

DAILY HANSARD

YOUR VOICE IN PARLIAMENT



THE FIRST MEETING OF THE FOURTH SESSION OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT MONDAY 13 NOVEMBER 2017

ENGLISH VERSION

HANSARD NO. 189



DISCLAIMER

Unofficial Hansard

This transcript of Parliamentary proceedings is an unofficial version of the Hansard and may contain inaccuracies. It is hereby published for general purposes only. The final edited version of the Hansard will be published when available and can be obtained from the Assistant Clerk (Editorial).

THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY SPEAKER
The Hon. Gladys K. T. Kokorwe PH, MP.
DEPUTY SPEAKER
The Hon. Kagiso P. Molatlhegi, MP Gaborone South

Clerk of the National Assembly
Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly
Ag. Learned Parliamentary Counsel
Assistant Clerk (E)

- Ms B. N. Dithapo
- Ms T. Tsiang
- Ms. B. Morolong
- Mr R. Josiah

CABINET

His Excellency Lt. Gen. Dr. S. K. I. Khama PH, FOM, DCO, DSM, MP.	- President
His Honour M. E. K. Masisi, MP. (Moshupa-Manyana)	- Vice President
Hon. Dr. P. Venson-Moitoi, MP. (Serowe South)	- Minister of International Affairs and Cooperation
Hon. S. Tsogwane, MP. (Boteti North)	- Minister of Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. N. E. Molefhi, MP. (Selebi Phikwe East)	- Minister of Infrastructure and Housing Development
Hon. S. Kgathi, MP. (Bobirwa)	- Minister of Defence, Justice and Security
Hon. O. K. Mokaila, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Transport and Communications
Hon. P. M. Maele, MP. (Lerala - Maunatlala)	- Minister of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services
Hon. E. J. Batshu, MP. (Nkange)	- Minister of Nationality, Immigration and Gender Affairs
Hon. D. K. Makgato, MP. (Sefhare - Ramokgonami)	- Minister of Health and Wellness
Hon. T. S. Khama, MP. (Serowe West)	- Minister of Environment, Natural Resources Conservation and Tourism
Hon. V. T. Seretse, MP. (Mmopane - Lentsweletau)	- Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry
Hon. O. K. Matambo, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Finance and Economic Development
Hon. T. Mabeo, MP. (Thamaga - Kumakwane)	- Minister of Employment, Labour Productivity and Skills Development
Hon. T. Olopeng, MP. (Tonota)	- Minister of Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development
Hon. E. M. Molale, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister for Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration
Hon. Dr. U. Dow, MP. (Specially Elected)	- Minister of Basic Education
Hon. P. P. Ralotsia, MP. (Kanye North)	- Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security
Hon. Dr. A. Madigele, MP. (Mmathethe - Molapowabojang)	- Minister of Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology
Hon. S. Kebonang, MP. (Lobatse)	- Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security
Hon. D. P. Makgalemele, MP (Shoshong)	- Assistant Minister, Health and Wellness
Hon. K. K. Autlwetse, MP (Serowe North)	- Assistant Minister, Agricultural Development and Food Security
Hon. B. M. Tshireletso, MP. (Mahalapye East)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. F. S. Van Der Westhuizen, MP. (Kgalagadi South)	- Assistant Minister, Local Government and Rural Development
Hon. M. M. Goya, MP. (Palapye)	- Assistant Minister, Basic Education
Hon. F. M. M. Molao, MP (Shashe West)	- Assistant Minister, Tertiary Education, Research, Science and Technology
Hon. T. Kwerepe, MP (Ngami)	- Assistant Minister, Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration
Hon. K. Mzwini, MP (Mmadinare)	- Assistant Minister, Youth Empowerment, Sport and Culture Development
Hon. I. E. Moipisi, MP (Kgalagadi North)	- Assistant Minister, Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services
Hon. G. B. Butale, MP (Tati West)	- Assistant Minister, Investment, Trade and Industry

MEMBERS OF PARLIAMENT AND THEIR CONSTITUENCIES

Names	Constituency
RULING PARTY (Botswana Democratic Party)	
Hon. S. M. Guma, MP	Tati East
Hon. C. De Graaff, MP	Ghanzi South
Hon. L. Kablay, MP	Letlhakeng - Lephephe
Hon. M. N. Ngaka, MP	Takatokwane
Hon. S. Lelatisitswe, MP	Boteti East
Hon. J. Molefe, MP	Mahalapye West
Hon. K. Markus, MP	Maun East
Hon. P. Majaga, MP	Nata-Gweta
Hon. M. I. Moswaane, MP	Francistown West
Hon. B. H. Billy, MP	Francistown East
Hon. M. R. Shamukuni, MP	Chobe
Hon. B. Arone, MP	Okavango
Hon. I. J. Davids, MP	Mochudi East
Hon. M. R. Reatile, MP	Specially Elected
Hon. B. J. Kenewendo, MP	Specially Elected
OPPOSITION	
(Umbrella for Democratic Change)	
Hon. Adv. D. G. Boko, MP (Leader of Opposition)	Gaborone Bonnington North
Hon. G. S. M. Mangole, MP	Mochudi West
Hon. A. S. Kesupile, MP	Kanye South
Hon. N. S. L. M. Salakae, MP	Ghanzi North
Hon. Dr. T. O. M. Mmatli, MP	Molepolole South
Hon. S. Ntshaile, MP	Jwaneng -Mabutsane
Hon. M. I. Khan, MP	Molepolole North
Hon. H. G. Nkaigwa, MP	Gaborone North
Hon. Kgosi Lotlamoreng II	Goodhope - Mabule
Hon. D. L. Keorapetse, MP	Selebi Phikwe West
Hon. S. O. S. Rantuana, MP	Ramotswa
Hon. K. M. Segokgo	Tlokweng
(Alliance for Progressives)	
Hon. W. B. Mmolotsi, MP	Francistown South
Hon. Maj. Gen. P. Mokgware, MP	Gabane-Mmankodi
Hon. N. N. Gaolathe, MP	Gaborone Bonnington South
Hon. S. Kgoroba, MP	Mogoditshane
Hon. Dr P. Butale, MP	Gaborone Central
(Independent Member of Parliament)	
Hon. T. Moremi, MP	Maun West

TABLE OF CONTENTS
THE THIRD MEETING OF THE THIRD SESSION
OF THE ELEVENTH PARLIAMENT
MONDAY 13 NOVEMBER 2017

<i>CONTENTS</i>	<i>PAGE (S)</i>
QUESTIONS OF ORAL ANSWER.....	1 - 9
WRITTEN ANSWER TO QUESTION NUMBER 12	37 - 39
Response to the President's Speech <i>(Resumed Debate)</i>	10 - 36
TABLING OF PAPER	
Statutory Instrument No. 93 of 2017	
Botswana Innovation Fund Order, 2017.....	10



Monday 13th November, 2017

THE ASSEMBLY met at 2:00 p.m.

(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)

PRAYERS

* * * *

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER

FUNDS BUDGETED TO PAY FORMER BCL WORKERS

MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH):

asked the Minister of Mineral Resources, Green Technology and Energy Security: -

- (i) what happened to the funds that were budgeted to pay former BCL employees the 12 months' retrenchment packages as initially agreed between management, employees and the Government of Botswana;
- (ii) how such funds were utilised;
- (iii) what informed Government's decision to divert such funds from the initial plan; and
- (iv) what is being done by Government to offer counselling services to such employees.

Later Date.

AMBULANCE/CLINIC RATIO IN MOLEPOLOLE

DR T. O. MMATLI (MOLEPOLOLE SOUTH):

asked the Minister of Health and Wellness: -

- (i) how many ambulances are servicing the health facilities in Molepolole;
- (ii) where the ambulances are located;
- (iii) how many clinics they service;
- (iv) to state the ambulance/clinic ratio in the village;
- (v) how this impacts on the delivery of health services in the village; and
- (vi) when she plans to fully address the problem of shortage of ambulances in the village.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE): Thank you Mr Speaker.

(i) There are currently 12 ambulances servicing health facilities in Molepolole village. Currently five are off road and a total of seven are on road.

(ii) Of the seven serviceable ambulances, four are based in Scottish Livingstone Hospital and the balance of three serve all the other nine health facilities (seven clinics and two health posts):

- One ambulance is allocated daily to be shared by three facilities in Molepolole South (Bokaa Clinic, Kgosing Clinic and Magokotswane Health Post) because of their proximity to each other (all within 3-4 kilometres radius).

- Phuthadikobo Clinic is allocated one ambulance because it is a 24-hour clinic.

- The rest of the facilities (Molepolole Council Clinic, Boribamo Clinic, Borakalalo, Boswelakoko Clinic and Lekgwapheng Health Post share one ambulance based in Boswelakoko Clinic (all within 3-4 kilometres radius).

(iii) Molepolole village has 10 health facilities (one district hospital, seven clinics & two health posts). Therefore, the ambulances serve nine health facilities, seven clinics and two health posts.

(iv) Ambulance/clinic ratio: 1:3 (three ambulances serving nine clinics and health posts, excluding Scottish Livingstone Hospital).

(v) Mr Speaker, transportation is essential to delivery of health services to conduct outreach services, refer patients, transport commodities and conduct health campaigns. My ministry always ensures that vehicle utilization, both ambulance and non-ambulance, is rationalized to mitigate against any negative impact that may occur and ensure that service delivery is maintained.

(vi) My ministry has been experiencing shortage of vehicles, including ambulances countrywide. However, we have continued to replenish our fleet through replacing boarded ones and procuring new ones. A tender is currently being evaluated for replacement of boarded vehicles and 45 ambulances will be purchased in this financial year. Molepolole will be considered for allocation alongside other District Health Management Teams (DHMTs) when the vehicles arrive. Thank you.



DR MMATLI: Supplementary. Thank you Honourable Minister for the elaborate answer. Minister, when do you think ambulances that are off road will be serviced so that they get back on road and service Molepolole health facilities?

MR MAKGALEMELE: Well, like I said in my answer Mr Speaker, there is a tender that is currently floating. I believe Molepolole will be considered in the 45 ambulances that we are procuring for the entire country. At this stage, I cannot say anything with certainty, but Molepolole will be considered as I have already indicated Mr Speaker. Thank you.

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: Supplementary. Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Minister. Minister, can you briefly explain when these ambulances have been off road and really what their problem is.

MR MAKGALEMELE: Mr Speaker, I do not have an answer to the Honourable Member's question. I am unable to answer it, but I can look for it. I can make it available on how many ambulances are off road and their problems, that information can be secured. Thank you.

QUALIFICATION IN THE SENIOR STRATEGIC MANAGEMENT CADRE IN THE MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND FOOD SECURITY

MR N. S. L. M. SALAKAE (GHANZI NORTH): asked the Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security to state:-

- (i) the current lowest qualification in the senior/strategic management cadre of the ministry;
- (ii) the current highest qualification in middle management and operational cadres of the ministry; and
- (iii) whether the ministry has a budget for upskilling employees; if so, what was the budget for the past five financial years.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND FOOD SECURITY (MR AUTLWETSE): Thank you Mr Speaker.

- (i) The current lowest qualification for senior or strategic management cadre of the ministry is Bachelor's Degree.

- (ii) The current highest qualification in the middle management and operational cadres are Doctorates (PhD) and Master's Degree respectively.

- (iii) My ministry has a budget for upskilling employees, and for the past five financial years, the total budget was P37 430 710 allocated as follows:

YEAR	BUDGET
2012/13	P5,502,720.00
2013/14	P5,803,250.00
2014/15	P8,114,700.00
2015/16	P9,222,550.00
2016/17	P8,787,490.00
Total	P37 430 710.00

This figure tallies with the one that I indicated at paragraph three which is P37 430 710. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR SALAKAE: Supplementary. Thank you Assistant Minister. On upskilling employees, are you talking about short courses or long term training? Thank you.

MR AUTLWETSE: I mean both Mr Speaker.

MR SALAKAE: Further supplementary. Honourable Minister, are you sure that there is someone in your Ministry who has gone for a long term training? Since you say you are doing all.

MR AUTLWETSE: Mr Speaker, the Honourable Member's question may mean both short and long courses, that is why I said I mean it all, but he did not state the duration of a long course. All I know is that the duration for a long course is three years and above, whereas duration for short courses is only for months if not weeks. Thank you Madam Speaker.

MR SALAKAE: Further supplementary. He is not answering me at all

MR SPEAKER: I said it was the last one.

BUILDINGS' STATUS AT MOTSUMI JUNIOR SECONDARY SCHOOL

MR S. LELATISITSWE (BOTETI EAST): asked the Minister of Basic Education whether the Motsumi Junior Secondary School buildings in Letlhakane are dilapidated, not safe for students use and need urgent attention; if so:-



- (i) to give an update on the conditions of geysers, ceilings, drainage and painting of the school;
- (ii) how do students cope in bad weather given that for the past two years all classrooms in the school did not have doors and over 50 per cent of the classes did not have windows;
- (iii) which other school in Botswana is in that state;
- (iv) how has the Chief Education Officer, Regional Officer and ministry reacted to this situation since discovering that the school is dilapidated; and
- (v) how the Economic Stimulus Programme (ESP) or National Development Plan 11 will address this situation.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION

(MR GOYA): Thank you Mr Speaker.

- (i) Mr Speaker, I am aware that Motsumi Junior Secondary School buildings are dilapidated as they are in need of maintenance. Generally, the school needs major maintenance of buildings, mechanical and electrical works (e.g. geysers, ceiling, doors, windows, drains, drainage systems and painting of the school)
- (ii) I am aware that it is sometimes difficult for students to cope especially when there is bad weather.
- (iii) Mr Speaker, there are many other similar schools to Motsumi in the country, for example Ramokgonami and Dukwi Junior Secondary Schools. The main challenge is vandalism of property, sometimes immediately after its maintenance. As the ministry, we have taken a decision that when we maintain the facilities, if there is any vandalism (any breaking of windows or locks), it is the responsibility of parents of those kids to repair those. Honourable Members of this house are urged to assist in this area by talking to their constituents
- (iv) Mr Speaker, my ministry has scoped the works and developed tender documents for the maintenance to be carried out. Minor maintenance will be carried out in the school before end of this financial year.
- (v) Mr Speaker, there is nothing reflected under ESP or National Development Plan 11 in terms of these schools. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR LELATISITSWE: Supplementary. Honourable Minister, thank you for identifying the lack at Motsumi CJSS. Still on minor maintenances, is it possible to tell me whether you are going to replace windows and doors since we are now approaching the rainy season?

MR GOYA: Thank you, Mr Speaker. The minor maintenance covers doors and broken windows, those are what we classify as minor works, and this is what we are going to do before the end of this financial year. Thank you.

MR NTLHAILE: Supplementary. Thank you Honourable Minister. As a follow up to your answer, you said as a Ministry, you took a decision that parents should replace school property if ever their children vandalise it. I do not know what that implies on your mandate of improving and enhancing the quality of education as Government due to the fact that we all know that most of the parents do not have money to repair damaged school property.

MR GOYA: Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. The Government is also running out funds to renovate schools, but we cannot say children should just be left to continue destroying school property, while we continue to fix the damaged property. We have requested Members of Parliament to convey a message to the parents so that they help the Ministry by reprimanding their children and making them aware that their role is to go and learn rather than to destroy school property. Children should be sensitized to take good care of school property and be mindful that these same buildings will be used by the future generation who should as well find them in a good condition. We also request parents to work together with teachers to guide and reprimand those students who are involved in vandalism of school property. Thank you.

GOVERNMENT TENDERS AT THE MINISTRY OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY

MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH): asked the Minister of Investment, Trade and Industry to state the value of Government tenders that have been awarded to the following companies in his ministry from 2007 to date:-

- (i) Estate Construction;
- (ii) Bango Trading;
- (iii) Bothakga Burrow; and



(iv) Cul De Sac.

MINISTER OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MR SERETSE): Mr Speaker, from 2007 to date my ministry has awarded tenders to three companies as follows:

- (i) Estate Construction was awarded a tender during financial year 2017/18 for construction of Plaatjan Bridge. The tender amounts to One Hundred and Four Million, Five Hundred Forty-Seven Thousand, and Thirty-Five Pula (P104 547 035.00).
- (ii) Bango Trading was awarded a tender during 2015/16 financial year for the Selebi Phikwe Airport refurbishment. The tender amounts to Fifteen Million, Fifteen Thousand, Six Hundred and Fifty Pula and Fifty-Seven Thebe (P15 015 650.57).
- (iii) Cul De Sac was awarded a tender during the financial year 2016/17 for the renovation of Botswana Investment Trade Centre, Chief Executive Officer's official residence in Phakalane. The tender amounted to Two Hundred and Six-Seven Thousand, Seven Hundred and Seven Pula Fifty-Three Thebe (P267 707.53).
- (iv) Bothakga Burrow has never been awarded any tender by my ministry during the above period.

The total value of the tenders is Hundred and Nineteen Million, Eight Hundred and Thirty-One Thousand, One Hundred and One Pula and Eighty-Two Thebe (P119 831 101.82). Thank you Mr Speaker.

MR NKAIGWA: Supplementary. Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Minister. I want to understand something regarding the listed companies, do you ever assess whether they are doing well in other Government departments where they are also engaged before awarding them tenders or you just award? What is the status of these projects that you just mentioned?

MR SERETSE: I do not have an answer with regard to the status except to say that, I think the improvement for the house has been completed. The airport refurbishment has been completed. The estate construction has not been completed, I think they are just about to start. With regard to monitoring, we expect that relevant personnel that are supposed to monitor must do exactly what is expected of them. Thank you Mr Speaker.

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: Further supplementary. Thank you very much Speaker. Thank you very much Honourable Minister. I can hear you saying that you do not have a complete answer on whether those projects are completed on time. Are you saying you are not certain of the status of these projects? Do you mean that you do not know whether the projects were completed on time? If at all they were not completed on time, what was their agreed duration and was there any cost overrun?

MR SERETSE: I usually do not want to say it is a new question. It is new in the sense that the original question did not extend to that. It is unfortunate that I did not extend myself to check for that as well. However, should you really need that information, I can go and check if indeed it was on budget or on time and give you the information, at least for the two.

PROVISION OF RESPITE CARE FACILITIES

DR T. O. MMATLI (MOLEPOLOLE SOUTH): asked the Minister of Health and Wellness if she will consider providing respite care facilities in strategic places throughout the country to cater for people living with disabilities, thus enabling their caretakers to reasonably participate in social and economic activities.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE): Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, my ministry has no plans to provide respite care facilities in strategic places in the country to cater for people living with disabilities. It is important to highlight that respite care facilities are not health facilities. However, we do acknowledge the need for such facilities for some categories of disability in the country. This initiative is better integrated into our social services system with a multi-sectoral approach to better support the affected clients and their families. I thank you Mr Speaker.

DR MMATLI: Supplementary. Honourable Minister, are you saying you could consider respite services for health services or what? I heard you saying you understand that they are not health facilities and that is my understanding also.

Secondly, are you aware that there are people who could contribute in the economy of Botswana if they were not preoccupied in taking care of people with disabilities so they are unable to cater for their other children including their own wellbeing.



MR SPEAKER: Honourable Minister, you should also explain what you mean by respite care.

MR MAKGALEMELE: Mr Speaker it refers to tools which are mostly used for the care of those with cerebral palsy and autism to allow their caretakers to participate in other activities since they need constant care as the Honourable Member alluded. I agree with you Honourable Member that if such tools were provided, indeed they could enable the caretakers of people living with disabilities to participate in other activities which would allow them to contribute and improve their livelihoods. The answer to your first question, I indicated that those tools are not health facilities. That is why I said that they are better integrated on the socio-economic side. Currently our situation does not allow us to consider them as part of the health intervention processes.

COMPANIES OWNED BY BOTSWANA MEAT COMMISSION (BMC)

MR N. S. L. M. SALAKAE (GHANZI NORTH): asked the Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security whether the Botswana Meat Commission (BMC) owns any companies; if so, to state:-

- (i) the names of those companies;
- (ii) their net profits for the past five years; and
- (iii) the amount of dividends they have been paying to BMC every year for the past five years.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND FOOD SECURITY (MR AUTLWETSE): Mr Speaker,

- (i) Botswana Meat Commission owns three subsidiary companies. These are Table Bay Cold Storage in South Africa, BMC (UK) Holdings in the United Kingdom and Mainline Carriers in Botswana.
- (ii) At Table Bay Cold Storage, profits were realised from 2012 to 2014 and losses made from 2015 to 2016. Depreciation on the re-valued assets contributed to the loss. Similarly, BMC (UK) Holdings made losses in 2012 and 2013 and thereafter made profits which declined over time. On the other hand, Mainline Carriers made profits in the past five years, i.e. from 2012 to 2016. These profits are tabulated as follows:-

Year	Profit after tax		
	Table Bay Cold Storage (Rand)	BMC (UK) Holdings (£)	Mainline Carriers (Pula)
2012	1 822 373	-946 131	251 158
2013	665 718	-400 538	337 567
2014	1 365 069	293 929	446 943
2015	-815 053	192 484	328 816
2016	-2 161 929	88 380	551 143

- (iii) Due to general poor performance of the subsidiaries, no dividends have been paid to BMC in the past five years. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR SALAKAE: Supplementary. Honourable Minister, if BMC is running at a loss and subsidiary companies are not making profits as you indicated that they are making negative 5 are you going to be able to pay farmers outstanding balances which is more than P20 million as at this month? Are you going to pay them or you are going to continue taking them for granted as usual, are you not going to pay them their balances in these coming months? Thank you.

MR AUTLWETSE: Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. I would like to explain that I did not mention anyone being taken for granted in my response. With regards to BMC paying farmers; I also cannot answer that because I do not know what the future holds. Subsidiary companies cannot make profits if the beef supply is low due to throughput and other challenges faced by the beef market in Botswana. Thank you Mr Speaker.



HONOURABLE MEMBER: Further supplementary.

MR SPEAKER: Make sure it is the last one Honourable Salakae.

MR SALAKAE: Further Supplementary. Honourable Assistant Minister, I heard you say you have no funds to pay the farmers their outstanding balances; are you aware that your Ministry has come up with a timeline of paying the farmers within 14 days?

MR AUTLWETSE: When the Honourable Member initially asked this question, he was asking about the debts that the Botswana Meat Commission (BMC) is in and whether they will be able to pay the farmers their outstanding balances. You never asked how the BMC will be able to cope be in the future. I have the question that you asked here; I will answer that one at the right time because I do not want to mix them up. Just hold on to it for now.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Further supplementary, last one.

MR SPEAKER: With all due respect, I have asked for Honourable Salakae to be the last one.

STATUS OF MOSU PRIMARY SCHOOL HOSTEL

MR S. LELATISITSWE (BOTETI EAST): asked the Minister of Local Government and Rural Development to apprise this Honourable House on the status of Mosu Primary School hostel; in particular:-

- (i) its staffing;
- (ii) student population;
- (iii) status of buildings and furniture available;
- (iv) maintenance plans; and
- (v) water situation.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN): Mr Speaker,

- (i) Mosu Primary School Remote Area Dwellers (RADS) hostel has 17 staff members and no vacant posts. There are eight cooks; two males and six females, matron and eight caretakers; four males and four females.
- (ii) The hostel capacity is 240 and hostel enrolment is currently standing at 160, 79 girls and 81 boys.

(iii) The status of buildings and furniture is such that some buildings need maintenance while some furniture needs to be repaired or replaced. It is against this background that last year, new furniture was procured for Mosu RADS hostel but it was inadequate. Additional furniture would be procured when funds are available.

(iv) There are maintenance plans for the buildings unfortunately these are limited in scope due to inadequacy of funds. Since there are inadequate funds for cyclic maintenance, the district council is only able to do spot maintenance.

(v) The settlement sometimes experiences water shortage which negatively affects the primary school hostels. As a result, the district council has provided the school with water tanks which are filled with water, by either Water Utilities Corporation (WUC) or the district council in cases of water scarcity. Thank you.

MR NTLHAILE: Supplementary. Honourable Minister, you said that you will maintain the school buildings when the funds are available; are you going to take accountability for the pupil's results that are going to get poor due to studying in an environment that is not conducive? The results are continuing to decline and this is happening in other schools too.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Murmurs)...

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Minister, hold on a moment. There is lot of noise coming from Members on my right; please be quiet, I do not want to call out anyone. You may continue Honourable Minister.

MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: My ministry has taken the responsibility for the maintenance of these facilities. I cannot say that I will be able to take responsibility, because there is no proof that because of the bad state of the facilities the result would be poor.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Further supplementary.

MR SPEAKER: The last one from Honourable Dr Phenyio Butale.

DR P. BUTALE: Does the Honourable Minister think the state of the school and all those things that have been said could somehow contribute to the poor results? I heard you say that there is no proof that the results are affected by the state of the school. You also have a procedure in which when those former industrial class



staff retire, you do not fill those vacancies because you are trying to cut down the number of civil servants; does this not affect the staffing in our primary schools?

MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: The performance of our children could be affected because the facilities might be in a bad state, but it cannot be the only contributing factor. What was your last question?

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Yes, but industrial class, that is another question which I will have to get the figures for.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: Yes, but this one there are no vacant posts here.

VALUE OF TENDERS AWARDED THROUGH ECONOMIC STIMULUS PROGRAMME

MR H. G. NKAIGWA (GABORONE NORTH): asked the Minister for Presidential Affairs, Governance and Public Administration to state the value of tenders awarded to the following companies through the Economic Stimulus Programme:-

- (i) Estate Construction;
- (ii) Bango Trading;
- (iii) Bothakga Burrow; and
- (iv) Cul De Sec.

ASSISTANT MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS GOVERNANCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR KWEREPE): Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker,

Estate Construction and Bango Trading have not been awarded any tender through the Economic Stimulus Programme.

- (iii) Mr Speaker, Bothakga Burrow has been awarded two ESP projects at the Ministries of; Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services (MLWS) and Transport and Communications (MTC) namely:

- a) Design, supervision and construction of Phakalane link road at a contract sum of fifty-one million, three hundred and forty-nine thousand, four hundred and five pula sixty-five thebe (P51,

349, 405.65), a project which was completed in September 2016.

- b) Consultancy service for pre-contract, construction supervision and post-contract services for Gaborone-Boatle road section at the value of twenty-nine million, five hundred and eighty-five thousand, eight hundred and sixty-four pula (P29, 585, 864). The project commenced in March 2017 and it is ongoing.
- (iv) Mr Speaker, Cul de Sac was awarded Kang Minimal Servicing Project by Ministry of Land Management, Water and Sanitation Services at a contract sum of five million, eight hundred and forty-seven thousand, and ninety-nine pula (P5, 847, 099.72). However, after the 10 per cent (P584, 710.00) advance payment for mobilisation, the contractor abandoned the site and the contract was terminated in May 2016. After repeated requests for refund from July 2016, Cul de Sac has not yet refunded Government and the issue has now been elevated to Attorney General's Chambers for legal advice. Thank you.

MR NTLHAILE: Supplementary. I understand that you said that they have completed them but I would like to know if those contractors finished the projects on time. Secondly, let us know the reasons why the contracts were terminated and whether there were any variations to the tenders and at what stage were those variations introduced?

MR KWEREPE: Thank you Mr Speaker. I have pointed out in my answer that the project was completed in September 2016. The other project was started in 2017, so it is still ongoing. The other one is complete, the other has been abandoned, but we will take legal action so that they would repay the mobilisation funds that were paid.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Supplementary.

MR SPEAKER: That will be the last one Honourable Nkaigwa.

MR NKAIGWA: Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Minister maybe...

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Nkaigwa please wait a moment. Honourable Members there is a lot of noise. I do not want to be calling any Honourable Member to order. Honourable Nkaigwa continue and please add a bit of energy when you speak.



MR NKAIGWA: Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Minister are you aware that we continue to give them many projects and this makes them fail to deliver on time as the Government expected them to do? Are you also aware that a company called Cul De Sac is the one that was doing the maintenance of Parliamentary flats and even now we are still in leaking houses?

MR KWEREPE: Thank you Honourable Member. I do not believe that giving a company many tenders can result in it not completing their projects, there could be other reasons. I said Cul De Sac abandoned the project. That could be a reason why they did not complete and we are still taking legal advice as what to do, the case is at the courts.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Further supplementary and the last one Mr Speaker, please.

MR SPEAKER: No, I had said Honourable Nkaigwa's would be the last one.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: You had said you would give me a chance.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: This man does not answer our questions at all Honourable Members.

VACANT POSTS AND THEIR EFFECT AT SCOTTISH LIVINGSTONE HOSPITAL

DR T. O. MMATLI (MOLEPOLOLE SOUTH): asked the Minister of Health and Wellness:-

- (i) to provide a list of vacant posts at Scottish Livingstone Hospital;
- (ii) which of the above vacancies are key to the delivery of services at the hospital;
- (iii) what effect the vacancies have on the execution of the hospital's mandate; and
- (iv) if there are plans to fill the said vacancies.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF HEALTH AND WELLNESS (MR MAKGALEMELE):

- (i) Mr Speaker, Scottish Livingstone Hospital has a total of 26 vacancies.
- (ii) All the vacancies are key to the delivery of services in the hospital. 17 positions are for the delivering of core mandate and seven are for support staff. As such, all are needed as they complement each other.

(iii) The existence of the vacancies results in shortages of staff across the hospital resulting in compromised care.

(iv) Arrangements are ongoing to fill the vacancies: letters of appointment have been offered to 11 candidates, three have been rationalised, one has been filled by transfer, one staff is on end of contract leave and will resume duty thereafter, two positions have been advertised internally, while eight remain vacant. I thank you Mr Speaker.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

LIST OF VACANCIES IN SCOTTISH LIVINGSTONE HOSPITAL

1. Principal/Registered/Nursing Officer C1234 = 2
2. Senior Dietician D4 = 1
3. Medical Specialist E2 = 2
4. Switchboard Operator B5 = 1
5. Porter B5 = 1
6. Dietician i/ii Intern C1234 = 1
7. Hospital Orderly B5 = 2
8. Kitchen Hand A2 = 1
9. Occupational Therapist C123 = 1
10. Senior Medical Records Clerk B2 = 2
11. Senior Nursing Officer D4 = 5
12. Principal/Senior/Radiographer officer C1234 = 1
13. Medical Officer D4 = 1
14. Senior/Assistant Administration Officer B2/B3 = 2
15. Principal/Medical Scientific Officer D3 = 1
16. Principal/Senior/Medical Laboratory C1234 = 2

BREAKDOWN OF VACANCIES BEING ADDRESSED

	Core	Support
- Offered = 11	9	2



- Transfer =	1	-	1
- Rationalisation =	3	1	2
- End of contract =	1	1	-
- Internal advert =	2	-	2
- Vacant =	8	6	2

CASH FLOW PROBLEMS AT BOTSWANA MEAT COMMISSION (BMC)

MR N. S. L. M. SALAKAE (GHANZI NORTH): asked the Minister of Agricultural Development and Food Security to state:-

- (i) whether the Botswana Meat Commission (BMC) still has cash flow problems;
- (ii) what measures have been put in place to address the situation;
- (iii) how long BMC takes to pay farmers; and
- (iv) whether there are still complaints from farmers with respect to late payments; if so, what strategies have been put in place to address the situation.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT AND FOOD SECURITY (MR AUTLWETSE): Mr Speaker,

- (i) Botswana Meat Commission has cash-flow problems which are necessitated by both internal (old plant) and external (low throughput) deficiencies of the beef value chain.
- (ii) Government's notable interventions include the recent national consultations on the future of BMC and commissioning of the on-going study on liberalisation of the beef export market. A final determination on the referred recommendations is yet to be decided by Cabinet.
- (iii) Botswana Meat Commission has set a turnaround standard to pay cattle-producers (farmers) within 14 days after slaughter (for direct slaughter suppliers), or delivery (for feedlot bound cattle). Currently, Francistown pays within the set standard of 14 days while Maun and Lobatse are failing to comply due to cash flow problems.
- (iv) There are still complaints from farmers whose payments have been delayed by the BMC. The strategies put in place to address the situation

include the following;

- BMC has acquired bank facilities to bridge the cash flow.
- Government is in the process of implementing the measles control strategy
- Fast track registration of holdings for European Union (EU) traceability compliance
- Strengthen Foot and Mouth surveillance and control measures.

I thank you.

MR SALAKAE: Supplementary. Thank you Mr Speaker and thank you Honourable Assistant Minister. I hear you properly Assistant Minister when you say the BMC has got persistent cash flow problems. Are you aware that when you say a company has got cash flow problems, you are simply saying that a company is unable to sustain itself? So, is your Government telling this Parliament that the BMC is unable to sustain itself? Therefore, how then is it going to service more than 20 million accounts payable to farmers, most of which are ordinary farmers?

MR AUTLWETSE: Mr Speaker, I believe I have explained that there is an ongoing study by the Government where they saw it fit to engage a private consultant to assist with assessing what the future of BMC could be. We have our own thoughts, but we do not want to conclude this issue more so that at a time when we did consultations, stakeholders humbly requested that there should be a study that can help us with how the challenges BMC is facing could be resolved. Before this study comes out, I do not want to be too forward to state the conclusion that was reached because eventually the information will end up where such issues should be taken to.

MR SALAKAE: Further supplementary.

MR SPEAKER: Let it be the last one Honourable Salakae.

MR SALAKAE: Thank you Mr Speaker and thank you Honourable Assistant Minister. Assistant Minister, you are answering a completely different question. My question was very simple and straightforward saying, "are you aware that when you say a company has got cash flow problems, you are simply saying that particular company is unable to sustain itself?" Let me stop here.



MR AUTLWETSE: It is unable to sustain itself yes; that is the reason why the Government has been injecting some funds in it and currently, she has seen it fit to engage another company to assist with finding out what the final solution could be. I am not disputing the fact that BMC has cash flow problems, that is a fact.

**BOTETI EAST CONSTITUENCY JUNIOR
SECONDARY SCHOOLS NOT DOING
PRACTICAL SUBJECTS**

MR S. LELATISITSWE (BOTETI EAST): asked the Minister of Basic Education:-

- (i) to state the actual funds disbursed to the under listed votes in all junior secondary schools in Boteti East Constituency and Nanogang Junior Secondary School in Gaborone respectively: feeding, stationery, service charges, domestic, staff uniform, minor works, maintenance and practical subjects;
- (ii) what percentage is allocated to each vote against what the school had requested as an annual or quarterly demand;
- (iii) whether it is true that students in Boteti East Constituency junior secondary schools are not doing practical subjects because funds are never adequate to even buy the necessary items for these subjects; and
- (iv) when these schools will be given enough funds to carry them through the year.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION (MR GOYA): Mr Speaker, the actual funds disbursed to Boteti East Constituency Junior Secondary Schools make a lengthy report. I propose that the Honourable Member receive a hard copy of this report if it satisfies this House.

MR SPEAKER: How long is that answer?

MR GOYA: It is very long Mr Speaker, five pages but the fifth page, I will read it out Mr Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: Yes, just make that quick summary.

MR GOYA: Mr Speaker, I would like to point out that the funds distributed to these schools are based on formulae which consider the numbers of learners and whether the school has a boarding element or not.

Mr Speaker, the students in Boteti East Constituency Junior Secondary Schools do practical subjects.

However, the money given is not adequate for students to do enough practice before the final examinations.

- (iv) My ministry provides funds to all schools within our financial constraints. I have been unable to meet all of the requests for funds by schools, but I remain committed to continue to increase the schools' budgets as and when funds become available and we improve our operational efficiency. I thank you Mr Speaker.

MR LELATISITSWE: Supplementary.

MR SPEAKER: how do you know that what you are seeking clarity on is on the response I am yet to give?

MR LELATISITSWE: No, it is not there

MR SPEAKER: Be brief Honourable Member, question time is up.

MR LELATISITSWE: Thank you. Honourable Minister, concerning practical subjects, I understand that the funds are not enough. How do you expect students to pass the practical subjects without having followed the practice from the school sessions?

MR GOYA: Mr Speaker, we are in an era whereby we are supposed to do more with the little that we have. That is why I was saying that we are just trying to manage the little that we have to ensure that students have their examinations. Thank you.

TABLING OF PAPERS

MR SPEAKER: I understand the Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Development has a paper to table.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ...(Inaudible)...

MR SPEAKER: Did he not request anyone to stand in for him? Okay, we will later date it. He had requested for a later date but we cannot remove it from the office and have to follow the procedure. So, later date.

Later Date.

BOTSWANA INNOVATION FUND ORDER, 2017

(Minister of Finance and Economic Development)

Later Date.

**RESPONSE TO THE PRESIDENT'S
SPEECH**

Motion

(Resumed Debate)



MR SPEAKER: Order! Order! We are resuming debate on this Motion. When we adjourned last Thursday, Honourable Keorapetse was on the floor. He had just started and he is still left with 44 minutes 52 seconds.

MR KEORAPETSE (SELEBI PHIKWE WEST): Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker, pardon me I have got influenza, but I will debate nonetheless.

Mr Speaker, let me start off by thanking both the President for his State of the Nation Address and Leader of the Opposition for his response to the State of the Nation address. The most important highlight of the President's speech was his commitment to retire next year April, unlike other African leaders who are sitting tight and are showing no signs of retiring; some with clear intentions of dying in office. There was a big fight in one Parliament in Africa where the President seeks to extend his term of office. Whilst that President is still at that, he is also grooming his son to take over. So let us thank the President for agreeing to retire. We may also have to take this opportunity to deal with the politics of blood relations and dynastic successions. I hope the message should be sent to, especially the ruling party that these politics of dynastic successions have no place in modern history...

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: Elucidation. Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. I hear you very well; we can congratulate him, and say that he has done a good job, but are we not worried by Paragraph 5 of his speech where it says that his own Cabinet chose him to be the Champion of Vision 2036? What are the implications?

MR KEORAPETSE: I will deal with that point at a later stage, but I am just wondering General Mokgware how that came about. Anyway he is still holding power, so he will not be holding this power from April 1st henceforth and I think that decision can be reversed. I do not know how he could be chosen to be the Champion of Vision 2036 when he has not delivered on Vision 2016 for 20 years. I say 20 years because that is the time he spent in the Office of the President; 10 years as Vice President and 10 years as President.

Mr Speaker, there is no doubt that Botswana of today is much better than Botswana of 1966 when this country got independence. There is no doubt. I think that is why the ruling party thinks that we need to always shower them with accolades that there was a five kilometre road, there were no graduates from universities and so on and

so forth. When you compare us with Zambia, Malawi and some other African countries, yes, you could say as Clark Leith has put it, that Botswana has prospered. Look at others which took the same economic marathon around the 1960s; look at the Asian Tigers, Hong Kong, Singapore, South Korea and Taiwan, who took an economic marathon alongside Botswana almost half a century ago. We took this marathon with the Asian Tigers. When we got our independence in 1966, Mauritius got hers in 1968. Compare us today with these countries. As I said, when you compare us with your Democratic Republic of Congo (DRCs), your Zambias and your Malawis, you would agree with Clark Leith that Botswana has prospered. Between 1960s and 1990s Mr Speaker, the Tigers registered an average annual growth rate of seven per cent and Botswana out passed them for 30 years, during that time when we were enjoying a whopping 9.2 per cent economic growth and that economic growth is only surpassed, I think by China. For 30 years we surpassed economic growth rate of these economic Tigers.

Now here is the paradox at the turn of the 21st century Mr Speaker...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR KEORAPETSE: I am making my point. All of these Asian Tigers which took an economic marathon with you almost half a century ago, some of them have now graduated into first world. They are called the newly industrialised countries of South Asia and where are we? We are still in third world.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR KEORAPETSE: Let us hear what you have to clarify.

MR GUMA: Clarification. Are we really third world or middle income state sir? Well, that is not my point. When you are using these comparative figures, are you using the same baseline?

MR KEORAPETSE: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR GUMA: No, when you say the other country was 9 per cent, we are at 4 per cent, are you using the same baseline to calculate those percentages?

MR KEORAPETSE: You know, Honourable Guma, what you need to forget about is the orthodox economic precepts or be obsessed with these calculations. What you need to understand is that these economies can be



said to have prospered and we cannot be said to have prospered. Look at the poverty levels, unemployment levels, level of Information and Communications Technology (ICT) and the education system in those countries. These are the variables that we need to look at, not the mathematical figures. We cannot be called a newly industrialised country. We cannot be called a first world country. We are still a developing country. The point I am making is that these countries when they got their independence almost the same time as us, they were even worse off in that most of them, if not all of them, did not have minerals in recoverable quantities like we had coal, diamonds, nickel, copper and many others.

Look at Mauritius, it took independence two or three years after us. When you look at unemployment in Botswana today, it is 20 per cent, Mauritius we are talking about 7.6 per cent. Poverty levels; Mauritius is 7.9 per cent, in Botswana we are talking about 20 per cent or 19.4 per cent. This is the country which is not well resourced with minerals. We have not moved.

Sir Seretse Khama talked about Economic Diversification Drive (EDD) for the 14 years that he was the President, Quett Masire talked about Economic Diversification Drive for the 18 years he was President, Festus Mogae talked about the same thing, President Khama is talking about Economic Diversification Drive, but where are we? Why is it that we are not moving? Why is it that all the speeches have this Economic Diversification Drive as the overarching objective of Government?

You know what we need to do, we need to face the reality that we need martial plan. We need economic transformation in this country because we cannot apply business as usual. This is what the State of the Nation Address is actually telling us, that it is business as usual. There is nothing that is robust. There is nothing that shows that there is an intention of turning around this economy. We are still basking on past glory and these accolades are misleading us. Accolades such as the one by Clark Leith that Botswana has prospered. Accolades such as the one by Ismail Samatar, who said Botswana is an African miracle. Mr Speaker, look at who is saying we are an African miracle, a Somali, from a failed state. We have to listen to these accolades that we are an African miracle. I am glad that my Professor Calmon Mogalakwe wrote back a journal article and said, "this is a case of mistaken identity. There is no how we can be an African miracle."

Well, Honourable Vice President, we are the only ones in Sub-Saharan Africa to have sustained multiparty democracy and unbroken record. That one yes, we deserve ... (interruption) ... but in terms of economic prosperity, we cannot be said to have prospered economically.

Let me hear what Honourable Kgathi has to say.

MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR KGATHI): Clarification. Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you colleague. Honourable Keorapetse, I think the point raised by Honourable Guma of comparison in terms of baseline is realistic. You cannot talk about non-development in Botswana when you compare economic growth or level of industrialization and social transformation without giving a baseline. Surely, if you look at literacy rate in Botswana from as way back as 1966, do the same comparison with that of the Asian Tigers, where they were and where did we start from. Otherwise your argument does not hold water.

MR KEORAPETSE: Honourable Kgathi, you think Botswana was worse off than Mauritius when it took independence, Botswana was endowed with minerals, Mauritius was not. Compare Gaborone with Port Louis today. I do not know what you are trying to get at. You are trying to make us believe that you were worse off than the Asian Tigers. I am saying these countries were also economically poor. We were almost at par...

MR GUMA: Clarification. Honourable Member, are you comfortable with where we are at, the inflation rate comparably with other economies that are at middle level income? We are hovering between 3.1 and 3.5 maximum per year, are you comfortable with that? What does it say about the management of the economy?

MR KEORAPETSE: The question by Honourable Moyo does not help my debate in anyway because Mr Speaker as I have said, I am not a student of this orthodox economics. When the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank told African countries that liberalise trade and finance, cut public expenditure, service law, the Government should roll back and embark on inflation targeting under the guise of macroeconomic stability, those who listened are nowhere to be found in terms of competitiveness and economic development. The Tigers are a clear example of defiance of IMF and World Bank. Had they gone that route, we would probably be at the same level with the Asian Tigers, but



they did not listen. They said, “no, what we are going to do, we are going to develop our economies the way we deem fit.” I am not going to embark on a debate on inflation targeting because I know it has not helped African countries. Inflation targeting at the expense of jobs and at the expense of development of our own people. I do not think it is something that we need to waste time...

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: Elucidation. Thank you very much Honourable Keorapetse. I mean, you are right Honourable Member, we are told that Botswana economy has grown by 4.3 per cent. Can a man on the street actually see that sort of growth, can he feel it? The unemployment rate has gone up Minister Kgathi. Is that clear ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: Yes, because people are suffering and you are talking about statistics which people do not eat. This is what the Honourable Member is talking about here. We are not talking about the growth in inflation or either its low or what, we are talking about people's lives. He is right to say that it does not reflect in people's daily lives. How many companies have closed up? This is what he is saying.

MR KEORAPETSE: Yes, that is true my colleague. It has been jobless growth.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Elucidation.

MR KEORAPETSE: No! Let me go on with my debate. The point we are making Honourable Speaker is that, there is a problem with this economy with its dependence on mineral revenue and exports. Prominent features of this economy is unemployment, poverty, wealth and income inequalities. These are prominent features of our economy. Nothing much has been achieved in terms of Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) and even Domestic Investment. Otherwise, we would not be talking about these high levels of unemployment and poverty, ranging around 20 per cent. I do not think that the presidency of President Khama has even helped us because these unemployment figures of about 20 per cent, do not include Ipelegeng participants, this is a delusion, how are we expected to respond properly when you include Ipelegeng participants as if they are employed? Even when you include those who have given up on looking for jobs, unemployment rate can go up to 40 per cent if you include Ipelegeng participants. That is why the happy planet index rates Botswana

among the unhappiest people in the world. We may look happy because you are cracking jokes that side when we are talking about serious matters but the truth is that we are unhappy because you decided to close the BCL Mine acting on ill-informed advice. There is no how we can be happy. President Khama has not done much about improving our economy and is worse off than when he became President. Some of you say it is because when he became the President there was global economic meltdown. Were we the only people to have experienced global economic meltdown? Honourable Guma Moyo, think about the Asian crisis of the 1970s, it was experienced by the Asian tigers but they weathered the storm. They became the newly industrialized countries, notwithstanding the Asian crisis. It was for a very long time when that Asian crisis was there and it hit them hard. I told you that for 30 years your economic growth surpassed those of the Asian tigers.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Elucidation.

MR SPEAKER: Order! Wait a minute Honourable Keorapetse. Honourable Kgathi, if you talk holding that microphone, it produces some feedback from recording. Do not hold it. Proceed Honourable Keorapetse.

MR KEORAPETSE: Mr Speaker, we will remember President Khama as the President, by all the tough measures that he introduced on many fronts, notably the alcohol levy and the restrictions on operating liquor industries, these are the things that have almost destroyed our entertainment industry and our performing arts because of these restrictions. It has even affected our tourism. People now prefer, even on weekends, Batswana, Honourable Kgathi, prefer to go to South Africa to go and enjoy themselves, either in Rustenburg or Johannesburg or elsewhere because there are no restrictions. If you go to Cape Town in Long Street, it is up to you when you are tired, but in this country at 2 o'clock we are supposed to be chased out of the club because the police may come to close the club down. What is this? These are the things that we will remember President Khama's presidency by and we implore His Honour the Vice President that, as soon as you assume office, make sure that this is rectified. We have even attracted not so laudatory labels that we attracted during President Seretse Khama, President Masire and President Festus Mogae, we started now attracting labels such as your authoritarian liberalism, soft autocrat, military dune damask raiding as a democracy. These are some of the labels that we attracted under the presidency of Ian Khama. We will remember him with the higher numbers



of people who are unemployed. We will remember him by high numbers of extra judicial killings, including the infamous, execution of John Kalafatis, by the men in uniform, which he later pardoned and the reasons for pardoning those criminals are still unknown. We know that he has the executive power to pardon criminals as he has done with others, committing their sentences, etcetera. We do not know why the killers of John Kalafatis were pardoned. It is something that we will have to deal with as the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC) Government.

President Khama probably has been the most costly President we have ever had. The caravan that he purchased, refurbishment of the State House when he came in, the recent chopper that was bought. I asked a question here in Parliament, Honourable Kgathi was telling us that including Value Added Tax (VAT), it was around P297 million. For all intents and purposes, this President has been the most costly President we have ever had. We appeal to His Honour the Vice President when he gets in to...

MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR KGATHI): On a point of procedure. Mr Speaker, the point of procedure I stand on will require your good brains in the interpretations of the Standing Orders and the understanding of what is a State of the Nation Address. Do you think Mr Speaker, it is fair and within procedure for us, as Honourable Keorapetse does, to stand up and do editorials on the speech and hence rendering interpretations on the speech, when he is on the opposition, he possibly should be giving an alternative to the speech of the other party.

MR SPEAKER: Order! I understand you Honourable Kgathi. When Honourable Members respond to the President's speech, I do not think they are restricted to start off with a review of the President and the country at large and render their opinion thereafter. It is solely upon them to choose what to say during their debate. My responsibility is to ensure that nobody crosses the line in disrespecting the President as per the prescriptions of the Standing Orders. The layout of the presentation of their debates is determined by them. Proceed Honourable Keorapetse.

MR KEORAPETSE: Thank you Mr Speaker. I was saying these are the things that we will remember President Ian Khama for. Media freedoms...

MR MOREMI: Point of order. Mr Speaker, deliver us from the Vice President, maybe he is tired.

MR SPEAKER: I have been talking to him. I believe he is listening, there is no problem.

MR KEORAPETSE: I was saying under this President; we have seen some of the laws that some people were not aware of; that this country has provisions on sedition in the Penal Code. Outsa Mokone has been charged with sedition. Edgar Tsimane fled the country. These are the things that we saw under the presidency of Ian Khama.

Honourable Kgathi is saying that we should present an alternative. We always present alternatives in this House. For instance; when the Leader of the Opposition presented here, he said under the Umbrella for Democratic Change (UDC), we will create 100 000 jobs in the first 12 months. Some of you laughed thinking that this was impossible. This is possible if you re-open the BCL mine. According to the Finance and Economic Development Minister when he came here to ask for a loan guarantee, he made it clear that BCL group employed 6 000 people directly and that indirectly it employed 10 000 people. If you re-open BCL, already you have about 20 000 jobs including other industries like the banking, financial sector and so forth. Fill up the vacant positions in Government including employment of Interns and Tirelo-Setšhaba participants, then you are on your way to 100 000. Forget about the purchase of the Gripens and employ more police officers then you are en route 100 000 jobs. Make sure that you have more money to help the start-ups because the future of employment does not lie in the big corporations. They do not employ anymore; instead what they are doing right now is to reduce their sizes. Employment will be created by start-ups; small, medium economic enterprises. These are the things that we are saying as the alternatives; the alternative to achieving 100 000 jobs in 12 months. It is not impossible. It is very possible if we do not prioritise Gripens over employment of graduates. This is how it has to be done.

Under the President Ian Khama, our Judiciary has lost integrity, the public has lost the confidence in it and it is in trouble. For the first time in our history, four Judges were suspended. They are now reinstated after apologising to the President and four are about to be suspended including a Judge who is hearing the case on the Electronic Voting Machines (EVMs). He may be suspended. When you look at the steps, how it got to the suspension of previous Judges; Justice Dingake and the three others, now we have other four Judges and it appears that, that is where we are headed, where they will ultimately be suspended. One of these Judges, we



were not surprised because the case on EVMs is before him. We were not surprised. It did not come as a surprise when the newspaper reported that the Directorate of Intelligence Services (DIS) was behind this Judge all the time. It came as a no surprise that there is an exchange of letters between the Chief Justice, the Judicial Service Commission (JSC) and that there was a case pertaining to the petition that was signed by 12 Judges. It came as no surprise to us because he is a Judge who is hearing a case on EVMs and one of the fairest-minded Judges we know in this country. So we were not surprised.

The Judiciary under this President did not also escape what the media experienced. It did not escape what the public servants experienced when we witnessed the mother of all strikes in 2011 (industrial relations). Under this President, four names were refused after the JSC carefully assessed these men. They are fit and proper to be Justices of High Court. President Khama said they are not proper and fit and refused to appoint them until one of them, Mr Motumise took him to court. President Khama was still reluctant to appoint him even when the Court of Appeal pronounced him as proper and fit to be Judge. These are the things that we will remember President Khama's Government with. Honourable Kgathi is saying we fail to present alternatives. We have presented you with alternatives saying improve the system of appointment of Justices and nomenclature of the JSC. We cannot have five people who have been appointed by the President and only one who is a nominee of the Law Society recommending to the President on who to appoint Judge.

We have said expand this JSC; make it more inclusive. We have said to you Honourable Kgathi that reform the Constitution. Make sure that when these people are interviewed, it is public interviews like it is happening in the progressive democracies. These are the alternatives that we talked about. We have presented you an alternative that for 20 years that President Khama was Vice President and was President, there was no single female who has been called to the Court of Appeal bench.

MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR KGATHI): Procedure. No Mr Speaker, we are not in coalition in Government. We are not in coalition whereby you can say "we provided alternatives." If they do not make sense we cannot implement them and if they make sense, we do. Now you are comparing the two issues. Recently Professor Otlhogile said Khama has not started something new. It

has happened in 1967 for the President and he professed. He is an authority in law! Who are you?

MR SPEAKER: Order! Honourable Kgathi, that is not a procedure; it is a point of complaint. Let him debate, you will respond later.

MR KEORAPETSE: This is the same Professor in a book authored by Wayne Edge and Mogopodi Lekorwe who has penned an article, saying that Section 47 (1) and (2) of the Constitution of Botswana effectively authorises dictatorship. Thank you for agreeing with him. The Professor was merely reminding us what President Khama is doing by refusing to appoint a Judge. It is what his father did when he was President. That was merely what he sought to remind us about. We are in agreement; you and I on President Khama. We said the Court of Appeal, let us legislate here in Parliament that it must be localised and that there must be a quota for females. These are the alternatives that we offered but you ignored them. Today you come here and say we do not offer alternatives. We offer alternatives but you ignored our alternatives.

Mr Speaker, my constituency is in trouble as a result of the closure of BCL. I have said before, that BCL and the town of Selebi Phikwe's economy were Siamese twins, inseparable. Prior to the closure of the BCL, Selebi Phikwe and the SPEDU region had 35 000 households or 121 000 people in terms of the 2011 Census. Selebi Phikwe alone had 16 000 households or 49 000 population in terms of the 2011 Census. BCL employed 15 per cent of the region's workforce, this is about 5000 plus or 1.5 per cent of the workforce of the region. BCL was directly responsible for/ between 20 to 25 per cent...

MR SPEAKER: Order! Wait Honourable Keorapetse. In this Parliament, there is no Member who is allowed to stand up while the other Member is debating. If you want to talk, you can talk while seated. You do not just stand like someone in a train.

MR KEORAPETSE: BCL was directly responsible for/ between 20 to 25 per cent spending by households in the SPEDU region, this is the estimation by Econsult. BCL accounted for 2.4 per cent of the Gross Domestic Product in the first half of 2016. In terms of exports, it was responsible for around 2 billion or 4.5 per cent of total exports. There is no doubt that BCL closure was a big blunder by this Government. Apart from this Mr Speaker, we know that BCL was the biggest client to Morupule Colliery, to those who sold petroleum, to



Botswana Power Corporation, Botswana Water Utilities Corporation, the financial sector including banks and insurance companies, Botswana Railways and many others. Most of these are now affected as a result of the closure of BCL. We were told by this Government that the reason for closing BCL was that the mine was deep and expensive to mine and we wondered, elsewhere they are mining in excess of 3 kilometres, the deepest shaft in BCL was 1.54 metres. We were told that the...

MR GUMA: Point of order. I think Honourable Member while we want to listen to you, it is wrong for you to mislead the House. The truth of the matter is that at the time of closure, what was the liquidity position and the financial status of BCL then? Forget about viability, what state was it in? Was it in a state that it can actually sustain itself? The answer is no.

MR SPEAKER: Order! I think it is neater for you Honourable Guma to correct him if he is not telling the truth. So that if we have to reprimand him, we know who is telling the truth. I do not have any BCL figures here, even on my brain I have not memorised them. So, debate accordingly for me to be able to help.

MR KEORAPETSE: I will ignore what Honourable Guma has said, because he is the one that is misleading the House. We were told that the Government has been pouring money 37 out of 40 years, but when you look at the realities that the last time Government pumped money into BCL just about when it closed was around 2002. For 14 years BCL was sustaining itself. What we also know about BCL is that the Government decided to shift goalposts during the game.

MR GUMA: Correction. We gave a guarantee to Barclays Bank that is a contingent liability, which is cash injection, after the closure we had to pay that amount. We injected cash, do not say we have not.

MR KEORAPETSE: He is wasting my time again, because I said just before it closed. Remember that that guarantee was in April and the BCL closed in October. I am saying before then, for 14 years it was sustaining itself and that is what I am telling you and that information is correct. It is the same information that was presented to Cabinet on the 1st of October. BCL management presented to your Cabinet that they had a four Dollar per Pound plan which they proposed that "retrench and make sure that we have a linear structure, make sure that you complete the deal with Nkomati". This is very painful Mr Speaker because this

Government told us that the reason why they are rushing onto liquidating BCL was because Norilsk Nickel was likely to liquidate BCL.

Mr Speaker, what we know now is that this Government claims that it does owe Norilsk Nickel, but it is the same Government which told us that they owe Norilsk Nickel P3 billion and that is why they are rushing into liquidating BCL.

MINISTER OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT (MR MATAMBO): Correction. Thank you very much Mr Speaker. Of course it would serve no useful purpose if what we are going to say correcting the Member and he keeps on denying it. The truth of the matter is that BCL did not during these years that you are talking about sustain itself. Time after time, repeatedly there were a lot of financial restructurings at BCL and each time the Government was either injecting cash directly or was forfeiting to receive dividends from BCL. These are facts and you cannot deny them. You are also aware that other investors in BCL kept on withdrawing, until Government was left alone being the major shareholder. At the beginning Government owned 15 per cent only. I do not know whether you know these facts. Thank you.

MR KEORAPETSE: I think what Honourable Matambo is talking about I addressed it in one of the articles. If you have not seen it I will send it to you. That is why I am saying as Government because of the value of BCL in the SPEDU region, in the economy of this country, not just of the SPEDU region and Selebi Phikwe, BCL was never treated like a public enterprise, in which the Government will continuously cash dividends. It was a deliberate economic model to sustain Selebi Phikwe and other industries like the Botswana Power Corporation, Water Utilities Corporation and many others. Look at the ripple effect of closing BCL, everybody is now retrenching; Water Utilities Corporation, Botswana Power Corporation, the financial sector; banks, insurances and all these companies are now retrenching. Mr Speaker...

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR TSOGWANE): Procedure. Thank you Mr Speaker. Mr Speaker I thought the two Honourable Members, Minister Matambo and Guma Moyo wanted us to get the facts right, because there are two positions here; the position of the Honourable Member holding the floor and the position of Government. We must clearly leave this House



knowing which one is the correct position, because he keeps on changing and shifting once a clarification or correction has been given. We really need to know the truth, because we are not in this House for game of politics, we are here to know the truth and the people out there want to know the truth too. If there are two positions and one Honourable Member insists that he is correct or he once wrote an article somewhere which we never had access to or we have not seen, let us hear the truth. It is a very critical point that he is raising and it has got repercussions going forward. I thank you.

MR SPEAKER: Order! you know what, when you made your Standing Orders, there is no section which states that everyone debating should produce evidence, you know that right? We believe that when a Member of Parliament debates, they are being honest because you are Honourable Members. That is why I am saying when you refute something, do so but with facts. If one member has made an error correct him/her properly as Honourable Matambo was doing. When the member disagrees, I cannot force him to agree with Honourable Matambo. All we do is to record that so and so said this, Honourable Matambo corrected here, you know the process.

That is why at the end of our debates we have a response by the Leader of the House Honourable Vice President. He will explain all the issues raised. If you want to have a great debate do so by stating facts, you should not force me to get involved in your debates. You will not enjoy your debate right? Honourable Keorapetse, proceed.

MR KEORAPETSE: Yes, Mr Speaker. My main problem with this Government is that they change the rules of the game during the game. BCL was never treated like a proper public enterprise in which Government will cash dividends. The forfeiture that the Honourable Minister has talked about was done by Seretse Khama, Quett Masire and Mogae for a long time with deliberate intentions of making sure that people are kept in their jobs. The BCL management requested P2 billion injection, P1 billion in 2016 and another P1 billion in 2017. That is all they needed and also a commitment that BCL will be restructured.

The most painful thing about the closure of BCL is that, when His Honour the Vice President and other Ministers visited Selebi Phikwe, they made a litany of promises. He used the phrase soft landing as a caring Government, "we care about you as the former workers of BCL mine and we will make sure that you are

adequately compensated so that you can even start life afresh, if this mine does not open anytime soon." He said these words at the Selebi Phikwe stadium. What the former BCL mine workers experienced was a crash landing instead of the soft landing that His Honour the Vice President promised, crash landing in the sense that promises were made that they may be paid between 12 to 18 months after the closure of the mine, they will continue to stay in BCL houses for around a year and their kids school fees will be paid at private schools, the BCL mine hospital will be kept open and many other promises. However, look at what happened to the people who worked in BCL mine, they were paid one-month salary notice. That is what they were paid. They were paid their leave days and their bonus. All these things were due to them, whether the mine was closed or not, they had to be paid their salary for that month. They had to be paid their annual bonus and their leave days. These are the only things that were paid to the workers because according to the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) Government, when one liquidates their company, workers can go home empty handed. It happened with that mine in Boteti, workers went home with nothing.

In Selebi Phikwe, notwithstanding the promise that they will be paid between 12 to 18 months, they were never paid. Up to now, they have not been paid retrenchment packages because the Government says the law does not compel to pay retrenchment packages. We are saying as a caring Government that you said you were when you addressed Selebi Phikwe residents, predominantly former mine workers, you said you will provide soft landing including adequate payment so that these people can start life afresh. Instead, you delivered crash landing. People are going hungry as we speak at their homes, Mr Speaker. They have nothing to eat and this is not a joke. They cannot feed their families and some have committed suicide. They have nothing, notwithstanding the promise. Even worse, some who were injured and sustained occupational diseases were left to die because of how the public health care system operates. Some were scheduled for medical procedures at private hospitals, Gaborone Private Hospital (GPH) and South Africa, but after the closure of the mine, the Government said, "now you have to queue like everybody else." It does not matter whether you were scheduled a medical procedure in a few weeks' time before the mine was closed, it is up to you, otherwise, you will have to queue. Some will tell you that I can only see a specialist in eight months and in the meantime, what is happening? Therefore, these are the realities in the town of Selebi Phikwe.



MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: On a point of elucidation Mr Speaker. Thank you very much Honourable Keorapetse. This is the most hurting issue that as a leader, a Member of Parliament you have to take into consideration. If you retrench a person now and that person has a loan at the bank, what does it say to you? That person has a medical condition which you are aware of, what does that translate into the medical aid? Most people who had loans and medical conditions were left with nothing, it means they had to sell all their assets to pay their debts. That is why people committed suicide. We did not even have a strategy on how we are going to deal with these people and this is very painful.

MR KEORAPETSE: You know it is very painful Honourable Mokgware. One of the senior ruling party officials told me that they have relatives who lost their jobs at BCL and was asking me if something can be done about the banks which are threatening to auction people's property and threatening with civil imprisonment. I said, you are close to the guys in Government, why do you not talk to them so that they deliver on their promise of soft landing by paying these people retrenchment packages. That is the reality in Selebi Phikwe. Creditors including micro lenders and commercial banks are phoning those former mine workers everyday threatening them with civil imprisonment. Some have started the process of auctioning whatever little property they have. I am just wondering what happened to the soft landing promised by His Honour the Vice President. It is very painful.

Selebi Phikwe town and the SPEDU region need a marshal plan. What we need is something akin to a marshal plan which was done on the reconstruction of Europe after it was devastated by the war. We do not need empty promises of that. We will revitalise the economy and when you go, there is nothing that is happening on the ground. One year after the BCL was closed, tell us how many jobs were created in Selebi Phikwe? Ask this Government how many jobs were created since the closure of the mine? The promises of job creation and revitalisation of the economy must become a reality. Transform SPEDU Honourable Minister to make sure that it drives the economy of that region. It should not just play a facilitative role; it must play more roles, the one stop centre, in which one can go and register a business, get tax clearance, land and all those things. SPEDU must have that responsibility. Transform SPEDU into a proper entity that can turn around the economy of the town; turn around the economy of that region. Otherwise there is no point in declaring the

SPEDU region a Special Economic Zone (SEZ) and then you do nothing. I appreciate the few initiatives that you have done there Honourable Seretse, but we want to see these initiatives in practice. We do not just want to read about them on papers; no, we want you to actualise these promises.

Having said that Mr Speaker, we beforehand congratulate His Honour the Vice President because we were told that he will be taking the baton from President Khama. I guess as Bangwato, we have to welcome Mr Khama back to Mmangwato to reclaim his Bogosi position. Thank you Mr Speaker.

MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS, GOVERNANCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR MOLALE): Thank you Mr Speaker. Let me also

take this opportunity to comment on His Excellency the President's State of Nation Address. It was a beautiful speech that outlined all that was done in order to improve the lives of Batswana. Anyone who has read the President's speech in detail should be able to ask themselves what other country can achieve all that. This is our unique culture and practice for the President to freely address issues that affect citizens from all four corners of this country. This shows that our President is hands on and knows what is happening with the lives of the citizens of this country because there is no week that passes ...

MR SPEAKER (MR MOLATLHEGI): Order! We do not have quorum; someone must have left when I was not looking ...

...silence...

MR SPEAKER: Order! You may continue Honourable Molale.

MR MOLALE: Mr Speaker, this clearly shows that he is a President that has Batswana's interests at heart and that is why he wants every Motswana to hear his speech to confirm that what he is saying is nothing but the truth. The President stated that we experience challenges, but we do not give up; we carry on.

Some people complained that this was his last address as a President but he never said anything about progress regarding the five D's that he came up with when he first became the President. Anyone that has carefully read his speech will realise without shadow of doubt that he gave feedback on the five D's. Those D's stand for Democracy, Development, Dignity, Delivery and Discipline. If I may



paraphrase what was said by Honourable Butale that Botswana is much worse than it was before President Khama became the leader of this country; that is not true. The problem with the opposition is that they will oppose the truth even if it is right in front of them. That is not right. It is quite clear that there is democracy in this country and it has got stronger.

President Khama's Government continues to fight corruption which is one of the measures of good governance. Another factor is that of political stability and absence of violence; we have challenges but we have stability because Batswana believe in peace. We want Batswana to continue with the knowledge that there is peace in this country; we recently witnessed what could happen if there is no peace within a family when some people fought and poked each other's eyes out...

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Laughter!)...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Was it a slingshot?

MR MOLALE: When there is no peace then there is a problem. President Khama's Government has maintained peace and even encouraged those who lost peace amongst themselves to get their act together and get it back...

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Murmurs)...

MR MOLALE: For peace to exist amongst you...

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Inaudible)...

MR MOLALE: Honourable Kgathi will be in a better position to say where this lack of peace surfaced. There is also what we call a regulatory quality; how the Government is run. The laws that are passed in this Parliament; even though some people choose to oppose them whilst deep down they know it will be beneficial to them. We need to understand and appreciate that opposition forms part of Democratic Governance but if people are just going to oppose and say things that are not true, that in some way makes Batswana realise that they have somewhat made a mistake by bringing such a person to Parliament.

Mr Speaker we have examples that we can give when we talk about democracy. We are not the ones who come up with benchmarks for the examples I will mention here. Countries have agreed on what true democracy is. There are certain benchmarks which are adhered to like the ones that I talked about of political

stability, regulating quality, the rule of law, voice and accountability. We have a number of institutions around the world, credible institutions around the world that monitor us as Botswana and other countries. Right here Mr Speaker, for 2017, I have the Positive Peace Index which states that Botswana is one of the two countries to achieve high peace since 2008, a year when President Khama assumed office. When others say Botswana is worse off, I do not know how they are looking at things. There are credible institutions, and they have pointed out that President Khama has done a good job because Botswana is one... I quote Mr Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: Do quote; what are you quoting from?

MR MOLALE: I am quoting from a Report of Global Peace Index by the Institute of Economics and Peace, 2017.

MR SPEAKER: Go ahead Honourable Member.

MR MOLALE: It reads, "Botswana is 27 out of a 163 countries. Botswana is only one of the two countries in the world to have graduated to a high peace ranking over the past decade in its decision on transitions to high levels of peace." By a decade, I mean 10 years which means President Khama's tenure. So when someone stands up and says, "we will be very happy to see that person going." It does not show discipline in Parliament that after the President has spoken, someone from the opposition would say "we will be very glad to see that person going because he has not done anything." That is not only demeaning; it is a lack of our well-known Setswana value of Botho (respect).

If someone has done better than you, do not abuse him or her with words; it is better to just keep quiet. Do not stand and disrespect someone who has not done anything to you. He always said to Batswana "there are many challenges, I might have failed here and there, but I am not stopping here." As I have been quoting, other countries can see the progress. Other countries are talking about it.

Mr Speaker, in the World Internal Security Index, the International Police Association and the International Institute of Economics for Peace reports, they are talking about the state of security in Botswana. If I may quote Mr Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: Do quote Honourable Member.

MR MOLALE: It reads, "The Botswana Police Service was ranked number 1 in Africa and 47 out of 127 in the



world. The index measures the ability of the security apparatus within a country to respond to internal security challenges both new and in the future.” Now if this is not democracy, where people live in peace, where people are consulted, what else do we want? When we see others in conflict we simply remind them that ‘dialogue solves conflict better,’ talk about issues than fight about them. If you are failing to communicate with each so that there is peace among you, do not spoil the peace for everybody else; and try to defame President Khama’s Government which is upholding the pillars of peace. I am still on democracy Mr Speaker...

MINISTER OF DEFENCE, JUSTICE AND SECURITY (MR KGATHI): On a point of elucidation. Mr Speaker, let me thank the Honourable Member; he is really debating very well. I was enjoying it when you were illustrating what President Khama has done against what his opposers were saying. I would like you to touch on this issue of fights that took place in Bobonong. It shows lack of unity and lack of democracy. This is something historic Mr Speaker, therefore we would be able to hold them accountable. It should be recorded in history because it ended up leading to the split of a party. Now they are boasting about multi-party democracy, yet they are repeating one thing.

MR MOLALE: Thank you Mr Speaker. Honourable Kgathi, I was not in Bobonong but from what we have heard, they negated the time tested Setswana adage which safe guards peace; ‘dialogue wins greater conflicts.’

I was about to continue showing that indeed democracy is alive in this country Honourable Kgathi. The Global Democracy Index of 2016 has put Botswana at number 27 out of 167 countries, if this is not democracy then what is it?

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MS TSHIRELETSO): On a point of elucidation. Honourable Minister Molale you are debating very well. President Khama is someone who loves peace indeed. There was a political ‘world war two’ in this country. After the Palapye saga, there was another one in Bobonong. Police officers were dispatched, dogs were biting people. Therefore, I implore you to reiterate that democracy is found here. We saw the two conflicts that occurred; the police officers went there and assisted, under Khama’s Government. Thank you Mr Speaker.

MR MOLALE: Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Tshireletso, you are right. That is why when we went for elections, our slogan was that “there is still no alternative,” meaning the BDP (Domkrag) which is currently in Government, being led by President Khama is on the right track.

MR KEORAPETSE: On a point of clarification. Mr Speaker, of course, we are supposed to bolster peace within political parties. We know very well that the (Domkrag) regional congresses, in the lead up to the main congress in Tonota, there were fist fights as reported in a paper dated 17th March 2017; 4th June 2017 le 19th June 2017 (Mmegi, Sunday Standard and The Voice). Headlines such as ‘fists fly at BDP Congress.’ So, these ones Mr Speaker, were not shown on Botswana Television (Btv) because they concerned the ruling party. This thing has to be condemned. He should not just condemn the opposition; he should condemn even those who were fighting from the BDP (Domkrag) side.

The other thing he should be aware of is that the Afro-Barometer Report shows that over 60 per cent of Batswana believe that the opposition offers a viable alternative including 56 per cent of Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) members.

MR MOLALE: Thank you Mr Speaker, thank you Honourable Member. No, you will not lead me to where you want me to go. The truth is that we know that when you fail that side, you start sending some of your members to go and stir the peace at the BDP (Domkrag). We want you to know that we are aware of that. You sneak around during the night telling people “go and do this, go and do that,” no, that is a futile exercise my friend.

I am still on the first D- Democracy Index; Mr Speaker, I highlighted that where there is corruption, the growth of the economy remains stagnant. But in 2016 Mr Speaker, the Corruption Perception Index by Transparency International still reported Botswana as the least corrupt country in Africa and 35 out of 176 countries. This is the report and we do not have any influence in how it is produced. They are the ones who come up with the findings. So the first D has been covered Mr Speaker. moving on to the second D-Development; it appears like some Members from across the aisle did not read the speech when they got it, or they were not even listening when the speech was presented, because the entire speech covers all the developments which are underway and are evident to every Motswana.



MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR TSOGWANE):

Clarification. Before Leader of the Opposition goes out, I just need clarification. When this started, Honourable Minister said that Honourable Members should listen and that they should read and understand that you do not have to list. You do not need to list a particular subject that each D carries, because it is embodied in the speech regarding the State of the Nation. We know that we are fighting the HIV/AIDS pandemic and we have restored the dignity of the people through the housing appeal by the President. These are the things which Honourable Boko should know because they wanted you to list the Ds.

MR MOLALE: Thank you Mr Speaker. You are right Honourable Member. I am only trying to get the attention of those who said that the President did not talk of the Ds in the Speech itself. It is clear that when we talk of democracy, that aspect is covered, when we talk of developments, we have covered another principle, sector by sector. So I just wanted to bring to their attention, these aspects.

When talking of developments, people start talking of things which have not been included in the speech and they talk of the processes we do not even use to run our developments. A Member would just take the floor and claim that they are going to create 100 000 employment opportunities, you know, these are the things which show that that person has never even had one day's experience in running a Government. They think we are at a playground when we house the poor, that initiative to restore the dignity is what we call running a Government. That brings the developments which we have seen, and they continue to happen. It does not mean that the government is failing when the funds are not available. We are part of the world and when the economy collapses around the world, we also feel the impact and Honourable Keorapetse knows that even at the height of the world's economic recession, the government led by His Excellency President Khama did what no other country did by giving the public service the recession Relief Allowance, since the public service is a group which you represent very well. When the economy recovered, this allowance was turned into Housing and Upkeep Allowance. Dignity...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: How much is it?

MR MOLALE: Is it not that you represent them? Go and ask them how much they are earning and maybe they will tell you.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Elucidation.

MR MOLALE: You always just talk without having done any research.

MINISTER OF INVESTMENT, TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MR SERETSE):

Elucidation. Thank you very much colleague for yielding. Honourable Member, when you talk of what we did as a country during the economic recession, Honourable Keorapetse can even attest that at that very point, when many governments around the world were retrenching, and other governments were even raiding the pension fund as a mitigation factor, we did not do that. We took a deliberate position that we will never retrench. We maintained our workforce, that was a way of showing that we are a government who carefully considers the lives of the people and did not want to risk having people on the streets. Thank you for yielding.

MR MOLALE: Thank you Mr Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. You are on it Honourable Member because we wanted to show them the meaning of the third D- dignity, that when times were hard, President Khama introduced the Recession Relief Allowance. Honourable Keorapetse; you asked how the Housing allowance was broken down and this is how we have allocated it; Grade A3 to A1 get P340 every month, Grade B5 to B1 get P287 every month because this was made for the low income class so that it could cushion them during the economic recession as well as give them the dignity. Can you tell me that the leadership of President Khama does not care for Batswana? There is something which we are missing here and I do not know where our focus is...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR MOLALE: No, my time is almost up, I have yielded before. That is the third D which carries a lot of aspects, with it the dignity of Batswana. You are aware that we are going towards the 1000th house of the Presidential Housing Appeal, where we build for the less fortunate in the society and that is not the only programme. We have the Self Helping Housing Agency, (SHHA). Under the leadership of President Khama, SHHA was introduced for public officers, P30 million per annum, for D4 salary scale and below.

One Member could just stand and tell this House that President Khama should retire because he has not done anything, and people refer to him as a dictator, where is the dictatorship in a person who has come up with such



wonderful programmes? No Honourable Members, please be truthful, it will set you free. There is no use in denying it. We are only speaking the truth about what President Khama has done in terms of restoring dignity to Batswana.

Discipline; in a democratic set up, we might find that may be what you want Honourable Keorapetse, is to entertain yourself all night long, yet that entertainment disturbs someone's sleep. Do you want us to make your entertainment priority at the expense of disturbing another Motswana? Discipline means that you respect another person's rights in as much as you want yours to be respected. Now that ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR MOLALE: Do you get that? Then you injure one another with slingshots.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Yes.

MR MOLALE: That is indiscipline. When you say you just want to go and drink alcohol, that is indiscipline. Drink alcohol in a responsible manner. Do not abuse it.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs)...

MR MOLALE: When the President was sworn in, he dedicated President's Day holidays to celebrating culture. Although Makgorwane's moves are nothing to write home about, he still attends. It has given people dignity as they win prize money and even manage to perform in other countries.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Who is Makgorwane?

MR MOLALE: I am referring to one of the dancers who failed to impress on President's Day. He is not here ... (Laughter!) ...

These Ds are imbedded in here. They are President Khama's good works which some do not recognize. Then Honourable Pheny Butale says, "The Government of President Khama has delocalized the Court of Appeal bench." I do not understand which Court of Appeal he is referring to since we know how ours operate.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR MOLALE: We are all aware of those who make up the Court of Appeal bench.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR MOLALE: Yes. He mentioned that President Khama's Government does not heed court orders more especially court orders pertaining to public workers' case. That is not true at all. If he was here, I could ask him to cite at least one that was not followed. When judgement has been passed and you appeal, you request for stay of execution until Court of Appeal decides it. Fortunately, the political mischief that came with some of those court cases where opposition parties were inciting public workers were won by Government at the Court of Appeal. Requesting for stay of execution does not mean you do not take heed of the court order. People debating here and being economic with the truth saying court orders are disobeyed with impunity is not true Honourable Members. All this talk that in this Government people are not free to talk is not true either because we respect people. We have relatives in opposition parties, we sit down with them and talk without any fear of being apprehended. I do not know why you are scared. Do not fear because the police as I have read from the Security Index on how they work under this Government will protect you always whether you are a Motswana or not in this country. Talk freely but be mindful of other people's rights.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Procedure Mr Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: Before your procedure, Honourable Moremi when you are there, you have crossed the floor to the ruling party.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs)...

MR SPEAKER: Proceed Honourable Keorapetse.

MR KEORAPETSE: Procedure. Mr Speaker, I tried looking away but Honourable Molale's gaze follows me.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR KEORAPETSE: No, I was not looking at him. Please address the Speaker.

MR SPEAKER: Honourable Moremi, check the quorum before you leave. Honourable Molale, please address the Speaker. Stop looking at him, he says you are scaring him.

MR MOLALE: Thank you Mr Speaker. It is just that I am looking where I am facing. Unfortunately, Honourable Keorapetse... again he is not telling the truth, I am actually facing Honourable Lotlamo II.

Mr Speaker, we should always tell the truth. What was said by Honourable Boko and Honourable Pheny Butale



that public workers have not had salary increment is not true. In 2008 when His Excellency became President, he increased public workers' salaries by 15 per cent. In 2010, he increased by 10 per cent and that was at the beginning of the recession.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs)...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR MOLALE: Of course, if you want 20 per cent, you should say that and do not say public workers have been neglected and are not given salary increment. It is not right. Increment goes hand in hand with other things. Remember that petrol, health services, education and other things have been subsidized. Public service also benefits from these subsidies over and above this. I do not understand why it is said ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR MOLALE: No! You have just arrived and you are already asking for clarification. Let me hit you where it hurts and then again time is not on my side.

Public service under President Khama is well taken care of. There is nothing that can be done if funds are unavailable. I said earlier that although funds were unavailable and economic recession had also struck, President Khama allocated public workers Recession Relief Allowance to cushion them.

“EXCHANGE OF SPEAKERSHIP”

MADAM SPEAKER (MS KOKORWE): Honourable Gaolathe, check the quorum before you leave.

MR MOLALE: Madam Speaker, we should desist from denying things that we can even see with our eyes.

MADAM SPEAKER: It is okay. Honourable Tsogwane, do not go.

MR MOLALE: Madam Speaker, my last point is on talks of Government capture of Botswana Television (BTV) and Radio Botswana (RB). Once more, this is being economic with the truth.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)

MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS, GOVERNANCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR MOLALE): ... Ombudsman is independent, if he chooses to have his own opinion about something, there is nothing I can do. For your own information, no one

has captured Botswana Television (Btv). Instead, we see the opposite of people instructing the Btv officers on the feed they should broadcast. We do not condone such.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR MOLALE: Yes, if you have once worked there and has since resigned, you do not have any role there. You are the ones who are provoking these officers and confusing them. Secondly, you need to appreciate that the public broadcaster is responsible for informing the nation about the policies and developments. You should bear in mind that the bulk of those things originate from the President, his Vice and the Cabinet Ministers. If you talk unprofessionally about others just to discredit, know that they are of less importance. The most pertinent issues that will be of benefit to Botswana is informing them about policies that are crafted by the leadership of this country which has been voted by Botswana. Not a government that wishes to take over when it has not been voted.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR MOLALE: Go to the barracks, you have dismally failed! There is nothing like capturing anyone. We know that you are just pushing to be given a slot that will run parallel with the President's public meetings so that you can nullify the developments that have been done in this country. That will not happen, for as long as I am still there, do you hear me. What you are doing is very bad and unfounded. You need to sort yourselves out. You are also alleging that opposition parties' events are never aired on television, and that is untrue. We recently aired the Bobonong event.

MR KEORAPETSE: On a point of procedure. Madam Speaker can you kindly ask Honourable Molale to speak nothing but the truth. Ombudsman stated that there is skewed news coverage in favor of the ruling party on Btv. These are facts that have been documented by Ombudsman. We know that when the President delivers the state of nation address, he was covered by Btv. When Honourable Boko presented alternative view, Btv was nowhere to be found. We know that Honourable Molale has instructed Btv not to air Honourable Boko's speech because he does not want to find the opposition...

MADAM SPEAKER: No, you are out of order. I thought I was in agreement with you.

MR KEORAPETSE: Yes he instructed them not to show a live broadcast on television.



HONOURABLE MEMBER: Who?

MR KEORAPETSE: Honourable Molale, the evidence is that it was not broadcasted live, what more do you want?

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Honourable Members, he likes exaggerating. I thought at first he is talking about the skewed issue. He is saying you are sometimes broadcasted on television but you are saying it is at minimal.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Procedure Madam Chair!

MADAM SPEAKER: No, there is nothing like that. You cannot say procedure just when I take my seat. I am not out of order. Proceed Honourable Molale.

MR MOLALE: That is what I was saying Madam Speaker...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Elucidation!

MADAM SPEAKER: Wait, what are you elucidating when the Member on the floor has not said anything? No I will not yield for you Mother.

MR MOLALE: Thank you Madam Speaker. Earlier on, when I was speaking, Honourable Keorapetse said I am facing him and my debate is about him. Now if he starts talking like this, I do not know what he wants me to say, but I will respond to him.

MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS AND COOPERATION (DR VENSON-MOITOI): On a point of elucidation. Can I ask Honourable Molale to clarify on this issue of skewed information? There is no problem with having that because the President and his Vice by virtue of their positions, regardless of the party in ruling, they are supposed to be covered by the public broadcaster. From there, those who are executing duties of public interest should inform the nation about them. That is why we have them skewed towards government.

MR MOLALE: Thank you Madam Speaker. If you have a tendency of complaining when you do not even know the processes in place is a problem. You cannot dictate to those who are ruling just so that they can suit you. First of all, we do consult with you and secondly, whether it is Matlho a Phage or any other Programme, they have their life span...

MADAM SPEAKER: My goodness! Honourable

Keorapetse Honourable Butale I am about to have you thrown out of this House.

MR MOLALE: They have to know that the public broadcaster takes the Government information to the nation. This Government is led by President Khama, his Vice, Mokgweetsi Masisi and Cabinet Ministers. If they choose the opposite, we as the ruling party, we shall continue to do that so that the nation can vote us back into power. Not to subscribe to their dictates which will not even benefit the nation, we will not do that. You need to appreciate that because we know that is what you always say. Even when we select committee Members, we know that you want the opposition Members to outnumber the ruling party members. We will not allow that because we will derail the entire nation. In a proper Government, there is nothing like *skeif dah!* Because there is what we call accountability which is one of the basic tenets of democracy. I fail to understand the source of qualms that Honourable Butale has. We were just giving you a synopsis of what President Khama has done because evidence is there.

DR P. BUTALE: On a point of order. Madam Speaker, the Honourable Minister has derailed because the issue at hand here is the response to the State of the Nation Address. I have not seen anywhere on the speech where Dr Butale is mentioned. Madam Speaker, when one Honourable Member stated that there was a Broadcasting Act of 1998 which was repealed and replaced with a draconian Botswana Communications Regulatory Authority (BOCRA), then you come here and talk from an uninformed perspective, then somehow you are playing with the valuable Parliament time.

MADAM SPEAKER: No, I will not allow that, you cannot say Honourable Molale is out of order. You always exaggerate issues about others as well, if he has done that with you, let him just proceed. Proceed Honourable Molale.

MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS, GOVERNANCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR MOLALE): Let me move towards conclusion Madam Speaker. What I have just said is exactly what Honourable Phenyio Butale said. So he does not want us to respond to him, but we are responding and what he said was not true. The truth is, if you had read this booklet you would know the truth, we are not wasting anybody's time. We are saying President Khama's exact words when he was telling the nation how he is doing in his government. People can testify



because they can see what he is doing, but your wishes that you want to pile on top of our priorities will not happen.

As I conclude Madam Speaker, I am very thankful for the President's speech. Most Batswana are happy for the speech save for a few. They indicated that when the President leaves office, he will be remembered for what is documented in this booklet and others things that he has done. We are also thankful that he bid the nation farewell and indicated that he will be handing the baton to Honourable Masisi, but other people felt that he would not want to leave office. Thank you Madam Speaker.

MR GUMA (TATI EAST): Madam Speaker, thank you very much. I never want to engage in a cross debate with other Honourable Members. Before I comment on the State of the Nation Address (SONA), I just want to raise some of the issues that Honourable Keorapetse raised. I will tell you why I raise them Honourable Keorapetse because you and I, were affected the same. There is a lot to talk about Selebi Phikwe mine. No one ever talks about Tati Nickel, the impact it has had on Francistown area. We were affected the same political posturing, talk and looking for public sympathy, the whole topic is about Selebi Phikwe when the whole of Francistown region has been highly affected.

Having said that, let me say this, in our committee, we called SPEDU and BCL management for an update on the status of Selebi Phikwe. We have not tabled that report, but I will give you the details. We had a detailed report by SPEDU on the future of the BCL mine. We had no intention at that time to call the BCL management. The composition of SPEDU included the Chairperson of SPEDU, who was the General Manager at BCL. According to the report from SPEDU, they painted a gloomy picture of BCL, in their view it should have long been closed.

I am correct Honourable Butale, in the submission of SPEDU, BCL had no vitality, it should have long been closed. In that SPEDU management, the Chairperson of SPEDU then, was the BCL manager. Surely, the SPEDU gentleman was actually giving us the picture of BCL. It did not only come from Cabinet, it came from SPEDU itself and the management of BCL on the future of that mine. It is there on Hansard Madam Speaker, it is documented, and we will give you the Hansard Madam Speaker. When they had actually brought the report to us, we took a decision to call...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR GUMA: Honourable Member, may I speak. Can I be protected from the Member so that I am not distracted?

MADAM SPEAKER: He will not repeat that, he heard you.

MR GUMA: We then took a decision Madam Speaker to visit the mine. Two days before visiting the mine, the Cabinet took a decision on the basis of information that was given to them factually to close the mine. The truth of the matter, let us look at the liquidity situation. Any business operates on the position of liquidity. It does not matter how you look at it. If your liquidity position is weak, it means the creditors can call off the loans anytime and close you down. The liquidity position of BCL at that time was horrible. In fact, at the time when the Minister was bringing the P1 billion for us to authorise as Parliament, that was the time that we should have interrogated the Minister and even refused to give BCL money because at that time it was worse.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR GUMA: Why are we then crying when the Government has taken the right decision? The truth of the matter is that, that mine is dead Keorapetse ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR GUMA: It is finished. Wait a minute and let me speak.

MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS AND COOPERATION (DR VENSON-MOITOI): Procedure. The point of procedure I wish to raise Madam Speaker is that when Honourable Butale and Honourable Keorapetse speak, we listen to them and respond later. When it is our turn to debate, they have the audacity to shout at us. I request that you reprimand that habit.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs) ...

DR VENSON-MOITOI: That is not right. You can respond, but you should not shout to an extent that the member on the floor has to stop talking and for that matter it is not only the two, most of them like doing that.

MADAM SPEAKER: They are lonely because they are only two.



HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs) ...

MADAM SPEAKER: Listen.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MADAM SPEAKER: What are you laughing at?

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MADAM SPEAKER: What did I beat you with? You are lonely, that is why you are doing that. Standing Order 58.4 does not allow you to disturb another member when he is on the floor. So if you are not careful, I am about to send you out.

MR GUMA: We should be talking about two mines here. The reason why we do not shout about Tati Nickel is because we know the facts. We were heavily affected as Francistown area by the closure of Tati Nickel, badly. We knew at some point in time that Tati-Nickel was going to fall into that problem.

For it to survive, it had to go underground. The total estimated cost of doing underground mining was P4 billion. We have been briefed all along. I have been a Member of Parliament since 2005, I have been monitoring all these activities and we have been given all the reports and knew we were heading for that. So, no responsible Government will keep on pouring money in the drain, never! Even if it makes us unpopular, we had to take that decision period. I support the Government. We continuously tell people the untruth because we want to be popular. We cannot do that, we have to be factual, the facts are there. You have the balance sheets and the records, they are there. At some point in time, we must make two distinctions.

HIS HONOUR THE VICE PRESIDENT (MR MASISI): Clarification. Thank you Madam Speaker. I would like the Honourable Member to clarify whether it is true in his recollection that, the opposition, I do not know which one now because it keeps metamorphosing, at some point, wanted an injection of capital to the tune of P7 billion to BCL.

MR GUMA: That was what one would look at, it is correct. In order to make it survive... In fact, it was understated because it did not take into consideration the further injection that we were to put in at Tati Nickel as a supporting one. Those are facts! We had interrogated SPEDU and had reports from BCL, and those are the facts! The truth of the matter is that the mine is dead. It does not matter how many times we speak, it is dead!

The residents of Selebi Phikwe and the people from Tati East and Francistown have long accepted that, and we have moved on. Finish!

MR KEORAPETSE: Clarification. It is the same Government of yours that says they are looking for somebody to buy the mine and run it, why would they be looking for somebody to buy something that is dead to run it? The other thing is that as we speak now, those who do research in minerals are predicting that the prices of nickel and copper will go up as a result of the soaring demand in hybrid and electric cars because they will need copper.

The last point is that when you look at this company that you buy vehicles for Members of Parliament from; Kia, it had liquidity issues back then but the South Koreans because they did not subscribe to what the International Monetary Fund (IMF) tells you, they injected capital into Kia and today it is transporting your Members of Parliament. They did not close though IMF was saying it deserves to be closed according to their philosophy; but they did not close it because they do not subscribe to the orthodox economic precepts presided over by...

MR GUMA: Honourable Keorapetse, do you know in mathematics there is no however or but? What you do in a mine is that you look at what is left of the mine resource. How do you sustain yourself while you are waiting for the price of copper to increase? You have to inject capital; the running costs must be there but that is a different debate altogether. My issue is that the resource is not there; it is dead. Listen to me, there are other things that you can do; it is either you scale it down and get the little that is there, cut down on your cost or you can do the same thing...

MR KEORAPETSE: Procedure. I said the House could be misled by Honourable Guma's statement of saying there are no resources in Phikwe. If we look at the resources statement of BCL at the time of closure, it shows that the official BCL resources stood at 25 million tonnes at grades 0.66 per cent nickel and 0.77 copper. 2.7 million Tonnes measured resources at 0.86 per cent nickel and 0.98 per cent copper. So...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR KEORAPETSE: No, at that time it was around 4 Dollars per pound but as we speak now the prices of copper and nickel are up and they are predicted to grow as a result of the demand for hybrid cars and electric vehicles. I was referring to the resources; what is there



in Phikwe can be mined for the next 40 years. So, let us not say there are no resources, they are there in terms of the resource statement.

MR GUMA: I am not buying your story sir; you can read whatever you want to read and I can debate with you on a different day. I just wanted to say that you keep talking about Selebi Phikwe and I am telling you that I have the same situation in Tati Nickel, so let us not look at...

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: Clarification. Thank you very much for yielding Honourable Member. There is what is called Government social responsibility, we all agree that the mine was not doing well at that particular time but what is important was the timing of the closure. Did we look back at the impact? Did we actually assess it? Did we have a plan? This is how critical it is Guma Moyo. The same thing applies even at Tati Nickel. Did we close it at the right time? Do you have a resolute plan?

MR GUMA: It does not matter what you say, the mine is dead. When a man is dead, he is literally dead, whether you say this or that, he is dead...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MR GUMA: No! No! Do not keep on trying to raise issues and raise emotions and give people expectations on things that do not exist. We were there with Honourable Keorapetse in Phikwe when addressing people; he could not even tell the people the truth. The truth is when we got there, Cabinet had taken a decision to close the mine; that is the truth because it was under provisional liquidation. If a mine is under provisional liquidation, then the law has taken its course, it is dead. How it happened, who is right and who is wrong is immaterial, at that point in time the mine is dead. Tell people the truth so that they can condition themselves. They know that at some point in time jobs come and jobs go. Let us stop talking about seeing BCL waking up tomorrow, it will not happen. There is a possibility of reviving Tati Nickel but we have to inject more capital. I thought I should start with that point deliberately because you spoke so much about it without any counter.

Madam Speaker having said that, let me get back to the issue of the State of the Nation Address as I understand it. It is important to understand what this House stands for; we are legislators and we make laws. When His Excellency comes here to deliver the State of the Nation Address, it is premised on the National Development

Plan and our budget. A National Development Plan is a plan approved by Parliament. When His Excellency comes to deliver the State of the Nation Address, he is telling us what he has been doing during the year and how the economy is performing in line with what we have approved here. When he starts to deliver that, we should be saying that it is the prelude for the next budget which the Minister of Finance and Economic Development, I suppose by now, he is almost 80 per cent in finalising his Budget Speech or his budget proposals which he will then table around December at Cabinet. In January he prepares draft estimates which he tables here in line with the National Development Plan. Whenever the State of the Nation Address is brought to us, we should be having analytical tools to analyse the National Development Plan and the budget in line with what we have approved here; how far are we in terms of performance. That is how we hold His Excellency and the Government to account. That should be the basis of the debate, not another rally. The whole issue of us playing games and talking about what happened in Bobonong who did this and that, we are not being helpful to the nation. There are very pressing issues that are so critical; issues such as unemployment and we cannot hide them. There are issues that His Excellency raised in here, for example issues of corruption.

In my view Madam Speaker, the most important thing that the President spoke about was to give us a brief on the performance of the economy and he gave us figures that I do not want to repeat. He then goes on to talk about other issues that concern him that I agree with. I tell you that the main issue that will destroy this economy and destroy us is if we tamper with institutions. How do we tamper with institutions? When we as leaders are being perceived to be corrupt or involved in corruption. It is not enough for us to look at the guys at operational level and point figures at them. The need for us to come up with Bills that protect us in terms of how the nation perceives us is more urgent. I talk like this because I am in pain. I have gone through hell of processes, being alleged to be corrupt. By the time you try and get out of that, there is so much damage that has been done to you. Your families are destroyed, a lot of things have happened to you and at individual level, you are destroyed. Let me tell you who gets destroyed more; it is the nation, the institution and leaders. How we are being perceived, it is a disease. It is cancerous, trust me. You destroy an institution and you destroy governance. It does not matter what you do. When corruption cuts across, we are dead.



I call upon all of us in this House to question ourselves in our conscience, what are we doing? There seems to be somehow somewhere in our society a hurry to loot, to position ourselves to those who have influence so that we can take as much as we can. That is scandalous. It affects economic growth. Even the growth that we have is fictitious. His Excellency has spoken about it and it is a call to us to say, this is a disease, let us catch it before it destroys all of us. Look at what is happening in Southern Africa. Look at what is happening to our big economy next door. It is the topic of the day. I, at Chairperson's level in some committees, receive reports. I have reports piled like this, damning reports about some of us here in this House, across the board, all of us. We shall table them at the time, proper. It is scandalous. We are busy catching the small guys on the streets and we have not done anything to protect... even perceptions are stronger than facts. Just for these people to perceive us as a House that is busy, as a place where we are positioning ourselves to eat, sad! His Excellency has spoken about it. To me, it was the highlight of the speech; corruption. I talk openly about it because I am a culprit. I will talk about it because I have got nothing to fear. I can tell you it takes a man to survive that.

Madam Speaker, it is important for us to come up with ideas on how to grow this economy. Government cannot grow this economy on its own. We need the collective. It starts from where we come from; our constituencies. I will give you an example; the impact the P10 million has had in our constituencies is amazing. Only when you start to interact with people, have discussions and involve them in the planning, everybody, then you start to see that it is not how much it is, but it is the input of different people coming out with ideas and saying, "take us on board, do not impose development on us and let us be in charge of our destinies." When you then look at it, it is spread across the six-year period, you can do quite a lot. I am not even hearing anybody coming, those that I have spoken to, to say what is the impact of this? How is it happening? Maybe Members spoke about it, sorry I was not in last week. But it is key. Small as it is, it has assisted us to...

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Order! Honourable Lelatisitswe, Standing Order 58, what does it say regarding newspapers? Stand and say what it says. I said stand and say what 58.3 says

MR LELATISITSWE: Sorry Madam Speaker about that.

MADAM SPEAKER: Alright, put away that newspaper. Proceed Honourable. I stopped the clock so your time was not wasted.

MR GUMA: These small amounts have allowed us to engage with our people to take charge of the development agenda in their own areas. That is where the Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises (SMME) come from; from that small amount. It is not how much, but it is the thinking that goes in there. We must take advantage of that.

At a bigger level, there is a need for us to talk about how we develop the infrastructure in this country. Sometimes I look at ourselves, I say in Southern Africa, we could become another Singapore of Africa. How? We sit in the middle, between South Africa and another big giant in terms of numbers. An economy is all about population and the purchasing power; Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) and Zambia. The growth of Southern Africa is in the North. If we do not take this advantage quickly and develop infrastructure that links us to where population is and where business is, we will have a problem in future because there will come a time when our balance sheet cannot afford for us to inject money in infrastructure. There are different ways of doing it.

I keep saying if we were to take advantage and build the railway line, Kazungula/Sowa, we will with immediate effect divert traffic from Beit Bridge. We do not have to put in money. The total estimated cost of that area in my view, current, could be around P15 billion, but we do not have to put money in there. We have to give a concession.

You know, Rhodesian Railways, the infrastructure that we have today was built by the Rhodesians. Even today we can still engage the private sector without paying a cent to develop this infrastructure. At construction level you are talking about further capital injection into the economy of P15 billion. What does P15 billion do as money circulating in the economy? Sometimes I do not know whether we require a rocket scientist to think along these lines. I am still baffled. The difficulty it takes and how many years people sitting in those parastatals, how difficult it is when you have given them an opportunity in terms of legislation, even to go ahead and say, "Government, this is what we think can be done." What is the difficulty? Government on its own with the revenue collection of plus or minus P50 billion, it is totally impossible for us to inject so much money in that infrastructure. Infrastructure gives us economic



growth; the development of it, not the infrastructure that is meant to bring political votes. No! Infrastructure that assists us to grow the economy, and it must be targeted. When the Minister of Finance says I will build a road that costs P1 billion, there must be returns on it. When you then release another billion because it is for political expediency, it is going to catch up with us at a later stage.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR TSOGWANE): Clarification. Thank you for yielding Honourable Member. I entirely agree with you on that point. Notwithstanding what you are saying, we all know that there are also social cost benefits which accrue to people when it might not look economically viable but socially a project might also have to undertake on the basis of social considerations. I thank you.

MR GUMA (TATI EAST): Financial management entails prioritization Sir, that notwithstanding, yes, you do not have so many resources, you have to prioritize issues and see what comes first so that you can reach exactly where you are talking about but if you do not grow the economy enough and keep on throwing money in areas that do not assist you to grow the economy, you will at some point in time get to a stage where there is not even enough money to support the very same social programmes that you have. You are going to have a situation where one day you will only have money to assist you with Ipelegeng projects because of prioritization. It is very critical.

Madam Speaker, I want to applaud His Excellency, he took over in 2008, when we had planned for the National Development Plan 9, and we had good plans. The revenue projections were very good and six months into his Presidency, there was a situation where we had to even look for money to borrow the De Beers to pay salaries. That is how bad it was. We had good diamonds we had to stop ... (Inaudible)... and for somebody to stay in that difficult period, we did not even retrench staff, we did not cut down on expenditure, we took the decision that we are going to increase expenditure but then we became targeted, we had to defer development projects and focus on maintaining our existing projects or building some infrastructure. It was a deliberate decision. In actual fact, Ipelegeng concept came as a result of the 2008 economic meltdown. We were saying what should we be doing? Do we cut down expenditure or do we increase it? If we do, what do we do? How do we do it? It takes leadership and leadership is not a joke. It takes courage to do that. It brings quite a number

of people around you to advise you. Sometimes you take certain decisions that are not popular. That is what leadership is all about.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR GUMA: No! So, when you compare him with other leaders, the first President it was tough, second then you pick, then there is a bit of stability, you knew where you are heading for then this one when he is supposed to drive, he meets challenges. What is critical is we are still intact as a country and democracy. That we must applaud but he is a human being, did he lead without fault? It is totally impossible. Faults according to who; according to the way you see it. At a time when you take a decision somebody is going to agree or disagree with you but leadership is all about decision making. The worst thing out of a leader is failure to make a decision, right or wrong; make a decision. I had never seen any situation where His Excellency has failed to take decisions, right or wrong. We rectify them as time goes on.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR GUMA: Disaster, sir.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs) ...

MR GUMA: We must applaud him. The second most important thing which is not easy, now listen to it. Power is a very sweet thing however if it lands in the hands of a wrong person it is a disaster. It is a very powerful thing. His Excellency has not tampered with our institution and democracy and he has managed to pass the baton to another and he has managed to make sure that we are still as we are known, he has preserved it. He took an oath, on his leaving, he says, "I am leaving and I am leaving you in the capable hands of my Vice President". It is not about the Vice President. It is about making sure that I am saying to you as an outgoing President, I said do not tamper with our institutions and our laws. We are where we are today because we have managed to preserve our values. This is who we are. That is what distinguishes us from everybody else. That is what he is saying. He said, "I could have done anything, I had the powers, I have the numbers, I have got people behind me. Like any other, I can stay as long as I want," but to whose detriment, to your detriment and he has not done that. Power is a very sweet and powerful thing. What is the definition of power? It is something that gives you the right thing to do the things that you want to do but what do you want to do? Somebody can even decide



to do horrible things in the name of power. So, in that regard, we have to applaud His Excellency.

MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS AND COOPERATION (DR VENSON-MOITOI): Clarification. Honourable Guma, Can you just repeat what you just said regarding power and the numbers in Parliament because we have heard of instances where people use them for their own benefit.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

DR VENSON-MOITOI: I did not get what you said. We make the laws in this house; can you give an example of an instance where he used the numbers to help pass the law.

MR GUMA: Madam Speaker, I am not that good at japing otherwise I am going to lose focus... (Laughter!) ... Having said that Madam Speaker, I thought I would want to say farewell to His Excellency, you have served us well, you have done an excellent job, we appreciate that but that is not the end of you serving this country. Even though I do not understand the wisdom behind it in terms of processes, checks and balances but I think the wisdom of Cabinet of saying, "be part of us in the Vision 2016." It means they were saying, "do not stop serving this country, you are still part of us". 2036, they had interrogated this particular point they say, "you are still a Motswana be part of us but as I know the leader of a vision as it is practically known, the custodian of a vision becomes the current President and it has always been like that.

In Setswana, your parent will forever be your parent no matter how old you get. Can I sit down Madam Speaker?

MADAM SPEAKER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR GUMA: Thank you.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable...who are you? My Honourable uncle.

MR REATILE (SPECIALLY ELECTED): Thank you Madam Speaker. ... (Laughter!) ...

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Murmurs) ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Point of order.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Reatile. ... (Laughter!) ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: We were not going to get you off the hook that easy Madam Speaker.

MR REATILE: I am grateful for the opportunity to also comment on the President's State of Nation Address. I am going to start my comments in a very unusual manner. I will start by agreeing with the opposition as they always say the, "BDP has failed, the BDP Government is failing." I agree with them entirely after listening to the Leader of Opposition presenting his speech. It is indeed true that the BDP has 'failed.' I agree with him because we failed to get involved in this issue of marijuana. That is failing indeed. If the BDP can attempt to grow marijuana as it was suggested, that would mean the end of my journey with the party. This is the first time I am agreeing with the opposition. That is where the BDP (Domkrag) has failed, as they have always explained it. Today I officially concur with them and it should be captured on record that I clearly agree with the opposition that BDP(Domkrag) failed to create jobs for the youth. I do not want jobs that will emanate from the growing of marijuana Madam Speaker.

Madam Speaker, Botswana are happy with the way the government of BDP (Domkrag) has been doing concerning the issue of drugs, especially that our television has been showing us that, there is a black dog that protects Botswana. This black dog Honourable Batshu, I do not know where you have been breeding it; it is doing a great job. Nowadays in the villages, when the news hour comes the old women would be saying, "Let us go and see where this marijuana that is grown has been discovered." The elderly really appreciates this anti-drug campaign because they have been abused by their very own children before. Their brains were not functioning properly because of these issues of drugs. If you say you are going to ensure that Botswana start growing Marijuana, yet the elderly men and women, young ladies and gentlemen are grateful for the measures that have been put in place regarding safety, where Botswana has taken a stand against drugs to ensure the safety and sanity of Botswana, so that in future people would not be dead-alive then that is a very painful thing. It is really heart breaking to discover that there are some Botswana who think the efforts that are being made by the police are in vain; since they believe there are alternatives they can come up with.

MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS AND COOPERATION (DR VENSON-MOITOI): On a point of elucidation. Hey, Honourable Member you are debating very well. When the Honourable Leader



of Opposition was presenting his speech here, he was really on top of his game. I did not hear his conclusion about what should be done with the black dog. Perhaps you might have heard him. He was not clear in his speech. From there, there is the issue of women and soaps because he also said something about it...

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!) ...

MR REATILE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I believe that...

MAJ. GEN. MOKGWARE: On a point of order. Thank you Madam Speaker. I do not think we would be in order if we may allow the Honourable Member to continue debating in this manner. I believe the Leader of the Opposition did not say people are going to be employed to grow marijuana. I kindly request that you quote him in the context he was speaking in, not the way the Honourable Member is putting it.

I did not hear him saying anything about soap. We can go and retrieve his statement. He did not say anything about any female soaps. I kindly request that the Honourable Member should withdraw that statement. The voters out there might soon think it is something he said.

MADAM SPEAKER: Please seat down. You are out of order because you did not say anything related to order from what you said. If you wanted to correct you should have said "correction."

MR REATILE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I believe with regard to the black dog issue, the Leader of Opposition somehow forgot about it. I do not remember him commending it for the great job it is doing. I do not think he forgot it, but looking at his speech, the dog is actually doing a tremendous job which is the opposite of what he wants; he on the other hand is portraying drugs as some form of a mine.'

On the issue of soap, maybe his speech was long. He did not even realise that he left 40 minutes. He might have realised that if he talked about the issue of soap time was going to elapse. Maybe Honourable Mokgware will talk about it because it seems he knows a lot about it.

Madam Speaker, continuing with my debate, we should note that during the economic recession, the World Bank addressed the Government of Botswana in conjunction with the Ministry of Finance and Economic Development, that Botswana's wage bill is soaring high. They were saying it is imperative that the public service is down sized so that the wage bill goes

down, because the economy does not allow it to continue as it is. As they were advising us like that, there was a public service strike in 2011. Songs were composed at that time attacking the Government of the day and the President, but he did not use the recommendation from the World Bank and the fact that the public servants were attacking him under trees as an excuse to down size them. These are the things we cannot take away from President Khama because he is someone who is very merciful, because in the midst of all that, he knew that people are on strike because of disappointments and he did not want to add salt to injury by adhering to the recommendations made by the World Bank to down size the public service, because that would be the end of them. We should recognise this as a capability on the part of our President who has just presented his last State of the Nation Address (SONA) in this House; and shortly he will be going around Botswana bidding Batswana farewell. These are some of the things we should acknowledge about the President because in that very season Madam Speaker, countries like Greece where Jesus and Apostle Paul once passed through, had challenges because people's pensions were cut, civil servants were retrenched. However, Botswana then made a decision that, there is no Motswana whose pension is going to be cut nor any public officer who is going to be retrenched. Still on that note, it occurred that the diamond market went down, and a move was made to extend the Jwaneng mine through the cut 8 project which when completed, would have costed 34 billion. The Government together with her partner De Beers decided that the Cut 8 project should go ahead so as to secure the jobs of Batswana, even though we knew that there was no market for diamonds. This is the work of a Government that makes decisions to ensure that people do not suffer due to the recession. These are some of the things we should applaud the outgoing President on, given the steps he took during tough times. He did not assume duty as a smooth sailor he was faced with challenges even though he thought all things were under control and things changed along the way, but he soldiered on amid all these challenges.

I have to admit that in this very Honourable Parliament, recently Madam Speaker, I asked a lot of questions and Honourable Members were even concerned as to why I was asking those questions. This is a time for me to respond to the concern Honourable Members. I asked several questions to Ministries and Parastatals, seeking the number of temporary employees in their organisations, and the number of vacant posts. Madam



Speaker, when these vacant posts are brought together they made 6356 in the government sector and 2320 in the parastatal sector. When you combine them they make a total of 8676 vacancies. If there is one organisation that has maybe 4 vacant posts and they are not filled, then they should know that they are not doing justice to the nation because if all these vacancies were filled then we could have absorbed 8676 people hence reducing the unemployment rate.

Madam Speaker, it is sad because most of these vacant posts have not been filled for up to three years and when we ask on why that is the case, the response would be there is a particular qualification required yet there are so many people roaming the streets with that qualification. We could be doing this to alleviate poverty from Botswana. These are some of the things...

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR TSOGWANE): Clarification. He is on the right track and he is following up on his questions. He is using this time to roll out the objective of those questions. For these vacancies, did they say they were existing vacancies or that there was a ceiling?

A post could be available in a particular organisation, but that organisation may have reached the ceiling in terms of the work they can do, yet the vacant post is there.

MR REATILE: Thank you Madam Speaker. Thank you Honourable Minister. You are asking a very wonderful question. I just wanted to touch on that. The issue at hand is the fact that, there are vacancies and some people slept on their jobs rather than filling those vacant posts. Let me cite an example; at Councils, an enquiry was made as to why vacant posts were not filled, I even had to meet with the outgoing President and raised my concerns. When he consulted the relevant Ministry to establish why close to 1000 posts were not filled in Councils, the response was that, officers do not want to be posted to remote areas so, they are still persuading them to take the offers. I asked His Excellency the President where those remote areas were since he has travelled around the country, because as far as I know, there were vacant posts in the areas of Francistown, Jwaneng, Lobatse and all these places are in Botswana; so, how possible could Botswana refuse to go to such places? I am only giving you this as an example because when we start questioning them, they always find a way of defending themselves. These are issues that we come across but...

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR TSOGWANE): Elucidation. I get you but your story is not complete, because there are vacant posts even now at councils which you cannot fill because you have reached the ceiling. There are those kind of posts Honourable Member., so that story was not complete.

MR REATILE: Thank you Madam Speaker. Honourable Minister, I am presenting what I got from the responses from the Honourable Minister, regarding the questions I asked in this House. He even went on to state the measures put in place in trying to fill in those vacant posts, hence my response to your concern. For those vacant posts which have not been filled to date, no Minister has come before this House to say that they cannot be filled because they have reached the ceiling, all they said was that, they were still shortlisting the suitable candidates for the posts. That was the general response from the Ministers.

Madam Speaker, moving on, we have to realise that other countries are leaving us behind. When we take financial institutions for example, especially commercial banks and we compare ourselves to Namibia, a country which Honourable Ndaba Gaolathe worked for before he joined politics. The government of Namibia made a mandatory provision that, every bank trading in their country should invest half of their annual profits in Namibia and the other half the banks can invest it outside if they so wish. Currently we have people coming to Botswana to make money, but they have not invested anything in this country, all we see is the construction of the First National Stadium in the Republic of South Africa whereas in this country they only make donations of P5000 to various foundations, and then we continue to praise these banks for the good work they are doing in Botswana. I believe the time has come for us to take proper measures to ensure that those banks invest in Botswana and also improve the lives of Botswana. That is the only way our economy can take the same shape that is taken by other countries.

If we take a country such as Ethiopia for example, there are no foreign banks there, the country has indigenous banks, but as for us, all the banks that we have here are foreign banks, except the Botswana Savings Bank and National Development Bank. We would like to see these banks in competition with the existing foreign banks in Botswana such as Barclays Bank, FNB and Standard Chartered Bank. Madam Speaker, we should



come up with a way that will help us build our country's economy, such that in the long run...

MR KEORAPETSE: Clarification. I hear you Honourable Member. You are on point. Do you not think it is time that we should have a law on Corporate Social Responsibility or Corporate Social Investment? So that we ensure that those who do business in Botswana declare their profits of hundreds of millions and give back to Botswana in a more extensive way, not the P5000 that they donate and then they get coverage on Botswana Television.

MR REATILE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I do not want to get more into this one regarding Corporate Social Responsibility because I want us to ensure that we come up with a law that will not dictate to them to use part of their annual profits for social responsibility. We should come up with a law which compels investors to use the profits in the country to invest in areas such as the Selebi Phikwe mine for example, because they have experts in that field who they can source from countries like Chile, since they do not have any financial challenges, so that they can come and operate the mine. That is why we want them to take half and we remain with ours so that we can develop ourselves. Right now all these funds are being taken to other countries and they will be used to develop other countries while it is the wealth that was produced in Botswana. But now we do not see how our wealth benefits us. The only thing that we can show is the building that one of them has rented, but apart from that, there is nothing that shows the seriousness of these banks in helping the Government to build this country. They come to exploit us and go. When we experience economic problems they pack their stuff, leave and ridicule us that, they knew Africa would be the shining example for only a few years and we are back to being the dark continent. We should ensure that we come up with laws which will bind them to develop our country. That is our duty and that if they would still want to have corporate social responsibility, that would be good and it will mean the investor is innately compassionate.

Madam Speaker, another issue that I want to talk about regards liquidation and according to answers given in this Parliament, it has come out that we have not lost all in Palapye. We were worried that the Palapye project, Fengyue Glass has failed and it has been liquidated, but that is not the case. Madam Speaker, the reason I am saying this is because the project was supervised by Botswana Development Corporation (BDC) and it was later on bought by a subsidiary of BDC. Since BDC

failed, we should now ensure that the project goes under the company that bought Fengyue Glass. We were told that the company that bought the Fengyue Glass Plant is a subsidiary of BDC.

We should not have projects that collapse and we would not know what happened to them. I am grateful for the answers that I heard from the Minister and I realised that not all is lost. The Minister should then inform us when the project is starting. We should move on from that phase and open a new chapter. This is a project that Botswana were interested in and right now we should kick start it lest we fail in a project that was very good.

Madam Speaker, let me indicate that we experience the same problems across the country. There are security companies that are contracted by Government and you will realise that, these companies are paid but they in turn do not pay their employees. You will see employees who have not been paid for three months. Madam Speaker, they do not have anywhere to offload their heartaches and all they know is that the Government of the day is the one that makes them suffer. I wish Ministers could decide on this issue because employers cannot continue to get rich at the expense of the poor by failing to comply with the conditions that they agreed upon.

Madam Speaker, what hurts most is that even companies that have been contracted by the Botswana Police to guard their communication towers are the ones that do not pay their workers as well as those engaged by the Ministry of Finance, Accountant General. Madam Speaker people are hurting about this and pointing a finger at the BDP for not talking about this issue or taking any action. In other incidents, some employers brag to their unpaid employees that there is nothing they can do to them because they are friends with Ministers. These things are heart breaking, and it is not like they were sent by any Minister but they are saying that to abuse Botswana. Should we not do anything then their bragging will sound like reality to the public. So, we have to...

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MR TSOGWANE):

Elucidation. I agree with you. When we hold meetings, people complain about this. There is another one that does not pay people and we withheld their payment and they went to report to court. So we were told that we have to comply with our agreement we made with the company as we do not have any agreement whatsoever



with the employees of the company. We are trying Honourable Member but the law does not give us access to tell them how they should work with their employees. We are trying and it means we are also not protected because they can quit the job anytime when they are not paid.

MR REATILE: Thank you Madam Speaker. I concur with the Honourable Minister that that is how the law is; we cannot freeze company funds, but we have the powers according to the law. I believe the Employment Act still allows the Commissioner of Labour to take action when workers register complaints at the office; they can even detain employers to show them that they are in charge. The Commissioner of Labour should be able to make an order for that person to be detained, but now it shows that they do not take our labour offices seriously. Even our workforce is not keen to go to labour, then when they meet a Minister, Member of Parliament, they complain to us yet there is an office that they should report to. That is why I want Ministers to decide what could be done to protect Botswana and the BDP that I like so much to avoid tarnishing our name because of a few people who are mistreating employees.

MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT, LABOUR PRODUCTIVITY AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT (MR MABEO): Point of clarification.

MADAM SPEAKER: Clarification by Honourable Mabeo. Did you not say you are sick?

MINISTER OF EMPLOYMENT, LABOUR PRODUCTIVITY AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT (MR MABEO): On a point of clarification. Yes Madam Speaker but I did not want him to worsen my sickness. My colleague is on the right track. I wanted to highlight that there are many companies but be that as it may, we are trying our best with the minimal funds that we have, to get inspectors. We send these inspectors to areas where we have received reports of problems; you will find that in most cases, there is a shortage of resources in terms of transport and personnel, but nonetheless I take it that you are talking about an existing issue.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Reatile, I hope that you have read that note.

MR REATILE: Yes, I have it here Madam Speaker. The issue that I want to touch on regarding this note is that of drivers working at Central Government, who have been loyal for many years since they were employed, and then six months before their retirement they have a car

accident. From there we do not take into consideration the fact that he has served for long and is about to retire, we just take a decision that he should be surcharged, yet we know that the driver has always been the most loyal of all the drivers and there are challenges that people encounter in life. The main reason why these drivers are treated like this is because Central Government does not ensure their vehicles. I do not know why they are failing to do so whereas a small Ministry like local Government is able to insure all their vehicles and buildings? When clinics were still under the ministry for Honourable Tsogwane they were insured, but after they were moved to Central Government they were not insured. I do not know why it is so difficult for Central Government to have an insurance policy because the insurance for Local government is not done by Councils individually but by the Ministry in Gaborone. They group all their vehicles and buildings together and pay insurance at once. Let us insure that we do justice to our employees, who love this country and want to serve it efficiently.

There are other issues that I would like to raise but there is a note here that talks to me. I have mixed feelings, like one singer Budaza once sung Madam Speaker.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Laughter!) ...

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT (MS TSHIRELETSO): Thank you Madam Speaker. Thank you for giving me the floor but I will start by commending you for the honor that you just received. This award is not just yours, it is for the entire Parliament in addition to that it is an honor for all the women of Botswana.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ... (Applause!) ...

MS TSHIRELETSO: Firstly, I would start by thanking the President of this country, President Khama who has served this nation but his term would be ending in the next five months. I really applaud him for shaming the devil because there were allegations that he is going to refuse to hand over his Presidency seat. Honourable Moitsoi added on what Honourable Guma said that, President Khama has never asked for votes to extend his term. We love our President, if at all he wished for his term to be extended he could have done so, but because of his respect for the constitution and his love for this country he did not hesitate. President Khama has already bid the nation farewell, he did not wait for next year.



I would like to commend President Khama because during his tenure, he appointed women for two consecutive terms as Speakers of the National Assembly. No one ever knew who the Speaker would be. I was with you Honourable Kokorwe and Honourable Venson-Moitoi when we had a meeting with the President to nominate the Speaker, both you Madam Kokorwe and Dr Nasha wanted that post. We gave him the opportunity to select one of us and he appointed Dr Nasha. I want all those who thought that President Khama never loved Dr Nasha to know the truth. We are the ones who made the President to choose Dr Nasha and indeed we welcomed her as the Speaker. Whatever happened afterwards only Dr Nasha knows. All what I know is that Dr Nasha assumed her speakership position through President Khama. Even for the second time he never thought of anyone among men, he chose you Madam Speaker Gladys Keitumetse Theresa Kokorwe...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible)...

MS TSHIRELETSO: Wait Honourable Member. Names are submitted by the President, please you are disturbing me at our caucus, do you get me...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: On a point of procedure Madam Speaker.

MS TSHIRELETSO: No! There is no point of procedure here. All the two names were brought by the President.

MR KEORAPETSE: On a point of procedure. ... (Laughter!)... Madam Speaker, our knowledge is that the Speaker is elected by Parliament. We are not aware that the President had a hand in the selection of the Speaker.

MADAM SPEAKER: Alright! You are wasting her time; it is almost time up. Like she is saying, the name comes from the President and the other names are brought in Parliament. That is all she is saying.

MS TSHIRELETSO: I never denied anything, we lobbied the President, and he gave us names as a party. Majority of us then chose Dr Nasha. We will never agree on any name that you bring here, if it was not submitted at the caucus. You once brought a name last year, and we rejected it. By the time that name was brought by him, we agreed and voted. He then submitted your name Madam Speaker, and we voted, you are here as the Speaker. Two women were appointed as Speakers of the National Assembly under

the leadership of President Khama. Let me say the name of our President correctly not like someone who was making fun of it last week and it was a shame because no one even laughed. President Khama has left good deeds that Batswana will never forget. There is no village or settlement that he has not visited in Botswana. He has had a handshake with Batswana regardless of their skin colour. It is an honour to us for our President to have travelled all over the country to meet Batswana. There was a concern that President Khama never visits other countries but when President Mogae visited foreign countries, he was criticised in newspapers that, he is not a President of this country. Now when President Khama visits people it is also a problem. I saw Honourable Boko at New Xade hugging one of the elders in that village and I could not believe my eyes. People were criticizing Khama for visiting the villages but when he carries out an initiative, it is a lesson to you especially those on the other side of the aisle. He loves peace. Right now the opposition claim to love peace but we recently witnessed their drama at Bobonong because they did not want Gaolathe's son to be the president. I will mention his name because he is in Parliament, the people responsible are also present, there was a lot of backstabbing. The reason opposition is here is because of the Botswana Movement for Democracy (BMD) which was led by Honourable Gaolathe but there is now confusion.

After he left to form another party of Alliance for Progressives (AP), that is when they said there should be re-election of the congress. I was so surprised! So much jealousy, we saw that there is no peace. After the Bobonong congress they called for re-election because they were afraid of one person, something was wrong. You think we do not know these things.

My point is President Khama has initiatives of Ipelegeng and Housing Appeal, he leads by example. If he did not initiate the housing appeal, there could be no houses built. The President took action and initiated programmes which will assist us; there is one vehicle per village, there is community service day which we usually do as Ministers, there is Ministers' phone in. There are just so many initiatives that if I could list all of them I will not be able to talk about the President. I would like to talk about him, he used to visit people and sat with them around the fire and according to our culture where there is fire there is life.

He bid us farewell, he is my chief I do not want it to be a secret. I would like to quote his statement, he said,



"Madam Speaker, in accordance with the Constitution, five months from now, I shall be passing the baton of leadership of our great country into the capable hands of His Honour the Vice President. I am confident that with support of Members of this House and the nation as a whole, the next administration will continue to build on the legacy of progress that was began under my predecessors."

He requested us to support the Vice President, like I said he is my chief and I love him so much, when he says something I obey. We are going to support the Vice President; in fact, I am his prophet maybe you do not know. I have known Honourable Masisi since 1985 while we were at Mahalapye and he came to address a situation because students were dropping out of school, we were with my Member of Parliament Mr Merafhe, may his soul rest in peace. Honourable Masisi was a very handsome young man! We met at Mahalapye when he came up with an initiative to allow students to take their children to preschool while they attend classes.

As he spoke I saw a leader, he was working for the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF). After he came to Parliament in 2009 I put him under my wing and acted like his mother. I watched him and realised that he is a very clever person. I used to stare when he spoke as he mostly spoke English which was not common then before some of you came.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Laughter!)...

MS TSHIRELETSO: When he spoke, his deliberations were even written in the newspapers, it is just that they forget quickly. They were impressed that this young man of the Botswana Democratic Party is good in English. I am his friend. I asked T.W what he thought of him, we did not even think that one could occupy that position. I prophesied that he is going to be the Vice President. T.W then told his friend Mmolotsi, he thought I heard that information elsewhere. I am a prophet Honourable Members.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Laughter!) ...

MS TSHIRELETSO: Maybe you do not know why he was called VP before he actually became the VP it was because of me. I was chatting with my friend T.W then he spread the rumour that "Honourable Tshireletso heard that Mokgweetsi is going to be the VP" then they started calling you VP. After that we went to Mahalapye, I want to talk about Mokgweetsi before he becomes President because after that it will be boot licking.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Laughter!) ...

MS TSHIRELETSO: I would like to talk about the leadership, you have long qualified and I support you your Honour. We went to Mahalapye and he presented his initiative and the residents were so angry. When Kgosi Tshipe gave his vote of thanks, he said, "Sir, you are going to be the Vice President." I laughed and wondered if he is giving the same prophesy that I gave. He responded by saying "yes". We did not say anything about the prophesy from Mahalapye but our prophesies were the same.

I accompanied him to China, he was a member of the leading group and when we arrived as he spoke I saw a capable leader. Honourable, I am saying this as a welcome note, I welcomed you on behalf of Honourable Venson-Moitso as a member of the leading group from China. He spoke as if he was representing Foreign Affairs, I was in awe of his good command in English.

Most people do not like Honourable Masisi and Honourable Gaolathe because of how eloquently he can express himself in English. There were claims that we do not have people who can speak English fluently but now we do, majority of them here speak English fluently without any problem.

Honourable, we will heed the President's request as he asked us and the opposition to support you. We will support you fully without any reservations. Come the 1st there is no need for any sort of communication the only thing left is your Vice. I was talking about your capability and personality. Maybe we will never get the chance to talk about this because you will be busy delivering the State of the Nation Address. These are facts Honourable Masisi. Let me move on and congratulate him. The words of the Kgosi are obeyed Honourable. You should also support him from that other side, he can manage if we all do.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ...(Inaudible)...

MS TSHIRELETSO: Those who are strong will support him. Those like the one seating next to him, whom you have chased...you are afraid of intelligent people. I realised that they are threatened by intelligent people. When the likes of Honourable Phenyio and Honourable Gaolathe speak you understand them. They are angry after they heard Honourable Matambo asking what you are doing that side as you should be his assistant. Since then.



HONOURABLE MEMBERS: ...(Laughter!)

MS TSHIRELETSO: Even when I say Honourable Gaolathe is a well behaved person, people always attest to this. You cannot come to this House with three other Members and then they surpass you in number along the way. You were eliminated without your knowledge because they were threatened by your intelligence. The opposition are full of jealousy.

Madam Speaker, I will now present my issues. First is health. I would like to thank the Ministry of Health for all that they have done so far like the introduction of Antiretroviral (ARV), Treat All. Treat all was introduced under the leadership of President Khama who is said to have done nothing for this country because they have never liked him. Khama cannot be 100 per cent perfect; even Jesus was not perfect. He can be criticised because he was the leader of this country but he has done a lot for it. He made sure that everyone was treated for Tuberculosis (TB) in order to reduce the number of infections. I believe that when he was part of the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) he stood in support of human rights.

I would like to talk about the issue of intersex; people born with two genders. I think as Members of Parliament, we need to look into amending our constitution to make sure that it accommodates them. When these children are born with two genders, it is very scary and confusing to both the nurse and the parent as this is very unusual, but only one gender is written in the birth certificate. The constitution has to be amended to include them because they are neither boy nor girl. When they get to puberty they can then make a choice as to whether they want to be a boy or a girl; our doctors have been given permission to make that change. This has destroyed the lives of some children who have been considered to be of a certain gender whilst they are of another gender. This is why I think we need to be considerate of our children and respect their rights. Just recently in one of the schools in Gaborone, there was a child who was treated like a boy and wore trousers and one cruel person told him to wear a dress during examinations and the child ended up not showing up for examinations. He was placed in a wrong classroom because nobody knew his true gender and the head teacher cannot be held accountable for that either; he grew up wanting to be a boy yet he is said to be a girl. The law does not protect this child; we need to stand up for these people and make sure they are protected. This is not their fault; they were created by God in that manner; just like any of us. I would like to plead with the Honourable Vice President and all the other Honourable Members that are present here to take these matters seriously to try and assist them.

MADAM SPEAKER: You have said it all honourable. I would like to ask the leader of the House to move a motion of adjournment so that we can go and think about what the Honourable Minister just said.

MOTION

ADJOURNMENT

LEADER OF THE HOUSE (MR MASISI): Thank you Madam Speaker. I humbly request on behalf of my colleagues that we adjourn so that we can go evaluate those beautiful words we just heard. Thank you.

Question put and **agreed to.**

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until Tuesday 14th November, 2017 at 2:00 p.m.

WRITTEN ANSWER TO QUESTION NUMBER 12

Motsumi JSS

VOTE	AMOUNT DISBURSED	(ii) AMOUNT REQUESTED	(iii) % ALLOCATED AGAINST REQUESTED
Feeding	1,106,405	1,696,200	65.2



Stationery	177,210	280,000	63.3
Service Charges	1,101,508	1,800,000	61.2
Domestic	39,585	159,670	24.8
Staff Uniform	8,397	44,195	19.0
Minor Works	3,996	5,000	79.9
Maintenance of Buildings	4,407	20,000	22.0
Practical Subjects	96,254	150,000	64.2

Ditsweletse JSS

VOTE	AMOUNT DISBURSED	(ii) AMOUNT REQUESTED	(iii) % ALLOCATED AGAINST REQUESTED
Feeding	1,193,240	1,616,766	73.8
Stationery	168,957	408,885	41.3
Service Charges	1,150,094	440,300	261.2
Domestic	42,680	127,750	33.4
Staff Uniform	8,471	28,383	29.8
Minor Works	4,,151	60,000	6.9
Maintenance of Buildings	4,578	50,000	9.2
Practical Subjects	98,632	439,350	22.4

**Makgadikgadi
JSS**

VOTE	AMOUNT DISBURSED	(ii) AMOUNT REQUESTED	(iii) % ALLOCATED AGAINST REQUESTED
Feeding	1,133,730	2,611,423	43.4
Stationery	158,978	300,000	53.0
Service Charges	986,116	120,000	821.8
Domestic	37,310	75,000	49.7
Staff Uniform	8,283	35,000	23.7
Minor Works	3,755	40,000	9.4



Maintenance of Buildings	4,141	50,000	8.3
Practical Subjects	92,564	300,000	30.9

Nanogang JSS

VOTE	ESTIMATES	2017/18 PROVISION	% Allocated
Food	1,920,400.00	1,352,305.00	70.41%
Stationery	185,738.00	219,252.97	118.04%
Service Charges	493,368.00	1,057,031.00	214.25%
Domestic	122,650.00	44,385.00	36.19%
Protective Clothing	27,940.00	9,000.00	32.21%
Minor Works	45,000.00	4,317.00	9.59%
Maintenance	75,000.00	127,761.30	170.35%
Practical Subjects	182,575.00	106,172.00	58.15%



HANSARD RECORDERS

Mr. T. Gaodumelwe, Mr T. Monakwe, Ms T. Kebonang

HANSARD REPORTERS

Ms T. Rantsebele, Mr M. Buti, Ms N. Selebogo, Ms A. Ramadi, Ms D. Thibedi,
Ms D. Pheko, Ms G. Baotsi, Ms N. Mokoka, Ms B. Pinaemang

HANSARD EDITORS

Ms K. Nyanga, Ms W. Mbeha, Ms C. Chonga, Mr K. Goeme, Ms G. Phatedi,
Ms B. Malokwane, Mr A. Mokopakgosi, Ms O. Nkatswe, Ms G. Lekopanye, Ms T. Mokhure

TRANSLATORS

Ms. K. Ben, Ms. M. Kagiso, Ms B. Ntsetsang
Ms. B. Dintwa, Mr. T. Rajane, Ms. M. Sekao, Ms. M. Rabotsima, Ms. B. Mosinyi, Ms. V.
Nkwane, Ms. N. Kerobale, Ms K. Alepeng, Ms T. Bocock
Ms K. Tshetlho

LAYOUT DESIGNERS

Mr B. B. Khumanego, Mr D. T. Batshegi

