

DAILY  
**HANSARD**  
YOUR VOICE IN PARLIAMENT



THE SECOND MEETING OF THE THIRD SESSION  
OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT  
MONDAY 13 FEBRUARY 2017

**ENGLISH VERSION**

HANSARD NO. 187



**DISCLAIMER**

**Unofficial Hansard**

This transcript of Parliamentary proceedings is an unofficial version of the Hansard and may contain inaccuracies. It is hereby published for general purposes only. The final edited version of the Hansard will be published when available and can be obtained from the Assistant Clerk (Editorial).

**THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY SPEAKER**  
**The Hon. Gladys K. T. Kokorwe MP.**  
**DEPUTY SPEAKER**  
**The Hon. Kagiso P. Molatlhegi, MP Gaborone South**

|                                       |                    |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------|
| Clerk of the National Assembly        | - Ms B. N. Dithapo |
| Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly | - Ms T. Tsiang     |
| Learned Parliamentary Counsel         | - Mr S. Chikanda   |
| Assistant Clerk (E)                   | - Mr R. Josiah     |

**CABINET**

|   |  |
|---|--|
| His Excellency Lt. Gen. Dr. S. K. I. Khama PH, FOM, DCO, DSM, MP. | - President  |
| His Honour M. E. K. Masisi, MP. (Moshupa-Manyana)                 | - Vice President   |
| Hon. Dr. P. Venson-Moitoi, MP. (Serowe South)                     | - Minister of International Affairs and Cooperation                              |
| Hon. S. Tsogwane, MP. (Boteti North)                              | - Minister of Local Government and Rural Development                             |
| Hon. N. E. Molefhi, MP. (Selebi Phikwe East)                      | - Minister of Infrastructure and Housing Development                             |
| Hon. S. Kgathi, MP. (Bobirwa)                                     | - Minister of Defence, Justice and Security                                      |
| Hon. O. K. Mokaila, MP. (Specially Elected)                       | - Minister of Transport and Communications                                       |
| Hon. P. M. Maele, MP. (Lerala - Maunatlala)                       | - Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services                     |
| Hon. E. J. Batschu, MP. (Nkange)                                  | - Minister of Nationality, Immigration and Gender Affairs                        |
| Hon. D. K. Makgato, MP. (Sefhare - Ramokgonami)                   | - Minister of Health and Wellness  |
| Hon. T. S. Khama, MP. (Serowe West)                               | - Minister of Environment, Natural Resources Conservation and Tourism            |
| Hon. V. T. Seretse, MP. (Mmopane - Lentsweletau)                  | - Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry                                     |
| Hon. O. K. Matambo, MP. (Specially Elected)                       | - Minister of Finance and Economic Development                                   |
| Hon. T. Mabeo, MP. (Thamaga - Kumakwane)                          | - Minister of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development             |
| Hon. T. Olopeng, MP. (Tonota)                                     | - Minister of Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development                   |
| Hon. E. M. Molale, MP. (Specially Elected)                        | - Minister for Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration        |
| Hon. Dr. U. Dow, MP. (Specially Elected)                          | - Minister of Basic Education  |
| Hon. P. P. Ralotsia, MP. (Kanye North)                            | - Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security                         |
| Hon. Dr. A. Madigele, MP. (Mmathethe - Molapowabojang)            | - Minister of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology               |
| Hon. S. Kebonang, MP. (Lobatse)                                   | - Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security            |
| Hon. D. P. Makgalemele, MP (Shoshong)                             | - Assistant Minister, Health and Wellness  |
| Hon. K. K. Autlwetse, MP (Serowe North)                           | - Assistant Minister, Agricultural Development and Food Security                 |
| Hon. B. M. Tshireletso, MP. (Mahalapye East)                      | - Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development                     |
| Hon. F. S. Van Der Westhuizen, MP. (Kgalagadi South)              | - Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development                     |
| Hon. M. M. Goya, MP. (Palapye)                                    | - Assistant Minister, Basic Education  |
| Hon. F. M. M. Molao, MP (Shashe West)                             | - Assistant Minister, Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology       |
| Hon. T. Kwerepe, MP (Ngami)                                       | - Assistant Minister, Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration |
| Hon. K. Mzwinila, MP (Mmadinare)                                  | - Assistant Minister, Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development           |
| Hon. I. E. Moipisi, MP (Kgalagadi North)                          | - Assistant Minister, Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services             |
| Hon. G. B. Butale, MP (Tati West)                                 | - Assistant Minister, Investment, Trade and Industry                             |

## MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT AND THEIR CONSTITUENCIES

| <b>Names</b>                                    | <b>Constituency</b>       |
|---|---------------------------|
| <b>RULING PARTY (Botswana Democratic Party)</b> |                           |
| Hon. S. M. Guma, MP                             | Tati East                 |
| Hon. C. De Graaff, MP                           | Ghanzi South              |
| Hon. L. Kablay, MP                              | Letlhakeng - Lephephe     |
| Hon. M. N. Ngaka, MP                            | Takatokwane               |
| Hon. S. Lelatisitswe, MP                        | Boteti East               |
| Hon. J. Molefe, MP                              | Mahalapye West            |
| Hon. K. Markus, MP                              | Maun East                 |
| Hon. P. Majaga, MP                              | Nata-Gweta                |
| Hon. M. I. Moswaane, MP                         | Francistown West          |
| Hon. B. H. Billy, MP                            | Francistown East          |
| Hon. M. R. Shamukuni, MP                        | Chobe                     |
| Hon. B. Arone, MP                               | Okavango                  |
| Hon. M. R. Reatile, MP                          | Specially Elected         |
| Hon. B. J. Kenewendo, MP                        | Specially Elected         |
| <b>OPPOSITION</b>                               |                           |
| <b>(Umbrella for Democratic Change)</b>         |                           |
| Hon. D. G. Boko, MP (Leader of Opposition)      | Gaborone Bonnington North |
| Hon. G. S. M. Mangole, MP                       | Mochudi West              |
| Hon. W. B. Mmolotsi, MP                         | Francistown South         |
| Hon. A. S. Kesupile, MP                         | Kanye South               |
| Hon. N. S. L. M. Salakae, MP                    | Ghanzi North              |
| Hon. Maj. Gen. P. Mokgware, MP                  | Gabane-Mmankodi           |
| Hon. Dr. T. O. M. Mmatli, MP                    | Molepolole South          |
| Hon. S. Ntlhaile, MP                            | Jwaneng -Mabutsane        |
| Hon. M. I. Khan, MP                             | Molepolole North          |
| Hon. H. G. Nkaigwa, MP                          | Gaborone North            |
| Hon. I. J. Davids, MP                           | Mochudi East              |
| Hon. N. N. Gaolathe, MP                         | Gaborone Bonnington South |
| Hon. S. Kgoroba, MP                             | Mogoditshane              |
| Hon. Dr P. Butale, MP                           | Gaborone Central          |
| Hon. Kgosi Lotlamoreng II                       | Goodhope - Mabule         |
| Vacant  | Tlokweng                  |
| <b>(Botswana Congress Party)</b>                |                           |
| Hon. D. L. Keorapetse, MP                       | Selebi Phikwe West        |
| Hon. S. O. S. Rantuana, MP                      | Ramotswa                  |
| <b>(Independent Member of Parliament)</b>       |                           |
| Hon. T. Moremi, MP                              | Maun West                 |

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**  
**SECOND MEETING OF THE THIRD SESSION**  
**OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT**  
**MONDAY 13 FEBRUARY 2017**

*CONTENTS*

*PAGE (S)*

|  |         |
|--|---------|
| <b>QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER</b> .....   | 1 - 9   |
| Appropriation (2017/2018) Bill, 2017 (No. 2 of 2017)<br><i>Second Reading (Resumed Debate)</i> ..... | 10 - 37 |



Monday 13<sup>th</sup> February, 2017

THE ASSEMBLY met at 2:00 p.m.

(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)

PRAYERS

\* \* \* \*

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER

TELEPHONE CONSULTATION OF STAFF IN  
SOME SAFARI CAMPS

**MR M. R. SHAMUKUNI (CHOBE):** asked the Minister of Health and Wellness:-

- i) if she is aware of a practice whereby staff who need medical attention in some Safari Camps in the Chobe National Park and the Okavango Delta are consulted telephonically by company nurses resident in Maun, who prescribe medication to staff through medically untrained camp managers;
- ii) whether such a practice is allowed by the Ministry; and
- iii) if it does not infringe on doctor-patient confidentiality where a third party in the form of a medically untrained manager is involved.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE):** Good afternoon Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker,

- i) I am aware that some staff working in some Safari Camps in the Chobe National Park and Okavango Delta who need medical attention are consulted telephonically by the company nurses resident in Maun, who prescribe medication to staff through medically untrained camp managers. This came to light in August, 2016. The Managing Director of the affected Safari Camps was subsequently contacted in the same month by phone and in writing to warn him to stop this practice as it is in gross violation of medical ethics and against the law. He was advised to identify a registered health personnel qualified and licensed to deliver the services.
- ii) The practice is not allowed by the Ministry as it is unethical and unlawful in violation of patients' rights to privacy and confidentiality. We are currently working with the respective District Health Management Teams (DHMTs) to ensure compliance to warnings given to companies

- iii) The practice does infringe on the doctor-patient confidentiality, where a third party in the form of a medically untrained manager is involved. It is also not allowed for the employer to have access to the health information of the employee.

Thank you.

**MR SHAMUKUNI:** Supplementary. Thank you Honourable Minister for such an elaborate response to my question. A lot of things Minister happen in some of these remote camps in the Chobe National Park and Okavango Delta and I appreciate that you issued a communication that discourages camp managers from doing such a practice. But of course I was there in October 2016...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** It has to be a supplementary question.

**MR SHAMUKUNI:** I was there in October 2016 Honourable Minister and this practice is still continuing. But then in terms of procedure for aggrieved employees...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Shamukuni! What is it with you? I said, supplementary.

**MR SHAMUKUNI:** Okay! Honourable Minister! ... (Laughter!) ... Do you want to talk about the procedure that has to be followed by the employees that are aggrieved by such a practice?

Secondly, what kind of sanctions do you mete out to operators that continue with such practice even after you have issued such a communication that bars them from doing so? Thank you Madam Speaker.

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Madam Speaker, as I have indicated, we have instructed the concerned DHMT to look into the matter. As I have already indicated, we have issued some warning letters. It is a practice that we do not tolerate and I want to assure the Honourable Member that we are going to be putting a very close eye on such a practice. It is completely not acceptable Madam Speaker. Thank you.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Supplementary.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** The last one.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Supplementary. Thank you Honourable Minister for your answer. We are just expecting the same answer because this thing has been going on for a very long time and people have been complaining, even up to the Labour Department but nothing is being done. So can you just explain to this House what actions, indeed just like you said that you



have issued a warning, what actions or possible actions will you take and when can you do that? As we are speaking today, now this issue is still going on, I was from that area last night.

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Well Madam Speaker, as I have already indicated, this came to light in August 2016 and ever since then, some action has been taken. I want to assure this Honourable House that we are really keeping a very close eye on the developments and we will as the leadership of the Ministry go and do our own inspections to ensure that the instructions that we have given are actually adhered to. It is certainly a very unfortunate development Madam Speaker. I thank you.

#### **PROGRESS ON THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE KAZUNGULA BRIDGE AUTHORITY**

**MR M. R. SHAMUKUNI (CHOBE):** asked the Minister of Transport and Communications to update this Honourable House on progress made regarding the establishment of the Kazungula Bridge Authority.

**MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND COMMUNICATIONS (MR MOKAILA):** Good afternoon, Madam Speaker.

Madam Speaker, the two countries Botswana and Zambia are in the process of procuring expertise to develop the Terms of Reference to Develop a Framework to Establish the Kazungula Bridge Authority (KBA). Request for Proposals has been issued to the shortlisted Companies following the completed Expression of Interest exercise, and the deadline for submission is the 27<sup>th</sup> February, 2017. It is expected that once the procurement process has been completed, the process to establish the Authority would begin.

Thank you Madam Speaker.

#### **INCREMENT OF ELECTRICITY TARIFFS AND CONNECTION FEES SINCE APRIL 2008**

**MR D. L. KEORAPETSE (SELEBI PHIKWE WEST):** asked the Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security to state:-

- i) the number of times electricity tariffs and connection fees have increased since April 2008; and
- ii) the amounts and/or percentages.

**ACTING MINISTER OF MINERAL RESOURCES, GREEN TECHNOLOGY AND ENERGY SECURITY (MR MOLEFHI):** Good afternoon, Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Good afternoon sir.

**MR MOLEFHI:** Madam Speaker, the trend of the tariff increase and amounts/percentage since April 2008 is as follows;

#### **ANNEXURE 1**

#### **TARIFF INCREASES FOR THE PREVIOUS YEARS**

| <b>Financial Year</b> | <b>Proposed Increase</b>                          | <b>Increase Awarded</b>                  |
|-----------------------|---|--|
| 2007/2008 (YTD)       | Domestic 15 per cent<br>Other 35.22 per cent      | No Increase                              |
| 2008/09               | 25 per cent Biannual<br>or<br>63 per cent Annual. | Domestic 9 per cent<br>Other 14 per cent |
| 2009/10               | 20 per cent Biannual<br>or<br>63 per cent Annual  | No Increase                              |



**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** You are the one out of order. I am waiting for him to finish and then tell you that you are out of order. Proceed Honourable Minister.

**MR MOLEFHI:**

|         |             |  |
|---------|-------------|--|
| 2010/11 | 55 per cent | Stepped 15 per cent for Domestic (200 Units) and Small Scale Business (500 Units), 30 per cent above for the same categories. 30 per cent for the rest of consumer categories. |
| 2011/12 | 30 per cent | Stepped 15 per cent for Domestic (200 Units) and Small Scale Business (500 Units) 30 per cent above for the same categories. 30 per cent for the rest of consumer categories.  |
| 2012/13 | 30 per cent | 0 per cent   |
| 2013/14 | 16 per cent | Average 10 per cent  |
| 2014/15 | 15 per cent | Average 8.5 per cent   |
| 2015/16 | 15 per cent | 15 per cent  |
| 2016/17 | 15 per cent | 0 per cent   |
| 2017/18 | 12 per cent | Not yet publicised   |

I thank you Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Tawana, take off your hat. What were you saying?

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Supplementary. Honourable Minister, my question is, what was prompting the proposed increases by Botswana Power Corporation (BPC)? What was the main reason for the increase?

**MR MOLEFHI:** Madam Speaker, up until now, the Government has allowed subsidised tariffs. Right now BPC wishes that it could charge prices which are comparable to the costs of generating and buying electricity from other countries. Currently the Government is selling electricity at the cost close to 60 thebe per kilowatt hour even though the Government is generating and buying electricity at the cost close to P1 per kilowatt hour. BPC wishes that electricity consumers could pay tariffs which correlate with the cost of generating and buying electricity.

Those are the plans that BPC has relayed to the Government. The aim of doing that is to extend services. We will recall that in the previous years, the Government initiated standardised connection fee which stemmed from the fact that in the past, individuals used to incur the costs of a transformer when connecting electricity. When the Government initiated the standardised connection fee, it now meant that some of these costs are incurred by Government and we started having subsidised tariffs across the spectrum, both connection and consumption. I thank you Madam Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Supplementary.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** You are out of order, you are not supposed to be there. I cannot allow you to speak whilst you are there. Look for your name. It was announced here how the sitting arrangement has changed.

**MR KGOROBA:** Supplementary. I want to ask the Minister a question but now he is chatting. Honourable Minister, I heard you talking about the tariff at which BPC is selling to the ordinary consumer and the cost to them per kilowatt. Now I want to understand, is the cost of them producing electricity and the cost of them buying electricity from outside still the same? What is the difference between the two? What is the cost of producing it here and at what cost are you buying it from wherever you are buying it from?

**MR MOLEFHI:** Thank you Madam Speaker. We buy electricity from other countries for about P1.20 and it fluctuates. Certain contracts are fixed but that is the average; P1.20 per kilowatt hour of imported energy. Local production is between 95 thebe to about a Pula. I thank you.



**MR NTLHAILE:** Further supplementary. Thank you Madam Speaker. I want the Minister to state the major consumers of electricity in our country given that the electricity is produced at a cost which is between 90 thebe and P1. Minister, do you not think the time has come to review prices for major electricity users?

**MR MOLEFHI:** Thank you Madam Speaker. Electricity use varies. During the day, it is used by industries; mines, industries and commercial activities. Of course during the night mines are active users or consumers. I explained earlier that there is what is termed as stepped tariff structure, which shows you that for you to use 200 units, you need to pay this much, if you are a big business which uses 200 units, you will pay this amount and if you are a small business, you will pay this much. It was a way of making distinctions because electricity consumers; those in homes, industries and mines. That is why Government found it befitting to have an arrangement of differentiating electricity users by tariffs and costs. Thank you.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Madam Speaker...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** I want you to move, you cannot just say "Madam Speaker" while on the space. Move to where your name plaque is.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** I want to ask something Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, you cannot be recorded if you are not in your seat.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, it does not matter even if it is Kgosi.

**KGOSI LOTLAMORENG II:** Madam Speaker, may I ask something. When I came to Parliament, I was given that chair, my name has just disappeared yet I was not informed as to who took it Madam Speaker. I want to know who took my name and why? Thank you Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Yes, you are out of order Kgosi, sit down. Your name is right where you are sitting. It was announced here that sitting arrangement has changed. Maybe you were absent.

**INTERVENTIONS IN PLACE TO ENABLE  
BOTETI WEST COMMUNITIES TO BENEFIT  
FROM CENTRAL KALAHARI GAME RESERVE  
AND MAKGADIKGADI NATIONAL PARK**

**MS B. J. KENEWENDO (SPECIALLY ELECTED):** asked the Minister of Environment, Natural Resources

Conservation and Tourism what interventions have been put in place to enable Boteti West communities to benefit from the two parks surrounding them being the Central Kalahari Game Reserve (CKGR) and the Makgadikgadi National Park.

**MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, NATURAL RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND TOURISM (MR T. S. KHAMA):** Madam Speaker, there are a number of initiatives that have been put in place to facilitate communities neighbouring Protected Areas (PAs) including Boteti West through our Park-Neighbour Programme.

At least nine (9) community trusts have been mobilized through Community Based Natural Resources Management (CBNRM) programme to co-manage and derive livelihoods from natural resources in Boteti. The trusts are engaged in project activities that are mainly tourism related such as development and running of campsites; utilisation of veldt products and other resources like quality clays and water springs, crafts, cultural village, fishing, bird tourism and game ranching.

Recently two (2) projects funded by GEF; being the Northern Botswana Human Wildlife Coexistence Project (NBHWCP); and the Birdlife Botswana Catalysing Sustainability of Protected Areas; Sustainable Financing of National Protected Area Systems have been implemented in the Boteti area and adjacent the CKGR. The NBHWCP has enhanced mitigation of human-wildlife conflict through proactive preventative interventions in these areas. The interventions included chilli pepper fence, bee hive fence, early maturing seeds; herding dogs and predator proof fences. In Boteti West, community members from predominantly Khumaga and Moreomaoto areas also benefitted from the project interventions.

In order to monitor the impact of project interventions for human-wildlife conflicts; Management Oriented Monitoring System (MOMS) has been adopted. To that end, two (2) escort guides from Ngande Community Trust and Moreomaoto Development Trust and six (6) community members (Khumaga and Moreomaoto) have been trained on the concept of MOMS for local level adaptive management.

Furthermore, twenty (20) young people from Boteti West were trained in tourism related skills on Lodge Management, Professional Guide and Junior Hospitality. Most of the youth have already been employed by various tourism enterprises throughout the country.

The Birdlife Botswana project's objective is to improve the financial and operational sustainability of small but biodiversity-rich Protected Areas through enhanced



working partnerships between public, private, Non-Governmental Organisations (NGO) and community stakeholders. It is anticipated that the project will develop bird tourism in the area and will open up opportunities for neighbouring communities of Mmatshumo, Mosu, Mokubilo and Mmeya. The project has capacitated communities through provision of equipment and governance skills to meaningfully participate in the tourism industry. I thank you Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER (MS KOKORWE):** Order! There is noise.

**MS KENEWENDO:** Supplementary. Thank you Madam Speaker, thank you Mr Minister. Do you have any numbers of people that have benefited from these programmes? Also, what is the status of any economic activity programmes in the areas? I know you mentioned several GEF programmes, but in particular those that are employment creative. Thank you.

**MR T.S. KHAMA:** Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I do not have the numbers with me right now unfortunately, but I can make those available. Interesting enough, on the issue of the sustainability of the ongoing projects, we have noticed that subject to when the water had depleted, there was a disbursement of initiatives from those areas, and we have subsequently remodeled what we are offering to keep them sustained, and therefore we should not have any loss of programmes as we go forward. To this end, we have also included two more additional camp sites on the Boteti Riverside and we are looking at three or four more camp sites on the wildlife management area. Thank you Madam Speaker

**MR MOREMI:** Madam Speaker, you should go and mourn your son.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Tawana, I am not going to allow you to abuse me. You get out! Can you please take him out.

**MR NTLHAILE:** Supplementary.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No wait a minute, can you please take him out.

**MR MOREMI:** Go and mourn your son.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Tell him to leave, he may not be well, he is out of his mind.

**MR NTLHAILE:** Supplementary. Thank you for your response. Since we do not have the tourism industry in Boteti West only but across the country, do you have a policy in place which accords Batswana the benefits that are brought by tourism and do they have any input on the activities that are taking place in their areas? Are they involved?

**MR T.S. KHAMA:** Thank you Madam Speaker, thank you Honourable Member of Parliament. Madam Speaker, we are currently working on the revised Tourism Policy which takes into account the very issues which have been mentioned here. One of the issues of the Tourism Policy is how the particular communities would benefit more directly from the tourism activities that are taking place already. We have in excess of I think it is 312 CBNRMs roughly registered in the country majority of which are in the North West region. Once that policy is concluded of which CBNRMs are part of and form a very intergroup part of them, we will then be able to rollout even further participation where possible for communities to benefit and participate in the tourism in that particular area appropriate for that particular area and that type of tourism.

At the moment Madam Speaker, our belief is that some of the models that we perceive to have been successful in Botswana may not be relevant to some marginal areas. Thank you Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Rantwana is not sitting in his allocated seat.

#### AMOUNT OF MONEY USED IN DEFENCE AND SECURITY SPENDING

**MR D. L. KEORAPETSE (SELEBI PHIKWE WEST):** asked the Minister of Finance and Economic Development to state the following for the National Development Plans (NDP) 9 and 10 periods where applicable:-

- i) the amount of money in Pula terms and as percentages of GDP Botswana used in Defence and Security spending in general for the two planning periods;
- ii) the amount of money in Pula terms and as percentages of GDP Botswana used in military spending in general for the two planning periods;
- iii) the amount of money in Pula terms and as percentages of GDP Botswana used in intelligence services spending for the two planning periods; and,
- iv) to compare the aforesaid spending with United Kingdom, United States of America and France.

**MR RANTUANA:** Madam Speaker, what were you saying?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, you know where you are supposed to sit, an announcement was made in this House, if you are not going to sit where you are supposed to sit...



**MR RANTUANA:** Madam Speaker, I have to be consulted.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** You cannot speak while you are still there.

**MR RANTUANA:** Madam Speaker, can you please listen to me.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No the arrangement was changed.

**MR RANTUANA:** No I have been here all along.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, Clerk can you explain it.

**MR RANTUANA:** Madam Speaker, you are supposed to consult us when such things happen.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** You were consulted.

**MR RANTUANA:** I am not a school child, I cannot be instructed anyhow.

**MADAM CLERK (MS DITHAPO):** An announcement was made in the House to the effect that there has been a change in the sitting arrangement after consultation with leaders of political parties in the House.

**MR RANTUANA:** Consultation with who?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** We were not consulted.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** What have you applied on your chairs that makes you refuse to relocate from them?

**MR RANTUANA:** You are supposed to treat us with seriousness.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MS TSHIRELETSO):** On a point of order. Madam Speaker, this House is out of order. The first day, you informed us that you have consulted with our political party leaders about the new developments which we happened to hear for the first time together with the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC) that Honourable Tawana has defected from the UDC and therefore allocated a new sit. Now I fail to understand what they have done over the weekend that has made them to change their minds after such a long time. I am not referring to Kgosi, I mean my colleague *makgorwane*.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Everyone should take their seats and move with it.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Or they should use their own chairs because these ones are Parliament property. Go and sit next to Honourable Keorapetse.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** They say they have performed some rituals on those chairs and it is none of our business. Honourable Keorapetse, did you ask your question?

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Yes Madam.

**MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT (MR MATAMBO):** Thank you Madam Speaker.

- i) Madam Speaker, the total amount of money used on Defence and Security together during NDP 9 was P15.56 billion whilst P36.77 billion was used in NDP 10 which translates to 4.32 per cent and 3.78 per cent of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) respectively.
- ii) Out of the total amount of money that I have just stated, the amount of military expenditure alone during NDP 9 was P9.89 billion or 2.75 per cent of GDP and in NDP 10 the amount was P21.26 billion or 2.18 per cent of GDP.
- iii) Madam Speaker, regarding intelligence services, a total of P274.46 million was spent during NDP 9 which was 0.08 per cent of GDP and a sum of P2.34 billion was spent in NDP 10 which is 0.24 per cent of GDP.
- iv) Madam Speaker, the aforesaid spending cannot be compared with that of the United Kingdom nor United States of America nor France because these countries use different variables for similar types of computations. I thank you Madam Speaker.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Supplementary. Honourable Minister, would you say this Defence and Security expenditure is in line with an assessment of security threats, in the sense that analysts have continuously said what Botswana faces in terms of security threats are unconventional threats or human security threats like poverty, unemployment, inequalities, diseases, pandemics etcetera.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** He is not on his seat Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, he is at his seat; I had told him that otherwise he cannot ask a question.

**MR MATAMBO:** Madam Speaker, with regard to the supplementary question just raised I think I should indicate that perhaps our Minister responsible for



Defence, Security and Intelligence would have been the better person to answer that question. Be that as it may, I venture to say that in our circumstances, this expenditure was considered to be necessary. It is neither too big nor too small but as it turns out in all countries there are always differences of opinion between those who are ruling and those who are making other analysis elsewhere but without the responsibility to rule and provide defence for a country. I thank you.

**MR KEORAPETSE:** Further supplementary. Are you satisfied with the value for money? I will give an example of the procurement of the SK105 tanks in 1998 which were obsolete and could not meet armoured regiments requirements and there are numerous other expenditures which are questionable value for money, are you satisfied about value for money?

**MR MATAMBO:** I repeat Madam Speaker to say that these supplementary questions should be directed to the rightful Minister who knows the equipment you are talking about better than I am able to. I thank you.

#### **NUMBER OF CLINICS OPERATING WITHOUT DEDICATED VEHICLES**

**MR M. REATILE (SPECIALLY ELECTED):** asked the Minister of Health and Wellness to state:-

- i) the number of clinics which are operating without dedicated vehicles in Moshupa, Kanye, Goodhope, Mabutsane and Jwaneng;
- ii) the number of drivers who are at various stations without vehicles and to provide the names of these stations; and
- iii) how long they have been stationed there without vehicles.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Madam Speaker! Madam Speaker!

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** It is not wrong. It is up to you.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Rantuana out! Take him out.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Get out, you are not asking. Take him out, he is wasting our time.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Take him. It is either you move to this chair or you go out.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Rantuana, go out.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE):** Thank you Madam Speaker.

Madam Speaker,

- i) Moshupa District Health Management Team has five (5) clinics and 3 clinics are operating without vehicles. Kanye DHMT has eight (8) clinics and only two clinics have no vehicles. Goodhope has 9 clinics and all have been allocated vehicles. Mabutsane has 9 clinics and all have been allocated vehicles. Jwaneng DHMT has 10 clinics and only 3 are without vehicles.
- ii) Madam Speaker, the Ministry is implementing a transport pooling system. Vehicles are not assigned to drivers but rather allocated as and when transport is needed hence it is not unusual to have more drivers than vehicles. Thank you.

#### **ACCESS TO POTABLE WATER BY BOTETI SOUTHERN CLUSTER**

**MS B. J. KENEWENDO (SPECIALLY ELECTED):** asked the Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services when the Boteti Southern Cluster (comprising Mokoboxane, Mopipi, Kedia, Xhumo, Toromoja, Mmadikola, Rakops and Xere) will have full access to potable water given that this was planned for in the National Development Plan (NDP) 10.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LAND MANAGEMENT, WATER AND SANITATION SERVICES (MR MOIPISE):** Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, the Boteti Southern and Central Cluster villages water supply project comprising of Mokoboxane, Mopipi, Kedia, Xhumo, Toromoja, Mmadikola, Rakops and Xere is a subject of the ongoing negotiations that Government is pursuing with the World Bank Group for funding. These negotiations are part of the strategy for funding of some critical projects as planned for in the NDP 11.

The design review which was necessary as a pre-requisite for the construction has been concluded and preparations for the procurement of a contractor is underway with a view that the project can be advanced to construction during the current year (2017) after securing the funds needed for construction. The construction is estimated to take a period of 24 months and the project will be completed in mid-2019. I thank you Madam Speaker.



**NUMBER OF PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP (PPP) PROJECTS UNDERTAKEN BY THE GABORONE CITY COUNCIL SINCE 2010**

**MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** asked the Minister of Local Government and Rural Development:-

- i) how many Public Private Partnership (PPP) projects have been undertaken by the Gaborone City Council (GCC) since 2010;
- ii) to state these projects and how much income is received monthly and yearly from each of them;
- iii) what is delaying GCC in undertaking PPP projects;
- iv) what his Ministry is doing to ensure value creation through PPP in the city; and
- v) what PPP projects are envisaged in Gaborone and when they are likely to be implemented.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN):** Thank you Madam Speaker.

- i) Madam Speaker, since 2010 Gaborone City Council has had one Public Private Partnerships (PPP) projects. The partnership is with a local company for development of Plots 2112, 2113 and 2114 situated in Bontleng residential neighbourhood.
- ii) No income has been received from this project as the development has not yet started. The private sector party has submitted plans for consideration of a mixed use development.
- iii) Madam Speaker, there are no PPP projects that GCC has delayed to undertake as a deliberate and conscious decision has been taken to approach PPP projects with caution to avoid going into agreements that may unduly expose either Government or Gaborone City Council.
- iv) GCC has prioritized two (2) plots envisaged to be developed through PPP being;
  - Mixed use development of Civic Centre Plot (Plot 330 and reminder of plot 329)
  - Development of a mixed use Transport oriented hub on plot 17983 and plot 14379.

Expressions of interests have already been closed and the best evaluated submissions have been shortlisted for further engagement with a view to soliciting bids

for detailed project proposals. It is anticipated that the detailed development proposals would have been submitted and perused by the end of the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of 2017/18 after which time it will then be possible to generate definitive implementation timeliness.

In terms of value creation through PPP, my Ministry engages the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development as the latter has a PPP unit responsible for overall coordination, monitoring of PPP Policy and projects and provision of technical assistance to Ministries.

I thank you.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Supplementary. Thank you Madam Speaker. Thank you Honourable Minister. Minister do you not find it embarrassing for you to be saying that the first city of this country has not availed an opportunity to the private sector to undertake into the city to ensure that indeed your cry as Government that there is no money can be addressed by the private sector participating into its economic development?

**MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN:** Madam Speaker, I cannot say that we should be ashamed that we do not have the public involved in the city's projects. What I can say is that the city council is busy trying to involve the public in these projects and it is an ongoing process.

**MR NTLHAILE:** Supplementary. Minister, could you explain to this House if at all your Government has a detailed comprehensive plan of how the PPP will be rolled out so that Batswana could get a better understanding of it. Batswana have been waiting for it but they have not seen anything to suggest that it is happening and that is happening countrywide. Do you have a plan in place of how you are going to implement it?

**MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN:** I have, Madam Speaker, indicated, even mentioned the plots that have been identified. For example; Gaborone City Council is planning to go into the PPP with the private sector.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Supplementary. Thank you so much Madam Speaker. I just want to hear from you Minister; the Public Private Partnership Policy was adopted by this Parliament, I think way back in 2009, are you saying that since 2009 only one project was achieved in your Ministry or with Gaborone City Council? If so, is this not a sign of being half-hearted in terms of your commitment to this?

**MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN:** Madam Speaker, in my response I have said that PPP projects are approached with caution to avoid going into agreements that may unduly expose either Government or Gaborone City Council.



**UPDATE ON THE INCREASE OF WATER TARIFFS AND CONNECTION FEES SINCE 2008**

**MR D. L. KEORAPETSE (SELEBI PHIKWE WEST):** asked the Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services to state:-

- (i) the number of times water tariffs and connection fees have increased since April 2008; and
- (ii) the amounts and/or percentages.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LAND MANAGEMENT, WATER AND SANITATION SERVICES (MR MOIPISI):** Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker,

- i) Since 2008, potable water connection fees were reviewed in 2015 while water tariffs were reviewed two times.
- ii) Currently, Water Utilities Corporation provides water at a standard rate up to 50 metres for P2, 000.00 which includes the corporation digging the trenches and P1, 500.00 where the customers dig trenches for themselves. This was an increase from the original P840.00 with no option of self-trenching. As for potable water tariffs, Madam Speaker, the tariffs were increased as follows since 2008:
  - 10 percent in 2012;
  - 15 percent in 2013; and

Notwithstanding the above, the tariff will increase by 25 percent for Government and 15 percent for domestic and business effective from 1<sup>st</sup> April 2017.

I thank you.

**MONITORING OF PROJECTS FUNDED UNDER THE POVERTY ERADICATION PROGRAMME**

**MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** asked the Minister for Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration:-

- (i) how projects funded under the Poverty Eradication Programme are monitored;
- (ii) how many are currently performing well per district;
- (iii) how many have collapsed per district and the reasons thereof; and
- (iv) how many beneficiaries in (iii) have been assisted to resuscitate their businesses.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS, GOVERNANCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR KWEREPE):** Madam Speaker, good afternoon.

- (i) Monitoring of projects funded under the Poverty Eradication Programme is done at district level by implementing Departments in collaboration with the District Development Committees under the guidance of the District Commissioners. The success of this programme requires full participation of the district leadership; including but not limited to District Agricultural Coordinators, Tribal Authorities, Council Secretaries, Chief Community Development Officers, Home Economic Officers, Gender Officers, Chiefs, Councillors and Land Board Secretaries, Village Development Committees, CBO's. The Village extension Teams (VET's), form part of the monitoring team and give feedback to District reporting structure. Such arrangement is crucial to ensure that individual household performance tracking is done as this forms a basis for assessments to determine appropriate intervention if need be.

- (ii) Madam Speaker, the total number of projects that are currently performing well are eighteen thousand one hundred and thirty five (18 135) and out of these one thousand two hundred and seven (1207) projects are excelling.

- (iii) Madam Speaker, a total of nine hundred and twenty nine (929) projects have collapsed across all the districts. Some of these projects collapsed because of various reasons which include among others; shortage of water, unaffordable water bills, lack of commitment on the part of beneficiaries, lack of intensive entrepreneurial skills among beneficiaries resulting in challenges of effectively marketing their products, market saturation of some packages and poor mentoring of beneficiaries.

- (iv) Madam Speaker, a total of one hundred and twenty-six (126) beneficiaries whose projects had collapsed were assisted to resuscitate their businesses. Most of those assisted were Agricultural projects that collapsed due to circumstances beyond beneficiaries control such as an outbreak of diseases. In other instances beneficiaries are assisted to resuscitate and sustain their projects through psycho-social support services given to them during mentoring visits.

I thank you, Madam Speaker.



APPROPRIATION (2017/2018) BILL,  
2017 (NO. 2 OF 2017)

Second Reading  
(Resumed Debate)

**MR SPEAKER:** I am informed that when the House lost quorum last week Thursday Honourable Guma was still on the floor debating and was left with 27 minutes.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Point of order. Thank you Madam Speaker. I was not prepared to stand up or rise on any point of order, but I am rather disturbed by the way Members of Parliament, especially on the opposition are being treated in this Parliament. Of course Madam Speaker, you announced on Monday that there are changes due to Honourable Tawana's situation, but something which is surprising is that you said you have been in consultation with the leadership of the opposition concerning the sitting arrangement here in this House, but we did ask, they were all surprised like us.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Really!

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Yes, now I am rather surprised because if you are going to stand there as the Speaker of the Assembly...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Why can you not ask me first so that I explain?

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Okay Madam Speaker, can you just explain then, maybe you want me to follow after. I do not have a problem with that Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Yes, but that is not point of order like somebody is saying, let me clarify it by saying it happened here this afternoon. I consulted just like it is stated in the Standing Order, I did consult. I consulted Leader of the House who is the Leader of the governing party; I consulted Honourable Boko who is the Leader of Opposition. There is only one (1) Leader of the Opposition in this House, so I consulted those two (2). That is what I did. From there we changed...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, it is not a Point of Order. I do not know if you still want to say something and please do not be long because I was just giving you a favour; it is not a Point of Order.

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Yes Madam Speaker. I do not negate that, usually when there is a change in sitting arrangement, you inform us at the General Assembly, but...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Okay, he is there, he can just speak for himself, but you did not inform him that there is going to be change in the sitting arrangement and he is there.

**LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (MR BOKO):** Elucidation. Thank you very much Madam Speaker. Maybe the problem is the extent perhaps of whatever consultation has to take place. My recollection is that the Speaker did inform me of a development in relation to Member of Parliament Tawana and that is what I was advised on and I had absolutely no control over the matter. In terms of the detailed implications thereof, I have absolutely no idea what it meant in terms of a sitting arrangement and what the extent of a consultation should have been in that regard. I cannot claim any knowledge. What I do know is I was advised of a development in relation to Honourable Tawana and that was basically the extent of my involvement and consultation. Thank you.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Okay, you may sit down. Do not address side remarks. Standing Order 41.1, "Every Member shall have a seat reserved for him or her by the Clerk. The seats shall be arranged in such a manner as may be decided by the Speaker, after consultation with the leaders of the parties represented in the Assembly." So, that is what I did.

**MR BOKO:** Elucidation. My understanding of a Standing Order is that in relation to the sitting arrangement, the extent of the consultation, it seems to involve some detail as to who is going to sit where exactly so that such detail is then discussed with the Leader of the Opposition and in this case, I do not think it was malicious on your part. I would be remiss to impute any malice but I think the import of the Standing Order is that there must be some fairly detailed discussion on the sitting arrangement which in my humble view did not occur. So as I say, it was not anything malicious on your part. It was probably the way you understood the Standing Order, but the full import of the Standing Order seems to be that the discussion or the consultation must disclose who is going to sit where and even if you will, a diagrammatic or pictorial representation of the seats so that that is disclosed to the Leader of the Opposition. That is all I wanted to say.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** I thank you. It is true; this thing must be given to you. When we had a conversation this is what I said to you "I tried convincing him that this shall be announced tomorrow." We were told at 12 by Honourable Tawana that he no longer wants to sit next to the members of the Umbrella for Democratic



Change (UDC), we then suggested that we make the announcement the following day. Like you said, in future, we will make sure that the Clerk gives you the copy of the sitting arrangement. Thank you Honourable Member. Let us proceed Honourable Members.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, I am not going to allow Point of Order anymore. We proceed.

**MR GUMA (TATI EAST):** Madam Speaker, thank you very much. When the House adjourned, I was still talking about the review of taxes as it is said by the Minister. My understanding was that the Minister never said there was going to be an increase in taxes. What he said was that there is going to be a review in the tax administration because it is long overdue. As you may be aware that the Botswana Unified Revenue Service (BURS) was a department within the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, then it was formulated to be a parastatal. So when it was still a department, there was an accounting environment under which it was operating which is the current Government accounting environment, which is based on cash accounting. Now cash accounting purely looks at issues from cash that has been received, it does not talk about issues that could be accrued, and then at some point in time you sit with the situation where you do not know how much you are being owed quantum. So there is then a need for BURS or the Ministry to review its tax administration so that they have a clear database of where they are collecting their taxes. Currently the system as we have right now, even if you look at the financial statements, the amount outstanding currently is sitting at P1, 8 billion and that P1, 8 billion is not part of the balance sheet; is sitting as an annexe and the bulk of that amount is basically penalties and interests and there is a need basically for the Minister to look at other areas. Honourable Boko will agree with me, there is a concept in law called the in duplum rule that at no point the interest should never exceed capital. So the bulk of the amounts that are due, outstanding is as a result of interests and penalties. The truth of the matter is that, what then is the capital amount? So you can have a situation where you say the Botswana Unified Revenue Service (BURS) has reached its targeted amount of collections when in actual fact the bulk of it is penalties. Let us assume that there is no interest and there are no penalties, are we really having the actual real collections?

**MR BOKO:** On a point of clarification. Thank you very much Member of Parliament, Honourable Moyo. The Minister in his reference to there being a tax review does not rule out, in fact just the use of the word review seems to admit of a possibility of increase in taxes and

the approach that you take seems to be that there is an understanding that there will be no such increase. I want the Minister if he can come here and provide the clarification. When you said review, it is very relevant because he is making several points in relation to what you said. Your conception of review does not exclude increase in taxes, does it? If it does, please say so now, commit yourself to a no increase, so that we debate on an understanding that your review does not entail any increase. If anything, it may result in reductions. Let us hear it from the horse's mouth so that you assist the debate and direct it properly as the Honourable Member who is on the floor makes his submission.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** You are ready Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development?

**MR GUMA:** On a point of procedure Madam Speaker, it does not work that way, I am holding the floor. There is no issue that the Minister can..., he will do that when he is actually responding.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Are you yielding for him?

**MR GUMA:** Madam Speaker, what should happen basically is that I need to proceed then he can come in and elucidate.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** I know, Honourable Minister, please proceed.

**MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT (MR MATAMBO):** On a point of elucidation. Thank you very much, I will try to be brief because I will have yet another opportunity to respond. Honourable Boko is correct when he says that he understands my statement to be saying the Ministry is going to review, that is correct, that is what the statement says. He is also correct I should say, being honest that review does not necessarily exclude the possibility of an increase, he is correct. However, what is not correct is what some Members of Parliament have been saying up until now since my statement where they say the Minister has said that he is going to increase taxes, the Minister has not said that, nowhere in the speech is it so indicated. So I hope it is clear that review does not necessarily mean increase is excluded, on the other hand I have not said at the point in time I read the speech, and up to this moment, because I may review and not increase, that also is true Honourable Boko. I may review and not increase, that also is correct. So do not prejudge, please all of you do not prejudge what the result of my review is going to be. Thank you Madam Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Further clarification.



**MR GUMA:** I am holding the floor, can I? If you look at the minutes that I have, let me just develop the point then you can...

Madam Speaker, the review is important because it is critical. When taxes are charged on income derived or perceive that you are going to receive certain income, the environment on which you are going to be collecting taxes needs to be watertight, including the review of the legislation itself. Like I was saying before that, if you then look into the financials themselves here, the bulk of the amount outstanding is basically interest and penalties which is legal; it is a legalistic issue. Again when you are just really collecting on the basis of law not on the basis that there has been any amount really owing, you are really operating within some academic exercises because the income really has not been derived. You may end up even crippling the industry and businesses purely on issues of law. So what should be collected is what has been earned. Then where penalties are there, there should not be draconian to the extent of destroying the accounting and the business environment. So the whole legislation as it stands right now seems to be basically rushing to say, 'I need to collect.' Even the target that you see coming in here, they are really not based on historical information to say last year we collected X therefore this year we need to collect X, and then when we look into the books, the bulk of it is charge them interests and penalties. You need to look into the tax regime carefully.

When you then look into it, you also need to look at it within the performance of the economy itself. My suggestion Minister is that there is need for you to also look into taxing companies that are getting cash on a daily basis on revenue. You can do that by dropping their tax rate and getting your cash but it is a subject matter of playing the game. The critical thing really is that the Minister must have cash. The advantages of charging taxes on revenue is that you get it just like you are getting Value Added Tax (VAT). The one that you are charging on net profit is that there is usually tax manipulation and tax evasion at times.

Also the Minister must actually review very carefully the issue of transfer prices; so the entire data management system must be looked into very carefully.

There is a lot that is happening in the borders; the issue that you need to look into is the Customs. There is a lot that is under declared that comes into this country. I am just trying to buttress this Minister that the review is necessary.

Now given that you may come out with the review and come to say look, in actual fairness, the total projected

income that I am supposed to be getting is far lower than the expenditure that I am going to be getting. The expenditure is X, it is higher than the revenue itself, you even look at the increase component at various levels; there is nothing wrong with that. I think in Southern Africa we have got the lowest, it must be understood that taxes is a compulsory payment for which there is no direct benefit, it is important. We cannot demand services ourselves and not even start thinking about where are going to get the money to pay for those services. We cannot be talking about free education and free health facilities without any income coming. There is a need for us to talk about this and then it should be factual. We cannot even talk about review of the salary structures without looking at where the income base is coming from. The basis must actually be unpacked and understood.

**MR KGOROBA:** Clarification. Thank you. It is unfortunate that you are asking us to indicate where the money would be coming from. When the Minister spoke about poverty eradication, he did not illustrate as to how he is going to do it.

**MR GUMA:** I am just talking about tax issues sir. I am trying to elaborate on that. Let me stop that far on this one and then go to the second point.

Minister, where we need to commend you even though it came late, is the introduction of, I do not like to call it the Constituency Fund because it is not going to be managed by the constituencies. It is part and parcel of the budgetary process. It is your increase within the Local Government and Rural Development. People at Local Government and Rural Development have to make sure that they can actually on their own, sit and have discussions amongst themselves and take ownership of the development agenda, create employment and even attend to issues of maintenance. If you then look at it, let me put it very clear, we discussed this matter as a ruling Government. It was discussed very carefully and we need to talk about it because we are in Government.

The fallacy that some Ministers and Members of Parliament have been talking about it before is correct. What happens is that 15 days before the Minister makes his speech, the Standing Order says he must table the financials before us and once the draft financial estimates have been tabled, they are public. That becomes your budget preparations statements for your deliberations. That is what we are discussing.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Clarification. I just wanted you to help me understand here, the P10 million, we first heard about it way before the estimates were tabled, that is another one.



I also want you to help me understand, is this an investment fund because I heard some saying they are going to purchase brick making machines and trucks? What is this? Is it an investment fund or a development fund?

**MR GUMA:** The fact of the matter is that as we are sitting right now, you must be looking at what the accounts are saying. The truth of the matter is that unless you want to lose the boat, you are going to lose it. These funds are sitting at the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development. They will be going through the Councils and the Councils are going to be sitting and determining exactly the priorities in their own areas. So, it is important and incumbent on all of us to be part and parcel of the development agenda. There is no fund coming to your constituency office. You have no control and they are going to be audited procedurally like any other accounting. So, it is going to come like that.

What it means is that the fund for the Local Government and Rural Development has been increased. It is critical for us now to have discussions with our Local Authorities and participate and take everybody on board. What is interesting basically is that if you plan it across the National Development Plan (NDP) 11, it has a huge impact on the employment generation on areas. Just look at it and do not even lose the boat, seriously. There is a need for us at our constituency levels, at our local levels to take charge of the development agenda and this fund really helps. What we did in our constituency for instance, when we sat to unpack it, we then found out that P10 million allocated really covered most of the maintenance issues in our area. The question we asked ourselves was that, had we been given the opportunity right at the beginning to take part in the budgetary process, we would have been far. I am urging you Members of Parliament to take advantage of this.

The truth of the matter is that this money is not coming to our offices, we are not even there. There is no change in the administration of funding. It is there with the Minister. It is the fund that is going to be given straight ... (interruptions)...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR GUMA:** Sir, please, you will have your opportunity to speak. I am just saying Minister, we appreciate this initiative and it must be seen. What is important again and to buttress this point is that there has been no increase in the expenditure. What has happened basically is that we have made adjustments in the total budget. There has been no increase in the total National Development Plan 11. There has been prioritisation of projects and this point must actually be put clear. In

terms of the projections as the Minister has had, which he tabled before us at NDP 11, there has been no change. All what he did was, he prioritised projects. I thought it was important that this particular point must be put very clear. Somebody should not be thinking that we have gone ahead and increased the NDP 11 by an extra P3 billion, we have not. Madam Speaker, I rest my case. Thank you.

**MR NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):** Let me thank you Madam Speaker for affording me an opportunity to also stand and deliberate on the budget proposal as presented by the Minister of Finance and Economic Development.

Firstly, let me acknowledge the Creator, God Almighty for presenting this opportunity to me and also for giving me a voice again this afternoon to stand before my peers, Honourable Members of Parliament and deliberate on the National Budget.

Let me also thank God for giving us a newly born baby, a newly Umbrella, the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC) that has embraced the Botswana Congress Party (BCP), a party that God has ordained and declared that in 2019, it shall be a new Government.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Applause!)...

**MR NKAIGWA:** It is very clear Members of Parliament, that God is not happy with the leadership of the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) and it is very clear that God is still going to award to our nation, to ensure that victory is certain for the Umbrella for Democratic Change in 2019.

I want to assure you my President, Honourable Ndaba Gaolathe, that it would not come up easily. Anything that is from God is bound to face trials and tribulations but the reality is that our faith shall be established and the will of God shall be accomplished. I stand this afternoon to declare and decree the will of God upon this nation, that indeed his will shall be established.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MR NKAIGWA:** I know. One thing that worries me a lot is that, we are living in a country that is said to be a rich; a million income country but when you look at the lives of the people living in this nation, it does not resemble in their lives. Many of our Batswana including Members of Parliament are so poor. Before a month ends, many of us will not be having even an income to spend; we will be waiting for month end to come so that we can have an income. When you look at the economy of this country, the realities, the economy of this country is in the hands of naturalised Indians. It is not a secret,



it is a reality, and it is only us Batswana who can bring back the economy to the hands of Batswana if indeed we can trust that other Batswana have the capability to drive the economy of this country.

I think His Honour, the President if he was here, he will testify to what I am saying. I have even mentioned in the last debates that it is very unfortunate that Indians are currently funding His Honour the Vice President to push the campaign of the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) and also to push his own personal campaign towards 2019. This is unfortunate that if indeed it was to happen, if the devil's wish was to come to reality that he becomes the President of this country, it is clear that he will be under the control of Indians and poor Batswana will continue to suffer out of their country, out of our own country that we so love so much. I wish that one day Honourable Members of Parliament, we can believe and have confidence on fellow Batswana that indeed we have what it takes to also run profitable businesses that will create employment opportunities and reserve certain businesses for our own Batswana knowing very well that indeed it does not take anything to run a restaurant, a retailer, a farm project and it does not take anything to run a restaurant.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Who is asking for a point of order?

**MINISTER OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND FOOD SECURITY (MR RALOTSIA):** Madam Speaker, I do not think the House can be regarded to be in order when Honourable Nkaigwa is making such serious allegations on His Honour, the Vice President, unless he provides us with evidence that indeed he knows His Honour the Vice President's dealings with the alleged naturalised Indians.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Nkaigwa you are being a tribalist by saying that. If the people that you are talking about were listening they would probably also like you to produce some evidence that they will indeed use the man in question. Please make sure you debate without offending other people. What you are doing is wrong; that is what is referred to as imputing improper motives, because you have not produced any evidence.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Madam Speaker, it is very unfortunate that we have Honourable Members of Parliament, Honourable Ministers who do not listen when Members speak. In the last sitting of this Parliament, I said the same thing in front of His Honour the Vice President, and he never disputed it. I wonder what is going to the head of the Honourable Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security to say what I am saying

I need to present evidence to that effect when it is very clear that this country has been mortgaged to naturalised Indians and they are the ones who are controlling the economy of this country. I am telling you.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Member, they would not like you to talk about them in that manner.

**MR NKAIGWA:** It is not up to them to like it.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, it is not right to .... (Interruption) ...

**MR NKAIGWA:** I have never said I want them to like it Madam Speaker, from me it is okay because it is coming deep down from the bottom of my heart and from my spirit.

Madam Speaker, immorality has rocked this nation, and it needs to be condemned. People are getting positions of power because of sexual immorality, because of sexual favours, be it in Government, in parastatals, and this needs to be condemned. This is why we are failing as a nation. It is because people are holding higher positions of power in Government and in parastatals. Some ... (Interruptions)... really they deserve to be ....

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Mokgware. I am sorry to say Mokgware. Honourable Ralotsia.

**MR RALOTSIA:** Point of order! Are you saying I look like Honourable Mokgware Madam Speaker?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, I was reading something from him. I am sorry.

**MR RALOTSIA:** Thank you very much. Madam Speaker, I insist that the Honourable Member there must provide us with sufficient evidence that indeed His Honour the Vice President has dealings with some called "naturalised citizen", to use his words.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Nkaigwa, what you are saying is wrong. You are imputing improper motives. Produce evidence to prove that indeed he has some dealings with the said people as well as the kind of dealings they do, then I will let you debate; but if you are not going to produce any evidence, you should withdraw your statements.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Madam Speaker, I made it very clear that the same sentiments I said them in the last debate in this Parliament, and His Honour the Vice President was here and he never disputed it.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** I have no evidence of that.

**MR NKAIGWA:** You go get the ... (Interruption) .... because same words that I am referring to are the same



words that I said in the last debate in this Parliament. If you can take the old Hansard, the last Hansard of the last Parliament, the same words were mentioned in the presence of His Honour the Vice President, and he never disputed it because he knows his deals with naturalised Indians. I know at the end of the day the truth shall set me free, and even Honourable Minister knows that what I am telling this Parliament is actually true.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** I am not aware of this therefore I need evidence; otherwise withdraw.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Madam Speaker, I do have young people in my constituency who were actually recruited from the opposition by His Honour the Vice President, and they are currently salaried and paid accommodation for, and you can ask yourself, if His Honour the Vice President his only salary just like us as Members of Parliament, where is he getting all this income that he is using to pay Members of Opposition salaries each and every month and accommodation fees and even money for girlfriends and boyfriends. Where is he getting all this money?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Are you saying they are naturalised Indians?

**MR NKAIGWA:** Yes! It is true.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Give us a name of at least one of them.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Anyone who has a problem with that can go ...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Give us a name Honourable. We need evidence. Give us a name then you can continue with your debate.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Madam Speaker, you said we should not mention names in this Parliament. If you want me to come out with the names, I can come out with the names, but I did not want to mention names but reality is that there are groups of Indians that are currently working for His Honour the Vice President mobilising resources for him. If you want the Vice President to be investigated, you should investigate it and the truth shall come out on what is actually prevailing in our nation.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** I need some evidence; give me a name.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Madam Speaker I cannot give out names. I mean really...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** If you cannot say names in this house, you should stop talking about this matter and you can later bring the names to my office, then I will tell them that you were right.

**MR NKAIGWA:** I said let us look at the Hansard; the past Hansard of the past Parliament, the past sitting. I did mention the same sentiments in the presence of His Honour the Vice President and there was no dispute from him. I do not understand what is it that is unsettling the Honourable Minister while the person concerned was never bothered by this issue.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** He is unsettled. Stop talking about that matter and will check the Hansard and you will also bring the names to my office.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Amen.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Okay!

**DR P. BUTALE:** On a point of order. Thank you Madam Speaker. May be this can help, one day when I was watching television I once saw people from the nationality the Honourable Member is talking about donating vehicles to His Honour the Vice President, at his victory celebration. I think this should help us to figure out where this is going.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, it is not helping us in any way because we do not know the reasons why they were donating to him. Any Motswana can also donate; these people whom we are talking about are actually Batswana by the way. Any Motswana can do that, so what you have said is not solving anything.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Madam Speaker. I want to say to Honourable Boko, Honourable Gaolathe, Honourable Saleshando and Honourable Molapisi that the project that you have undertaken, the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC), is not your project. It is the people's project. It is the will of God, and it is in the mind of God. Therefore, whatever battles that you would be faced with are not yours. Those battles belong to God Almighty and He shall fight for you.

**MINISTER OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND FOOD SECURITY (MR RALOTSIA):** On a point of order. Madam Speaker, if you allow Honourable Nkaigwa to continue with what he is saying, it is not good for us because he is being racist.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Order! No, Honourable Ralotsia, I have requested Honourable Nkaigwa to drift away from that such discourse because he has not given us evidence yet. If you can get the evidence bring it to the office.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** I did not ask him to withdraw because he said there is a Hansard which shows that he



once uttered such a statement before the Vice President (VP), I also wanted to look at it. I have made a request to the Clerk that they should find it.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Madam Speaker for protecting me, for protecting the voice of the people and the voice of God. Madam Speaker, I wonder what reasons the Minister of Finance...

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE):** On a point of procedure. Thank you Madam Speaker. I wanted to know that when the Hansard is retrieved, and it indeed shows that he spoke like that on that day, how are you going to know that His Honour the Vice President was there at that particular moment?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** We will check. Those who were present on that day will tell me. We also have an attendance list which shows those who were present.

**MR NKAIGWA:** You know Madam Speaker, even in church when we deliver an evil spirit; it usually makes a lot of noise. I am not surprised that when I speak words of liberation for this nation, there is a lot of noise across the aisle. The spirit of God, the spirit of light does not meet with the spirit of darkness.

Madam Speaker, I wonder what reasons the Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development would give me if I was to ask him before this Parliament that, he has failed this nation, he has failed Batswana and it is time for him now to resign from his position because really he has failed us. Madam Speaker, listening to the Minister of Finance and Economic Development delivering his speech, this was the worst Budget Speech that I have ever listened to in my entire life. For the forty years that God has given me in this country, I have never witnessed such a Budget, whose intentions are to go deeper into the pockets of Batswana, instead of creating value for Batswana. Like I said, one would have expected that...

**MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR KGATHI):** On a point of order. No, Madam Speaker, you have moved Honourable Davids here, and he is now facing me; he is talking so I cannot even hear the debate clearly. Can he not be called to order so that he keeps quiet to enable me to listen because I have not yet debated. I want to come and oppose these statements which are being said.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Order! Actually the Standing Order is clear and it says if another Member is on the floor, others have to keep quiet. It is clear; it is just that you do not read Standing Orders Honourable Members of Parliament. Honourable Davids, please obey the rules.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Madam Speaker. For the past fifty years, the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) Government has failed this economy. They have been preaching economic diversification, whilst they know very well that there is no conducive environment for business in Botswana. There is no conducive environment for attracting Foreign Direct Investment into this nation. Our laws are not flexible. Our license requirements leave a lot to be desired. Then we say we can diversify this economy through participation of the private sector in the economy. It was very clear earlier on, from the Honourable Minister of Local Government and Rural Development that, even our own local authority, Gaborone City Council, from 2009, they have only managed to undertake one Public Private Partnership (PPP) project. One would have thought that a Government that is willing, and has a good heart for the private sector to undertake and help Government in economic diversification, would have created a conducive environment for participation of the private sector to ensure that indeed there is a meaningful influence, there is a meaningful value creation by the private sector in the economy of our nation. Honourable Matambo, you have failed to do that, and I blame you because you are the Minister of Finance and Economic Development.

I might not be an economist but from the knowledge of God, what God has been ministering to me, it is a sign of failure. Really, you should not be talking about going on to tax Batswana, to evaluate taxes. No! You should be talking about private sector participation in the economy of our nation. If you could have long done that, we would not be talking about unemployment in this nation, because really the private sector would have created jobs for our own young people.

Look at Gaborone, for a city like Gaborone, Government should not be concerned about funding Gaborone. Just like the cities of Johannesburg and Tshwane, they make income for themselves, but your Government has failed to empower local authorities so that they can be able to create value out of the land and out of the little resources that they are currently withholding. Then you say your Government has direction in taking Batswana to another level. I am not surprised Minister Matambo that you are even proposing that we should go to villages and start taxing our parents property tax because your Government has failed to diversify the economy of this country. Now, you want us to compensate and pay for your failures as a Government. That is why I am saying give me a reason why you should not resign from your position as Minister of Finance and Economic Development, because I believe you have the responsibility to advise Government, to advise people



like Honourable Kgathi, who do not have the knowhow on how the economy is managed and run.

Recently we heard that even people, the small medium enterprises, you are bringing laws that are going to be a barrier for them to be in business. I would give an example; we have had so many Batswana trading in driving schools. There is a new law within your Government that in order for one to run a driving school, he needs to register with the respective department and he needs to pay P25 000. How many Batswana are going to afford to pay P25 000 to run a driving school? This is really pathetic. We are taking Batswana out of business and it is very clear that your so called Indian friends are the ones who are going to be taking all these little jobs that could be run by Batswana.

Our education sector Honourable Minister, is a circus, we have had so much of our resources being invested into the development of classrooms, what value creation do we have out of building more classrooms when people that you should be investing on are unhappy with what we are currently providing them with, in terms of their working and living conditions. That is why we have a country that celebrates people who have a grade “D”, because this is a “D” country, for you “D” is a pass, for us “D” is a failure. If somebody gets a “D” then you celebrate and say these “Ds” will go on to senior secondary schools, it is very unfortunate. That is why we have so many young people who have graduated from universities, but they are unemployed. Why are you continuing to take so many students to ...?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Nkaigwa, can I say something? Standing Order 51.1 says; “A Member shall speak standing and shall address his or her observations to the Speaker”. But you are only addressing the Honourable Minister, “Minister this, Minister that,” address me, proceed.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Madam Speaker. I am very worried Madam Speaker because this country ...

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (MR GOYA):** Clarification. Thank you Madam Speaker, thank you Honourable Member. I can hear you are very energetic, but I want you to just clarify something on the issue you raised earlier on more especially on the issue of construction or building of classrooms. I believe there is a need to put up classrooms countrywide, because the number of students in our classes currently they are way, way too high, but it looks like you are not happy about these ideas of increasing the classrooms in our schools. Maybe I did not hear you properly. Thank you very much.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Madam Speaker, thank you Honourable Minister. It is good to build classrooms Honourable Minister, but we need to create a balance between building schools and also ensuring that those that are going to be using those schools are also well motivated. What is the use of building so many classrooms whilst teachers are unhappy with their working and living conditions. It has been almost 10 years for the civil service having not received a meaningful salary increment. It is not up to us to look for ways in which we can generate more income so that civil servants can have a salary increase. If you are going to be increasing taxes on people that are already poor and you want them to deliver and give you value out of education, it is a joke Honourable Minister, and we will never achieve our goal as a nation and a country.

It is very unfortunate Madam Speaker that this country continues to encourage monopolies. I am a farmer Madam Speaker and I have even said it to the Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security that it is very unfortunate, Government came up with a programme called Integrated Support Programme for Arable Agriculture Development (ISPAAD) in which Government is ploughing for us for free, we are being given seedlings for free, but when you look at the actual suppliers of these seedlings, the seed industry has been monopolized. A bag of maize which we buy ad Seedco for P200, Seedco is selling to Government at P600, why? Because they have monopolised the market and Government is just paying with a blind eye and then you say there is no money Honourable Matambo whilst money is so misused like that.

A road that is five (5) kilometres from Phakalane to Glen valley cost Government P54 million and you say there is no money. A road that is sub-contracted to 3 companies, what was the profitability on that road, for it to be subcontracted to 3 companies? What is happening in our nation Madam Speaker? There is money in this country. A pen that costs P2 Honourable Matambo, is sold to Government for P20, and then you say there is no money. There is money that can be paid to us even Members of Parliament and even civil servants for salary increases, if you were managing our procurement processes. I do not think we are doing enough as a country. I do not think we are doing enough as a Government to ensure that there is proper management of the little resources that we have as a country. When I did Economics I was taught prudent financial management and I thought it is something that as an Economist it should always ring on your head, that indeed the little resources that you have you can meaningfully use it to ensure that you create more value for the benefit of the nation.



Teachers and civil servants have been complaining about accommodation. Government does not necessarily have to invest money on accommodation of teachers Honourable Goya, the private sector can undertake this as a project Madam Speaker. This can be done by the private sector. There is a problem in this country, there is a lot of fear in Government of taking out projects to the private sector. What is the fear all about, whilst the private sector is ready to invest and help Government to create value out of the little resources that we have?

Whatever income that we are making as a country it may not be enough, but the private sector says, "we are ready, create a conducive environment" but you are not, you are holding on everything, that Government can fund everything. What is the use of creating regulatory bodies like Botswana Educational Research Association (BERA), whilst now there is no implementation on what they were created for? How long did it take Honourable Goya? Fifty (50) years for us to come up with the regulatory authorities that will ensure participation of private sector into the economy? It is very unfortunate, we are sitting with big numbers of unemployment in this country, which should not be the case if we had visionary leaders who saw what the future is bringing for us as a country.

**MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT (MR MATAMBO):** Clarification. Thank you Madam Speaker, thank you Honourable Nkaigwa. I just wanted you help me with this scenario that you have rightly indicated and it is true, that when Government wants to procure some goods or items the private sector tenders, because this happens in tendering, it tenders using prices which sometimes are ten times the actual price of the item concerned. What are you saying to the private sector about this? Because this is not Government tendering, it is the private sector offering those high prices. What are you saying to the private sector about it having agreed you are correct that happens?

**MR NKAIGWA:** Madam Speaker, you know when I propose that the Minister should resign some of these kinds of questions I do not expect them from the Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development, honestly. He is the one who needs to come up with controls and even proper policies on how really our tendering systems can be improved, on how we can ensure efficiency and effectiveness in our tendering systems.

I used to be a person, I remember when I used to be the Mayor of the City of Gaborone, this beautiful City of Gaborone which you refused me to undertake good projects that could have benefited Batswana in this

beautiful City of Gaborone. I had good proposals, you know Honourable Minister it is not wrong to say to the private sector that, "our price selling for a pen is P3 and you cannot go above that." Just because it is an open economy it does not mean that we should just allow people to tender for a pen for P20 and we say because they are the lowest which means we are going to be giving them the tenders, no it is wrong. That is misuse of public funds.

**MR GOYA:** Clarification. Thank you Madam Speaker. In fact I just want to say to him that, what he is saying is right, I think recently I heard from the Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Board (PPADB) Chief Executive Officer (CEO) that nowadays companies are not going to compete for price but rather on capability and capacity to take on jobs that are available from the Government. I think what you are saying Honourable Member, is right. Thank you.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Thank you Madam Speaker. The Honourable Minister spoke about tax assumptions that are going to be reviewed. There is no time for us to review tax assumptions more especially on the basic needs of life; agriculture products. Not at all Honourable Minister. Let us look at other areas. We allowed this country to be where it is right now. When we were saying let us diversify our economy as a nation, let us not only rely on minerals to drive the economy of the country, the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) Government relaxed because by then we were making money out of diamonds but now the trend in terms of the revenues from the minerals shows that it is going down. The only way you can make easy money is through increasing taxes but I believe that is not the way to go. Let us create value from the private sector and make more money out of the private sector and even foreigners.

Sometimes it is very unfortunate for me to be said that I am classified at the same level with naturalised Motswana. I believe we need laws that would protect us. Madam Speaker, we cannot be classified in the same level as those. Those came with money, assisted by others. We start from nothing. How will you manage because even if you are trying to invest into farming, they are already into farming, and if you want to invest into property, they are already into property. How do you protect our own indigenous Batswana so that they can also participate meaningfully into the economy?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MR NKAIGWA:** I am not jealous of them. What I am simply saying is that let us also see the likes of Slumber Tsogwane running his garage and selling vehicles; it is not wrong. Let us also see Honourable Nkaigwa



selling chickens to Batswana. Let us not monopolise everything. Somebody sells chickens and feeds and then you say it is proper. It is wrong Madam Speaker. It needs to be corrected and condemned Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development. Come up with laws that will protect me; the black person, the black Motswana. I am worried Madam Speaker. Sometimes when we say the partnership that we have with De Beers is not a good partnership to this country, people say all is well. I remember when the Honourable Minister was requesting money for BCL in March last year, I stood up and asked the Honourable Minister, "did you do your due diligence? You are saying we should fund BCL for P1 billion. What informed your decision to request P1 billion from Parliament? Have you done your due diligence?" Then you said, "no, all is well with BCL." You are now coming to us and say you have closed BCL. Why should you not resign if you have made such big decisions that have cost the country money? You continue to incur interest on the BCL loan. You continue to pay interest on money that was given to the Government of Botswana by the World Bank whilst the project has not been undertaken.

We are still awaiting the Greater Gaborone Transport Model; a project that was funded by the World Bank which should have been undertaken but you continue to pay interest to the World Bank whilst nothing has been done. We had expected that circles at Botswana Television (BTV) and Game City would be a thing of the past. We also expected spaghettis in Gaborone. Where are the spaghettis Honourable Minister because you promised us? Funds have been released by the World Bank for such projects and it is just silent. We have such a dull city. It is so dark in Gaborone. There is no storm water drainage, but there is a proper master plan for storm water drainage in Gaborone. My people at Gaborone North farms do not have water in a city. They do not have proper roads. They do not have sewage system, and they use a bush in the city. Imagine a BDP Government that you say Batswana should be proud of; not me and my God, we will never be proud of such a Government. That is why I believe that the Honourable Minister, your Government has failed us and it is time for you to say goodbye and say, "Batswana, I have done my part." I like you so much as a Minister but not as a Minister under the BDP Government.

I am worried Honourable Minister, civil servants; we are not saying buy them and give them money because they should vote for you in 2019, no! We are simply saying, these are our brothers and sisters, these are our mothers and fathers and they have not had meaningful salary increment for the past ten (10) years. We think it is normal because some of us we are getting bribes somewhere and we are fine because our pockets are full.

That is wrong. Let us appreciate the reality that we are such a rich country, let us see the richness of this country on the livelihoods of our people. Let us have happy civil servants. What is so hard Honourable Members? In Botswana it is possible for everyone to have a million, including Honourable Makgalemele...

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE):** Point of order. Madam Speaker, you are not taking any action yet Honourable Nkaigwa continues to say wrong things. Right now he is saying people take bribes. I want him to mention those people otherwise he should withdraw. He should produce evidence that those people take bribes; where do they take it and who are those?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** It is not like I am not paying attention to him. As Honourable Members, you should listen to others when they debate and then you raise points of order. Honourable Nkaigwa, which ones are receiving bribes?

**MR NKAIGWA:** Madam Speaker, I never pointed a finger to anyone. If somebody is bothered, maybe he is part of them.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** What were you saying?

**MR NKAIGWA:** I was saying, this country is rich Madam Speaker. The riches of the country should be seen on the livelihoods of the people of Botswana, including civil servants, myself and yourself Madam Speaker. We are being underpaid, so let the riches of this country benefit us Madam Speaker and not only a few people. That is what I said Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, you said something about bribes. What did you say concerning bribes?

**MR NKAIGWA:** I was simply saying, there are cases before the Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime (DCEC) that have been investigated, given to the Directorate of Public Prosecutions (DPP) for prosecution and they have not been done but always there is clear evidence that indeed certain people were corrupt. That is what I was referring to.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** But you were not clear. Your time is up.

**MR NKAIGWA:** Madam Speaker, the time slot was inadequate.

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** Point of order. Madam Speaker, we cannot leave this issue like that. Honourable Nkaigwa is saying people are suffering, public workers are not paid yet some people receive bribes. After I interjected, he said those who are worried, maybe they



are part of that. Now he is imputing improper motives on me because I was querying what he said. We cannot leave this issue Madam Speaker. May I request that you ask Honourable Nkaigwa to withdraw that statement on bribes because he does not have evidence. I do not know but maybe he is the one who receives bribes.

**MR NKAIGWA:** I withdraw Madam Speaker.

**MR MOSWAANE (FRANCISTOWN WEST):** Madam Speaker, thank you and good afternoon. I am happy to see you in a new year ...

**MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE:** Point of order. I am sorry Madam Speaker. Maybe it is not supposed to be a point of order but a procedure because Honourable Makgalemele was just advising that Honourable Nkaigwa should withdraw the words but he also used the words in reverse and said, "you might be the one who is now taking bribes." I think it was squaring up. He should also withdraw those words.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** What is the matter now? Is that what you said?

**MR MAKGALEMELE:** I withdraw Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** You should never speak like that.

**MR MOSWAANE:** Thank you Madam Speaker and I am happy to see you and all Members of Parliament in this new year. May I wish you a fruitful year ahead of you.

Madam Speaker, let me start off by commending women of this country. Let me extend the same to Ms Masego Mogwera, Dr Pelonomi Venson-Moitoi, Ms Tshireletso, Dr Unity Dow, Ms Kenewendo, and Madam Speaker, who are heading Government departments whom by far have displayed their leadership skills amicably. I pray that the Holy Spirit will strengthen them to greater. Women leadership have proven to be capable and fruitful. Therefore, I commend all those women who are holding higher positions.

Now, directing my focus on the budget speech that has just been delivered by Honourable Matambo...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR MOSWAANE:** Honourable Member, if you do not appreciate their capability, take it from me today. I am advocating for them because from time immemorial, they have really been leading us accordingly.

I would like to commend our system of governance for working tirelessly and effortlessly to develop our economy for the past 50 years right from 1966 up to

now. This economy has begun in humble beginnings with a budget of around R18 million to a current budget of P50 billion. Let me remind you that the first 1 billion that this country ever had to spend on was back in 1989. Afterwards, we experienced a tremendous growth as a country.

Let me further remind you that as we are on our 51 years of independence, we need to reflect and address current issues so that we are at par with the current developments and their challenges. I have a problem with non-implementation of our budget but approved annually. The budget allocation seems to be one sided so we need to address such issues so that we have a clear direction on our aspirations.

I am concerned about how the budget is run at the Ministry of Education. I am however cognisant of the fact that they sometimes receive limited funds, like last financial they were allocated 9 billion but this time around, it is 6 billion. I know that for them to be able to address the challenges they are faced with currently, they need a budget of about 40 billion. However, 40 billion is the budget that is enough for the entire country when it comes to allocation of recurrent budget.

Honourable Matambo, I am very concerned with the Department of Tertiary Education Financing (DTEF). It looks like we are spending money into a bottomless pit. They seem not to have clear policy guidelines when it comes to budget implementation just like the rest of other ministries.

My suspicions are that, the private universities are not yet ready to collaborate with our government. They are more concentrated on making profits not taking into account that they were fortunate enough to be afforded that opportunity. They are just in the business of making money without even being considerate.

Honourable Minister, the issue of private institutions really need to be revisited because we are losing a lot of money. The certification should be at par with the charges paid into these private institutions. Some of these certificates are really not worth what they claim to be. When you look at a school like New Era, students who have completed their Diploma there cannot register anywhere as engineers because the certification is of low standard. So this is something that should be looked into.

The other issue that pains me is that DTEF and University of Botswana will cost the ruling party to be ousted...

**MR REATILE:** On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Thank you Madam Speaker. Honourable Member has stated that there are some students who graduate from New Era College and their certificates



are of low standards. My question is, does the fault lie with those that grade the school being the Botswana Qualifications Authority (BQA), such that we end up having schools that offer sub standardised education?

**MR MOSWAANE:** Honourable Member, research has revealed that the problem lies with the New Era School because they have offered that diploma which is not recognised by the Engineers Registration Board (ERB). The students have expressed their grievances over the issue for a long time and through that the BQA were able to probe an investigation into that.

Like I have stated earlier on, the DTEF and the University of Botswana have their plans to oust the ruling party because they are failing to deliver in everything. Their situation is just beyond repair. Therefore, I would like to urge all the responsible Ministers to do something about this because once we lose the elections in 2019, it will be very hard for us to regain power.

These are the things that we need to pay serious attention to because they are intentional. We have approved the budget last year in April and the agreement was to pay all the Target 20 000 people but now we are in a new year, February, some of those people have not yet been paid and yet the budget and supplementary budget has been approved. We need to look into University of Botswana...

**MR SALAKAE:** On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. You are coming up right. Just a quick one, I think a lot of people will agree with you when you say there are some people in some of these institutions like DTEF who do not regard their job with the level of seriousness it deserves. According to you, what is the cause of that? I suspect it is because when your party is supposed to appoint competent people, you take people whom Batswana have rejected during elections to head these departments. What do you think causes this situation?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** On that note Honourable Salakae, we have lost the quorum. I did not see who walked out and I always tell you to check the quorum before you got out.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** There is no quorum Honourable Moswaane.

#### EXCHANGE OF SPEAKERSHIP

**MR SPEAKER (MR MOLATLHEGI):** Take your seats so that we check the quorum.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Olopeng, go to your seat so that I check the quorum.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Olopeng, go to your seat. Order! Proceed Honourable Moswaane.

**MR MOSWAANE (FRANCISTOWN WEST):** Honourable Salakae, you asked a question and my answer would just be an assumption like you. When we suspect someone to be a loved BDP member, others will also suspect there is a favourite member of the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC). So, assumptions can come from either side. One of the reasons is infiltration...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** What?

**MR MOSWAANE:** Infiltration.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)...

**MR MOSWAANE:** Infiltration. That is one of the reasons why people are failing because they have acquired Masters and Doctorate Degrees, they cannot fail to do the job. That is why I suspect that we have been infiltrated.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Clarification. Thank you. Honourable Moswaane, I can hear that you are dealing with a delicate issue and you are doing very well. Do you not think treating the public servants badly for a long time is the cause of this slowdown that they cannot even press 'enter' to give credit student allowances?

**MR MOSWAANE:** Honourable Member, that is still infiltration. Getting rid of such people is difficult.

There is an issue that I would like us to carefully look at. University of Botswana students come from as far as Maun, Shakawe, Ghanzi, Kgalagadi, Bobirwa, Borolong and other places and we have promised to give them a living allowance. Mr Speaker, my issue here is that children leave their home villages as virgins, and they come here to Gaborone and spend months without getting this allowance and they end up resorting to prostitution to make a living. This is not right and as Parliament of Botswana, we should sternly criticise this because when the Ministry requests for funds during the Budget and in Supplementary, we give them the funds as a way to curb situations like this. The thing is students are angry and end up vandalising property to show...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Moswaane, did I hear you properly, do you have evidence on...

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Or is it just hearsay?



**MR MOSWAANE:** Which one?

**MR SPEAKER:** Of virgins resorting to prostitution?

**MR MOSWAANE:** I am saying children come here with sober minds and intending to focus on their studies but since they do not get their living allowance for more than three months, four months, six months, they end up being tempted to find money for survival. And this is not good for us. So, given these situations, I have a problem to criticise these students until their monies are paid on time because that is possible. Let us address the root cause of the problem, for someone who is sitting in the office failing to press 'enter' to credit allowances.

Honourable Members, I do not condone vandalism but what are we saying about the situation whereby students can go up to six months without getting their living allowances yet they are renting houses. What should they do?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**MR MOSWAANE:** For the last time.

**MINISTER OF YOUTH EMPOWERMENT, SPORT AND CULTURE DEVELOPMENT (MR OLOPENG):** Clarification. Honourable Member, are you implying that the person who is refusing to press 'enter' to credit student allowances is someone anti-government?

**MR MOSWAANE:** I used the word 'infiltration'. I have issues in which public servants are not happy and have joined the #BDPmustfall as a result. When I started I said that we should all recall that when we started developing this country, that was in 1989/1990, the national budget was R18 million and the first time the Botswana Government budget reached P1 billion. At the moment we are over P50 billion but our national needs amount to over a trillion. This shows that we have a deficit.

During the 10 years, from 2008 there was an economic crunch and as Batswana, we had to see how we could deal with that situation. When an honest parent bids his children good bye in the morning, children would say 'father bring us sweets' and he would say, 'my children, I do not have money', but in that situation an irresponsible parent would agree to bring sweets and later give the child an excuse. I agree with someone who will give an honest answer.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR MOSWAANE:** Honourable Members, we should assess our situations. I agree with Batswana when they

call for setting our priorities right. We should prioritise where we use our funds.

With the current slowdown in the public service, it is better you give them P3 billion on top of the P18 billion because it is costing this Government more than P3 billion. I think it is much better if we pay them so that we see what else to address on their conditions of service. That is my view which I think will take us forward.

Honourable Members there is one issue that I want us to focus on this year and that is the issue of minimum wage. There is no way a person can be paid P900 per month and just be told to accept it and be consoled by being told that God is there for them. There is no truth to that.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR MOSWAANE:** God is there for everyone in this world. I suggest that we abolish this minimum wage and if we still think that it is acceptable to pay someone P1500, I would like to tell you Honourable Members that no one agrees with that notion. If one has to pay for transportation, lunch, accommodation and school fees including snacks that children carry to school, then there is no one who can manage on a P1 500 salary. It is not right for us to be paying Batswana such paltry amounts of money. My wish is that if we are to say we are doing our best, then people should be paid a minimum wage of P3 500. I know that people are going to say "what not have you Honourable Moswaane has a scatter brain, we do not know!"

I know that there are some people who are given P2 500 as dog allowance, and yet on the other hand we expect another person to be surviving on P1 000 or P1500 per month. Honourable Members, even the private sector has begun to reconsider their minimum wages because they tell us that they consider what the Government pays its employees, so they cannot pay more than that. I want to emphasise that no one in the private sector or in Government should be paid less than P3 500 as a salary because poverty has really affected them. We should speak strongly against this issue of low wages.

The other issue that I want to touch on is that of poverty eradication. In Francistown, there are around 584 people who applied for different programmes and whose funds were approved. However the budget that was allocated last year, was not enough to even pay a quarter of that number. Therefore to the Minister of Finance and Economic Development, Minister of Nationality, Immigration and Gender as well as the Minister of Local Government and Rural Development, I should mention that the programme no longer serves Batswana.



Some people have been waiting for projects from the poverty eradication programme for three years now. I therefore suggest that the bulk of the money should be apportioned to that programme because it has to do with the issue of job creation and self-reliance. There are also issues when it comes to the tendering system because it does not permit the beneficiaries to tender as the councils and the District Commissioners office need certain documentation that these beneficiaries do not have.

**MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR TSOGWANE):** On a point of clarification. Thank you. I have been listening to your debate carefully Honourable Member and I thought that perhaps you should clarify for us because the Government is not the only employer. With your proposed minimum wage of P3 500, it is as if you are only focusing on Government employees, so what do you say about those in the private sector who do not pay people much? Are you referring to them as well and does the P3500 minimum wage include maids' salaries as well?

**MR MOSWAANE:** I did explain that even those in the private sector no longer pay people well and they justify it by saying that the Ministry of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development has stipulated the minimum wage one can pay per hour. I did explain that I implore even those in the private sector to see to it that they improve that situation because there is no one who can survive on P900 or P1 500.

I would like to talk about Ipelegeng programme which is one of the programmes that our government greatly assists people with. We have tried to alleviate people from poverty through the programme and they are paid P550. I want us to try and see to it that we increase their allowance to P900 and have them work for 8 hours and not part time as they have been doing, so that the money can be sufficient enough to buy groceries. That is my request and I say this because we can see what Ipelegeng does in our areas. We should remember that through Ipelegeng, jobs that used to be done by companies like picking litter around the city, cleaning surroundings and constructing culverts which needed a lot of money from Government, are now done through the programme. The people working under the Ipelegeng programme should not find themselves being used as cheap labour.

I also want to talk about the Ward Development Committee (WDC) members who now find themselves engaged for long periods of time working with public officers and councils on implementing Government programmes. They now work fulltime and yet they are paid a measly sitting allowance of P170, really we should look into that.

I want to emphasise that people who work under the Ipelegeng programme should have a standard fee amounting to at least P1 000 per month plus sitting allowances, as a way of indicating that they are employed temporarily. You can see that they are there countrywide and there is no Member of Parliament who can say that they are not doing anything. Those are some of the things that we need to look into.

Madam Speaker we also have Councillors who are responsible for overseeing the administration of our constituencies, they are the torch bearers in communities but currently they are going through financial hardships. They are running the Local Government but have financial problems to sustain it. It has been quite some time with Councillors asking for salary adjustments with no action taken. I am hoping that in 2017 they will be remembered and something will be done regarding their situation. They incur costs when it comes to conducting meetings and you know very well that you cannot assist as Members of Parliament since you also decry low salaries. These are issues that we should talk about and also emphasise that councillors should be paid proper salaries to aid their work at the villages and running the Local Government.

Honourable Members, when it comes to the issue of salaries for Members of Parliament, I have complained and I have just about given up, there is no way I can talk about it now. We know that we spend full time in the House as well as at the constituencies. So Members of Parliament should also be assisted with the current situation.

The other issues have to do with the youth and I should mention that the BOT50 celebrations ended up impacting on the Youth Development Fund (YDF). A budget for the youth Honourable Minister Olopeng and Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development, we are experiencing a high rate of unemployment and we have almost more than 500 000 youth who are unemployed and when you consider the money that we have budgeted for, the money that we are using, it is enough for 1000 people annually. Are we going to be able to improve this situation? We know that some people are supposed to be employers and some employees. My suggestion was that we increase this budget from P120 million to P2 billion so that the youth could start big profitable industries and hire other youth. Because the P10 000 shows that a young person can only employ one employee or just themselves.

It is clear that if we are not going to react to this situation, very soon the youth will be opting for other means of survival, which we will not approve of. I therefore would like to urge the Minister of Finance and



the Minister responsible for Youth to address this issue because it is an answer to the issue of job creation. If we only give them P120 million which can only create 1000 jobs while there are 500 000 unemployed youth, will we be solving this problem?

This can be compared to other issues affecting women, Gender Affairs issues in relation to economic empowerment. We all know that men are given very little funds but are the pillars of our families. We should at least increase their budget to P2 billion to aid job creation so that they use the funds in different areas. For women to take part in economic development, they need assistance so that this country becomes proud and celebrates with them so that they also get important jobs like us.

These cases are really touching. If you can go to places such as Old Naledi, Monarch, Botshabelo, Gaborone West, Mahalapye and Serowe, there is a child who goes to bed on an empty stomach and wakes up hungry, a child who cannot afford a P1.00 fat cake. We should therefore not allow this to continue. In rural areas our people are starving and in urban areas such as Gaborone and Francistown they mask the hunger with make-up. We should not turn a blind eye to this and ensure that the money assists in alleviating this poverty. Let us protect the future of our people and give them control of the economic status. Those are the points that I did not want to leave out today. Honourable Minister that is all I wanted to talk about.

I wanted to stress the issue of paying our students in private universities their allowances on time. Honourable Members if there is shortage of funds, we should be given a report before the Parliament adjourns. Our students are not supposed to suffer because we are now turning them against the Police officers, the Government and every Member of Parliament who is in the governing party solely because of incompetent officers.

**MR SPEAKER:** Your time is up!

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MS TSHIRELETSO):** I thank you Mr Speaker, mostly I want to thank Honourable Matambo. Honourable Members be reminded that Honourable Matambo does not prepare this budget alone; he does so with the rest of the Ministers here. Where we decide how much to allocate to which ministry. It is only that we cannot come here and present together. We know that we shall have a committee stage where every Minister will be presenting their estimated budget.

After thanking him, I would like to indicate that we are faced with challenges in this country. I seem not to understand but I suspect that when we started, the governing party encouraged...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Tshireletso, it seems like we have lost quorum. Actually the 21<sup>st</sup> member has just arrived, so you may proceed.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I do not understand if the ruling party provided a lot for the people and did not encouraged the spirit of independence in that everybody including the Members of Parliament blames the Government for everything. This is why last time when Honourable Matambo was mentioning that the Government has suspended hiring people due to the fact that the public workforce is larger than the number of jobs, people started getting furious. I have people on Facebook who are accusing Honourable Matambo saying he is changing what the manifesto of the ruling party has promised them. I do not think we are deviating from what our party manifesto says; to create jobs for Batswana.

The thing is we started as an independent country, that time when we built the University of Botswana, when we contributed money and cattle. During that time we did not have many graduates, there was only a few. I was expecting that by now Botswana would have really grown considering the number of learned people that we have. The main problem is that when the Government announces that it is not able to hire people anymore, even the economists and the business experts do not trust that they can do without the Governments' input.

I was thinking that maybe we should start here in Parliament and see how our experts could assist in the job creation aspect. You cannot say that there are no funds. Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) is there giving you millions. In this country before we had many graduates in the past when we had nothing, people worked hard, there was no such thing called hunger. They made an effort; they exchanged cattle for food so that their children could eat. I was not expecting our people to be so dependent on the Government; I was hoping that by now they could be using ideas that they copy internationally through Google to create employment. They could be copying ideas from America, England and South Africa. They could not be blaming but assisting Government with job creation.

Honourable Matambo, I do not know if we did not plan for CEDA well or people do not understand what we are talking about. Just recently there was an opportunity



where people are financed, if you are two you can get up to P150 000 to kick start a business, it might be a tuck shop business. CEDA is...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Yes, I will conclude my child, I hear you Minister. He is my child and also a Member of Parliament.

Yes the funds are insufficient, but millions are being dispersed. After being funded with millions, you will see "in the matter between," while we are here hoping that people are out there creating jobs for the people, they use the money to buy expensive suits and cars such as Range Rover and Mercedes Benz and that is one huge mistake that we make as Batswana. Honourable Boko reminds me of them, the lawyers; I like their profession because you cannot see them wandering around looking for jobs. They do not expect to see jobs created for them unlike the economists, those who did Business Studies at Botswana Accountancy College (BAC) and other universities are complaining and giving up.

**MR BOKO:** Clarification. You were talking about lawyers. Let me commend you for mentioning lawyers because they are doing a great job in creating employment. But their biggest complaint Honourable Tshireletso is that the Government and Parastatals have a lot of work which is enough to be allocated and shared amongst these lawyers who will in turn be able to make money and continue creating employment.

Now the issue is that these Government owned companies give all the work to just two or three of their friends then the rest who are suffering remain with nothing. It would be helpful if there can be a process that compels them to distribute the work to those who are trying their best. Thank you.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I do not have any complaints, nevertheless I suppose the relevant Minister is present and is listening to you. More so that there is something called affirmative action that we should also talk about local empowerment in the districts and also talk to the Councils so that when they give out tenders/contracts they should spread out. If the Government does not spread out on giving lawyers contracts then it's a pity because if this is done then many people can get jobs, and I do not have a problem with this. I do not want an opposition member who says no to everything. If what you are saying is true, I believe the minister is listening to you. I was commending some of them because they have law firms, some have nothing to show.

Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) as widespread as it is, I do not believe that if someone

went to Gabane with a certain idea of what to do, it will be a problem. If you take for example a time when I was raising my children, I was struggling, our parents were struggling too. We did not know anything. We only knew that once you start a fire and cook, you are done. We would make fat cakes and cool-aids and feed our children.

We now have people who are knowledgeable and my view is that they should approach the Government and say sir or madam, I also form part of the Government therefore give me funds. Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) has funds so does the National Development Bank (NDB). There is another issue which does not sit well with me which I would ask them to help us with ideas on. When it comes to the issue of poverty eradication as Batswana we are used to working, just as some of our parents would go to work at the mines while some looked after others' livestock. Yet nowadays people do not want to work as maids or even look after livestock because they are educated. Let us leave it there.

With our poverty eradication programmes one is given 10 000 or 15 000 whilst they are seated at home and when one knows nothing about running a business they will be given P15 000 not knowing what to do with the money. They will then spend the money and go back to Ipelegeng. We give them the money and workshop them for two weeks but the challenge is that you cannot educate an adult in just two weeks. That is why someone posed a question on why people do not graduate at Ipelegeng yet there is a poverty eradication programme.

My idea Honourable Matambo is that as we ponder on the issues of budget allocation, let poverty eradication programmes be treated as cooperatives. I once visited Mauritius and found one cooperative which people were encouraged to start. Educated people who have skills like the ones I have mentioned before can become managers or anything they want. Then if this is started in a village like Mahalapye by tailors of uniforms, we will not give them projects as individuals but now we will know that these ones are tailors. When they are a collective unit, one will cut out the pattern, the other will sew in the hand, the other sew in the buttons, the other one will stitch, just like that until the final product is complete. By sun-set, there will be complete uniforms and dresses which are ready for sale. Making cooperatives will be the answer Honourable Matambo because if you try to check, people have already taken small stock and cattle programmes, and for other programmes the money is not put to good use. Why? This is because people want us to employ them. From here one will know that this money is not meant for personal use rather to be injected back into the business. I was thinking that if we employ them



then it can be important for the ones whose businesses are struggling because when we take statistics we will say these ones are doing well, these ones are struggling, these ones have failed. They do not know that profits should not be spent but rather be used to continue the business. I am coming up with this idea looking at the situation because there is no one who can say Batswana are not being assisted financially, there is the poverty eradication programme as well as the youth fund.

The Minister of Youth is also advocating for his Ministry to be given more funds so that the youth can have jobs. Some young people who have not gone far in terms of education are really trying as some of them have their own livestock such as cattle, goats and dairy goats. Some businesses are well known by the personnel at the ministry, many youth are trying. Now some do not care about the youth fund.

One time when there was a strike orchestrated by University of Botswana (UB) graduates who were unemployed, someone said we can group ourselves and start a kitchen at UB. "Some were saying we cannot wear aprons, we cannot wear women's clothes and how can we cook?" But what he was implying was that he did not envisage the graduates working at the said kitchen but rather owning it and hiring staff.

These issues are centered on young people, they should be encouraged by being given funds. They have better ideas than those in Government. I sometimes hear people blaming us and I cannot be blamed when I have taken care of and supported someone up until they finished school. They are saying that the Government is in the hands of people who are not educated. But we are saying here is the money, educate me. You nurture people and then they turn around to mock you, and we always hear people mocking us. We have done our part through the programmes we have brought.

There is also an issue of looking down on some jobs which could be a source of income for people. One of our children said that she cannot work as a cook. Yet we have the Chinese and Japanese citizens cooking their traditional cuisine for us and we are the very people who eat at their restaurants. There is one, I am just not sure whether it's a Japanese or Portuguese restaurant where I sometimes go with Honourable Dow... (Laughter) ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Laughter!) ...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Yes, we eat their food but we do not want to own such outlets to say I am starting my own business specializing in Setswana cuisine. There is one lady at the bus rank that I love. She sells leafy vegetables and cooked and dried maize (*nišhwatšhwa*). People do buy and a lot of people always queue to buy from her

and Gaborone is very big. If only these people could do their business in different areas of the city like Block 8 because we love our food, we love our porridge, our leafy vegetables and our beans. We grew up eating these foods. These things are holding us back. But because we want to be voted for, we exaggerate and say "let them hire you". Why don't we change since some of us are young people and say to them, create employment for yourselves. Because now young people end up wishing death on elderly people who are still working to create vacancies for them to be hired and this is not supposed to be the case.

What I am trying to say is that this is an encouragement to our young people not everyone but rather the educated ones. Just as someone was saying even during teacher training, one does not learn everything, there are those who learnt how to cook and knit those who were doing Home Economics (HE), some of them can be employed yes but some can form groups and come up with ideas.

One young person came by this morning to fix my car and I asked him where he comes from, he said he is from Molepolole. He explained that they once worked for Land Rover before opening their own company. I explained to them how happy I was for seeing their efforts. All these so called Japanese cars that are all over, some of us could be in the business of selling them. When you try selling them just as Honourable Moswaane once tried but was criticised by some people I know here saying Moswaane is selling cheap cars while he on the other hand was creating employment.

Another issue I would like to talk about with emphasis on the Minister responsible for gender affairs, it is actually more of a complaint; Women Empowerment Programme has been suspended. Statistics in the country reflect that women are mostly affected by poverty for reasons known to all of us here; women cannot travel to Gaborone, Mahalapye and Molepolole to look for jobs. If she stays at Mantshadidi or at Kaudwane or Mokgenene she cannot just up and leave her children alone but for men this is easy because they can just travel around, they are mobile since they do not have the burden of taking care of children. Because of that women wonder who will take care of the children if they leave.

Many women took full advantage of this programme that is why the budget has been reduced. Honourable Minister Matambo this money could have been increased because the statistics reflect that the areas of Boteti West, Okavango, Mabutsane and Kweneng West are hugely affected by poverty mostly being women because men can always hassle so they are not as hard hit as women. That is one of the reasons I am for the idea



that Ipelegeng allowance should be increased. We can even rename it and call it Unemployment Programme for people who are working, and we can even pay them. I am not complaining because statistics proves that out of 65 000, there are 48 000 women and 11 000 men, there are less men because they do not carry the burden that we carry. Women are taking full advantage of this fund and are making successful projects such as morula oil, morula jam, morula soap and so on. They are taking this seriously, they have innovative ideas.

Others are now busy making and selling red and green candles but still their applications are suspended because they applied in large numbers Honourable Batshu is telling the truth so that is why I am imploring my Government to consider this; a huge chunk of budget should be allocated to women who are facing challenges of raising children, who are facing challenges of the virus whether young or old because they are caretakers. Honourable Matambo my wish is for the budget for women empowerment to be increased because as I have said there are high numbers of Ipelegeng workers who are mostly women. These women are not just sited doing nothing, they are working hard, but the funds have been ceased. Honourable Batshu said that applications are still being suspended. Women are complaining because they want to support their children using this fund. A good budget is the one which caters for a woman because she is a caretaker.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE):** On a point of clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Tshireletso. Whilst on that subject Honourable Member are you aware that although the programme is under Honourable Batshu's ministry, it focuses on assisting both men and women but mostly women? Women also have the right to benefit from other programmes in the country? More so that a young woman one has the right to benefit from youth programmes?

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I am focusing on women; gender does not only refer to women. We have allocated this budget to women that is the way Honourable Batshu presented it. I am grateful that the Chairperson of the Commission is Kgosi Mosadi Seboko, a woman of substance who I believe in her abilities to lead. My point is that there is a grant which you can benefit from as an individual, as a group of two, or three including one man. I have already mentioned the reasons why women should be a priority and this is because in most cases women are single parents and they have to take care of the children because some people whose names I will not mention have ignored their responsibility to take care of their children Mr Speaker.

I heard someone talking about fat cakes but in my Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development that is the first stop for a person in need even Honourable Pheno Butale who is my child as we work well together, knows. To say a person wants a fat cake, we must be fair. In most cases I work with Honourable Ngaka Ngaka and Honourable Kablay. I am talking about Pheno, Ngaka Ngaka and Kablay who come rushing to the Ministry of Local Government which is headed by Honourable Tsogwane with me as the assistant, when there is hunger somewhere they will say, Honourable Tshireletso please assist us as a woman. There is not even a single person who can sleep on an empty stomach whether that person is at Ditakaneng or Botshabelo. The person to blame then would be the Member of Parliament or Councillor for that ward because when we are told about that we do what we call temporary measures. They will never go to bed hungry we just fill in the forms. Since you want to take me back to the women empowerment issue, the challenge we face as women is that if he leaves you with eight, five or three children you are solely responsible for taking care of them. She is a mother who has to fend for her children..

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** No, wait. You are smooth talkers, when you sweet talk me, I accept Honourable... (laughter!)...if you flatter me I end up moving in with you but after a child is born you abandon me. You are right I am also against this behaviour. Like I always say when you tell a woman...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ...(Inaudible)...

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** I mean a child. A woman is undemanding if you just say "I love you," without having to give her anything, that is it, she will be happy. As women we are too trusting that is why we are easily tricked, after that we are left with a burden thus our request for budget to be increased. Of course women can benefit from all Government programmes but this one is the best one for them because it offers them more, they can apply as individuals, or as partners (two women) or maybe as a group of three (two women and a man). I have a son and a daughter but boys have more advantage because no one can stop them from going out sometimes or travelling to Gaborone or to Mahalapye. They can just board a 5 O'clock bus, I cannot do that, only a few women can. Men have no responsibility. I am not saying all women but majority of the women will opt to take care of your children. I am answering it the way I want.

Honourable Matambo, you are one of the wisest people when it comes to drafting a Budget, one cannot be liked



by all people. Someone said, "if you please others, you do not please others". There was once a man who was riding his donkey together with his son and when he arrived at the village he was shouted at and was told "are you not ashamed of yourself for overloading that donkey; why does the young boy not walk and because you are older, why do you not carry the sack?" they continued with the journey but before long he was shouted at once again to say "such an old man letting his little boy walk while he rides a donkey," and he let the boy ride the donkey whilst carrying the sack and soon enough the villagers shouted again saying "why do they both not walk and not overload the donkey?" he ultimately gave up. If you please others, you do not please some.

You sat down and came up with these ideas and we are also entitled to add more to your ideas. One such idea that I support that some are against, one of the first ideas in Botswana is that of the Village Development Committees (VDCs) I will like us to revisit Odirile Motlhale's idea. The idea was first brought about by Sebetlela, the problem is we never revisit old ideas. Honourable Sebetlela came up with the idea of Constituency Fund and Odirile Motlhale also brought up the idea at a later stage; he was a member of an opposition party but I supported the idea. This idea needs a lot of money and I think P10 million will not be enough just like other people have already stipulated therefore we should go back to the idea of the Constituency Fund because I know it very well and the Honourable Vice President is well aware that I am also in support of party funding. There is a misconception that we are not free to voice our opinions but that is not the case. I will like to conclude by pleading with you Honourable Members to make sure that the P10 million that my Ministry will be distributing to the constituencies goes to VDCs. It does not even go to VDCs it is distributed by us, maybe there was a misunderstanding. I was listening to Members of Parliament earlier on saying I requested for P10 Million for my ministry with some saying a constituency will be given P10 million, I do not know what you were on about.

Let me be straight forward as the minister responsible, nobody said any Member of Parliament has money here. Honestly speaking, when we thought about it, we realised that it was not going to end well so we did not discuss it fully. This was how we were supposed to conclude it. So Honourable Matambo came at the right time. Honourable Matambo has come up with the P570 million; it has been budgeted for. I, Honourable Tsogwane and Frans were aware that you will be in charge of dispensing this money but we never publicly talked about this. We were planning to talk about

this money once it is budgeted for and even have the guidelines for it. We have written down the guidelines and none of the Members of Parliament are included; a Member of Parliament is part of the VDC committee as well the Parents Teachers Association (PTA), his/her duty is to share ideas with people in his/her constituencies but there are no funds that are going to his/her own fund; this is not a Constituency Fund. I need to be very clear with this one. We should not talk about the budget that has not been approved; we approve the Budget and then we can start discussing the money. If we do so we are....

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** What are you clarifying because I am explaining to you? I am clarifying!

**MR KGOROBA:** Thank you Honourable Tshireletso.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Kgoroba, for recording purposes, you should wait until you are called to the floor.

**MR KGOROBA:** Thank you Honourable Tshireletso. Did you miss the issue that was raised by Honourable Moyo that when there is a budget estimate, it means we can discuss the money?

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** It is not the first we get a budget estimate; we always get it but we usually wait for Honourable Matambo to ask for our approval as Members of Parliament. There is nothing wrong with those that talked about what they have heard from the President's State of the Nation Address but I am speaking as the Assistant Minister to Honourable Slumber Tsogwane, my Honourable Minister. Even though he is speaking to Honourable Mmolotsi, I tried to call to support him. He said we will be using this money with guidelines that is why for the first time ever Botswana will get to enjoy their own projects in our constituencies. In Honourable Nkaigwa's constituency of Gaborone North, we could make paving bricks so that we make some improvements. We should listen to different ideas and give people a chance. They have always known that most of the Budget goes to Basic Education and Local Government and Rural Development and now there are those that make requests to install street lights and get them. I have asked those in Mmaphashalala to invest all their money in the streetlights, so that when one arrives in Mmaphashalala, they get lost. That can happen.

I will like to thank you for coming up with the budget that we have agreed on. We should stop blaming Honourable Matambo for the Government's decisions; I am not scared to say the Government alone cannot create employment. Most countries have progressed due



to their people's decision to run their own businesses. Some of the richest people around the world did not get rich with the assistance of the Government. The Government helps with funding people to help them progress. I advise the youth in print media to come up with their own businesses and refrain from working for other people. There is a Youth Development Programme (YDF) which assists with finances. Is my time up? I wanted to speak on behalf of those in media. Thank you.

**DR P. BUTALE (GABORONE CENTRAL):** Thank you very much Mr Speaker. I want to begin by thanking Honourable Tshireletso. I think if we had a few like her, this country would be in a much better place. I was listening to various Members of Parliament, more especially those in the Cabinet talking out of ignorance with regard to the P10 million. They were going on about how they are going to invest in bricklaying, some say they are going to invest in some sort of machines. So today we hear that there are indeed some guidelines and I think we should have waited for that. I think I should not wait until it is time for my speech to say, this is financial prudence, this is the way that Government should be run. We should not be hearing about appropriation from some structure that is not recognized by the Constitution. You cannot meet at some corner somewhere and give yourself some money. We need to come to Parliament and agree as Members of Parliament because in a democracy, Parliament is the custodian of the public purse. We need to come here and agree that we are getting P10 million.

The President told us that we are going to have a new programme, he never talked about P10 million and all of a sudden we hear people going around talking about P10 million. I think Honourable Matambo as the Minister of Finance and Economic Development, as the custodian of our resource, you need to stand up and speak against this character. We heard it first of all, last time again on Economic Stimulus Programme (ESP), we heard about it again somewhere, where people met and agreed that we are going to use this much money, from the public purse. I think we need to frown upon this, we need to have a very deem view of this because it is a deviation from the management that we are known for as a country.

I want to begin by getting a few points out of the way in support of some of the people that have spoken before me. I think we need to stress this point that I have spoken about in the past, about budget transparency Honourable Matambo, it is a point that I will belabor until something is done about it. It is a shame that we call ourselves a democracy, yet we continue to propagate only one (1) view to the public.

You come here, present your ideas on how the economy can be run and when we want to give Batswana alternative views and alternative ideas, they are denied an opportunity to hear the alternative voice. I think that is tragic. It is even devilish if you ask me. That is the reason why I always say in this Parliament, that we are indeed a dictatorship that is masquerading as a democracy. That is the truth about it...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** You are the ones who are refusing.

**DR P. BUTALE:** No, you are refusing. I also want to stress the point again about citizen participation in the budgeting system. I think we have seen over and over what international bodies have said about lack of transparency and lack of citizen participation in our budgetary process. I want to refer you and I know you know this very well, to the Botswana Institute for Development Policy Analysis (BIDPA). It has made pronouncements on the International Budget Partnership and Open Budget Index. Continually we are going down in terms of countries that are open in terms of their budget.

I think they have also spoken or referred to the issues around publication of media reviews. They have said that indeed this will facilitate public accountability and I agree with them that under the current system, it is very difficult to track spending. I believe that it is even difficult to track revenue collection and it is very difficult to track the borrowing the Government does when the budget is being implemented. I think we need to act and we need to move towards more transparency as a country.

I would not delve into our participation as Members of Parliament because I think we have all given up. I think we are just a rubber stamp, that is why people talk about P10 million and say, "no, we will tell you after." They know that there is nothing that we can do about it and we can all go hang. So, I will let that one pass because I think the only hope that we have as a nation, as Members of Parliament, is when we change Government. That is when Parliament as a true arm of Government, will be truly independent from the overbearing Executive as it is happening currently.

I want to get into the issue of budget as a policy tool and I think it is very critical. I have said this before that the budget is a policy tool. The budget should tell us exactly how the Government intends to deal with problems that are bedevilling the country. The budget should show us in terms of direction; what the Government needs to do to address unemployment and what you intend to do as a Government with regard to issues around the ever



plummeting education results. I am always disappointed to find that the budget as a policy tool, that expectation is never met. I will demonstrate why I say that.

The budget as a policy tool; your budget is all over the place. I will demonstrate as I speak why I say that. I want to speak very, very briefly about what you said on the role of Government in job creation. I think I need to say that the budget like all other communications from Government has now become an opportunity for trickery. It is the worst kind of flattery because we tell people things, we introduce new policies, we introduce new interventions all the time, but Honourable Matambo as Minister of Finance and Economic Development, never help us in terms of tracking performance.

On last year's Budget, you spoke about the Economic Stimulus Programme (ESP). You told us that ESP is earmarked and it will help towards employment creation. Instead of telling us how ESP is performing in terms of job creation, you now see ESP as a problem. You say in the speech how the pressure from the implementation of ESP has now given you some problems. It is now a problem. You are not helping us understand whether we are achieving that which you said we will achieve with ESP. I think this is a problem. How can we continue to throw money when we cannot even begin to know whether we are going in the right direction or not?

When I spoke last time about results based management, I said to you, "have clear targets." When you come to Parliament, tell us ESP is going to create these many jobs so that when you come as the Minister of Finance and Economic Development, you will then say to us that we are in the right direction because midway or halfway or whatever point you are, you are now seeing that you have now created these many jobs which indicates that you are going in the right direction, no, you did not do that. Instead, you introduced new...

**MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT (MR MATAMBO):** Correction. Thank you Mr Speaker, and thank you Honourable Butale. We can debate on this issue of tracking performance, but where I wanted to correct you is where you said that there is somewhere in this speech where I said I find ESP to be a problem, no. There is nowhere in this speech where I said ESP is a problem. I believe what you are referring to is where I was justifying the budget deficit to say that part of the reason why we do have a deficit yet again is because we are committed to implementing ESP and it costs money to implement ESP. Thank you.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Murmurs)...

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! Honourable Salakae, it is as if you have not debated...

**DR P. BUTALE:** I think Honourable Minister you would agree with me that the paragraph I am talking about is where you said, "...now the pressures from implementation of ESP..." that is why I am saying it is presenting itself to you as a problem. You said to us that it is a good thing. You said it is going to be manna from heaven. There is going to be something for everybody, so why should it be a problem for you? You need to...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**DR P. BUTALE:** Well, you did not read the speech. Even by your standard Honourable, you are showing excessive state of excitement and you should sit down and...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Butale, do not address side remarks, they will lead you into temptation; just focus on what you want to talk about.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE):** Elucidation. Thank you Mr Speaker. I just want to assist Honourable Butale because he did not read Honourable Matambo's speech. What Honourable Matambo was saying can be found on Paragraph 59. I just want to teach you something that when you look at what Honourable Matambo said, you also have to read it together with the State of the Nation Address; where at Paragraph 15 of the State of the Nation Address, His Excellency did present the number of jobs that were created. So, try to read the two (2) together.

**DR P. BUTALE:** There is always a problem when people are at an advanced stage of a disease called narcissism. It is an impediment. People cannot see facts for what they are and we cannot help you unless you help yourselves out of that problem.

I also want to speak very briefly about the problem that we find in the education system and I think one would have expected the budget in addition, not only to come here and tell us you are going to continue what you have done year in and year out, which is to take the larger chunk of money to Education. Tell us what the strategy is out of the squalor condition that we are in right now? When I speak about education, I am really angered by the mediocrity that I see in this sector where you can have a university student expected to live for two (2) months, (3) months, without living allowances, and you have a ruling party that issues an irresponsible statement that says those kids need to be jailed. I had 470 students held up in a community hall by City Council because they did not have anywhere to go. They had no shelter.



As parents, how can you have the audacity to mistreat students and then you issue a statement as irresponsible as that one?

I agree with Honourable Moswaane that indeed what is going on here is a sign that you in the ruling party you are kicking power away from you. You are saying to Batswana you are tired. You now have no initiative, you have nothing that you can offer Batswana and therefore Batswana need to help you, since it appears like you are tired of your responsibilities. I had young girls exposed to dangers because they were being picked there by strangers because a Government said, "they can go to hell". What kind of a Government is this? I think we need to say this as it is.

**MR KGOROBA:** On a point of clarification Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member for yielding. By UB students, do you mean the entire 10 000 UB students were striking and they have to be painted with the same brush for vandalism?

**DR P. BUTALE:** Well, you see, that is the clearest sign you may have of a fatigued ruling party; devoid of initiative. You have no idea what you need to be doing and because you have seriously abdicated your responsibility to run and make sure that students can learn in a better conducive environment, all you do now is to be vindictive.

Honourable Moswaane, was talking about a go slow and trying to sugar coat, hey! If you do not treat workers properly anywhere, those who are employers would tell you, I have said this before in this Parliament that you cannot beat your wife and expect her to go prepare a sumptuous meal in the kitchen. They would put something there that will kill you. This is the reality. So, you cannot be treating civil servants of this country like trash and expect results from them. That goes to show you are beyond redemption. Nothing can help you apart from getting out of power.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Clarification.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Honourable Tsogwane, I will not waste my time with your clarifications.

Honourable Matambo, you spoke about disability and what you are doing; that is Paragraph 31, disability and the programmes that you are extending to them. This is exactly why I have a problem with the pronouncements made in budgets and in the State of the Nation Address. I have a young man in my constituency called Andy, I will stop there with the name. He is blind. I have been going with him to the Office of the President to seek assistance. He was told he does not qualify, but he is wallowing in poverty.

I have a mother in my constituency who cannot work because she has a mentally disturbed child. One time she tried to go to work, she came back the child had injured himself, but she cannot be helped. You come here you tell us, "no, we have programmes, we can help everybody". That is why I was saying, I think these public addresses are now an opportunity for you to flatter our people. It is deceit, because we do not see this, they do not translate in actual upliftment of the lives of our people. That is exactly why we need to come here and tell you and debunk all these statements that you are making because they are not true, because we live with these people that you claim to be assisting.

I was shocked when I saw where you spoke about eradicating absolute poverty by December 2017. Was that a typo Minister? The Vice President of this nation, he headed a poverty eradication unit when he was Minister, we are yet to hear what success did we get out of that. Nobody here can tell us how many people have graduated from poverty. I am just wondering, December 2017!

**MR KEORAPETSE:** On a point of elucidation Mr Speaker. Honourable Member, perhaps we are lost this side, maybe this is an event, and just we once asked that perhaps this 2016 was an event.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Well, you see, I would not put it past them because I once asked, this thing that you are trying to eradicate, what is it, have you defined poverty to yourself, have you put the parameters? The World Bank, Botswana Institute of Development and Policy Analysis (BIDPA), they have always shown that Botswana remains one of the most unequal societies in the world, by we are saying 2017!

**MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT (MR MATAMBO):** On a point of clarification Mr Speaker. Thank you very much Honourable Speaker. Thank you very much again Honourable Dr Butale. No, it is not a typo. I meant it, and also Honourable Keorapetse, no it is not an event, it is a process. I think what you failed to understand is two things, that my suggestions that the way you are commenting, you misunderstand two things; the first thing is what we mean by abject poverty. The second thing is that it seems you are not aware that this has been going on. We are talking about the situation which some years ago the abject poverty was measured to be six (6) per cent and with the time that has passed, we believe that it is possible to come to zero by 2017 December. Thank you.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Well, I was hoping that the Minister will get into the nitty-gritties, the details of which source



is this. When you respond, give us those. You know, this is the worst kind of trickery and chicanery that I have ever seen.

I want to talk Honourable Minister about something that I think is a problem in our economy, and I think it is an issue that many many observers, many scholars have really pointed to, which is the declining credibility of the Government's ability to adhere to its own policy pronouncements. You make policy pronouncements and you do not adhere to them. I want to give examples because when I am an investor, and Government makes a policy pronouncement, I sit and decide and make a decision whether I am going to invest or not. Let me just give examples. In the past you have said you are going to privatise Air Botswana, and you called international bidders to buy a stake in the national airline, but that was called off. That was forgotten somehow, after you have said to people "come and invest." So, where is the credibility of Government to follow through on its own policy pronouncement?

You have said in the past that you want a private sector partner to develop the second university in Palapye, Botswana International University of Science and Technology (BIUST), in partnership with Government, right? There was a call from Government for a partner which resulted in partners posting P1 million each. The fate of those two bonds of P1 million remain unclear, what happened? Do you want to tell me that those people who put that money forward will ever trust our Government if you say you are going to give each constituency P10 million again? No! They have burnt their fingers. They cannot trust you. The credibility is gone. That is exactly what I am trying to say. Earlier on, the Assistant Minister spoke about Public Private Partnerships (PPP), something that was adopted as a policy in 2009, right? 2009 and he unashamedly says only one Public Private Partnership project was done.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**DR P. BUTALE:** Oh! All of a sudden Honourable Tsogwane knows the difference between an event and a process...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Laughter!)...

**DR P. BUTALE:** Wow! We should thank God for this. I think *Botswana* Confederation of Commerce, Industry and Manpower (BOCCIM) in their various reports have shown this lack of commitment to the PPP arrangement which you said is a policy. I am saying the credibility of your Government to proceed and follow through with your policy pronouncements is under threat because you say things and you do the opposite. This is exactly

what I am trying to say, because the challenge of this is that you now bring uncertainty, the confidence that you should be now giving to investors is gone because there is uncertainty in terms of investment returns. Somebody may post some investment and tomorrow you have had a change of mind and then you just change and go in a different direction. I think that is a serious, serious challenge, because as they say, the oil that lubricates economic expansion is the confidence that the investors have in the economy. I hear you talking about the private sector leading job creation when you yourself come up with policies that are averse, that do not help private sector growth.

I also want to refer very briefly to declining levels of public accountability as another problem. You cannot talk about private sector growth when there is such a decline in public accountability. We know all the concerns that people have had about what I have just been giving as an example here, where appropriation is done at some Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) Caucus and we are told it is okay. I think this is exactly what I wanted to talk about.

I also want to talk very briefly about supply driven policy implementation, because you decide to undertake projects without due assessment of the need of such projects. Then you undertake projects simply because as a Government you can do it but not because there was an assessment that said, "no, there is a need for such a project." This has led to serious challenges in terms of project implementation. I have been reading World Bank reports that give examples when they talk about supply driven policy implementation. They give examples of the Francistown and Maun abattoirs which they say have led to Botswana Meat Commission (BMC) losing profitability. Did you look at all the facts when you were doing that? No! When you look at Morupule B Power Plant, you look at Botswana International University of Science and Technology (BIUST) and all the dams, all of them were done within a five-year span, leading to constrained labour supply that drove construction prices high. So, what I am trying to say to you is that if you do not address these things we need to deal with them...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**DR P. BUTALE:** Honourable Vice President, you do not want to tempt me. I am in a very good space with regard to you. So, I do not want to leave that space.

Another point that I want to talk about and give as an example of supply driven policy implementation, construction of vocational training colleges that led to an oversupply of this. I was shocked that you built Oodi and immediately upon completion, it is no longer part of



your strategy, you have to rent it out to BIUST. Supply driven policy implementation, this is exactly what I am talking about.

Honourable Speaker of the National Assembly, I have given the views that I believe are serious challenges to why this Budget would not have any impact in the lives of the people that I represent in Gaborone Central. Apart from the flattery and apart from the self-congratulatory messages, in Gaborone Central we do not see any change. Our streets are still dark and we still have very dusty roads. I hear murmurings to the effect that, “What is the Mayor saying?” That is what a Government that is at wits’ end in terms of what to do, that what they do is, pass on the blame, pass on the blame. You have taken all the powers from our councils and as our manifesto says, decentralise and make sure that we use the tax base of Gaborone, we would not come here and ask for money. So we still have in my constituency people who ask for assistance with the poverty eradication since 2012, and the Minister says as a Member of Parliament (MP), I should come here and congratulate him for eradicating poverty that indeed he is on course to ensure that he eradicates absolute poverty. You manufacture poverty everyday actually. People are losing jobs. You have no direction.

I want to say to the young people of this nation and I want it very, very clear that I support their agitation. If you did not hear me, I am saying I support their agitation and I will radicalise all of that so that they stand up against this corruption that is bleeding jobs in this country when you are supposed to be creating jobs...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible) ...

**DR P. BUTALE:** Yes, if you do not know the meaning of radicalise, Google it.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** If he has to...

**DR P. BUTALE:** Yes, yes, I am not afraid of saying it because we have a spoilt Government that wants to destroy people’s lives and even prescribe to them how to respond to their brutality. I said this in Parliament the other time, you put children in a truck and when we ask about it you say, “you are politicising”, you kill our children and you want to prescribe to us how to mourn. What a spoilt lot! I want to make it very clear that in a democracy, freedom of expression is expression. It is enshrined in our Constitution. People should stand up for their rights. People should stand up and defend their rights. They gave you an opportunity to run this country, they did not give you an opportunity to run roughshod over their rights, if you do the wrong things they should go onto the streets and protest, and I will be amongst them. I rest my case.

**MR ARONE (OKAVANGO):** Thank you Mr Speaker. I will be very brief in supporting the Budget as presented by the Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development. Mr Speaker, Honourable Butale is on a mission to radicalise people but one thing that he can be assured of in this country is consistency of this Government. All the old ideals you would think of, that describe a working democracy is what this Government stands for.

Before I start reflecting on the Budget, the Honourable Member has been talking about investors. I do not know which type of investors Honourable Butale met, where he met them, because we travel all over together in different countries, but I have seen people fighting to come to Botswana. This is the only destination. We are not saying we are heaven, or the Garden of Eden; they crave to come to this country because all the ingredients for an investor are here in this country. There is peace, the economy is working, we have challenges and that is what I will be talking about.

What I have realised Mr Speaker since I joined this side is that, we live in two different worlds. I will be coming to Honourable Gaolathe’s speech which all the ideas I was not surprised when I looked at what he was suggesting, it shows that Honourable Gaolathe is a true Member of Botswana Democratic Party. If you look at all his suggestions about the Leather Park thing, it is work in progress. We do not want to repeat mistakes that we made in the past, the suggestion about the Community Based Natural Resources Management (CBNRM) Programme that Honourable Gaolathe talked about, it is all what the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) has said. It is even there in the manifesto. Honourable Matambo does not even feel bad listening to the likes of Honourable Butale preaching because we know that there are different types of pastors. Others preach the truth while others are demonic and as such, you ignore Honourable Matambo.

**DR P. BUTALE:** On a point of order. May I caution the Honourable Member to be careful with his choice of words because he claims that I was preaching and that there are pastors who preach the truth; those who preach lies and those that have demons. Therefore, may I encourage him in his excited state of his new home to be careful with his words.

**MR SPEAKER:** I am very impressed that you complain about the choice of words Honourable Butale, let us all be careful not to use provocative words on each other and learn to respect one another. Let us continue with the debate.

**MR ARONE:** What goes around, comes around. He was using words like ‘mediocrity,’ all sorts of things,



how would an Honourable Member in a nice suit come and call others “this lot” and then turn around and caution others to be careful with their words. We are going to tell you and you should be very patient as you receive, because we have been listening to all the lot that you have been saying. Just go and proofread your presentation; you never suggested not even a single idea, not at all. You only did what the late General Merafhe, may his soul rest in peace, used to say that “when you hear a resounding bell, you just ignore, because it never stops making noise! It does not make sense, no ideas at all, no suggestions at all, just making noise.”

Mr Speaker, let me move on with the Budget. I want to thank you Honourable Matambo; Honourable colleagues have been saying a large share of the Budget has gone to Okavango Constituency, there is nothing wrong with that. We are very thankful that at last we are having the bridge being constructed, a very huge project that will bring about employment, not only in the constituency but for Batswana in general. We are having a hospital being constructed in Shakawe again. That alone will promote employment and of course service delivery which is the responsibility of this Government to take services to the people. We want to thank you for that.

We are also very thankful in Okavango because at least we have the water plant that is being constructed in Seronga that will supply villages of Seronga up to Gudingwa. That alone is taking services to the people, which is the responsibility of this Government and we are very, very thankful and we will continue to do so. There are a number of projects.

Honourable Butale has been talking about Economic Stimulus Programme (ESP); I have seen ESP bringing changes in my constituency, in Samochima and Etsha 1. There are a number of projects you can count that have contributed to short term employment. You cannot be talking about permanent jobs in terms of construction, because in the construction industry a project has got a time limit; it is either six (6) months, twelve (12) months or two (2) years. At least during that period some form of employment would have been created. We are very, very thankful for that.

Of course it is true Honourable Matambo; we have got challenges in our country like in any other country. Unemployment is our big challenge more especially amongst our young people. The challenge is that we still have young people who are trained to look for jobs but not to create jobs, that is something that we need to work on. Honourable Butale, honestly speaking on a comparative note, Botswana is the only Government with the type of empowerment programmes that we have. That is why when foreigners come they take

advantage of these programmes and make themselves rich while we remain complaining like what you are doing. What this country needs is serious and visionary leaders. Instead of declaring in this Parliament that as a leader you are going to radicalise, you think you are radicalising them for the BDP? Ask Gadhafi and Satar, that is what he did when he radicalised the workers in Zambia. Do you think when you take over power the radicalism that you had planted will go overnight, no. In fact if I had a better word Mr Speaker I would say for a leader to declare like what the Honourable Member has done, he is totally irresponsible. You cannot call yourself a leader and you are saying you are going to encourage young people; the helpless souls that you are talking about, that you are going to encourage them to do wrong things. That is why I say I would rather call you a...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order Mr Speaker.

**MR ARONE:** You are even abusing the point of order. Just sit down and listen.

**DR P. BUTALE:** Mr Speaker, the Honourable Member is out of order if he starts saying things I did not say. If he wants to impress his new... you know, when people who are wet behind the ears, they believe that they can go out there and impress. I am saying that Mr Speaker, he should say what I said and not say that which I did not say. If he is trying to impress those who ensured that he goes that side, he should not impute things or associate me with things that I did not say. He is out of order and if there is anything irresponsible, the irresponsible thing is being voted and then ditching people for greener pastures. That is what is irresponsible.

**MR SPEAKER:** Order! You have not helped in anyway Honourable Butale. You should have repeated what you said to correct him. Secondly Honourable Butale, when he says something that you did not say, you say ‘correction’. You should not abuse point of order or procedure. Correct him if he is not saying what you said. Be calm Honourable Members and debate freely.

**MR ARONE:** Mr Speaker, it is very interesting if people, a whole Honourable Member, just after five (5) minutes when they sit down and they forget what they said, how do we then help? What I can simply request is that, I would request him to go and read the Hansard.

What I am simply saying Mr Speaker on a serious note, is that for a leader, it is totally irresponsible to incite violence. Those students you incited destroyed public property. That alone is a complete sign of problematic leadership. The issue of impressing, do you forget that you were a member of the BDP and left for the Botswana



Movement for Democracy (BMD)? So, you are trying to impress that side? Look, I am home.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** ... (Laughter!)...

**MR ARONE:** The reason why I left, Honourable Gaolathe because you are among the people, personally, I will say it publicly and I would make it very, very clear that I am waiting for you to come and join us this side, so that we move this country forward. That is the appeal. You know when I was reading your speech, may the old man rest in peace, I looked at the past speeches because I had the opportunity to sit with your late father here, all the ideas that you were talking about, you are a product of the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) and those ideas will not work well sitting next to people like Honourable Butale. Of course yes, I mean he is a product of this side, all what he has suggested, that is what I said, it is there in the manifesto.

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Arone, wait. Honourable Butale, Honourable Members, Standing Order 58.4, when the member is on the floor, you keep quiet and listen to them. Proceed Honourable Arone.

**MR ARONE:** Let me leave him and go back to the Budget. I take it he has heard me and he will never incite students to be violent.

Mr Speaker, I was talking about unemployment among the youth. What we should be doing, I want to agree with you on Page 9, Paragraph 35, on monitoring and evaluation. We have come up with all good programmes in this country. We have invested a lot of money in research and planning. Our programmes are okay. What we need is simply to monitor them. That is why I want to thank the Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development because even when he was delivering the National Development Plan (NDP) 11, part of the emphasis was on monitoring and evaluation so that at the end of the day, we see results and our returns on investment in terms of the money that we put forth. We should also, Honourable Minister and I want all the Ministers here present to...

**MR SPEAKER:** Honourable Arone, shake that person next to you.

**MR ARONE:** This one?

**MR SPEAKER:** Yes.

**MR ARONE:** No, he is not sleeping. What I want us to do Honourable Minister and I am saying this to all the Ministers; generally the work ethic in our country is a big issue. We have to find a way to resuscitate our levels of patriotism as Batswana. We should at all times, know that whatever we are doing, whether you are a police

officer, nurse or a teacher, wherever you are, you are serving your country. On top of what you earn, on top of what you are paid, first what has to come to your mind is that you are serving your country and we should all be proud and we should all love, wake up with a smile, despite the challenges that we have as we go to work, to ensure that we are serving our country.

I want to plead with my colleagues Honourable Butale that despite the challenges and differences that we have, we all have only one country. Let us go out there as leaders to ensure that we encourage our people to know that when they go to work, they are serving their country, despite the challenges that they are facing. If we go to work and do not deliver, we are killing our own economy. If I am a teacher and I go to work and I do not teach, I am killing my own people. If I go to the clinic and I do not work, I am affecting the same people that I say I am part of them. It is an appeal Mr Speaker that as leaders, we should go out all there to ensure that our people are proud despite the challenges that we have, more especially when it comes to serving our country.

Moving on to Poverty Eradication Programmes, because we are spending a lot of money in that area Mr Minister, monitoring of these programmes again, is where we fail. The intention is good, but as Honourable Butale said, the only thing that I picked is that he was complaining that our turnaround time in terms of assisting beneficiaries is still a challenge and at the end of the day, it affects the overall objective of assisting these people. Let us try and make sure that the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development, Honourable Tshireletso, the turnaround time for these people to get what they have been promised or the targeted programmes that they have been given is met so that they are able to move forward with their projects.

The other issue with these programmes Mr Speaker is lack of market. The market is a problem, of course simply we all know because our country is very, very small and we are very, very few.

At the same time, we should have targeted programmes that are linked clearly to market opportunities so that we reduce the rate of failure for this project.

The Local Enterprise Authority (LEA); we should also find a way Honourable Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry to ensure that LEA closely supports these projects, so that at the end of the day, we reduce the rate of project failures, more especially amongst young people in this country. I want to agree with Honourable Butale and of course I picked Honourable Ndaba Gaolathe, they also suggested this, that as Botswana, in our efforts to diversify our economy from the



mineral dependency, we should be looking at tourism to try and broaden it, more especially when it comes to International Conference Centres (ICCs) because they will bring a lot of money in our country. We have places that are well situated, places like Kasane, Maun, the Okavango Delta as a world known wetland, it would be an ideal place for an International Conference Centre of some sort, that will attract international conferences coming to this country and by so doing, we would be helping to grow our employment and revenue in that regard.

The other point Honourable Minister where this economy is very problematic, more especially for the citizens that are in the category of small businesses and those who are trying to start businesses is the turnaround or the red tape around getting a permit or a licence to start a business. Personally I would suggest that we have two categories of requirements. The ones targeting citizens to try and help them to ensure that they participate in the economy. Honourable Tshireletso talked about affirmative action. All these good intentions are there on paper. The challenge is enforcing them. For example, we have these Council tenders where people would supply foodstuffs to orphans and elderly people but when you look at some of the requirements, I do not know why for an example a kiosk, a vendor, for one to tender, they are required to have a Tax Clearance Certificate. What for? You do not even... What is the correct word? You do not even get the cut for you to be able to pay tax. Some of these requirements Mr Speaker, I strongly believe that they are completely unnecessary and they are keeping the same people that we want to empower, more especially the women, people with disabilities out of the whole programme which was intended to empower the 'small men' in the community. So, I would like the ministry responsible for that area to ensure that these requirements do not keep our people out because the main aim of Government is to make sure that they are assisted Mr Speaker.

I want to conclude by talking about the education system. I wanted to say this thing in Honourable Butale's presence. When we talk about the education system, we are all not happy. I do not think there is anyone who would say they are happy that students are not performing. The challenge that we have in this country is leaders like Honourable Butale. Honourable Butale is a type of a character who will go to a school and tell teachers that, "no, do not go to work, do not teach, this Government is not looking after you." He is a complete type of a leader who will do that. I would differ with those who will say, Honourable Mokgware, those who will say salaries only are the key to ensuring that results can be realised in our schools. I do not believe so. There are a number of issues that we need to address. There are a number of issues...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR ARONE:** You know very well Dr Mmatli as a teacher. The welfare issue I agree with you, it has to be addressed. The work ethic has to be addressed and we should also make sure that we leave politics for the politicians and let us ensure that we do not politicise the public service. We should not politicise the public service because if we do that, as I was saying, it will catch up with all of us. We have got countries, if you take for example which are struggling, Dr Mmatli, you know that very well but they are doing very well with the little that they are getting. According to me, the biggest challenge that we need to deal with in this country is our work ethics and our level of patriotism as we serve our country. That is the big thing that we need to address.

I would agree with one commentator who said, if we do not deal with the work ethics in this country, whichever Government that comes into power in this country, it would have a problem. Now the opposition has chosen one issue, salary increment. I was looking at my Honourable colleague, your suggestion of 17 per cent salary increase. For this economy, I would not agree with you. I tried to touch base with economists, and that 17 per cent translates to around P3 billion. We are not going to do things like what happened in the northern side by our neighbours where increments were just done without looking at the situation in reality. It does not help that you give out all what you have and tomorrow you do not have anything to offer to your people. That is not the way to do things on the side where I am standing now. We are not going to promise people things that cannot not be achieved practically. The first thing that we want to hear from that side is how do we move forward as leadership to ensure that the base of this economy is widened, this economy is fully diversified in terms of revenues, so that when we have surpluses we can then talk about substantial increments. Therefore, I want to disagree with that suggestion, it would be too much.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Correction.

**MR ARONE:** You will correct me when you present. I am saying my thoughts, you may not agree with me. So, even if I am talking about you, you will correct me when you present, you will have that opportunity to come and speak.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Point of order.

**MR SPEAKER:** No you cannot do that Honourable Member, you want to cheat us. You had initially stood on a point of correction, which is not allowed.

**MR ARONE:** I was still on the education system that we had agreed together with Dr Mmatli that it is not



only the salaries that are key, let us also work on our work ethics. Public servants, more especially in the teaching fraternity are made to believe that they are not looked after. People will talk about how in Namibia people are paid more but they do not talk about the taxes. How much tax do they pay? What are the benefits they have? A public servant in this country is given accommodation, while a public servant in Namibia is not given accommodation. They do not have official houses. As you talk about these things, let us not only look at one side of the coin, but we should also look at the other side.

I agree with the issue of resources in schools. I agree with Honourable Gaolathe for example that when the economy improves Honourable Matambo, I would be one of the people who would be supporting increment of the Old Age Pension. To me, one of the strategies to fight poverty is to try and give these elders something more for them to survive. We are not only helping them, some of them are still breadwinners even in their late ages. They are looking after orphans and a number of people. We have to give them what Honourable Gaolathe has suggested for example. I agree with that suggestion, or even more if the economy allows. That would improve money circulation in the economy.

Mr Speaker, I wanted to thank and to support the budget. With those few remarks, I would be waiting for the specific ministries and that is when I would be more than happy to reflect on them concerning my constituency Mr Speaker. I thank you.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE):** Thank you Mr Speaker. From the onset, I want to assure the Honourable Minister that I do support his Budget Proposal for 2017/2018 financial year.

I also want to thank the voters of Rasesa Ward Mr Speaker who on Saturday voted for the mighty Botswana Democratic Party (BDP). This win is very significant because it happened just a few days after a new baby was welcomed to the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC). The guys were really sure that they were going to win Mr Speaker.

#### MOTION

#### ADJOURNMENT

**LEADER OF THE HOUSE (MR MASISI):** Thank you Mr Speaker. I beg to move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and **agreed to.**

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until Tuesday 14<sup>th</sup> February, 2017 at 2:00 p.m.



### **HANSARD RECORDERS**

Mr. T. Gaodumelwe, Mr T. Monakwe, Ms T. Kebonang

### **HANSARD REPORTERS**

Ms T. Rantsebele, Mr M. Buti, Ms N. Selebogo, Ms A. Ramadi, Ms D. Thibedi,  
Ms D. Pheko, Ms G. Baotsi, Ms N. Mokoka, Ms B. Pinaemang

### **HANSARD EDITORS**

Ms W. Mbeha, Ms C. Chonga, Mr K. Goeme, Ms G. Phatedi,  
Ms B. Malokwane, Mr A. Mokopakgosi, Ms O. Nkatswe, Ms G. Lekopanye

### **TRANSLATORS**

Ms. K. Ben, Ms. M. Kagiso, Ms B. Ntsetsang  
Ms. B. Dintwa, Mr. T. Rajane, Ms. M. Sekao, Ms. M. Rabotsima, Ms. B. Mosinyi, Ms. V.  
Nkwane, Ms. N. Kerobale, Ms. K. Nyanga, Ms K. Alepeng, Ms T. Bocock  
Ms N. Makula

### **LAYOUT DESIGNERS**

Mr B. B. Khumanego, Mr D. T. Batshegi

