certain Members of Parliament who drink a lot of *joko* tea before coming to Parliament in the morning.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Nkaigwa, stand up and withdraw what you said. Stand up.

**MR NKAIGWA:** I withdraw Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Now you have messed up your question because we did not understand what you were saying. Honourable Arone answer the question.

**MR ARONE:** Honourable Minister, you said one of the main reasons for transferring was the fact that, land board lacks expertise, but can we appreciate Honourable Minister why as we speak now, most concessions have not received their leases, where is the problem because the transfers has sent the whole job to people with expertise?

**MR MAELE:** Honourable Arone is telling the truth. Most of the concessions have not been agreed on, they have not been signed yet. As I am speaking to you the only ones I am aware have been signed are only four, but I can remember that they are about fifteen which have not been signed. What is the problem? The problem is, when they were transferred to the Department of Lands, where there is expertise, they realised that some of these clauses were not good. We want to change these clauses. When they changed these clauses, the four which I said were signed did not have a problem despite the change. However, some said, they want them in the same manner they were in when they were still in land board. That is where the problems is, they do not agree to some of the clauses which the Department of Lands has suggested. The main issue at the end of the day is that, since they have the expertise they included clauses which they thought could help in terms of lease management. Look, Department of Lands is just doing the business side, the management, the planning still rests with the land board. It does not mean that we have given the Department of Lands all the powers, they are doing just the business side of lease management only. In terms of the planning, in terms of the land management, it is still the land board. Thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR MOREMI:** Minister can you confirm what you have just said about Royalties being given to the people

who have rights in that area because a question was once asked in this House and the response was, all these things are taken to the National Environment Fund. My request now is for you to reconcile these two positions because they differ yet they talk about the same thing.

**MR MAELE:** Mr Speaker, like I said, if the concessions belong to Trusts, we receive money and then give Royalties to Trusts. I do not think we are saying anything different.

**MR SPEAKER:** Time up! We have a question without notice by Honourable Dr Phenyo Butale.

### QUESTION WITHOUT NOTICE

#### CRITERIA USED BY BOTSWANA TELEVISION (BTV) AND RADIO BOTSWANA TO COVER POLITICAL EVENTS

**DR P. BUTALE (GABORONE CENTRAL):** asked the Minister for Presidential Affairs and Public Administration:-

- (i) to brief Parliament on the editorial policy that informs Botswana Television (Btv) coverage of political events, such as rallies;
- (ii) the Minister should further state;
  - (a) how his Ministry ensures fair and equal coverage between Opposition parties and the ruling party;
  - (b) since Btv news crew covered a recent UDC rally in Maruapula what happened to the footage;
  - (c) whether providing television coverage only for BDP launches of candidates in elections such as in the Sekoma Council bye-election does not adversely affect the fairness of the poll; and
  - (d) what his Ministry is doing to ensure that Btv and Radio Botswana serves the public interest rather than narrow political and personal interests.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR MAKGALEMELE):** Mr Speaker. State media including Botswana Television derives its editorial policy from the purpose from which they were set up by government and this is publicity and promotional policies and programmes that benefit Batswana. Whether covering political or other types of events, state media including Botswana Television is guided by the basic principles of journalism and nation building, that is, factuality, accuracy, truthfulness and being ethical or in good taste relative to matters of public interest. Like any professional media establishment, however, state media reserves the right of editorial decision making

with respect to what and when to cover and if or not to broadcast material collected.

Mr Speaker, my Ministry does not interfere in editorial decisions. The issue of fair and equal coverage between opposition parties and the ruling party is an old debate and a matter of opinion making because fairness in one person's opinion is not necessarily fairness in another person's view.

Mr Speaker, nonetheless, in the specific cases of political events such as political rallies, Btv makes every effort to provide equitable coverage relative to resources available and the volume nature and location of such events for which coverage would have been requested, and relative to other news making events and occasions as well as several other considerations in the news gathering process.

Mr Speaker, it is true that Btv was present at the recent UDC rally in Maruapula. The material was not used for news because it did not comply with Btv editorial policy that I have already outlined. It is up to Btv management Mr Speaker to decide on what to do with any material that is collected in the news gathering process and found to be inconsistent with state media editorial policy. Mr Speaker, the Honourable Member may wish to note that, it was not the first time that Btv covered an event but it subsequently did not broadcast nor was it the last time Mr Speaker.

For example, BTV covered a Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) political rally in Old Naledi on the 6<sup>th</sup> December 2015 and was never broadcast after BTV management determined it to be inconsistent with their editorial policy. In addition Mr Speaker, recently BTV covered a BDP political rally in Palapye and this was not aired.

I believe that this is a clear demonstration of equitable treatment of political material by the station. Mr Speaker, I must state in the most unequivocal language that it is not correct that Botswana Television coverage is provided to only BDP launches of candidates for elections as the question seems to suggest.

In the month of January 2016 and February 2016 alone Mr Speaker, candidates' launches and several other political activities were covered for all political parties. These include Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC) rally in Kanye on the 7<sup>th</sup> February 2016. The Botswana Congress Party (BCP) rally in Machaneng on the 4<sup>th</sup> February 2016. The Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) rally in Segwagwa on the 7<sup>th</sup> February 2016. The Botswana Democratic Party rally at the Gaborone bus rank on the 19<sup>th</sup> February 2016. UDC-BCP Memorandum of Agreement on the Sekoma by-

election on the 4<sup>th</sup> February 2016 in Gaborone, as well as the UDC rally in Tlokweneng on the 26<sup>th</sup> January 2016.

Therefore, suggestion that BTV provides coverage only for BDP candidates' launches is inaccurate and not backed by facts on the ground. Mr Speaker, on the basis of my answer above this question falls away that is the one at (d). However, for the avoidance of any doubt the notion of my Ministry somehow ensuring what is referred to as public interest in BTV coverage and reference to narrow political and personal interest in BTV news coverage is unfortunate as it both suggests that my Ministry should interfere with the editorial decisions. I thank you Mr Speaker.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Supplementary. Are you aware that some of the programmes that you said were covered by BTV, including the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding is not true?

Is the minister aware that this attitude of BTV to broadcast only BDP programmes has a potential of dividing the country? And lastly, since it has appeared that the BTV head, Mr Mogomotsi Kaboyamodimo is incompetent, when are you transferring him or relieving him of his duties...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Mmolotsi I said that you should not say public servants names in this House. Withdraw those names.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Okay. I withdraw the name. The Deputy Permanent Secretary to the...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** The accounting officer

**MR MMOLOTSI:** The accounting officer for Mass media is incompetent, when are you transferring him or fire him?

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Mr Speaker, I verify that what I have presented in the Parliament is the truth, including that which the Honourable Member said were allegations. Mr Chairperson, I have no doubt that the way BTV reports could bring any division into the country. Like I have stated earlier on, the intention of government media is to disseminate information in the best possible way to reach the entire country knitting together the nation. The third question Mr Speaker, I want to confirm that I have no intention of transferring or firing the Deputy Permanent Secretary, Broadcasting services because so far the department is still happy with his service.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Supplementary. Thank you very much. I want to refer you to the question 'c' where I spoke about the coverage of BDP Sekoma candidate launch and not covering our UDC candidate in Keng

and I asked whether that does not negatively affect the fairness of the poll?

I wanted you to also help us; you said the material that was collected at Maruapula rally did not meet the requirements of your editorial policy. I want you to help us understand. What are you talking about? Is it because they were too many people and you did not want the public to see or perhaps Ms Nasha spoke and answered the vitriolic from the leadership of this House and you did not want Batswana to see that? What editorial policy did that material offend? That is what I want you to say.

I also wanted... the last one ...

**MR SPEAKER:** Your questions are too many. It then means that...

**DR P. BUTALE:** It is the third one.

**MR SPEAKER:** You would have taken them all and deny others a chance to ask.

**DR P. BUTALE:** It is the third one Mr Speaker. The last one is on interference from your Ministry. You spoke that your Ministry has no interest in interfering. I want to put it to you that the reason why the Deputy Permanent Secretary in your Ministry has not moved to his office in the Office of the President is because he interferes and overrules the decisions of the editors at Mass Media and he overrules them willy-nilly and decides "this one is not good for the BDP and therefore is going to be aired, this one is not good for this particular faction in the BDP and therefore it is not going to be aired."

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Honourable Butale, you might be having something against us that we do not know of.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! I cannot hear him.

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** It is upon us to determine which offices the public service serve in. We therefore cannot allow you Honourable Butale to come and dictate to us the kind of public officers to have in a particular office. You had requested that I explain why a rally where Ms Nasha was at was not aired on BTV, I have highlighted our editorial policy when I responded, I said there are certain aspects that we consider before we air a programme and I want to confirm that airing a programme does not depend on the turn out of the public. The Keng instance, when I responded to the part 'c' of your question I gave examples of the Opposition party rallies that we covered. I cannot confirm therefore to this House that we will be able to cover each and every launch but we do our best to consider the requests and we cover them when I have ably demonstrated in

this response Mr Speaker that we have covered many many opposition activities.

**DR P. BUTALE:** On a point of Procedure. Thank you very much Mr Speaker. The Honourable Minister is deliberately evading my question. My question is, what exactly in that ...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale, that is not a point of procedure.

**DR P. BUTALE:** No, no he did not answer my question. How do we then proceed...

**MR SPEAKER:** It is not a point of procedure.

**DR P. BUTALE:** We are out of procedure because he is going to evade the question.

**MR SPEAKER:** Let me teach you. That is not a point of procedure. If he has not answered your question, you could have clarification again. Procedure is something else.

**DR P. BUTALE:** No, procedure.

**MR SPEAKER:** I am teaching you, I am not asking you.

**DR P. BUTALE:** No, I do not agree with your interpretation.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Supplementary. Since he did not answer the question, can he explain how Dr Nasha's rally has not qualified to be aired?

Lastly, it is the issue of interference Minister, maybe I should give an example; do you know that in 2009 when I was a Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) candidate, I called the person who is now the Deputy Permanent Secretary, after my rallies were not covered by Honourable Pheny Butale who was by then working in Francistown. When I asked him, he told me that every time he is directed to go and cover other rallies and when I called the Deputy Permanent Secretary he told me that my name was not in the list of people who should be covered from Tsholetsa. Are you aware that it has been a long time since this Deputy Permanent Secretary has been doing this?

**ASSISTANT MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR MAKGALEMEME):** Certainly Honourable Mmolotsi, you would not expect me to trust any information that you got from Honourable Dr Butale. I think that one, you are just raising to entertain this Honourable House. I think that is the response that I will want to give you.

**MR MMOLOTSI:** On a point of order. Mr Speaker, I think this Minister is out of order because I am not

raising any point to entertain anybody. If I wanted to entertain anyone, I would have actually indicated that Honourable Makgalemele's defection meeting from the Botswana Movement for Democracy (BMD) was covered by Botswana Television.

**MR SPEAKER:** You are out of order Honourable Mmolotsi.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Supplementary!

**MR SPEAKER:** Wait, you know what Honourable Members, Sometimes I give you time to ask questions that are in line with what has been asked after you have finished asking those important questions, you then ask irrelevant questions and start provoking one another. I am going to take the last supplementary then we proceed. Honourable Makgalemele conclude so that I take the last supplementary.

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Well Honourable Mmolotsi, what I said earlier on, thus stands and I am used to the remarks that you have just made.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Let me finish answering you. Wait with that point of order.

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** But anyway, the first one here was that he wanted to know...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Makgalemele, I said conclude your answer.

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** On the first question that he asked, I want to read the first part of my response again if you would allow me because it basically answers his question. I did state Mr Speaker and I quote, "state media including Botswana Television derives its editorial policy from the purpose from which they were set up by Government and this is publicity and promotion of policies and programmes that benefit Batswana." So basically when we look at the news feed, we will be looking at these broad provisions including what you have just said.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Supplementary. Thank you very much Mr Speaker...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** I have raised a point of order Mr Speaker. You said it would be attended when he finishes. He has finished and you allowed someone else to talk.

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes I have called Honourable Butale, let him finish.

**STATEMENT ON DIPLOMATIC IMPASSE BETWEEN  
THE CHINESE GOVERNMENT AND THE  
GOVERNMENT OF BOTSWANA**

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** I asked for a point of order Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** I will give you when he finish.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, my point of order is ordering Honourable Makgalemele, it does not order Butale.

**MR SPEAKER:** You will talk when he is done.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, I asked for it before he took the floor.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Murmurs)...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, I asked for it before he took the floor. Point of order is in the ...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order takes precedence Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, you are just being stubborn.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** But I asked for a point of order Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Look, if you do not ask, I proceed.

**DR P. BUTALE:** But Mr Speaker, I think we need to also observe the rules of this House. The point of order should take precedence.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale!

**DR P. BUTALE:** I wanted to ask the last question. Honourable Minister, you are not answering the question. The question is simple, you are telling us the obvious that there are some broad principles that you look at. We are asking, how the footage from the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC) Maruapula rally offended those principles? That is what we are asking. How did it not qualify? I am putting it to you and you are just making it difficult to yourself, it did not qualify because you were scared of the people who turned up! You were scared of the words that were said, just come out clean!

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Certainly Mr Speaker we are not scared, but in addition to the answer that I have already provided, I did indicate in the body of my initial response that, we also reserve the right of editorial decision making with respect to what and when to cover and if or not to broadcast material collected. Therefore,

we are not going to allow ourselves Honourable Butale that you will dictate to us. Why for example are you not asking us why we have not covered the many BDP events where Botswana Television went to cover and they were not aired? I thank you Mr Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ...(Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Butale, you have asked and now you have started arguing. Learn to keep quiet.

**STATEMENT ON DIPLOMATIC  
IMPASSE BETWEEN THE CHINESE  
GOVERNMENT AND THE  
GOVERNMENT OF BOTSWANA**

**LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (MR BOKO):**

Thank you very much Mr Speaker. In the last week or so, we learnt of a diplomatic impasse between the Chinese Government and the Government of Botswana. We heard of alleged closure of the Embassy of China. This closure, temporary as it may have been, carried a potent and ominous message for our country and its people. It was ascribed to the bruin diplomatic tensions between the Botswana and Chinese Governments. The Government of Botswana had in one of its many instances of thoughtless enthusiasm, issued a condemnatory statement against the People's Republic of China in respect of certain unresolved issues and territorial claims to the South China Sea. This was needless and extremely dangerous attention seeking by our Government. It was little wonder then that the Chinese Government responded with such a demonstration of displeasure.

As a Government in waiting, the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC), wishes to express and record concern at the way the Government of Botswana has acted in our relations with China. We are of the firm view that, in the first instance, it serves no purpose to issue a statement to publicize any view that the Government of Botswana may hold in relation to China on this matter. Botswana should have realized the trust that China places on the people of Botswana as well as the privilege available to us to engage China through the right diplomatic channels. These quite channels would be in keeping with the values of mutual respect, political maturity and a genuine appetite for, and commitment to, effective problems solving. We would like to remind our Government that when it comes to handling issues of Public International Law and Diplomacy, responsible engagement and measured communication are the channels and means by which we best can speak.

The Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC) also values the strategic importance of China to the economy and

welfare of our people, which privilege we can ill afford to squander. China is an economic super power that has made tremendous and admirable strides in a wide array of fields and sectors. China is a valuable trading partner and a great potential market for our goods and services. China possesses knowledge and technology from which Botswana could be a major beneficiary through both skill and technology transfer. These are the issues which we believe should form the pith and substance of engagements between Botswana and China.

It is disturbing that such a provocative statement should be issued by our Government, regardless of the size of the economy or the military might of the country against which such a statement is directed. Our place on the world stage is not to lecture other nations about our moral rectitude or supposed high governance standards. Far be it from us to be the self-anointed moral tutors of the world. On the contrary, our role is to be a true exemplar, not by what we say so much as by how we conduct ourselves in the way we govern this country or the way we manage our economy. For this and many other reasons, we wish to tender our apology, on behalf of our members and all right thinking people of our country, to the Government of China, for the statement in question and the many other lethal delusions to which our Government has fallen victim. We would also urge our Government to withdraw the irresponsible and reckless statement.

Finally, we observe, in fairness to the Minister of Foreign Affairs and International Relations, that the statement could not have been crafted by the mature, measured and able Honourable Venson-Moitoi or her circle of professional diplomats. We have it on good authority that is yet another act by the over-zealous and immature Office of the President, which continues to govern and operate on unbridled emotion and astonishing lack of foresight. We pray and hope that this callous mismanagement of our foreign policy does not plunge our country into an abyss from which we may not be able to extricate ourselves.

We would also like to record our dismay at the Office of the President and its misdirected fervor that draws it to issues far removed from it rather than focuses on issues of immediate moment to this country and its people. Our education is in perpetual crisis, yet there is not even a whimper from the Office of the President. Our President is like a demon propitiated only by human sacrifice; sacrifice in the many aborted futures and thwarted ambitions of many of our young people. And his pursuit of futile causes that have nothing to do with the immediate concerns of our country is fueled and fed only by the fanatical certainty with which his

Ministers advance countless falsehoods in defence of his Government.

We urge all Batswana and inhabitants of this country to wake up to the sad reality that this Government is pushing our country to rack and ruin. We must all rise up and rescue our country from the clutches of this perilous sycophancy and remove the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) from power. We urge all self-respecting Batswana to join forces with the UDC and free this country from this incompetent leadership of the BDP. Thank you Honourable Markus and others for the privilege of your attention.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Members, in accordance with Standing Order 41.3, I shall now allow short questions to elucidate his statement.

**MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR MOLALE):** Thank you Mr Speaker. Is the Honourable Leader of Opposition aware of the fact that the statement he has just made is based on falsehoods? There was never at any moment, a closure of the Chinese Embassy. There was never at any moment, any mention of China as a country in the issues that are affecting South China Sea. Why should you then want to pick China as against Japan, Vietnam and any other? Botswana as a member of the community of nations and a fully-fledged member of the United Nations, has a right to partake in the process of its building in the world.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR NKAIGWA:** On a point of order. I thank you Mr Speaker. I thought you did mention that Honourable Members were to make short questions, but from what the Honourable Member is doing, he is actually making a response to what the Leader of the Opposition...

**MR SPEAKER:** Sit down; I was waiting for him to conclude.

**MR NKAIGWA:** So why do you allow him to do that?

**MR SPEAKER:** Sit down, he is doing exactly what you normally do taking long to talk about the subject matter.

**MR BOKO:** I do not know the Honourable Minister to hold any brief to speak for and on behalf of the Chinese Embassy and tell us what they did or did not do. We would like to hear from the Chinese themselves corroborating or confirming what we have just said. As far as we know, the Chinese Embassy was closed, fact! that we know. What we may not know until the Chinese confirm is whether it was closed on account of

**STATEMENT ON DIPLOMATIC IMPASSE BETWEEN  
THE CHINESE GOVERNMENT AND THE  
GOVERNMENT OF BOTSWANA**

this impasse. That there was an impasse is not in any doubt, and you are fully aware of the circumstances that occurred subsequent to the issuance of this irresponsible statement. So we state and we state categorically that it was irresponsible to issue such a statement and provoke countries.

Do not punch above your weight, deal with issues that are of concern to this country. The education situation requires the attention of the President more than issues of South China Sea. Thank you very much.

**MR MOSWAANE:** Thank you Mr Speaker. I want to understand this because it seems like the problem here is that China is a rich country. China is the most powerful country, but I did not hear the Honourable Leader of Opposition talking about the deaths that happened as a result of wars in those countries, where women and children are killed, innocent people are killed. If you are rich are you not supposed to be advised? That is my question. I hear Honourable Boko saying he knows that the Chinese Embassy was closed. Can Honourable Boko give us proof that this embassy was closed and when? What time and for what reasons? That is what we would like to know otherwise if this is not true Honourable Boko should withdraw his statement. Thank you.

**MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR KGATHI):** Procedure Mr Speaker, I stand on a point of procedure that we should dignify this Parliament by coming up with statements of fact. The procedure that I would like to ask for is a clear explanation in this Parliament of whether it is true that the Chinese Embassy was closed. Otherwise we will be offending the Chinese by stating things that are incorrect in this Honourable House. We have to come up with statements of fact so that when we continue debating this, we know that indeed this embassy was closed. I submit.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Kgathi, you are now asking me questions that I am unable to answer. Yesterday when listening to the presentation of the Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation, the Minister talked about the issue of China. I also watched it on television and in the radio and nothing was mentioned about it being closed but Honourable Boko is stating that it was closed. If you want him to provide proof that it was indeed closed, just say so.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** I am on the floor, whom are you saying order to? Honourable Kgathi, I want you to be straight

forward about what you want. Do you want proof of whether it was closed or not? Stop asking me difficult questions.

**MR KGATHI:** Procedure. To come out clear on that point of procedure, I will like to say before we proceed to debate...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR KGATHI:** Wait, procedure and order are the same thing. Before we continue debating this statement, this statement of fact must be clarified by the Honourable Member of Leader of the Opposition. He has to tell us if it is a fact that the Chinese embassy was closed. Otherwise I would move that we close the debate on this statement because it is based on fallacies, assumptions and imagination. I submit.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Boko, in your ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Member, I am on the floor. When are you planning to respect the procedure of this house? I will chase you out and we will continue in your absence. You are disturbing the proceedings of this house, this is my last warning. Honourable Boko, can you please stand and explain whether you have proof that the Chinese Embassy was closed.

**LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (MR BOKO):** One of the most important skills in any serious and informed engagement is the ability to listen, listen and listen very carefully. I indicated;

1. That there was a diplomatic impasse.
2. That there were allegations of closure of the Chinese Embassy.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR BOKO:** That is what I started of saying and because folks do not listen, they choose to focus their attention on irrelevancies. What I did say and it is a fact, even your Ministry does close down at some point in time. What we may not know is the reason why it has closed. It may have closed down because you are refurbishing, it may have closed down because you have knocked off. It may have closed down for any number of reasons that any embassy or any establishment does at some point close down, it is a fact. What we have not done is to impute authoritatively any reason for the closure. What we have stated and stated categorically is that there was and still a diplomatic impasse between ourselves and

China. So, if you would have listened very carefully, these are things you would have picked out very, very easily. Thank you very much.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Boko, Honourable Moswaane asked you a question, answer him.

**MR BOKO:** I think the same answer that I have given, if you listen and you understand the totality of the statement presented, all these questions would in fact not even arise to any logically sound person. Switch off your microphones please and ...

**MR KGATHI:** Procedure. Mr Speaker, we are not leaving it hanging like that. This House is Honourable. By his admission, a Leader of Opposition is bringing allegations. He is speaking from the streets and for this House to come and prove unconfirmed allegations and debate and discuss them is not right and they are relating to another sovereign state for that matter. I would want to move Mr Speaker, that this speech be suspended until the Honourable Leader tells us the truth. I move.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** why are you quarrelling?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order!

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Just hold on, I have heard you.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** We are not here to serve the selfish interests of the Botswana Democratic Party.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Nkaigwa, out! Get out! Get out of the house! I have warned you time and again, out!

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** You have really made an effort today.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs) ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Moswaane, I have heard you, I said wait. Honourable Kgathi has just moved a motion here. I am consulting my legal brains ...

...“SILENCE”...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order! Honourable Members, let me apologise for taking some time looking for the standing order that will help us resolve this issue. Honourable Mmolotsi...

**MR MMOLOTSI:** Yes Mr Speaker?

**MR SPEAKER:** I am on the floor. Honourable Mmolotsi, out! Get out! You are talking back to me. Get out! Honourable Mmolotsi out! Get out, I will continue with Leader of Opposition, he will respond.

Order! Honourable Members. What Honourable Kgathi asked for is impossible because it is not covered anywhere in our Standing Orders. What needs to happen is that at 41.3 is that you ask short questions and you respond so that his issue can be clarified. There is nothing wrong with getting this Hansard so that you can discuss it afresh, I heard complaints that you do not agree with his statement but we have the benefit of a Hansard; we can go and get it and see what is it that you want him to withdraw.

**MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR KGATHI):** On a further point of procedure Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, can we please get the Hansard to confirm what he said because he now seems to be going back on his words when he is asked to state whether it is a fact that the Chinese Embassy was closed. My point is the Chinese are not in this House. You cannot come here and say some fallacies with a pretence that you are on their side. The Hansard should be brought here to confirm what Honourable Boko said about the Chinese Embassy.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of Order!

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Members. The Hansard is not available right now; it will only be available next week. I will look at it next week to confirm the words of Honourable Boko and we will continue from there. They are going to write down exactly what he said...

**DR P. BUTALE:** On a point of Order! Mr Speaker. Thank you very much. I very much agree with your ruling because I listen and I listen very attentively. The Honourable Leader of the House spoke about a diplomatic...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Correction, correction, correction.

**MR SPEAKER:** Wait first Leader of the House or is it Leader of Opposition?

**DR P. BUTALE:** Leader of the Opposition. Sorry! I would not have much to say about the Leader of the House.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale, where did you get that?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of Order!

**DR P. BUTALE:** Now, I wanted to...

**MR SPEAKER:** That was recorded Honourable Butale.

**DR P. BUTALE:** I withdraw.

**MR SPEAKER:** Thank you.

**DR P. BUTALE:** I also wanted to say my point of order is that in his statement, he made allusion to allegations of closure of the embassy. That is a fact. So I am saying for the sake of progress Honourable Speaker, please allow us to ask the Honourable Leader of the Opposition substantive questions that will help this nation because the futile theatrics of this regime are harming our interests outside.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Procedure!

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of Order!

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Procedure!

**MR SPEAKER:** No, I think that the decision we made to wait for final product of the Hansard so that we can look at Honourable Leader of the Opposition's words and the ruling was that he can withdraw what needs to be withdrawn is a good decision which we all agreed to. Now you are seeking procedure?

**MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR TSOGWANE):** On a point of procedure Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, I entirely agree with you but you are running short of following the precedence that has been set in this House, where you are faced with such a matter you suspend the debates. Even last week the Hansard printing was suspended. Why can you not suspend this debate until we confirm what the Leader of the Opposition has said? That is the precedence which was set last time when the printing of the Hansard was suspended.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! I think this is a complex issue. Let us suspend them debate right now. I will be holding the Hansard next week and will also avail copies to the interested parties; Leader of the Opposition and those who might need it so that we can see exactly what you said the come back to this House to finish that issues. Let us close this matter now Honourable Members.

**DR P. BUTALE:** On a point of procedure Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, I beg to differ. You know the issue at hand here is clearly...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of procedure Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** Let him finish, he is on a point of order.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Clearly, when you are on a point of procedure you cannot put another one on top of it.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** You are out of order sir. On a point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Moyo, switch off your mike.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Laughing)... It is amazing.

**DR P. BUTALE:** The point I wanted to raise was that the Minister of Foreign Affairs was here yesterday confirming the diplomatic impasse between Botswana and China which is the import of the statement read by the Leader of the Opposition. She said that after issuing a statement...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of order. He is out of order.

**DR P. BUTALE:** After issuing a statement, China did not like what was said. So, this is why we brought this statement. We cannot stop because these people are now seeing that they did something wrong. We need to proceed with this debate.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Order! Honourable Members. I made a ruling. I ruled that issue of LOO should be closed, we will go back to it when we have the Hansard, looking at it word for word and conclude this issue and proceed with other issues. So it has stopped we proceed with the business of the day.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Further procedure Mr Speaker.

**MR SPEAKER:** No.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, I want to understand.

**MR SPEAKER:** I do not want anyone talking about the issue I just closed.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Procedure Mr Speaker, just one shot.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale, if you are not going to talk about this closed matter.

**DR P. BUTALE:** I just want us to be clear as we suspend the proceedings. Why are we suspending them? Are we suspending them because there is a dispute...

**INTRODUCTION OF TACHOGRAPH SPEEDOMETERS  
IN ALL PUBLIC TRANSPORT VEHICLES  
Motion (Resumed Debate)**

**MR SPEAKER:** No, sit down you are talking about it.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Are we saying that...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale, sit down.

**DR P. BUTALE:** What are we going to find out?

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale, you were not really listening.

**DR P. BUTALE:** What are we going to find out?

**MR SPEAKER:** Sit down Honourable Member.

**MR KGATHI:** Clarification.

**MR SPEAKER:** What do you want to know Honourable Kgathi?

**MR KGATHI:** Mr Speaker, I want to understand that as we have suspended this issue, any printing on the subject matter that was discussed is it also suspended?

**MR SPEAKER:** No, listen. I am not going to stop printing of the Hansard. We will expunge words which need to be expunged from it, printing will carry on. We will expunge if we have to. The National Assembly Powers and Privileges Act allows us to do that. Even if you can bring it in 2019 we will still expunge. Let us proceed Clerk.

**INTRODUCTION OF TACHOGRAPH  
SPEEDOMETERS IN ALL PUBLIC  
TRANSPORT VEHICLES**

**Motion**

**(Resumed Debate)**

**MR SALAKAE:** Procedure. Mr Speaker, I need your assistance in order for me to understand the procedures of this House. There is an Order Paper that has a list of motions. You brought the same list in December and my concern is that the one motion that I had an interest in is not included in this list. I want you to advise me on what I should do to have it noticed again because I could not submit it the last time since Honourable Moswaane had already submitted it. It is the one that deals with demonopolisation of the Botswana Meat Commission Act or the liberalisation of the BMC Act.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Yes Honourable Member I understand you. The advice that I can give you is that whenever you receive the Order Paper and you notice something that does not sit well with you should approach the Speaker so that you can be given an explanation of why things could be that way. At this juncture I cannot give you a proper response since I

am following the order paper as is. Just as I complete reading out the motion by Honourable Moswaane I am informed that there is no quorum since the Members have left the House. So call them and I will be here for the next 15 minutes.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The Assembly adjourned at 10:59 a.m. until Monday 29<sup>th</sup> February, 2016 at 2:00 p.m.

### **HANSARD RECORDERS**

Mr. T. Gaodumelwe, Mr T. Monakwe, Ms T. Kebonang

### **HANSARD REPORTERS**

Ms T. Rantsebele, Mr M. Buti, Ms N. Selebogo, Ms A. Ramadi, Ms D. Thibedi,  
Ms D. Pheko, Ms G. Baotsi, Ms N. Mokoka, Ms B. Pinaemang

### **HANSARD EDITORS**

Ms W. Mbeha, Ms K. Alepeng, Ms C. Chonga, Mr K. Goeme,  
Ms G. Phatedi, Ms B. Malokwane, Mr A. Mokopakgosi, Ms O. Nkatswe

### **HANSARD TRANSLATORS**

Ms B. Ntisetsang, Mr T. Rajane, Ms M. Sekao, Ms M. Rabotsima, Ms B. Mosinyi, Ms V. Nkwane,  
Ms K. Nyanga, Ms N Kerobale, Ms K. Ben, Ms M. Kagiso, Ms B. Dintwa, Ms T. Boccock

### **LAYOUT DESIGNERS**

Mr B. B. Khumanego, Mr D. T. Batshegi